



# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF MULTIDISCIPLINARY RESEARCH AND INNOVATION (AJMRI)

ISSN: 2158-8155 (ONLINE), 2832-4854 (PRINT)

VOLUME 2 ISSUE 6 (2023)



PUBLISHED BY  
E-PALLI PUBLISHERS, DELAWARE, USA

## Plights of Tenured Teachers in Integrating Technology in Classroom Instruction: A Phenomenological Inquiry

Pedida Sunshine B.<sup>1\*</sup>, Diaz Rhey Mark H.<sup>1</sup>

### Article Information

**Received:** September 14, 2023

**Accepted:** October 17, 2023

**Published:** October 23, 2023

### Keywords

*Social Studies, Technology  
Integration, Phenomenology,  
Qualitative, In-Depth Interview,  
Focus Group Discussion, Thematic  
Analysis, Tagum City, Philippines*

### ABSTRACT

Technology integration for tenured teachers improves and enhances their skills in the teaching process. The study aims to explore the lived experiences, coping mechanism, and insights of tenured teachers in integrating technology. The researcher collected data from 17 Araling Panlipunan Tenured Teachers in high school from the Division of Tagum City using purposive sampling. This study employed a phenomenological approach and utilized an interview guide for in-depth interview and focus group discussion. The results of the study were analyzed using thematic analysis. In the lived experiences of tenured teachers, there are three emerging themes; facing challenges brought by ICT innovations; experiencing lack of know-how and interest; experiencing difficulty in access to resources and learning materials. Further, on tenured teachers coping mechanism there are also three themes; consultation with peers, class discovery and experiential learning; self-determination and perseverance. Lastly, on the insights of tenured teachers, three themes emerged; improving skills and adapting to change, best to share and learn from peers; never lose hope and determination. Results revealed that it is a challenge for tenured teachers to innovate strategies due to lack of know-how and difficulty or limited access to technology infrastructures. However, teachers were able to overcome these challenges through peer support, positive attitude and discovering classroom strategies which promotes experiential learning. Furthermore, tenured teachers see technology integration valuable since it improves their skills and adaptability to the technological changes and enable them to cope and never lose hope despite their tenure. This implies that on-going professional development plays a relevant role in improving tenured teachers' skills and delivery of classroom instruction with technology integration.

### INTRODUCTION

In a modernizing world, technology with its use and integration has become the driving factor to improve the educational system. Indeed, technological advancement plays a significant role in education (Yilmaz and Aydin, 2019). Technology has also evolved into one of the most important instructions that teachers apply in different educational institutions. However, technological integration may have varying effects depending on the pedagogical approach and instructional methods employed, Thus, it is important to explore how technology is used and how it affects both the teaching style and the entire educational process (Adams, 2021). Furthermore, research that highlight technology integration are abundant, but this abundance focuses more on its uses and less on those who integrate it. For instance, the study of Kubota *et al.*, (2018) stated that teachers did not have adequate trainings and lacks technical support for technical issues. It was also stated that teachers lack the know-how in operating computers and has inadequate basic knowledge and skills towards integrating technology in classroom instruction. Thus, there is an urgency to conduct this study to explore the live experiences of tenured teachers in ICT integration, especially that in the present time, the use of ICT is necessary and evident progress in delivering instruction in teaching and learning is extensive. Meanwhile, this study anticipated generating

results on the lived experiences of tenured teachers in integrating technology. Also, the findings of this study will stimulate awareness that the longevity in service does not hinder the opportunity of teachers to improve their skills to keep up with the modernizing world. Furthermore, this study would serve as a source of information about the impact of technology specifically to tenured teachers in integrating ICT in classroom instruction which will highlight the realization for the improvement of curriculum content that enhances teachers' performance. Furthermore, the outcome of this phenomenological inquiry is significant and will serve as a great opportunity for the Department of Education officials in realizing the implementation of training and programs to empower tenured teachers to keep up with the new era of teaching to be able to deliver quality instruction. At the same time, school administrators will also be made aware of the lived experiences among tenured teachers in integrating technology in classroom instruction and would enable school heads to review the existing policies to formulate or develop new programs or provide training to help tenured teachers maintain the engagement in fulfilling their tasks. The following are the research objectives of the study,

1. To explore the lived experiences of tenured teachers in integrating ICT in their classroom instruction.
2. To determine the coping mechanisms of tenured

<sup>1</sup> University of Mindanao Davao City, Philippines

\* Corresponding author's e-mail: [s.pedida.522036@umindanao.edu.ph](mailto:s.pedida.522036@umindanao.edu.ph)

teachers in integrating ICT in their classroom instruction.

3. To probe on the insights that can be drawn from the plights of tenured teachers in integrating technology.

Generally, this paper begin with an introduction. It contains a brief idea of the work, the requirement for this research work, the problem statement, and the Author's contribution to their research. Adequate latest reference citations should be included for showing the prevailing challenges and importance of recent work. This section should be concise, with no subheadings unless unavoidable. State the objectives of the work and provide an adequate background related to your work, avoiding a detailed literature survey or a summary of the results.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

Various studies determine plights or barriers in technology integration into two categories: Extrinsic and Intrinsic. Unal and Ozturk (2012) discovered from Ertmer who divides these hurdles into first-order (extrinsic) and second-order (intrinsic) barriers. It states that first-order barriers refer to external causes such as lack of access and infrastructure and training opportunities for relevant knowledge, while second-order (intrinsic barriers) refers to individuals' attitudes and beliefs. First is the study of Harrell and Bynum (2018) on the factors affecting technology integration, it was stated that although classrooms have access to technological tools there are several external and internal factors that affects the proper implementation of technology in classroom instruction. This involves scarcity of resources, such as infrastructure and technological tools.

In addition, Tusiime, Johannesen, and Gudmundsdottir (2020) in their study revealed that teachers' negative viewpoints towards ICT integration was a hindering factor in the implementation of ICT in the teaching process. This includes, the lack of ICT tools, lack of proper training for teachers in utilizing ICT, as well as the lack of institutional policies of its relevant use in teaching. In addition, teachers' factors included lack of confidence, consistency of the teachers, and the technical qualification in ICT integration. The results emphasized that lack of skills in ICT integration among teachers made them anxious in using technology. Therefore, lacking the confidence made them reluctant in applying ICT when teaching. Also, according to Bala and TAO (2018), teachers often encounter common obstacles in integrating technology, such as the absence of technology utilization, limited experience, insufficient technical support, financial support, time, and administrative assistance.

Further, Acabal and Casingal (2018) found that the integration of emerging technologies in Philippine education faces challenges, including insufficient infrastructure and resources. As a result, insufficient internet connectivity and restricted availability of devices and software impede the successful implementation of technology in the classroom. Another hurdle is the differing levels of technological proficiency among teachers, with some lacking the essential skills and

knowledge to fully leverage technology in their teaching, leading to limited utilization or improper application of technology.

Also, the challenges that persist include the heavy workload faced by teachers (Esguerra, 2018), the complexity of implementing the spiral progression teaching method (Dunton & Co, 2019), the limited availability of teaching materials (Soriano & Vargas, 2021), the issue of large class sizes (Esguerra, 2018), and the insufficient training provided to teachers (David, Albert & Vizmanos, 2019). In addition, the study of So, Jong, & Liu (2020) which emphasized an issue has arisen owing a variety of factors, including a lack of technology, internet access, and trained teachers, a multilingual and multicultural classroom, and a gap between policy and execution, among others. Moreover, according to the research conducted by Asadi, Abdekhoda, and Nadrian (2019), the willingness of teachers to adapt to technology integration has a positive impact on their level of success. It has been observed that as teachers develop a stronger relationship with technology, their behaviors in using technology and actively incorporating it into lessons improve. Also, Asare *et al.*, (2023) highlighted that the systematic review also emphasized how important it is to have the right infrastructure and technical assistance in place before attempting to deploy technology-enhanced language instruction. The successful incorporation of information technology in the classroom depends on having access to dependable internet connectivity, well-equipped computer labs, and qualified teachers.

On the other hand, the the idea in the study of Davis *et al.*, (2021) emphasized that teachers with positive beliefs about integrating technology were more likely to incorporate it into their teaching practices. The study also highlighted the relevance of continuous support and taking actions on the concerns of teachers to improve their utilization of technology. Also, Abbasi *et al.*, (2021) in their study, it was revealed that teachers' attitudes play a significant role in determining their behaviors when employing technologies in their pedagogical practices, as they respond either positively or negatively based on their experiences. On the contrary, On the other hand, the study of Smith and Johnson (2019) stated that resistance to change is one of the challenges of tenured teachers in adopting technological practices. Also, in the studies conducted by Soomro *et al.* (2020) and Noor *et al.* (2020), it was found that teachers exhibited reluctance in incorporating ICT into their instructional practices. This resistance was primarily attributed to the insufficient infrastructure and lack of technological competencies.

In addition, one significant idea is the varying capabilities of tenured teachers in applying technology in classroom instruction. One literature which supports the idea that tenured teachers have varying capabilities is the study of Jaschik and Lederman (2018), results stated that instructors who are tenured in the profession revealed less positivity with their use of technology. Also, in the study of Hampton *et al.* (2019) stated that teachers who

are tenured in the industry is fond of utilizing lower technological influence in learning activities which includes board work, reading of textbooks, and creating reflection or journal write ups. Although the use of technology supports the teaching process, the challenge remains in the manner of integration. (Abrigo *et al.*, 2019). In summary, the works of literature presented unveil different views concerning the prevailing technological progress in education, it is necessary that teachers are self-reliant, aware of their capacity, and are equipped with the needs to apply ICT integration successfully. Most of the tenured teachers grew in the institution before the technological era develops, but students nowadays are immersed in a drenched technological setting. Teachers may have control in the classroom by lingering in teaching traditionally, thus, the need to prepare for digital means and technological change is possible but crucial for educators. Moreover, the literature leads the researcher to explore and discover the different challenges of tenured teachers in integrating technology and their need to adapt to the progressive change in delivering teaching and learning education. This previous study, create realization for the involved stakeholders and school administration to somehow innovate and upgrade ICT-based resources to utilize their full potential for the benefit of teaching and learning and ensure that technology integration is consistently delivered.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

This part of the study covers the process in conducting and gathering the data. Specifically, it contains three sections: first is the study participants, second is the materials and instruments, and lastly, the design and procedure.

### Study Participants

This phenomenological study involved seventeen (17) participants, all of whom were tenured teachers from different secondary schools. The place of study involved big schools with a very large population from the Division of Tagum City. These were secondary schools that were coded respectively (TC1, TCN2, LF3, TNT4 ) and with enough number of tenured teachers teaching Araling Panlipunan that were chosen purposively. In a sampling technique a purposive type of sampling according to Etikan *et al.*, (2016) is defined as the deliberate choice of a participant due to the qualities they possess. It is a non-random technique that does not need underlying theories or a set number of participants. It refers to the researchers' decision about the needed information and people who can contribute to providing ideas with their experiences. Moreover, Creswell & Clark (2011) stated that purposive sampling involves identifying or selecting groups of individuals that are knowledgeable and experienced in a certain phenomenon. Among the 17 participants, seven of them had undergone focus group discussion, and the other 10 participated in the in-depth interview. When selecting participants for a study, it is important

to determine the needed population and consider the selection of people that can help the researcher enrich and understand the central phenomenon (Creswell, 2012). Moreover, in this study, the sample size is based on the recommendation and guidelines set by Creswell (2013) for phenomenological studies who recommended at least five to 25 informants to be interviewed until data saturation is achieved. This is to develop possibilities of experience, enrich the insights of the study and interpret the homogeneity of the participants' life experiences to capture better results for the improvement of the research. In addition, Creswell and Poth (2017) referring to Polkinghorne's (1989) highlighted the suggestion that phenomenological studies should involve five to 25 participants. Thus, the 17 participants of this study is supported by the following literatures which served as research participants for the focus group discussion and the in-depth interview. The selection of respondents in this study was based on the following inclusion criteria which was supported by Garg (2017) that, to attain consistent, reliable, uniform, and objective findings, selection of participants should have inclusion criteria. The inclusion criteria of this study are the following: Should be secondary tenured teachers currently in the profession teaching Araling Panlipunan; and secondary tenured teachers from different subject area who were able to teach Araling Panlipunan for five consecutive years in the Division of Tagum City; must have 10– 25 years of working experience in the teaching field and has experience in utilizing technology tools. Willing to contribute and convey information about the purpose of this study; and lastly, participants who are supportive and accommodating to the needs of the researcher. Meanwhile, the exclusion criteria of the study are the following: Teachers with less than 10 years' experience; Teachers who were not able to undergo an in-depth interview and focus group discussion, Teachers from different subject area who did not reach the five consecutive years minimum of teaching Araling Panlipunan; and those that are not teaching Araling Panlipunan from the Secondary schools in the Division of Tagum City; and Lastly, Teachers who are not open in participating the conduct of the study.

### Materials and Instruments

To gather essential data concerning the objectives of this study, the researcher utilized an interview guide which consist of self-made interview questions that exemplify in determining and discovering the plights, challenges, coping mechanisms, and insights of tenured teachers in technology integration. Also, to acquire reliable and valid findings (Boparai *et al.*, 2018), Interview questions that were utilized were made in accordance with the needs of this study and addresses phenomenological lived experiences and is based on the researchers' readings about authors, and various sources such as articles both published and unpublished, online references, and all other related sites with relevant information related to

this study. Furthermore, the research instrument was validated by the four external validators with connection to the University of Mindanao and another external validator outside University of Mindanao. The validation process was done through sending the soft copies to involve validators for revisions and enrichment of research instrument. Before the validated questionnaire was approved, I underwent revisions for the comments and suggestions of the involve validators to come up with a research instrument that would probe on the relevant experiences to improve the results of the study. Furthermore, these validators are people with quality experience in their field and had equivalent background interest and relevant experience in the given field.

### Design and Procedure

This study applied a qualitative research design to explore and understand the lived experiences of tenured teachers in integrating ICT in classroom instruction. Qualitative research is deemed to be flexible, open, and responsive to context. In qualitative research, sampling, data collection, analysis, and interpretation are related to each other in a cyclical (iterative) manner, rather than following one after another in a stepwise approach (Saunders *et al.*, 2018). Since this research is qualitative, as per Crossman (2019) definition, it is a type of research that collects and finds answers to a certain problem with the use of non-numerical data that seeks to interpret data to help us understand a certain phenomenon through the study of targeted population or places. Moreover, Aspers & Corte (2019) also stated that qualitative research is “multi-method,” involving the collection and use of a variety of empirical materials and approaches. It focuses not only on the objective nature of behavior but also on its subjective meanings: individuals’ accounts of their attitudes, motivations, behavior, events, and situations what people say and do in specific places and institutions in social and temporal contexts.

Specifically, this study utilized the phenomenological approach in which Chan *et al.*, (2013) stated as an approach to research that seeks to describe the essence of a phenomenon by exploring it from the perspective of those who have experienced it. The objective of phenomenology is to portray the implication of experience both in terms of what is experienced and how it was experienced. Neubauer *et al.* (2019) added that this approach is uniquely positioned to help professionals or students to learn from the experiences of others. It is also a form of qualitative research that focuses on the lived experiences of the participants related to the study. The following phases such as identifying the participants, asking permission for the conduct of the study, preparing the materials and tools needed; like the interview guide, recorders, and choosing the place for the conduct of the study are also prudently considered. To ensure that this research underwent informed consent process, before the conduct of the study, ethical approval was obtained from the UM Professional Schools particularly from its

Ethics Review Committee (UMERC) which included the verification process of the tools to be utilized, the verified research protocol and the permit to conduct the study. After the verification process, documents such as the permit and letter for the conduct of the study is forwarded to the involved school. Moreover, as the tool to conduct the study, a validated interview guide was utilized to conduct the purposive sampling strategy in gathering data. Also, a letter of permission was handed to the respective participants to ensure that they are all informed of the purpose of conducting the study. Furthermore, signatories from involved participants were secured as proof of participating voluntarily.

Considering the key roles, to ensure that proper dealing with the appropriate principles in conducting a qualitative study is dealt with accordingly, the following steps was done. First, as the researcher of this study, I started with a proper submission of permission letter to schools involve and underwent verification and validation of the instrument that was utilized. Also, I dwelled on the tenured teachers’ perceptions and plights in integrating technology in classroom instruction. In the process of conducting this study, I was the interviewer of the participants which was conducted by gathering data through recording and writing important details from the interview. Additionally, Dornyei (2007) also states that although there is a need to ask questions during the session, researchers should function more as a facilitator of the discussions than as interviewers in the traditional sense, since the dynamic of the focus group is one of the unique methods of this process. I believe that gathering essential data will enable a researcher to come up with the necessary results in this study. Thus, in this study, I am not only the interviewer but also the facilitator which sets a systematic process and helped exemplify deep ideas from the participants. I was also the moderator to probe the right questions to the participants by creating discussion guides that will elicit a detailed and clear response. I also bear in mind that the discussion process will address the research objectives while keeping the participants engaged in the process. Second, as a decoder of this study I made sure that all the participants’ responses in the whole duration of the interview were recorded properly. In addition, safekeeping of the information both hard and soft copies were done to provide duplicate copies to avoid corruption of files or deletion. Next, after gathering the essential information and data, I transcribed the responses of the participants concerning the questions in this study. In transcribing, I see to it that the words and sentences were properly transcribed to ensure that the results were authentic and natural. Aside from this, I made sure responses in vernacular language (Bisaya) were appropriately and accurately translated to standard English format. Once all the research interviews had been transcribed and checked, I began coding then theming. Lastly, the researcher believed in what Postholm and Skrovset (2013) stressed that researchers have a multi-faceted role that will challenge them cognitively and

emotionally. Thus, in this study, I analyzed and synthesize the gathered data. Subsequently, I formulated conclusions and recommendations based on the findings of the study. Yet again, as the researcher of the study, I expounded and examined comprehensively the experiences of the teachers and the existing phenomena in the integration of ICT in classroom instruction to understand and explore the impact of the study in the pursuit of quality education. Furthermore, in this study, the utilization of qualitative-phenomenological research which involved in-depth interviews and focus group discussions served as the primary data being employed. Initially, the in-depth interview and focus group discussion strategy started by aligning the research objectives in planning for target participants to produce an interview guide that exemplifies substantial result of the study. Next is the process of recruitment which was done through personal referrals and even professional networks and online platforms. Further, the process also required familiarizing the interview guide that helped me probe deeper ideas during the interview. Also, during the interview, building rapport, active listening and probing allowed me to give open ended questions which helped the participants to express their opinion on a deeper level. Moreover, during the process I made sure to take down notes and significant ideas of the participants. Moreover, the in-depth interview and focus group discussion had allowed participants to give their insights to arrive at concrete shreds of evidence from interviews concerning the enrichment of results of the study. In addition, the period covered in conducting the study started with the submission of the permission to conduct study to the involved Division, which was received in the month of November 2022, and was also approved in the same month. After the approval of the Division office, permission to conduct the study was also done in the involve Schools followed by the data gathering which involves in-depth interview and focus group discussion and was conducted in the month of January. To aid the supply of cultural and contextual descriptions and interpretations of social phenomena, researchers employed a qualitative design that covers a variety of data gathering methodologies. Creswell's approach is among the qualitative research methodologies that researchers employ (Creswell, 2013). This study employed Creswell's approach, first is the data preparation, which involves transcribing and organizing data to prepare for analysis, next is familiarizing the data which includes re-reading, taking notes, making observation, and familiarizing the content. Third, is the coding which involves assigning of descriptive labels to the data that suits the needs of the study as well as in helping to organize and categorize according to content. Next is the categorization and theme development which involves analyzing the coded data based on existing patterns which will represent the main findings. Also, in this phase data reduction is also important to summarize and select the most relevant and significant findings of the study. Lastly, is the interpretation, verification and reporting of the data, this

involves reflecting on the implications of the emerging themes, which aligns to the literatures considering connections, contradiction and overarching ideas, cross checking of interpretation to the original data and writing the results coherently.

Thematic analysis, according to Braun and Clarke (2013), entails seven steps: transcribing, reading and familiarization, coding, searching for themes, reviewing themes, defining, and labelling themes, and concluding the study. Further, transcribing is a laborious process that involved the conversion of recorded information into written documents. In this study, the researcher did an immediate transcribing of the recorded interviews. Before the coding and identification of themes, familiarizing was done first by the researcher, which occurred in the process of transcribing. To effectively familiarize the data, listening, typing, reading, rereading, and correcting was done by the researcher. This is to acquire the emergence of quotes and significant ideas that can explicitly match concepts in the theory. Coding requires discovering all relevant pieces of data within the full dataset to answer the research questions. Braun and Clarke (2013) define a code as "a term or brief phrase that captures the essence of a certain piece of data can be beneficial." Using the latent codes, I started with coding the transcripts, and while doing so, semantic codes had emerged. The emerging data (unexpected interview quotations found in the previous stage) was labeled with a name generated from the data itself. After the coding, I looked for pattern that occurred within the data. Braun & Clarke (2013) states that pattern-based analysis empowers the researcher to discover key aspects of the data which are relevant to the objectives of the research. Identification of the patterns was done by looking at the frequency of appearance of a certain code. However, considering the codes which did not frequently appear but had meaning and were useful to answer the research questions.

Identification of themes and sub-themes through the patterns of the data was also done. The term "theme" can be used as a description, a feature, a component, or a notion. It refers to an implicit theme that organizes a group of recurrent thoughts that allows researchers to answer the study question. It encompasses codes with a common point of reference and a high degree of generality that merges concepts about the topic of investigation (Vaismoradi et. al., 2015). Lastly, after data analysis, themes and other related data collected through codes about the research questions was presented by the researcher. Moreover, implications that are based on findings is integrated into the theories and literature of the study.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The lived experiences of the participants, their coping mechanism, as well as the insights that were mentioned from the data gathered through in-depth interviews and focus-group discussions were presented in this chapter. To glean a comprehensive and substantial data in this

study, participants were able to express themselves in any language that they felt comfortable with during the interview. The participants of this study answered the same set of questions. Before the interview proper, a permission letter was forwarded to my target participants to ensure formality and proper documentation. Also, after stating the important points of the study and how they could participate, they commenced ideas out from their experiences, resulting significant data. Furthermore, the purpose of the research was to discover and realize the lived experiences of tenured teachers in integrating technology in classroom instruction using probing questions. The presentation, evaluation, and analysis of

the collected data were also included in this chapter.

**Lived Experiences of Tenured Teachers in Integrating Technology in Classroom Instruction**

From the conducted interviews, most of the responses of the participants are dealing with the struggles they encounter in integrating ICT in their classes. The themes that flourished are as follows: (1) Facing challenges brought by the ICT innovations; (2) Experiencing lack of know-how and interest; and (3) Experiencing difficulty in access to resources and learning materials.

Table 1 shows the lived experiences of tenured teachers in integrating technology in classroom instruction.

**Table 1:** Major Themes and Core Ideas on the Lived Experiences of Tenured teachers in Integrating Technology in Classroom Instruction

Major Themes	Core Ideas
Facing challenges brought by ICT innovations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dealing with difficulty in introducing the use of technology.</li> <li>• Dealing with difficulty in using ICT tools</li> <li>• Having limited or no knowledge in using ICT</li> <li>• Dealing with issues, outdated or unavailability of gadgets or hardware.</li> <li>• Dealing with poor internet connectivity</li> </ul>
Experiencing lack of know-how and interest	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Showing no interest in technology. integration</li> <li>• Dealing with unreadiness and hesitation in accepting the use of ICT</li> <li>• Dealing with technology-oriented learners in support for ICT integration.</li> </ul>
Experiencing difficulty in access to resources and learning materials	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dealing with the lack of facilities and resorting back to traditional way of teaching</li> <li>• Lacking ICT tools for technology integration</li> <li>• Dealing with unavailability of internet connection</li> </ul>

**Facing Challenges Brought by ICT Innovations**

To design an effective strategy for 21st century learners, a teacher must consider integrating technology and innovation in classroom instruction. Tenured teachers, on the other hand, are reluctant in making changes and innovating technology in their instruction. Having limited or no knowledge in integrating technology was one of the challenges tenured teachers deal with. Teachers in their tenured stage, find it hard to introduce the use of technology in classroom instruction.

**The First Core Idea was Supported by FGD1 and FGD 2**

“Because ICT on our part during our school days wala ni siya na introduce although baba pa kaayo ang level of ICT or the information system in the Philippines, so nangapa pa kung baga, so in other words kaning experience namo sa naglisod mi in to introduce to ourselves.” (FGD1)

(Because ICT on our part during our schooling years, this was not introduced to us. Although, the adoption level of ICT or information system in the Philippines is slow, we find it hard to cope. In other words, it was difficult introducing ICT for us).

“Mas labaw nako nga naglisod kinadugayan na sa service wala pud ni na introduce sa amoa so sa akoo naglisod giyud ko permiro kay di gyud ko kabalo mumanipulate aning computer mao na to unya pero trying hard para naay mahatag na maayo pud na lesson para sa mga estudyante.” (FGD 2)

(I also struggled considering the years I’ve spent in teaching. ICT was also not introduced to us, and on my part, it’s difficult at first, because I don’t know how to operate a computer, but I’m trying hard to be able to provide a good lesson for the students).

Also, IDI 2 and IDI 5 Supported the Idea

“Sa paghimo sa una og mga powerpoint kay dili pa kayo ko kabalo mo himo unya asa ko nga site mag research, tapos sa una sa pag type mismo labi na kay sa mga daan na nga teachers wala jud mi naanad kay mostly mga bitaymax rajud among naandan sa pag sugod aning ICT.” (IDI 2)

(I don’t have much idea how to create a PowerPoint or what site I should refer to. Even in typing we, as tenured teachers are not used to using ICT, because mostly we utilize visual aids when ICT emerged).

“First few months mahirap, mahirap sya in the sense na there were times na di na ka kabalo how to operate no kana palanag so siguro challenges na sa amoa as a kanang old I mean season teachers no for how many years na in teaching.” (IDI 5)

(The first few months was hard, its hard in the sense that there were times that we don’t know how to operate, with that said it’s really a challenge for us as seasoned teachers teaching for how many years).

As the first theme states, this refers to the challenges faced by the teachers as they journey to the integration of ICT in their designed teaching and learning delivery system. Age and differences in generation have been considered

as factors affecting how they feel and how they react with the use of technology in their classes since most of the tenured teachers are not that well versed in the use of the newly integrated ICT strategies. For most teachers, they say that many of their students are better off knowledgeable in the use of technology which had given them the hesitation to compete at some point. They admit that there were several times when they ask for assistance from the students on how to operate and navigate the instructional material since some are not of their own work but are the works of their children or they have just asked assistance for them to come up with a power point presentation or a video presentation for the class.

### **Experiencing Lack of Know-How and Interest**

In today's technological advancement and innovative environment, teachers must keep up in dealing with the trend in delivering classroom instruction. However, putting everything in action is quite challenging for tenured teachers. Tenured teachers' reluctance and hesitation in accepting and handling innovative means in delivering classroom instruction are few of the reasons of their plights in technology integration. Dealing with the lack of passion, interest, unreadiness and hesitation in using ICT and dealing with learners who are technology oriented for support were few of the situations they were dealing with as well. Indeed, the following were evident in the participants responses.

### **The First Core Idea Highlights the Experiences of FGD 1 and FGD 3**

"First is awkwardness because we belong to the age of ano na kaning pawala na ba aah unsay tawag ani ahh dili na kaayo interesado with regards to the ICT especially in operating ICT in our subject mag differ into the age level of the new generations to our generation." (FGD 1)

(First, it's awkward because we belong in the seasoned age who is not that interested anymore with the use of ICT, especially in operating the ICT. In our subject, the use of ICT really differs from the age level of new generations to our generation).

Sa akoo, experience wise wala pa giyud koy know how aning ICT murag sa akoo uninterested kaayo ko mu learn ani tungod kay maulaw ko." (FGD 3)

(For me, experience wise, I don't have any idea about ICT, and I feel uninterested to learn because I feel shy).

Also, Teachers Shared Their Experience with Unreadiness and Hesitation in Adapting the Use of ICT in Their Classroom Instruction This Was Supported By IDI 5

"As a tenured teacher no integrating, at first I was hesitant no, makaya kaya namo ni na mga challenges as a so-called traditional teacher, although there was a computer na but then were not used to using teaching learning process." (IDI 5)

(So, as a tenured teacher integrating technology, at first, I was hesitant, can we overcome these challenges as so-called traditional teachers, although there were computers but then were not used to using teaching learning process).

Also, Focus Group Discussion Participants Stated Their Thoughts on Their Reluctance in Adapting the Use of ICT

"Kanang naa kay pag alanganin ba mao na siyay mga common challenge and then the operational the applications kay naay mga applications sa ICT nga kana bitawng complicated na kaayo mao na siya so lisod siya ba ang command ang shortcuts ang unsa pa tong uban so operational." (FGD 1)

(The feeling of hesitation is the most common challenge, also the operational concern, the applications, because there are ICT applications that are complicated, that is why it's difficult in terms of command, shortcuts and other ICT related operations. It's difficult).

Learners of the 21st century are immersed in a digital environment; this led them to become technologically inclined in responding to the ICT processes along with its uses. On the other hand, tenured teachers' difficulties in handling technology were observable, but with the use of ICT and the support of technology-oriented learners, they were able to explore and learn the know-how and how to strategies in dealing with ICT in classroom instruction, it also poses a challenge for them to keep up with the trend to be able to deliver instructions effectively and work on their weaknesses in dealing with technology. These learners were able to become the support that the tenured teachers need in dealing with ICT integration as they were able to show willingness, enthusiasm, and creativity in the process.

### **Experiencing Difficulty in Access to Resources and Learning Materials**

In achieving a successful delivery of classroom instruction, access to materials and ICT related software, hardware or gadgets should be available. But the access to the needed materials and support in dealing with ICT integration were some of the challenges of tenured teachers to fully adapt ICT processes. Indeed, issues such as lack of facility and access in ICT integration poses a challenge in technology integration.

The Following Are the Experiences Shared by Focus Group Discussion Participants First Core Idea Was Supported By FGD 4 And FGD 6

"Wala pa giyud kaayo ni siya na introduce ang ICT pero ang challenge man pud gud sa amu ana time is nakabutang mi sa murag makeshift na building na wala gani kuryente so bitay max giyud ang gamit so wala giyud sa akoang time na naabtan ning ICT integration, walang resources." (FGD 4)

(ICT was not thoroughly introduced to us, and the challenge for us that time was the location, we were assigned in a makeshift building with no source of electricity, so we really must use visual aids and during my time, there was no ICT integration, and no resources).

"Sa akoang case although sa akoang college days naa na koy kuan ani ICT pero basic lang giyud siya so dili giyud hands on kay sa lack of facilities pud siya pero pag start na nakog tudlo pag integrate lisod siya kay pag abot diri kulang pud siya sa mga facilities so naglisod ko ug

integrate.” (FGD 6)  
 (In my case, although in my college days I am already aware about the basics of ICT, I was not able to do a hands-on experience because we lack the needed facilities, and when I started teaching to integrate ICT, it was difficult back then, because when I got here, the school also lacks the facilities which makes it hard for me to integrate).

In Addition, Teachers Also Had Trouble in Dealing with Lacking ICT Tools Which Was Elaborated by IDI 5 and IDI 9

“There are times na dili gyud ni makuan no ma kumbaga ma present tanan siguro kay naa mga disturbances like kanang walay kuryente, then kaning the use of tv sa classroom naa nay mga not functioning na ana mga non-functional ilang mga TV.” (IDI 5)

(There are times that I cannot present everything because of some disturbances like no electricity and non-functional television in the classrooms).

“Struggles maam mga ana lack of ICT materials tapos tv, projector puwede man ako nalang mag extend, wifi and internet connection. Challenge kay first time sya mam dili paka aware kung unsaon dili paka unsa sya ana dili paka master unsa pag master sa pag operate.” (IDI 9)

(Struggles such as Lack of ICT materials, Television,

projector, WIFI and Internet connection. It is also a challenge for me being a first timer and unaware how to do the process and not well versed to operate).

To come up with an effective strategy in integrating technology in classroom instruction, the availability of resources should suffice the needs of teachers. On the other hand, participants reluctance to technology as mentioned from their responses has something to do with lack of facilities and resources for utilization. Furthermore, the provision of necessary facilities can make the integration process easier. The findings indicate that ICT tools and availability of resources is relevant in delivering classroom instruction and the negative impact of the lack thereof.

### Coping Mechanisms of Tenured Teachers in Integrating Technology in Classroom Instruction

From the conducted interviews in relation to the coping mechanisms of tenured teachers the following themes that emerged are as follows: (1) Consultation with Peers (2) Class Discovery and Experiential Learning (3) Self-Determination and Perseverance. Table 2 shows the coping mechanism of tenured teachers in integrating technology in classroom instruction.

**Table 2:** Major Themes and Core Ideas on the coping mechanisms of tenured teachers in integrating technology in their classroom Instruction

Major Themes	Core Ideas
Consultation with peers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Seeking help from knowledgeable peers with the use of ICT</li> <li>• Asking colleagues about how to do the process of ICT integration.</li> <li>• Consulting the nearest peers to help me with my concerns.</li> <li>• Seeking help about the updated process of technology integration from younger teachers</li> </ul>
Class Discovery and Experiential Learning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Providing instructions to students in creating their own power point presentation</li> <li>• Giving students the opportunity to share their ideas.</li> <li>• Stimulating group activity in creating self-made presentation</li> <li>• Giving task to students to initiate learning from their first- hand experiences.</li> </ul>
Self-determination and Perseverance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Showing willingness in learning</li> <li>• Setting time management and focus</li> <li>• Finding ways to integrate ICT effectively.</li> <li>• Involving love for work in integrating ICT</li> </ul>

### Consultation with Peers

Dealing with technology integration requires necessary actions to be able to integrate strategies in classroom instruction effectively. But for some tenured teachers, acting also means they will need help from their peers and assistance from learners to support their experience in learning the process of ICT integration. Indeed, these were evident from the participants responses.

As Explained

“I always seek help from the younger teachers and also from the student who knew how to use, learning by myself but I really need help. Yes, self-exploration and guidance wala man sad ko nag eskwela og ingana so I just seek help sa mga nakakaalam, hands on kanang naa juy mag tutok sa akoo.” (IDI 1)

(I always seek help from the younger teachers and from

knowledgeable students. Self-learning, but still needs help. Yes, self-exploration and guidance because I was not able to learn about these things, so I just seek help to those who are knowledgeable, in hands-on, I really need someone to guide me).

Another Participant Also Shared

“So again, be open, you need to ask help di giyud ka ingun nga pa as if ka nga because tigulang naka, dugay naka nag tudlo hawod naka sa tanan and everything, so be teachable nga kaya ka nga tudloan gihapon be open nya ask ghaon kag help.” (IDI5)

(So again, just be open by asking for help, and don't push yourself pretending that you already know everything just because you are tenured in the industry. So be teachable, the reason why you were being taught, should be open, and should still seek help).

Tenured teachers would be able to integrate technology successfully when provided with support and assistance from colleagues. This would help them grasp and acquire strategies to manage their plights in technology integration.

**Class Discovery and Experiential Learning**

Tenured teachers find it hard to manage ICT in their classroom instruction due to many reasons, but they were coping in ways that would help them in the teaching learning process. The participants responses show significant experiences in dealing with technology integration. Since, 21st century learners are immersed and introduced in an ICT and technological environment tenured teachers were able to integrate learners’ skills while adapting to the use of technology in delivering classroom instruction.

Participants of Focus Group Discussion Shares the Same Experiences

“Sa akong coping mechanism usahay akong ichallenge pud ang mga bata na mag oh mg create mog sarili ninyong presentation maghimo mo ug sarili ninyong powerpoint based on the topic, so ichallenge pud nako sila nga kay reporting man sila no.” (FGD5)

(My coping mechanism, sometimes I challenge the students to create their own presentation, create their own PowerPoint base on their assigned topics. So, I really challenge them because they are doing reporting).

So akong ginahimo gina by group nako sila so mao to ako cope up mechanism, so base on my experience nahimo man giyud pud excited pud sila nga magcreate pud silag sarili nilang slides mao to ako cope up pag di ko kabalo ohh kanya kanya tag himo, akoa ni unya kamo pud ni mao ni inyong grupo.” (FGD5)

(So, what I’m doing, I group them, this was my coping mechanism. So, based on my experience they were able to create presentation, they also show excitement making their own slides, so that’s how I cope if I don’t know what to do I assign them their task per group).

“Ginapractice pud nako nang group reporting so gina mix nako ang bata nga hawod sa dili kay para naa pud silay peer tawag ana peer tutoring ing ana siyempre naay mentoring sa ilaha pud sa peer group pwede pud siya, nga akong ginabuhat kanang naay lahi magbuhat sa powerpoint naay tabang lahi pud ang magreport.” (FGD7)

(I am practicing the group reporting strategy. I see to it that I am grouping the learners according to their level of skills, so that peer tutoring will be encouraged in the group.

I encourage and advise them to have delegation of task). Having peers to support and guide the technology integration process of tenured teachers lightens their difficulty in adapting to the innovative environment. Also, strategies such as experiential learning and class discovery could help them widen the avenue and ways in coping and improving their skills in technology integration.

**Self-Determination and Perseverance**

Determination and perseverance are important ways to sustain and continuously improve teachers’ ability to adapt the use of technology in delivering classroom instruction. These characteristics will help tenured teachers to remain motivated ang geared towards adapting the technological development considering their tenure in the teaching industry.

As Mentioned by IDI 7

“Yes, kay interesting man siya maam interesting man on the part of the students sa mga bata ug sa akong sarili kailangan maningkamot ka para ma effective ka na teacher ginakuan nako akong sarili maningkamot para magiging effective ka although na seasoned teacher naka dili pud boring imong lesson.” (IDI 7)

(Yes, because I find it interesting ma’am, for the students and for me as well. I work hard to become an effective teacher even though I am one of those seasoned teachers. In order not to deliver boring lessons).

Willingness of Tenured Teachers to Learn in Adapting Technology Keeps Them Motivated in Integrating Technology, as the Participants of Focus Group Discussion Mentioned

“Akoa kay willingness to learn kay maskin naa pa nay mentor ug dili ko ready mu learn wala lang gihapon.” (FGD3)

(For me it’s the willingness to learn, because if there are mentors but you are not ready to learn it’s all useless).

“Focus, kanang willingness, willing giyud ka na mulearn. Willing to learn then time management pud kay dugay baya ta mulihok sa preparations.” (FGD4)

(Focus, willingness to learn and time management because sometimes we take so much time in preparing).

The mechanisms of tenured teachers in coping with the needs of the learners lies in their ability to willingly accept and persevere in adapting and improving their skills to be able to integrate technology and continuously apply these skills for an effective delivery of classroom instructions.

**Table 3:** Major Themes and Core Ideas on Class Discovery and Experiential Learning

Major Themes	Core Ideas
Improving skills and adapting to change	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Improve teaching skills and technique in ICT integration.</li> <li>• Adapt to the use of ICT even in tenured stage.</li> <li>• Flexibility and readiness in learning ICT integration process.</li> <li>• Keeping up and being open with the trend in technology integration.</li> </ul>
Best to share and learn from peers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sharing ideas and practices about the process in integrating ICT with co-teachers</li> <li>• Asking or seeking help from peers through mentoring or tutoring</li> <li>• Consultation to those who are knowledgeable in ICT integration.</li> <li>• Asking and being open to share and learn ideas from younger teachers</li> </ul>

<p>Never lose hope and determination</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Diligence in integrating ICT in classroom instruction.</li> <li>• Continuous learning about ICT integration for more knowledge and mastery</li> <li>• Utilization of websites to further enhance knowledge.</li> <li>• Loving what you do</li> <li>• Attending trainings.</li> </ul>
--	---

**Insights of Tenured Teachers in Integrating Technology in Classroom Instruction**

Participants responses yielded different themes in integrating technology in classroom instruction, the following are, (1) Improving Skills and Adapting to Change (2) Best to Share and Learn from Peers (3) Never Lose Hope and Determination.

Table 3 shows the insights that can be drawn from the plights of tenured teachers in integrating technology in classroom instruction.

**Improving Skills and Adapting to Change**

Technology integration has been a great factor in improving teachers’ skills and strategies in the delivery of classroom instruction. Also, teachers’ character towards adapting the use of technology helps the integration process easier, this way, sharing and learning ideas from peers would develop the integration process into something a tenured teacher can diligently and continuously utilize in delivering classroom instruction.

With the use of technology, teachers were able to share their thoughts in adapting and openness to improve and adapt to different strategies in integrating technology.

“Sa mga co-tenured is I think you have to be open whatever new no sa be flexible na whatever unsa paman nga changes sa atong education we have to face, you have to be open and share what you had then maka learn pud ka through your experience.” (IDI5)

(To all my co-tenured is I think you must be open whatever new to our field in teaching be flexible whatever changes to our education we have to face it, you have to be open and share what you had then you can learn through experiences since experience for me is the best thing that we can share to others).

Participants of Focus Group Discussion Also Mentioned “Akoa still developing, pero bisan pag developing siya at least na happy ko kay ngano mao lagi to akong gina ingun na before ko ni retire hala ka nakaapas apas paman kay at least na lessen giyud pud akoang unsa na nga trabaho magsulat sulat.” (FGD2)

(As for me, it’s still developing, but even if I am in the developing stage, I feel happy. I feel happy because I was able to adapt with the use of ICT before my retirement. It also lessens the task that I had to do, no need to write everything because it’s already prepared).

“With the use of ICT, I can say na na develop na giyud ang akoang mga techniques and skills in teaching I mean dili na giyud kanang traditional akong ginahimo naka adapt na giyud ko sa kanang bag-o na pamaagi sa pagtudlo gamit ang ICT.” (FGD3)

(With the use of ICT, I could say it improved my techniques and skills in teaching, I mean I am not anymore

focus on traditional way. I have adapted to the new way of teaching using ICT).

Indeed, the responses of the participants shows that technology and the use of ICT improves teachers’ strategies in delivering classroom instruction. Their adaptive characteristics were also a factor to successfully appreciate and integrate the use of technology and its relevance in the teaching learning process.

**Best to Share and Learn from Peers**

Learning is worthwhile when you have people to share and learn from in the process. Those who are knowledgeable plays a great role in guiding tenured teachers in their experience.

Indeed, These Were Evident in the Responses of the in-Depth Interview Participants

“Those younger teachers are a big help to me, halimbawa gina set nila tong laptop para derecho nako ana or provide me og ppt ohh gina providan ko nila so ako nalang mag operate didto sa classroom.” (IDI3)

(Younger teachers also play a big help, they assist me through setting up the laptop so that I can directly start, or they will provide PowerPoint so I can operate on my own when I am in the classroom).

“Siguro isa lang giyud is kanang we should be open as a teacher we will continue learning since learn is continuous and there is always change at least ma dagdagan ang atong kaalaman para pod ma shares nato sa mga bata as well as atong kauban nato na teachers so.” (IDI 5)

(Maybe one is we should be open as teachers, and we will continue learning since learning is continuous and there is always change at least it will be added to our knowledge so that we can be able to share to our students as well as to our fellow teachers, because this is the life of a teacher).

“Normal, natural mo ingon jud kog maningkamot tag gamit og ICT and ang difficult lang jud sa amo ang beginning, mga techniques mao na akong ginalista so mao nang mo ingon ko nga naa didto ang humility kay para mo tudlo sa imoha makilouy jud ka ma learn jud maam.” (IDI8)

(It’s normal to say that we should work hard to use ICT. The only thing that makes it difficult for us is the beginning phase, we ask help from our co-teachers’ how to do it, they would guide us with the process, and I would list the techniques. That’s why I said that it’s really humility because you will learn to ask help from those who are knowledgeable).

Support from knowledgeable peers makes the task easier for tenured teachers in integrating technology. Shared practices add up to their knowledge in adapting and applying the use of ICT in their classroom instruction and introduce tenured teachers to what is new and evident to the needs of 21st century learners.

### Never Lose Hope and Determination

Determination and diligence towards adapting the use of technology enables tenured teachers to adapt strategies and skills in delivering instruction that corresponds to the needs of the learners. Indeed, there are characteristics a tenured teacher should have to keep up with the trend.

“How can I share my knowledge, so I just I just want to advise them to mga teachers na to never stop learning to ICT ana, so you can have many ideas to be shared to your students.” (IDI3)

(How can I share my knowledge, so I just want to advise them, to the teachers, never stop learning the use of ICT so that you can also impart ideas to your learners).

Focus Group Participants also shared their experiences “Ing ana sad akong gihimo para ma additional learning ninyo pwede mo kung naa moy mga load adto mo didto sa google kay mas masabtan.” (FGD2)

(I also do the same, for additional knowledge if internet connection is present, try to research in google to understand more).

“Permanente gamiton para mas mahawod.” (FGD2)

(Constant use if ICT for mastery).

Engaging in trainings and seminars is also one way of improving the skills of tenured teachers to be able to keep up with the trend in technological development. Opportunities which involve hands on trainings and seminars enables their confidence to deliver teaching processes in accordance with the needs of the learners. More so, it will need a diligent and determined character of tenured teachers to be able to adapt and absorb the knowledge and technique that they need in integrating technology in classroom instruction.

### Preparation of Figures and Tables

Please note that the article will be published in black and white. Present tables and figures within the article, not at the end of the article. Tables should be numbered consecutively using Arabic numbering (Table 1, Table 2, etc.) and must have corresponding references in the main text. Tables should also have appropriate and concise headings. All figures and illustrations, as in the case of tables, should be numbered consecutively as

‘Figures’ (Figure 1, Figure 2, etc.) with corresponding references in the main text. Figures should also have appropriate and concise headings.

Authors are supposed to embed all figures and tables in the appropriate place within the manuscript. Figures and tables should not be submitted in separate files or at the end of the manuscript. Figures and Tables should be numbered properly with a descriptive title. Each Figure/Table must be explained within the text by referring to corresponding figure/table number. Any unexplained or unnumbered Figure/Table may cause rejection of the paper without being reviewed.

### DISCUSSION

This section presents the discussion of the study based on the result of the in- depth interviews and focus

group discussion and the contextualization of the result supported by the review of related literature of the various authors and body of knowledge found in this study.

### Lived Experiences of Tenured Teachers in Integrating Technology in Classroom Instruction

Based on the findings on the experiences of tenured teachers, there are three major themes that emerged: 1) Facing Challenges Brought by ICT Innovations 2) Experiencing Lack of Know-How and Interest 3) Experiencing Difficulty in Access to Resources and Learning Materials.

#### Facing Challenges Brought by ICT Innovations

Findings about the experiences of tenured teachers were mostly because ICT was not introduced in their time. Most of them mentioned that they have difficulty in operating hardware and software. Operating basic hardware includes the use of laptop and television, they expressed that there were times that they find it hard to utilize the laptop because they have less knowledge even to its basic function. Internet connection was also one of the challenges, without data from the internet it’s hard for teachers to download resources that could help them to deliver instructions that corresponds with needs of the learners.

The collected result is congruent with the study of Bala and TAO (2018) which stated that teachers often encounter common obstacles in integrating technology, such as the absence of technology utilization, limited experience, insufficient technical support, financial support, time, and administrative assistance. Another, research which supports the findings of this study is congruent with the idea of Dela Rosa (2016) which stated that the lack of ICT resources, lack of Internet access and lack of computers, prevents the efficient integration of ICT in classroom instruction. These affects the entire implementation process of digital technology negatively especially if left unaddressed. In addition, the implementation of educational innovations of teachers are influenced by various factors (Georgiou & Ioannou, 2019). The integration of new instructional technology can pose challenges for teachers, making it difficult for them to incorporate it seamlessly and effectively into their classrooms. Technological integration presents significant obstacles for educators across all levels of the education system, such as acquiring new technology equipment to adapting curricula and teaching methods to include new educational resources (Irgashevich, 2020).

In the context of this study, tenured teachers faced challenges in innovating ICT related instructions. They feel that not being introduced with the use of ICT and their tenure in the teaching industry influenced their capacity to utilize technology effectively. Also, being tenured slows the integration process because of the factors which brought by outdated hardware and internet connection issues which was stated in the study of Njenga (2015) that unstable internet connectivity and the costs that goes with it impeded the integration of ICT

effectively. However, based on the findings students that were knowledgeable about technology decreases their distress as they were able to get assistance from learners in the integration process.

#### **Experiencing Lack of Know-How and Interest**

Lack of knowledge is a significant factor why teachers are reluctant in integrating technology in classroom instruction. Findings showed that their interest in integrating technology were less evident and that they need peers to guide them in the integration process because they lack the skills and knowledge in integrating technology in classroom instruction.

The findings were validated by the study of Smith and Johnson (2019) which stated that resistance to change is one of the challenges of tenured teachers in adopting technological practices. Also, in the studies conducted by Soomro *et al.* (2020) and Noor *et al.* (2020), it was found that teachers exhibited reluctance in incorporating ICT into their instructional practices. This resistance was primarily attributed to the insufficient infrastructure and lack of technological competencies.

Similarly, Tusiime, Johannesen, and Gudmundsdottir (2020) stated that teachers' factors such as lack of confidence, consistency of the teachers, and the technical qualification in ICT integration emphasized that lack of skills in ICT integration among teachers made them anxious in using technology. Therefore, lacking the confidence made them reluctant in applying ICT when teaching. Similarly, Bala and Tao (2018) pointed out that when it comes to incorporating technology into their teaching, teachers face similar obstacles worldwide. These challenges include limited exposure to technology, insufficient expertise, lack of technical assistance, financial constraints, time constraints, and inadequate administrative backing.

In the context of this study the following literatures supports the findings that indeed teachers experience lack of know-how affects the integration process and spurs their reluctance and dislike in using technology related instruction. On the other hand, their lack of know how were supported by seeking help from peers and applying experiential strategies for learners in which they would make their learning material with the use of technology or ICT tools.

#### **Experiencing Difficulty in Access to Resources and Learning Materials**

Indeed, it's a challenge for tenured teachers to adapt in the technology integration process if there are inadequate access to resources and learning materials. Findings showed that tenured teachers experience difficulties such as lack of resources, outdated ICT hardware, and internet connection problems which makes it difficult for them to integrate technology in classroom instruction.

Results of this study is in line with the research of Acabal and Casingal (2018) which found that the integration of emerging technologies in Philippine education faces

challenges, including insufficient infrastructure and resources. As a result, insufficient internet connectivity and restricted availability of devices and software impede the successful implementation of technology in the classroom. In addition, the study of Akram *et al.*, (2021a) stated that there are various factors that hinder the successful utilization of ICT in classrooms, this includes absence of ICT infrastructure and inadequate access to electricity and internet (Akram *et al.*, 2021b). Also, the study Dela Rosa (2016) stated that the lack of ICT resources, such as lack of Internet access and lack of computers, prevents the efficient integration of ICT in classroom instruction. These affects the entire implementation process of digital technology negatively especially if left unaddressed. Similarly, Alkahtani (2017) in the study about the difficulties involved in integrating ICT into the teaching process in Saudi Arabian schools revealed that inadequate equipment is one of the barriers to teachers integrating ICT into their classroom instruction. Further, internet connection was also mentioned as one of the key barriers of tenured teachers in the technology integration process, this was also supported by the study of Njenga (2015) which revealed that unstable internet connectivity and the costs that goes with it impeded the integration of ICT effectively. In context, access and availability of technology related infrastructure is relevant in supporting tenured teachers to integrate technology in classroom instruction. Also, this idea was supported by the study of Also, Asare *et al.*, (2023) which highlighted that the systematic review also emphasized how important it is to have the right infrastructure and technical assistance in place before attempting to deploy technology-enhanced language instruction. The successful incorporation of information technology in the classroom depends on having access to dependable internet connectivity, well-equipped computer labs, and qualified teachers.

#### **Coping Mechanism of Tenured Teachers in Integrating Technology in Classroom Instruction**

Based on the findings on the experiences of tenured teachers, there are three major themes that emerged: 1) Consultation with Peers 2) Class Discovery and Experiential Learning 3) Self-Determination and Perseverance.

##### **Consultation with Peers**

Despite the difficulties and the lack of know-how of the participants in this study, they also shared some experiences in coping with the plights in technology integration. The support and guidance from peers were one of the key factors why tenured teachers were able to keep up with the trend and strategies in integrating ICT in classroom instruction.

This was aligned with the study of Tichenor and Tichenor (2019) which emphasized the significance of teacher collaboration in promoting student benefits. They highlighted that when teachers work together and collaborate, it positively impacts student outcomes and

learning experiences. Another study congruent to the importance of peer consultation is the idea of Bates *et al.* (2019), the research highlighted that when classroom teachers collaborate, one positive outcome for students is an enhancement in their academic performance. Also Limon (2015), to achieve innovative technological approaches to teaching and learning, school systems and teachers must work together in pursuing technology integration. In addition, assistance from colleagues inspire teachers and keep them motivated in the workplace (Van den Broeck *et al.*, 2016).

In the context of this study, the presence of knowledgeable peers in ICT who assist and guide tenured teachers helped them to ease the difficulty in integrating technology, consulting, and seeking support from peers taught them how to operate the basics and how to use the following in delivering classroom instruction.

### **Class Discovery and Experiential Learning**

With the present trends and technological innovation, a key factor to succeed is to create strategies and think of ways to cope with the needs of digital development. Based on findings, one coping mechanism of tenured teachers was to provide opportunities for learners to experience and discover techniques that corresponds to the needs of the technological period. This mechanism eases the difficulty of tenured teachers to cope with the technology integration process.

The result of the study is congruent to the idea of Bozkurt & Sharma (2020), which highlighted that learning platforms such as Google and YouTube supplements to the processing of knowledge of learners in numerous disciplines. The accessibility of these platforms fuels and reinforce a wider avenue of knowledge in different practices. Indisputably, providing opportunities to engage in such activities allows students to become proficient in different social and learning platforms which strengthens their needs. It was also highlighted that considering and responding to the needs of the learners in the present time is the best way to cope with the present teaching and learning processes. Furthermore, the following strategies employed by tenured teachers seems to align with the idea of Sendall, et. al (2016), the study revealed that students' learns' best when they are engaged in the experience than merely listening as a participant. This was also emphasized in the study of Jomezai *et al.* (2018) regarding the benefits of ICT integration at the secondary school level, signified that the teachers who use ICT in their instructional practices observed a significant improvement in students' participation in their learning activities. In context, tenured teachers also adapt to their difficulty brought by lack of knowledge towards technology is through challenging learners to create technology related materials and allow them to share their skills in class and learn strategies in experiential learning through presenting their output.

### **Self-Determination and Perseverance**

One key factor to succeed in adapting the technological

trend is to have a positive outlook towards accepting and applying relevant strategies in response to the needs of the learners in the present time. Despite being tenured, findings showed that the attitude of teachers showed determination and perseverance in accepting the challenge of the technology integration process.

Indeed, teachers' attitudes play a significant role in determining their behaviors when employing technologies in their pedagogical practices, as they respond either positively or negatively based on their experiences (Abbasi *et al.*, 2021). Also, findings in the study of Kilinc *et al.*, (2016) revealed that teachers must have a positive attitude to effectively transmit and integrate their technical talents into their subject area teaching. Moreover, according to the research conducted by Asadi, Abdekhoda, and Nadrian (2019), the willingness of teachers to adapt to technology integration has a positive impact on their level of success. In the context of this study, willingness to learn and positive attitude encourage tenured teachers to adopt the use of technology and inspire them to create presentations despite difficulty and time constraints in creating learning materials.

### **Insights of Tenured Teachers in Integrating Technology in Classroom Instruction**

Numerous insights from the participants were gathered expressing their thoughts and experiences in integrating technology in classroom instruction. The third research question has three emergent themes. (1) Improving Skills and Adapting Change (2) Best to Share and Learn from Peers, (3) Never lose hope and determination.

### **Improving Skills and Adapting Change**

The emergence of technology has been a great advantage in improving educational systems and teaching practices of educators. Indeed, the findings of this study showed insights from tenured teachers that talks more about the impact of technology, coping strategies and positive outlook towards learning and adapting the technology integration in classroom instruction. The results were validated by Lagura (2022) that the utilization of ICT resources in education can greatly enhance the learning experience, particularly when these materials are presented with pedagogical support, user-friendly navigation, reflective aspects, and a well-designed structure that fosters active learning and encourages students to actively engage with the content, rather than simply receiving information passively. Also, in a study conducted by Abrigo, Ocdol, and Sadia (2019), it was discovered that the integration of technology in the education system of the Philippines has led to positive outcomes such as increased student engagement and improved academic performance. The research also highlighted the effectiveness of educational technology in creating collaborative and interactive learning environments, thereby enhancing the overall learning experience.

Furthermore, the study emphasized that emerging technologies have played a crucial role in providing access

to high-quality educational content, ultimately resulting in improved learning outcomes. Moreover, Schul (2014) which stated that the development of technology integration opens new opportunities in the social studies classroom in the aspect of teaching and learning. In the context of this study, technology was indeed a great game changer for tenured teachers in delivering classroom instruction, tenured teachers appreciate its use because it improved their skills and helped them adapt to the changes of the teaching process. Also, with the use of technology and difficulty that they have experienced, they realized the value of openness, readiness, and flexibility in learning the technology.

### **Best to Share and Learn from Peers**

Indeed, the idea of integrating technology into practice requires a lot for tenured teachers. However, their insights lead to a result that to be able to cope with the needs of technological advancement, one should seek, share, and consult for assistance and learn from peers in the process. Findings of the study were congruent with Tichenor and Tichenor (2019) found that teacher collaboration also leads to improved instructional practices and increased student engagement. The study emphasized the importance of collaborative planning and reflection, where teachers can share ideas, strategies, and resources to enhance their teaching methods.

Similarly, Bates *et al.* (2019) emphasized the benefits of peer consultation among teachers. The study found that when teachers collaborate and consult with their peers, they gain valuable feedback and support, which in turn leads to improved instructional techniques and student achievement. The researchers highlighted the importance of creating a supportive and collaborative culture within school settings, where teachers can freely exchange ideas and seek assistance from their colleagues. Overall, these studies highlight the significance of teacher collaboration in promoting positive student outcomes. Collaborative practices among teachers not only enhance instructional techniques but also improve student engagement and academic performance. Therefore, fostering a culture of collaboration and peer consultation within schools can contribute to the overall success and growth of both teachers and students. In addition, findings proved that assistance from colleagues inspire teachers and keep them motivated in the workplace (Van den Broeck *et al.*, 2016). In context, the journey of tenured teachers in learning technology is found to be best when shared and learnt from peers. Peer tutoring encourages tenured teachers to apply technology in class and enable them to look positively with the relevance of using technology in classroom instruction..

### **Never Lose Hope and Determination**

Teachers positive outlook towards the relevance of technology in teaching learning process plays a great role to succeed in adapting to the technological trend of delivering classroom instruction. Indeed, results from the

third theme on the insights of tenured teachers showed emphasis on their character and beliefs towards the use of ICT and relevant strategies to improve the technology integration process. The findings of the study is congruent to the idea of Asadi, Abdekhoda, and Nadrian (2019), it was discovered that the level of success among teachers is positively influenced by their openness and readiness to embrace technology integration. Also, teachers' attitudes play a significant role in determining their behaviors when employing technologies in their pedagogical practices, as they respond either positively or negatively based on their experiences (Abbasi *et al.*, 2021).

In the context of this study, tenured teachers shared insights such as diligence, patience, and love for work, this was supported by the idea of Halder and Dutta (2014) of which in their study, it was discovered that personality traits is significantly a contributing factor to teachers' effectiveness in dealing with technology integration, the study proved that there are numerous explicit traits which correlate to teachers' efficacy.

### **CONCLUSIONS**

The study explored the lived experiences of tenured teachers in integrating technology in classroom instruction. Findings shows that tenured teachers teaching social studies faced challenges in the technology integration process most of them attended school way before the emergence of technological developments and its use in the teaching process. With regards to results, most of the tenured teachers revealed that they lack the knowledge to innovate and integrate effectively due to the reason that ICT integration were not introduced in their time and that there was lack of resources to access from. It was also significant in the findings that teachers were reluctant not because they do not want to integrate to technology but because they feel they lack the knowledge to do so. The need for technology is evident, but not all school and personnel especially tenured teachers are properly introduced about technology. According to research conducted by Abrigo, Ocdol, and Sadia (2019), it was discovered that the integration of technology into the education system of the Philippines has led to enhanced student engagement and performance. The study also observed that the utilization of educational technology has been successful in improving the learning process and fostering cooperative and interactive learning environments. Thus, introducing technology to tenured teachers, provision of sufficient access of ICT materials and support to solve their lack of know-how would encourage them to integrate technology in a way that would help in the teaching process.

However, the difficulties experienced by tenured teachers did not hinder them to continuously adapt the use of technology, it created a significant impact on the delivery of their lesson and their teaching performance. Moreover, guidance and assistance from knowledgeable peers, exploring strategies that are student-centered which focuses on providing learners an opportunity to show

their skills and expertise in technology related practices and participation in professional training course had become a contributing factor in the improvement of their teaching practice in technology integration. Furthermore, tutoring done by knowledgeable peers allows them to develop their skills with proper guidance and assistance on the basic use of ICT and stimulates their willingness to create learning materials that responds to the needs of the learners. Further, giving students the task and providing them experiential learning and class discovery related activities somewhat helped understanding the value of technology in classroom instruction not only on a student level but mostly in the teaching process, it adds to the idea of tenured teachers to integrate technological interventions. Also, it eases their distress in using technology when surrounded with learners who are knowledgeable about technology. Importantly, provision of training course, seminars and the likes were a contributing factor to suffice tenured teachers the needed skills in integrating technology in the teaching learning process. Through these trainings they would be able to grasp strategies and appreciate the usefulness of technology in education. In context, these were evident from the participants responses that one should be open to participate in trainings because this would supplement their ideas to improve skills and adapt strategies to progress in the technology integration process.

In addition, perception of tenured teachers towards technology integration based on the findings were found to be significantly relevant and beneficial for them. They perceived it as a key factor in improving their techniques and skills in teaching. Moreover, the attitude of tenured teachers towards exploring technology integration showed a significant predictor towards an improved delivery of classroom instruction which is relevant to the needs of the 21st century learners. Also, the belief and continuous response of tenured teachers to the use of technology enhances their capabilities in the long run. The results implied that the need for programs, trainings, and school level support such as conducting learning action cell sessions and monitoring the self-direction of teachers which were mentioned from the participants response should be considered, for this will give tenured teachers the idea how to not only utilize the technology but to fully grasp its relevance in the delivery of classroom instruction realizing the curriculum content of the system of education.

The result of this study affirmed the theories of Johnson and Johnson on Social Interdependence Theory (2008), Davis on Technology Acceptance Model (1989), Supers Development Self-Concept Theory (1973) as well as Writers on Cooperative Learning Theory (2018) which states that activities which involve assistance and collaboration from colleagues yield supplementary strategies in dealing with technology integration and that positive or negative feeling of teachers in performing target actions influence the integration process. Moreover, the results affirmed Super's theory which emphasize a

challenge for educators to adapt to the needs of learners that are more than half of their age while keeping the pedagogical foundations intact for successful learning but the role of teachers in the teaching process magnifies from sharing knowledge to designing an interactive strategy in the learning process which in turn stimulates learners' active participation. which was aligned with the theory of (Writers ,2018).

## REFERENCES

- Abbasi, W. T., Ibrahim, A. H., and Ali, F. B. (2021). Perceptions About English as Second Language Teachers' Technology Based English Language Teaching in Pakistan: Attitudes, Uses of Technology and Challenges. in *International Conference on Emerging Technologies and Intelligent Systems, (Cham: Springer)*, 314–325. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-82616-1\\_28](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-82616-1_28)
- Abrams, S. S., & Walsh, S. (2014). Gamified vocabulary. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, 58(1), 49-58. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jaal.315>.
- Abrigo, M. M., Ocdol, M. E. M., & Sadia, G. (2019). Computerization programfor Philippine public schools: An impact evaluation. *Philippine Journal of Development*, 46, 145-174.
- Acabal, J. M. R., & Casingal, C. R. (2018). Emerging technologies for K-12 education in the Philippines: A systematic review. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning*, 13(11), 17-33
- Adams, L. (2021). The impact of technology integration in second language instruction: A review of recent literature. *Journal of Educational Technology*, 36(2), 127-144.
- Agbatogun, A. O. (2012). Investigating Nigerian primary school teachers' preparedness to adopt personal response system in ESL classroom. *International Electronic Journal of Elementary Education*, 4(2), 377-394.
- Aguinis, H., & Solarino, A. M. (2019). Transparency and replicability in qualitative research: The case of interviews with elite informants. *Strategic Management Journal*, 40(8), 1291-1315.
- Ajowi, J. (2012). The Role of Guidance and Counseling in Promoting Student Discipline in Secondary Schools in Kenya: A Case Study of Kisumu District. *Educational Research and Reviews*. Macmillan
- Akram, H., and Yang, Y. (2021). A critical analysis of the weak implementation causes on educational policies in Pakistan. *Int. J. Human. Inno.* 4, 25–28. <https://doi.org/10.33750/ijhi.v4i1.104>
- Akram, H., Aslam, S., Saleem, A., and Parveen, K. (2021b). The challenges of online teaching in COVID-19 pandemic: a case study of public universities in Karachi. Pakistan. *J. Inf. Technol. Educ. Res.* 20, 263–282. <https://doi.org/10.28945/4784>
- Al-Alwani, A. (2005). Barriers to Integrating Information Technology in Saudi Arabia Science Education. Doctoral dissertation, the University of Kansas, Kansas.
- Aldosemani, T. (2019). Inservice Teachers' Perceptions

- of a Professional Development Plan Based on SAMR Model: A Case Study. *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology - TOJET*, 18(3), 46-53
- Al-Furaih, S. A., & Al-Awidi, H. M. (2020). Teachers' change readiness for the adoption of smartphone technology: Personal concerns and technological competency. *Technology, Knowledge and Learning*, 25(2), 409-432.
- Alkahtani, A. (2017). The challenges facing the integration of ICT in teaching in Saudi secondary schools. *International Journal of Education and Development using Information and Communication Technology (IJEDICT)*, 13(1), 32-51. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1142266.pdf>
- Almekhlafi, A. G., & Almeqdadi, F. A. (2010). Teachers' Perceptions of Technology Integration in the United Arab Emirates School Classrooms. *Educational Technology & Society*, 13(1), 165-175.
- Amankwaa, Linda (2016). Creating protocols for trustworthiness in qualitative research. *Journal of Cultural diversity*, 23.
- Amuko, S., Miheso, M. and Ndeuthi, S. (2015). Opportunities and Challenges: Integration of ICT in Teaching and Learning Mathematics in Secondary Schools, Nairobi, Kenya. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 6(24), 1-7. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1078869.pdf>
- Asadi, Z., Abdekhoda, M., & Nadrian, H. (2019). Understanding and predicting teachers' intention to use cloud computing in smart education. *Interactive Technology and Smart Education*, 14–27. <https://doi.org/10.1108/ITSE-05-2019-0019>
- Asare, S., Amidu, A., Aning, E., Ampomah, T., Bediako, Y. A., Amuafu, E., & Baah, K. B. (2023). The Impact of Integrating Information Technology in Teaching English in College of Education: A Systematic Review. *American Journal of Education and Technology*, 2(3), 76-82.
- Aspers, P., Corte, U. (2019) What is Qualitative in Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Sociology*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11133-019-9413-7>.
- Bala, P., & TAO, I. (2018). An examination of technopedagogical competence and anxiety towards the use of instructional aids in teaching among senior secondary school teachers. *International Educational Journal Chetana*, 3(3), 95-114.
- Bates, A. W. & Sangra, A. (2011). *Managing Technology in Higher Education: Strategies for Transforming Teaching and Learning*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.
- Bates, S. M., Mellin, E., Paluta, L. M., Anderson-Butcher, D., Vogeler, M., & Sterling, K. (2019). Examining the influence of interprofessional team collaboration on student-level outcomes through School–Community partnerships. *Children & Schools*, 41(2), 111-122. <https://doi.org/10.1093/cs/cdz001>
- Becta (2008). *Harnessing Technology: Schools Survey 2008*. Retrieve October 20, 2011
- Beemsterboer, P. (2019). Beneficence, Ethics in Dentistry: Part I - Principles and values, CE Course, dentalcare.com. Dentalcare.Com. <https://www.dentalcare.com/en-us/professional-education/cecourses/ce510/beneficence>
- Bingimlas, K. (2009). Barriers to the Successful Integration of ICT in Teaching and Learning Environments: A Review of the Literature. *EURASIA Journal of Mathematics, Science and Technology Education*, 5(3), 235-245. <https://doi.org/10.12973/EJMSTE/75275>.
- Bonifacio, A. (2013). Developing Information Communication Technology (ICT) Curriculum Standards for K-12 Schools in the Philippines. Paper presented at the The Sixth Conference of MIT's Learning International Networks Consortium (LINC), MIT, Cambridge, Massachusetts, USA.
- Bordbar, F. (2010). English teachers' attitudes toward computer-assisted language learning. *International Journal of Language Studies*, 4(3), 27-54
- Bozkurt, S., & Sharma, K.A. (2020). Understanding students' experiences in a PE, health and well-being context: a self-determination theory perspective. *Curriculum Studies in Health and Physical Education*, 9(2), 157-173.
- Broeck Anja Van D., Ferris, Lance D. & Rosen, Christopher C. (2016) *A review of Self-Determination Theory's Basic Psychological Needs at Work*, 42(5).
- Burns, A., & Burns, R. (2010). *Basic Marketing Research* (2nd ed.). Pearson Education
- Caluza, B., Las Verecio, R., Grace D. Funcion, D., A. Quisumbin, L., A. Gotardo, M., Lester P. Laurente, M., . . . Marmita, V. (2017). An Assessment of ICT Competencies of Public School Teachers: Basis for Community Extension Program, 22.
- Canuel, R. (2011). Technology in Education: Research Says!! *Education Canada*, 51(2), 33.
- Cassim, K. M., & Obono, S. E. (2011). On the factors affecting the adoption of ICT for the teaching of word problems. In *Proceedings of the World Congress on Engineering and Computer Science*, 1, 19- 21.
- Caulfield, J. (2020). How to do thematic analysis | A step-by-step guide & examples. Scribbr. Retrieved from <https://www.scribbr.com/methodology/thematic-analysis/>. Date Retrieved June 21, 2021
- Chan ZCY, Fung Y-I and Chien W-t (2013) Bracketing in phenomenology: Only undertaken in the data collection and analysis process? *The Qualitative Report* 18(30), 1–9.
- Chen, N. S. (2017). The effect of a blended learning environment on EFL learners' autonomous learning capacity and English proficiency. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 30(7), 669-691.
- Chere-Masopha, J. (2018). Personal landscapes of teacher professional identities versus digital technology adoption and integration in Lesotho schools. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 17(3), 28-42. <https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.17.3.3>
- Chigona, A., & Chigona, W.(2010).An investigation of

- factors affecting the use of ICT for teaching in the Western Cape Schools. *18th European Conference on Information Systems*.
- Choy, M., Suan, K. & Chee, L. (2012). Enabling Learning at the Workplace Humans first, Technology second: Adopting a Best-Fit Approach to Implementing ICT in Training.
- Çiftçi, S., Taşkaya, S.M. & Alemdar, M. (2013). Sinifogretmenlerinin fatih projesine ilişkin görüşleri. [The Opinions of classroom teachers about fatih project]. *Elementary Education Online*, 12(1), 227-240.
- Correos, C 2014, 'Teachers' ICT literacy and utilization in English Language Teaching, ICT & Innovations in Education', *International Electronic Journal* 2, 1, 1-25.
- Cox, M., Preston, C., & Cox, K. (1999a). What factors support or prevent teachers from using ICT in their classrooms? Paper presented at the British Educational Research Association Annual Conference. Retrieved on August 2, 2008
- Cresswell, J. W., & Plano Clark, V. L. (2011). *Designing and conducting mixed method research* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). A concise introduction to mixed methods research. SAGE publications.
- Davis, F., 1989. *A Technology Acceptance Model for Empirically Testing New End-User Information Systems: Theory and Results*. (1st ed) Massachusetts Institute of Technology.
- Davis, N. (2018). Digital technologies and change in education: The arena framework. Routledge, New York.
- De Oliveira, J., Camacho, M., & Gisbert, M. (2014). Exploring student and teacher perception of e-textbooks in a primary school. *Comunicar*, 21, 87-95. <https://doi.org/10.3916/C42-2014-08>.
- Dela Rosa, J. P. (2016) Experiences, perceptions, and attitudes on ICT integration: A case study among novice and experienced language teachers in the Philippines. *International Journal of Education and Development using Information and Communication Technology (IJEDICT)*, 2016, 12(3), 37-57.
- Demir, K., & Akpinar, E. (2018). The effect of mobile learning applications on students' academic achievement and attitudes toward mobile learning. *Malaysian Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 6(2), 48-59. <https://doi.org/10.17220/mojet.2018.02.004>
- Dunton, J. B., & Co, W. S. (2019). Spiral Progression Approach in Teaching Science and the Performance of Learners in District I, Capiz. *Journal of Physics*, 1254(1), 012045. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1254/1/012045>
- Elizabeth Wargo, Davin Carr Chellman, Kathleen Budge & Kathryn Canfield Davis (2021) On the digital frontier: Stakeholders in rural areas take on educational technology and schooling, *Journal of Research on Technology in Education*, 53(2), 140-158, <https://doi.org/10.1080/15391523.2020.1760753>
- Ertmer, P.A. (1999) Addressing first-and second-order barriers to change: Strategies for technology integration. *ETR&D* 47, 47-61.
- Ertmer, P.A., Ottenbreit-Leftwich, A., Sadik, O., Sendurur, E., & Sendurur, P. (2012). Teacher beliefs and technology integration practices: A critical relationship. *Computers & Education*, 59, 423-435
- Esguerra, D. J. (2018). DepEd urged to lighten teacher workloads following suicide reports, *Inquirer News*. INQUIRER.net.
- Etikan, I., Musa, S.B., & Alkassim, R.S., (2016). Comparison of convenience sampling and purposive sampling. *American Journal of Theoretical and applied statistics*.
- Fabito, Bernie & Ching, Michelle Renee & Celis, Nelson. (2018). Data Privacy Act of 2012: A Case Study Approach to Philippine Government Agencies Compliance. *Advanced Science Letters*. 24. 7042-7046. <https://doi.org/10.1166/asl.2018.12404>.
- Fisher, C., Dwyer, D. C., & Yocam, K. (Eds.). (1996). *Education and technology: Reflections on computing in classrooms*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Frye, Elizabeth M. et.al. (2010). *Internet Workshop and Blog Publishing: Meeting Century Social Studies Classroom*. Social Studies, Vol. 101, Issue 2, pp.46-53
- Georgiou, Y., & Ioannou, A. (2019). Embodied learning in a digital world: a systematic review of empirical research in K-12 education. In *Learning in a Digital World* (pp. 155-177). Springer, Singapore.
- Given, L.M. (2008). *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*, 2
- Gomes, C. (2005). Integration of ICT in science teaching: A study performed in Azores, Portugal. *Recent Research Developments in Learning Technologies*.
- Gorder, L. M. (2008). A study of teacher perceptions of instructional technology integration in the Classroom. *Delta Pi Epsilon Journal*, 50(2), 63-76.
- Graneheim, U. H., Lindgren, B. M., & Lundman, B. (2017). Methodological challenges in qualitative content analysis: A discussion paper. *Nurse education today*, 56, 29-34.
- Gray, L., Thomas, N., and Lewis, L. (2010). *Teachers' Use of Educational Technology in U.S. Public Schools: 2009* (NCES 2010-040). Washington, DC: National Center for Education Statistics, Institute of Education Sciences, U.S. Department of Education.
- Guoyan, S., Khaskheli, A., Raza, S. A., Khan, K. A., and Hakim, F. (2021). Teachers' self-efficacy, mental well-being and continuance commitment of using learning management system during COVID-19 pandemic: a comparative study of Pakistan and Malaysia. *Inter. Learn. Emv*. 2021, 1-23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2021.1978503>
- Halder, S., & Dutta, R. (2014). Exploring the relationship between teacher effectiveness and personality traits. Retrieved from <http://www.myresearchjournals.com/index.php/IJEM/article/view/691>.
- Hampton, D., Welsh, D., & Wiggins, A. T. (2019). Learning preferences and engagement level of generation Z nursing students. *Nurse Educator*, 45(3), 160-164.

- <https://doi.org/10.1097/NNE.0000000000000710>  
 Harrell, S. V., & Bynum, Y. P. (2018). Factors Affecting Technology Integration in the Classroom.
- Harris, J. B., & Hofer, M. J. (2011). Technological pedagogical content knowledge (TPACK) in action: A descriptive study of secondary teachers' curriculum-based, technology-related instructional planning. *Journal of Research on Technology in Education*, 43(3), 211-229.
- Hesse, B. & Leavey, 2006 The Practice of Qualitative Research. Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung / Forum: *Qualitative Social Research*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.17169/fqs-9.1.363>
- Hofer, M., & Grandgenett, N. (2012). TPACK development in teacher education: A longitudinal study of preservice teachers in a secondary M.A.Ed. program. *Journal of Research on Technology in Education*, 45, 83-106.
- Holloway, I. (2015). Basic Concepts for Qualitative Research. Blackwell Science
- Hong, J., E. (2016). Social studies teachers' views of ICT integration. *RIGEO*, 6(1), 32-48. Retrieved from <http://www.rigeo.org/vol6no1/Number1Spring/RIGEO-V6-N1-2.pdf>
- Hughes, J. (2005). The role of teacher knowledge and learning experiences in forming technology-integrated pedagogy. *Journal of technology and teacher education*, 13(2), 277-302.
- Hyndman, B. (2018). Ten reasons teachers can struggle to use technology in the classroom. The Conversation. Retrieved from <http://theconversation.com/ten-reasons-teachers-canstruggle-touse-technology-in-the-classroom-101114>.
- Ilisko, Dz., & Ignatjeva, S. (2014). *E-learning and education for sustainability*. In U. M. Azeiteiro, W. L. Filho & Sandra Caeiro (Ed.). Environmental Education, Communication and Sustainability series (pp.167-185). Peter Lang, Frankfurt am Main.
- Inan, F. A., & Lowther, D. L. (2010, April 18). Laptops in the K-12 classrooms: Exploring factors impacting instructional use. Retrieved from <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0360131510001119>
- Irgashevich, D. A. (2020). Methods of Using Cloud Technologies in Islamic Education Institutions. *METHODS*, 7(5)
- Israel, M., & Hay, I. (2006). Research ethics for social scientists: Between ethical conduct and regulatory compliance. Sage Publications Ltd.
- Janesick, V. J. (2015). *Contemplative inquiry: Practicing the Zen of research*. Walnut Creek, CA: Left Coast Press.
- Janggu, W. (2012). Understanding the Basics of Qualitative Research. Academia. [https://www.academia.edu/2321667/Understanding\\_The\\_Basics\\_Of\\_Qualitative\\_Research](https://www.academia.edu/2321667/Understanding_The_Basics_Of_Qualitative_Research)
- Jaschik, S. & Lederman, D. (2018). The 2018 Inside Higher Ed survey of faculty attitudes on technology. Washington, DC: Gallup
- Jogezai, N. A., Baloch, F. A., Jaffar, M., Shah, T., Khilji, G. K., and Bashir, S. (2021). Teachers' attitudes towards social media (SM) use in online learning amid the COVID-19 pandemic: the effects of SM use by teachers and religious scholars during physical distancing. *Heli* 7:e06781. 2021.e06781.
- John, O. P., Robins, R. W., & Pervin, L. A. (2011). *Handbook of personality: Theory and research*. New York, NY: Guilford.
- Johnson, A., Pollard, T., Shen, L. *et al.* (2016) MIMIC-III, a freely accessible critical care database. *Sci Data* 3, 160035 . <https://doi.org/10.1038/sdata.2016.35>
- Johnson, D.W., & Johnson, R.T., (2008). Social interdependence theory and cooperative learning: The teacher's role. The teacher's role in implementing cooperative learning in the classroom, 9-37.
- Kahveci, Ajda; Sahin, Nese & Genc, Sebnem (2011). Computer Perceptions of Secondary School Teachers and Impacting Demographics: A Turkish Perspective. *TOJET: The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 10(1), 71-80
- Keengwe, J, Schnellert, G., & Mills, C. (2012). Laptop initiative: Impact on instructional technology integration and student learning. *Education and Information Technologies*, 17(2), 137-146.
- Kılınc, Emin & Kılınc, Seray & Kaya, Mehmet Melik & başer, Enis & Er Türküresin, Hafize & Kesten, Alper. (2016). Teachers' Attitudes Toward the Use of Technology in Social Studies Teaching. *Research in Social Sciences and Technology*. 1. 59-76. <https://doi.org/10.46303/ressat.01.01.3>.
- Kim, C., Kim, M. K., Lee, C., Spector, J. M., & DeMeester, K. (2013). Teacher beliefs and technology integration. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 29, 76-85.
- Kubota, K., Yamamoto, R., & Morioka, H. (2018). Promoting ICT education in developing countries: Case Study in the Philippines.
- Kuh, G. (2018, January). High-Impact Educational Practices. Retrieved March 3, 2019, from American Association of Universities and Colleges (AAC&U): [https://www.aacu.org/sites/default/files/files/LEAP/HIP\\_tables.pdf](https://www.aacu.org/sites/default/files/files/LEAP/HIP_tables.pdf)
- Kulkarni, P. (2013). What is triangulation of data in qualitative research? Is it a method of
- Kyngäs, H., Elo, S., Pölkki, T., Kääriäinen, M., Kanste, O. (2011). Sisällönanalyysi suomalaisessa hoitotieteellisessä tutkimuksessa [The use of content analysis in Finnish nursing science research]. *Hoitotiede*, 23(2), 138-148.
- Lagura, R. (2022). The Effectiveness of ICT Integration in Teaching Science Concepts. *American Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Innovation*, 1(3), 11-20.
- Lai, E. R., & Viering, M. (2012). Assessing 21st century skills: Integrating research findings. Pearson.
- Limon, M. (2015). Home Economics Teachers' Usage of Information and Communication Technologies in Hong Kong and in the Philippines and its Implications. *International Journal of Academic Research*

- in *Progressive Education and Development*, 4(4), 21-30. <https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARPED/v4-i4/1865>
- Lincoln, Y.S. & Guba, E.G. (1985). *Naturalistic Inquiry*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Liu, F., Maitlis, S., Mills, A. J., Durepos, G., & Wiebe, E. (2010). Encyclopedia of case study research. *Encyclopedia of case study research*, 2.
- Liu, Y., & Szabo, Z. (2009). Teachers' attitudes toward technology integration in schools: A four-year study. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 15(1), 5-23.
- Lowther, D. L., Inan, F. A., Strahl, J. D., & Ross, S. M. (2008). Does technology integration "work" when key barriers are removed?. *Educational Media International*, 45(3), 189– 206.
- Mason, J. (2004) 'Qualitative interviews: Asking, listening and interpreting' in T. May (ed.) *Qualitative Research in Action*, London: Sage
- Matulac, M. (2004). Experiences in technology integration. ICTs in Basic education. First National Congress. Retrieved August 10, 2014, from <http://www.fited.org/ictcongress/paper/fullpapers/matulac.pdf>
- Mei, B., Brown, G. T. L., & Teo, T. (2018). Toward an understanding of preservice English as a foreign language teachers' acceptance of computer-assisted language learning 2.0 in the people's Republic of China. *Journal of Educational Computing Research*, 56(1), 74-104. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0735633117700144>
- Mishra, P., & Koehler, M. J. (2006). Technological pedagogical content knowledge: A framework for integrating technology in teacher knowledge. *Teachers College Record*, 108, 1017-1054.
- Moser, A., & Korstjens, I. (2018). Series: Practical guidance to qualitative research. Part 3: Sampling, data collection and analysis. *European journal of general practice*, 24(1), 9-18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13814788.2017.1375091>
- Mulwa, A.S. and Kyalo, D.N., 2011. The influence of ICT infrastructure on readiness to adopt e-learning in secondary schools in Kitui district, Kenya.
- National Education Association – American Federation of Teachers (NEA – AFT). (2008). Access, adequacy, and equity in education technology: Results of a survey of America's teachers and support professionals on technology in public schools and classrooms. Washington, DC: NEA.
- National Education Association. (2008). *Technology in Schools: The Ongoing Challenge of Access, Adequacy, and Equity*. Washington, DC: NEA Policy and Practice Department.
- Ndlovu, N.S., & Lawrence, D. (2012). The quality of ICT use in South African Schools. Paper presented at the Towards Carnegie 111 Conference. University of Cape Town 3-7 September
- Newhouse, P. (2002). Literature review: The impact of ICT on learning and teaching, Perth, Western Australia: Department of Education.
- Njenga, L. (2015). Challenges facing the integration of Information and Communication Technology in secondary schools in Thika division, Kiambu County. [Master's Thesis, University of Nairobi]. <http://erepository.mku.ac.ke/handle/123456789/2870>
- Orlando, J. (2014). Teachers' changing practices with information and communication technologies: an up-close, longitudinal analysis. *Research in learning technology*, 22.
- Pegler, K., Kollwyn, J., & Crichton, S. (2010). Generational attitudes and teacher ICT use. *Journal of Technology and Teacher Education*, 18(3), 443.
- Polkinghorne, D. (1989). *Phenomenological research methods*. In R. Valle & S. Halling (Eds.), *Existential phenomenological perspectives in psychology: Exploring the breadth of human experience* (pp. 41- 60). New York: Plenum. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4615-6989-3\\_3](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4615-6989-3_3)
- Polkinghorne, D. E. (2005). Language and meaning: Data collection in qualitative research. *Journal of counseling psychology*, 52(2), 137.
- Polly, D., Mims, C., Shepherd, C. E., & Inan, F. (2010). Evidence of impact: Transforming teacher education with preparing tomorrow is teachers to teach with technology (PT3) grants. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 26(4), 863-870.
- Postholm, M. B., & Skrovset, S. (2013). The researcher reflecting on her own role during action research. *Educational Action Research*, 21(4), 506-518. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09650792.2013.833798>.
- Punch, K. (2005) *Introduction to Social Research: Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches*. (2nd Eds), Sage, London.
- Rakes, G. C., & Casey, H. B. (2002). An analysis of teacher concerns toward instructional technology. *International Journal of Educational Technology*, 3(1).
- Random House Dictionary (2014). Etymology Dictionary. Random House, Inc. USA: New York. Retrieved August 10, 2014, from <http://dictionary.reference.com/>.
- Rourke, L. & Anderson, T. (2004) Validity in quantitative content analysis. *Educational Technology Research and Development*
- Schoepp, K. (2005). Barriers to technology integration in a technology-rich environment. *Learning and Teaching in Higher Education: Gulf Perspectives*, 2(1), 1-24.
- Schul, J. (2017). Clinical entrepreneurship: A student teacher assigning desktop documentary making. *Research in Social Sciences and Technology*, 2(2).
- Schul, James E. (2014). Film Pedagogy in the History Classroom: Desktop Documentary Making Skills for History Teachers and Students. *Social Studies*, 105(1)
- Sendall, P., Stowe, K., Schwartz, L., & Parent, J. (2016). High-Impact Practices: An Analysis of Select University and Business School Programs. *Business Education & Accreditation*, 8(2), 13-27.
- Shafeeq, C.P., & Baskaran, L. (2015). Factors Influencing Technology Integration in ELT. 38-45.
- Shenton, A. K. (2004). Strategies for ensuring trustworthiness in qualitative research projects.

- Education for information*, 22(2), 63-75.
- Sicilia, C. (2005). The Challenges and Benefits to Teachers' Practices in Constructivist Learning Environments Supported by Technology. Unpublished master's thesis, McGill University, Montreal.
- Smerdon, B., Cronen, S., Lanahan, L., Anderson, J., Iannotti, N., & Angeles, J. (2000). Teachers' Tools for the 21st Century: A Report on Teachers' Use of Technology. Statistical Analysis Report.
- Smith, R., & Johnson, D. (2014). The effects of multimedia enhancement in teaching college English. *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 13(1), 153-165.
- So, H. J., Jong, M. S. Y., & Liu, C. C. (2020). Computational thinking education in the Asian Pacific region.
- Soriano, J. and Vargas, D. (2021). Adequacy of Instructional Materials and Facilities for the Implementation of K-12 Basic Education Program. [https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=3813237](https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3813237)
- Super, D. E., & Jordan, J. P. (1973). Career development theory. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling*, 1(1), 3-16.
- Taguinod, R. J. F., Baylon, M. A. F., & Mirandilla, R. M. (2020). Integration of emerging technologies in Philippine education: Opportunities and challenges. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning*, 15(6), 122-136
- Taylor, Julie Anne & Duran, Mesut (2006). Teaching Social Studies with Technology: New Research on the Collaborative Approaches. *History Teachers*. 40(1), 9-25
- Tichenor, M., & Tichenor, J. (2019). Collaboration in the elementary school: What do teachers think? *Journal of Curriculum and Teaching*, 8(2), 54. <https://doi.org/10.5430/jct.v8n2p54>
- Trochim, W. M. (2006). Qualitative measures. Research Measures Knowledge Base, 361, 2-16.
- Türel, Y. K., & Johnson, T. E. (2012). Teachers' Belief and Use of Interactive Whiteboards for Teaching and Learning. *Educational Technology & Society*, 15(1), 381-394.
- Tusiime, W. E., Johannesen, M., & Gudmundsdottir, G. B. (2020). Teaching art and design in a digital age: challenges facing Ugandan teacher educators. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 7(6), 1-21. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13636820.2020.1786439>
- U. S. Department of Education, Office of Educational Technology. (2010). Transforming American education: Learning powered by technology. National Educational Technology Plan 2010. Retrieved March 20, 2015, from <http://nces.ed.gov/pubs2007/2007020.pdf>.
- Van Melle, E, Cimellaro, L, & Shulha, L. (2003). A dynamic framework to guide the implementation and evaluation of educational technologies. *Education and Information Technologies*, 8(3), 267-285.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Warschauer, M., Zheng, B., Niiya, M., Cotten, S., & Farkas, G. (2014). Balancing the one-to-one equation: Equity and access in three laptop programs. *Equity & Excellence in Education*, 47(1), 46-62
- Warwick, P., & Kershner, R. (2008). Primary teachers' understanding of the interactive whiteboard as a tool for children's collaborative learning and knowledge-building. *Learning, Media and Technology*, 33(4), 269-287
- Watson, G. (1999). Barriers to the integration of the Internet into teaching and learning: Professional development. Paper presented at the Asia Pacific Regional Internet Conference on Operational Technologies.
- Watson, J. H., and Rockinson-Szapkiw, A. (2021). Predicting preservice teachers' intention to use technology-enabled learning. *Comp. Edu.* 168:104207. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2021.104207>
- Wozney, L., Venkatesh, V., & Abrami, P. (2006). Implementing computer technologies: Teachers' perceptions and practices. *Journal of Technology and Teacher Education*, 14, 173-207.
- Writers, S. (2018). Current Trends in Online Education. TheBestSchools.Org. <https://thebestschools.org/magazine/current-trends-online-education>.
- Yalin, S. Karadeniz and S. Sahin, 2007. Barriers to Information and Communication Technologies Integration into Elementary Schools in Turkey. *Journal of Applied Sciences*, 7, 4036-4039.
- Yilmaz, A., & Aydin, S. (2019). Determination of quality standards for the content of science education teacher training programs and the admission of students: The study of scale development and application. *Online Science Education Journal*, 4(1), 44 - 65.
- Young, A. S. (2012). Personality style as a predictor of personal computer use in an older adult population (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses. (Order no. 1113340274)
- Young, S. C. (2003). Integrating ICT into second language education in a vocational high school. *Journal of Computers Assisted Learning*, 19, 447-461.
- Zhao, Y. (2007). Social studies teachers' perspectives of technology integration. *Journal of Technology and Teacher Education*, 15(3), 311-333.
- Zhao, Y., & Cziko, G. A. (2001). Teacher adoption of technology: A perceptual control theory perspective. *Journal of Technology and Teacher Education*, 9(1), 5-30.
- Zhao, Y., & Frank, K. (2003). Factors affecting technology uses in schools: An ecological perspective. *American Educational Research Journal*, 40(4), 807-840.