

Analysis the Construction Age of Mogao Cave 3 was in the Yuan Dynasty rather than Xixia(1038-1227)

Ping Wei

School of Art, Zhengzhou University, Zhengzhou, Henan 450001, China

Abstract: The fine wall murals in Mogao Cave 3 are the representative works of the late grottoes. About its era, there are many debates between the theories of the Yuan dynasty and Xixia(1038-1227) dynasty. The Xixia(1038-1227) spokesmen put forward five evidence, namely, the restoration of the ancient law by line-drawing, the popularity of the belief in the esoteric buddhism of Avalokiteśvara, the prosperity of Dunhuang in the Xixia(1038-1227) and the decline of the Yuan Dynasty, the similarity between the Avalokiteśvara images in the grottoes and the “Avalokiteśvara images in the Xixia(1038-1227)” unearthed in Khara-Khoto, and the similarity between the murals in the grottoes and the art of the Eastern Thousand-buddha Cave 7 in Guazhou which be identified as the Xixia(1038-1227) murals. In fact, none of these five evidences can be established, which in turn helps to prove that Mogao Grottoes Cave 3 is a Yuan Dynasty grotto. In addition, the feature of flying in Mogao Cave 3 is a long-lost Western Asian style, which is related to the status of the Semu people in the Yuan Dynasty. In the painting, the elements of the Taoist murals permeated in the Buddha's garment, and the Bodhisattva image appeared obvious secular tendency. From a historical point of view, since the Binwang royal family of Mongolia was stationed in Guazhou and Shazhou in the Yuan Dynasty, large-scale land reclamation was implemented here, resulting in a significant improvement in the political status and economic development of the two regions compared with the Xixia(1038-1227). It can be concluded that the Mogao Grottoes 3 was constructed in the Yuan Dynasty rather than Xixia(1038-1227).

Keywords: Mogao Cave 3, Xixia(1038-1227), Yuan Dynasty, Khara-Khoto.

1. Introduction

Mogao Cave 3 is the only grotto with the theme of Avalokiteśvara belief in the late period of Dunhuang grottoes. The wall murals in the cave is excellent, and ‘Its artistic achievements may not be beyond in the Dunhuang art or the whole Chinese painting history’ [1], only Yulin Cave 2 and Cave 3 of can be compared. The author believes that Yulin Cave 2 and Cave 3 should be the grottoes constructed by the adherents of the Xixia(1038-1227) at the end of the Yuan Dynasty. The owner of the grottoes is the Suwang 肃王 system of the Binwang 幽王 royal family in Mongolia, belonging to the royal grottoes of Mongolia. [2]

Scholars in the academic circle who pay attention to the construction age of the cave, mainly forming two viewpoints. One is the Yuan Dynasty theory. Duan Wenjie 段文杰 believed that the cave was constructed during the reign of Emperor Zhi-zheng 至正 (1341 – 1368). [3] After that, Li Yuebo 李月伯 believed that the artistic style of Mogao Cave 3 was greatly affected by the literati paintings of the Yuan Dynasty through the analysis of techniques and styles. [4] Later scholars have come from it, [5] Dunhuang Academy compiled Dunhuang Grottoes Content Directory 'and other long-term uphold this view. Secondly, Xixia(1038-1227) theory, which hold by Huo Xiliang 霍熙亮, Guan Youhui 关友惠, Sha Wutian 沙武田 and other scholars.

Scholars who hold the Yuan Dynasty theory has not demonstrated the view in detail, only to say that it has ‘obvious style of the Yuan Dynasty’, but the specific performance is rarely discussed. Adversely, the Xixia(1038-1227) theory first argued by Guan Youhui 关友惠, even think Mogao cave 3 is the earliest Xixia(1038-1227) grotto, [6] followed by Sha Wutian 沙武田, Li Guo wrote essays to demonstrate. [7] In the academic field of grotto art and

archaeology, both Guan Youhui 关友惠 and Sha Wutian 沙武田 have great achievement and influence, so, the scholars follow an avalanche of their views.

2. Refuting the Evidence about Xixia(1038-1227) theory

For the era of the Mogao Cave 3, the academic circle has long been based on the inscription of ‘Gan-zhou-SHI-Xiaoyu 甘州史小玉’ on the 14th day of the 17th year of the first lunar month in the cave, and directly set the age of the cave as the Yuan Dynasty. [8] In fact, SHI Xiaoyu 史小玉 is only a tourist, and the inscription is the tourist letter and gossip in the cave, which has nothing to do with the cave murals. It has been clearly identified by Huo Xiliang 霍熙亮, Guan Youhui 关友惠 and Sha Wutian 沙武田. [9]

What is ‘Xixia(1038-1227) artistic style’? Academic circles have always been entangled. [10] Here we may look at the definition criteria of the initiators of ‘Xixia(1038-1227) artistic style’:

.During the investigation, it is found that there are a number of caves in the original Song Dynasty caves, which are different from those in the late period grottoes of Return-to-Allegiance Army at Dunhuang from Family Cao during the Song Dynasty in terms of theme layout, artistic modeling and mural style. We believe that these caves should be completed during the governed by Xixia(1038-1227) dynasty in Guazhou 瓜州 and Shazhou 沙州. [11]

There is reason to doubt that ‘Xixia(1038-1227) artistic style’ is in the absence of basic standards in the state of hard-born choreographed, but the author thinks that those do not have the characteristics of the Song Dynasty artistic style caves are gradeified into cave in the Xixia(1038-1227) dynasty. The evidence that the Mogao Cave 3 is gradeified as Xixia(1038-1227) Grottoes is the ‘Waer-moon

Avalokiteśvara's statue in the front side niche (Figure 1). Sha Wutian 沙武田 speculated that 'the original statue in the shrine is a Avalokiteśvara', when discuss the statue with bamboo as the background, Sha Wutian 沙武田 analysed that may be a Bodhisattva statue similar to the Water-Moon Avalokiteśvara. In the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty, the water-moon Avalokiteśvara in Dunhuang Grottoes was the most popular, such as Yulin Cave 2 and Cave 3 and Eastern Thousand Buddha Cave 2 and Cave 5.' [12] From the perspective of bamboo background, it is reasonable to speculate that the statue is water-moon Avalokiteśvara, but it is difficult to prove that Mogao Cave 3 belongs to the Xixia(1038-1227) Grottoes because it is close to Cave 2 and Cave 3 of Yulin Grottoes and of Eastern thousand-buddha Cave 2 and Cave 5. The four caves listed by Professor Sha, in addition to the Eastern thousand-buddha Cave 5, the author have all done special research and analysed that the Yulin Cave 2 and Cave 3 belongs to the descendants of Xixia(1038-1227) in Yuan Dynasty, [13] and the Eastern thousand-buddha Cave 2 and Cave 5 belongs to the Yuan Dynasty grottos. [14] The Water-moon Avalokiteśvara statue in the niche, according to the Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes Content Directory [15] and Dun-huang-shi-ku-nei-rong-zong-lu 敦煌石窟内容总录 [16] are all designated as statues of the Qing Dynasty. However, according to the carbon-14 sampling and determination in 2018, it is the original work, only repaired in the Qing Dynasty. There is a row of pigs under the Buddha (Figure 2). According Tianxizai 天息灾 translated Fo-shuo-da-mo-lizhi-pu-sa-jing 佛说大摩里支菩萨经: Marīcīdevī 摩利支天 body is reddish yellow, its figure like sunlight and a tower overhead. Wearing blue clothes, favoring all kinds of dignity. Marīcīdevī has six arms and three eyes, pig heads around the seat. Left hand holding bow, worryless branches and lines, right hand holding pestle, needle, arrow. [17] Marīcīdevī have eight arms and three eyes, light shining, lips like Manjusaka. On the top of the pagoda there is Vairocana, Left hand holding Saraca-Dives-Pierre. rope, bow, worryless branches and lines, right hand holding gold clubbing, needle. [18] These two images should refer to the two statues of Marīcīdevī, namely the three-sided, six-arm image and the three-sided eight-arm image.' [19] These two images should refer to the two statues of Marīcīdevī 摩利支天, namely the three-sided six-arm image and the three-sided eight-arm image.

There is a line-drawing painting of the theme about Marīcīdevī 摩利支天 Bodhisattva description in the paintings unearthed from Dunhuang Tibetan cave, that is, P.3999, a collection of Birch and P.3999. The Marīcīdevī is located in the tower, and the four Bodhisattvas are drawn on the upper and lower sides of the tower, which means that the four Bodhisattvas are located in the southeast and northwest of Marīcīdevī. [20] Observing the western wall (Figure 1), it can be found that the niche is not just a square cave niche, the top of the niche has a trapezoidal niche, like the top of the tower ; it may be inferred that the four bodhisattvas outside the western wall and inside the western wall, up and down, may also be inferred that the four bodhisattvas around the main body, like the Marīcīdevī of the Tibetan cave paintings, is not the mandala of Avalokiteśvara.



Figure 1. Western wall of Mogao Cave 3.



Figure 2. Pig heads under Marīcīdevī in Western wall of Mogao Cave 3.

The belief of esoteric buddhism of Avalokiteśvara belief was not only prosperous in the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty, but also in the Yuan Dynasty. The composition and layout of the Tang Dynasty 's 'Thousand-hand Thousand-eye Avalokiteśvara' image [21] unearthed from Dunhuang Tibetan Canon No. 35 (Ch. lvi.0019) and the Southern Song Dynasty 's 'Thousand-hand Thousand-eye Avalokiteśvara' image [22] unearthed from Taipei Palace Museum are very similar to those in Cave 3 of Mogao Grottoes (Figure 4), reflecting that the Thousand-hand Thousand-eye Avalokiteśvara Picture with secret religion style is not unique to the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty, and is more common in the Yuan Dynasty. If we don't fully consider a variety of factors and just grasp the Protestant Avalokiteśvara as the basis for the cave dating to the Xixia(1038-1227), it is inevitably biased.



Figure 3. Thousand-hand Thousand-eye Avalokiteśvara Picture (Song Dynasty, Taipei Palace Museum)



Figure 4. Thousand-hand Thousand-eye Avalokiteśvara Picture in Mogao Cave 3

The fourth evidence of the Xixia(1038-1227) theory is the judgment of the history of the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty and the Dunhuang in the Yuan Dynasty. It is believed that Dunhuang was prosperous in the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty, but not in the Yuan Dynasty. ‘The Maritime Silk Road was opened in the Yuan Dynasty, and the He-xi 河西 area was declining.’ [23] ‘The Yuan Dynasty engaged in Buddhist activities in Mogao Grottoes, Yulin Grottoes and other places, especially the construction of caves was extremely limited.’ [24] Even some scholars believe that the Yuan Dynasty Dunhuang 'is no longer the transportation, business and travel through the town, but only the Yuan Empire a sand cover for the border city of Shazhou 沙州. [25] Since Dunhuang in Yuan Dynasty is very desolate, it is impossible to have the appearance of grottoes like Cave 61 and Cave 3 in Mogao Grottoes. These statements are very popular and influential. Unfortunately, they are completely inconsistent with the historical facts of Dunhuang. In the Yuan Dynasty, as the direct descendants of Genghis Khan, Bin king, Su king

and Xining king were stationed in Jiuquan 酒泉, Guazhou 瓜州 and Dunhuang, respectively, with prominent status, which was bound to be above the provincial level of Gansu. These will inevitably enhance the political and military status of Guazhou 瓜州, Shazhou 沙州 and Suzhou. Accordingly, the local economic strength will also be enhanced, providing corresponding human and material resources for the large-scale construction of Dunhuang Grottoes. [26] Therefore, the Guazhou 瓜州 and Shazhou 沙州 area was not as desolate as some scholars thought. On the contrary, its political and military status was very important in the Yuan Dynasty, and its economy was relatively developed. In particular, the Guasha area opened up wasteland in the Yuan Dynasty, with remarkable results, and became a model of the frontier wasteland in the Yuan Dynasty. [27]

Both Liu-zi-zhen-yan-jie 六字真言碣 in Mogao Grottoes and Renovation the Huang-qing 皇庆寺 Temple Stele all mentioned Shazhou 沙州 Road River Channel Division ', which should be subordinate to the General Administration of Shazhou 沙州 Road to promote water conservancy and repair river embankments. [28] The development of water conservancy can provide the necessary guarantee for land reclamation. The reason why some scholars in the academic circle attributed the large-scale caves of the Yuan Dynasty to the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty is that they misunderstood that Dunhuang was prosperous in the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty and had the ability to build large caves, while Dunhuang in the Yuan Dynasty was barren and uninhabited and had no ability to build large caves. On the contrary, Guasha, as the residence of the Mongolian royal family, is most capable of building large caves and drawing fine murals. From a historical point of view, Guazhou 瓜州 and Shazhou 沙州 belong to Xixia(1038-1227) area for a hundred years, but their political and economic status is not important, or even very secondary. In the ' Song History · Xia Guo Zhuan ', Shazhou 沙州 was only mentioned twice. Guazhou 瓜州, as the seat of Xiping Military Division, was only occasionally mentioned. [29] The Decree of Tiansheng Reforming the Old New Law "promulgated by Xia-Ren-zong 夏仁宗 stipulates that all local divisions should limit their reporting of local financial situation to the central government. It takes one report in three months for the Beijing division and its vicinity, and one report in six months for Suzhou and Heishui, with only two exceptions, requiring one annual report, namely Shazhou 沙州 and Guazhou 瓜州. [30] In addition to the factor of remoteness, there is no doubt that economic status is not important. In the Xixia(1038-1227) period, Guazhou 瓜州 and Shazhou 沙州 prospered without knowing the basis.

3. On the Similarities and Differences Between Avalokiteśvara Images in Khara-Khoto and Avalokiteśvara in Mogao Cave 3

As is known to all, Khara-Khoto is located near Ejina Banner, Inner Mongolia. As a necessary place for the north of the desert to Corridor, it has an important strategic position. Since Song-bao-yuan-nian 宋宝元年 (1038), it has been occupied by the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty and set up Yanjunsu in Heishui Town, which lasted nearly 180 years. After 1226, it returned to the Yuan Dynasty and became the seat of Yijinailu General Administration. Since 1908, a large

number of literature scrolls and Buddhist works have been unearthed at the site of Khara-Khoto, including scrolls, silk cloth, Tangka and woodcut Buddhist paintings. Russian Orientalist Odenburg first made a systematic analysis of these works. It is believed that only part of these Tibetan works has the Tibetan style, and their works are deeply influenced by the art and culture of the Central Plains. [31] Kochanov said, 'Basically, Buddhism accepted and spread in Xixia(1038-1227) belongs to Han Buddhism.' [32] Menglev has different views that the Xixia(1038-1227) Buddhism embodies more Tibetan Buddhist characteristics than Chinese Buddhism. [33] Monlev is concerned about the documents unearthed in Khara-Khoto, and there is no strict distinction between the Xixia(1038-1227) literature and the Xixia(1038-1227) literature of descendants in Yuan Dynasty. As for the era of silk paintings in Khara-Khoto, publisher Samaxiuk asserts: 'We can be sure that the Tibetan Thangka unearthed in Khara-Khoto will not be produced before the middle of the 12th century, but at the end of the 14th century. [34] Gardner attributed Tibet's Tangka unearthed in Khara-Khoto to the 12th and 14th centuries, [35] namely the Xixia(1038-1227) and Yuan Dynasties. Both the Central Plains and Tubo cultures have an interactive impact on the Xixia(1038-1227) culture, forming a unique 'Hanbo artistic style' [36], and the art works are common in Khara-Khoto relics. The research on the literature of Khara-Khoto, especially the works of art in the academic circles of the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty in China generally only paid attention to the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty, but ignored the problem that Buddhism and Buddhist art in Khara-Khoto were equally prosperous in the Yuan Dynasty. In the study of Xixia(1038-1227) literature or unearthed objects with Xixia(1038-1227) style, there is little in-depth and detailed research on their ages. Unless there is definite evidence to gradeify them into the Yuan Dynasty, they are generally gradeified into Xixia(1038-1227).[37] From this standpoint, with plausible evidence as a supporting point for the so-called 'Xixia(1038-1227) Grottoes' qualitative is unreliable. The author recently observed that there are not only many unearthed objects in the literature of Khara-Khoto in the Yuan Dynasty, but also the objects of Liao, Jin, Song and Northern Yuan Dynasty. Even the Khara-Khoto ruins we see today are actually the Adherents of the Yuan Dynasty, not the objects of the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty. Because of the limited space, in other articles will be discussed in detail. Avalokiteśvara belief in esoteric buddhism is very popular in the Xixia(1038-1227) and Yuan Dynasty. To identify the construction age of Mogao Cave 3 the portrayal of Avalokiteśvara in art works is common occurrence. [38] It is necessary to discuss the Avalokiteśvara images in Buddhist paintings unearthed in Khara-Khoto.

4. The asymmetrical Threat Bodhisattva in Mogao Cave 3 and the flying of Western Regions artistic style

The western wall of Mogao Cave 3 has been discussed as the theme of Marīcīdevī. In addition to the four Bodhisattva in the western niche, there are four Bodhisattva in the niche. Interestingly, the Four Threatened Bodhisattva in the niche did not follow the symmetry of the altar city and the Pure Land Change towards the main portraits, but was free to stretch towards one side. There are two bodhisattva in the murals on the north side of the western niche. The bodhisattva

close to the niche is wearing white silk, facing the front and concluding the seal. The bodhisattva on the side is wearing yellow silk, and the head is on the micro side. Combined with ten seals, it seems to discuss Buddhism. The Bodhisattva near the inner niche on the south side is not facing the master, but slightly backward. Although the Bodhisattva behind it has been vague, it is still unclear that its fingerprints and postures are echoed with the Bodhisattva around it. It can be seen that the two groups of four-body Bodhisattva in the western niche have no rules to follow in the composition. This does not follow the fixed formula of religious painting, and the composition characteristics contrary to symmetric aesthetics are related to the social factors of the Yuan Dynasty.

The literati painting was popular in the Yuan Dynasty, and the literati painting and the prosperity of Taoism had a common era factor and internal spirit. [39] This makes the aesthetic fashion in the Yuan Dynasty coincide with Taoism. On the one hand, the literati's participation in Buddhist painting is different from that of folk painters. They are accustomed to placing personal personality ideals or meanings in their works and do not pay attention to the fixed procedures of religious painting. [40] On the other hand, Confucianism in Yuan Dynasty was rejected, Yuan Taizu Kublai even blamed Confucianism for the cause of national ruin of Jing dynasty. [41] According to Die-shan-ji 叠山集 wrote by Xie Fangde 谢枋得: 'Someone who silver-tongued eloquent sneered the confucian: The laws and statutes in our great Yuan dynasty, divide people into ten grades, the officials in the first grade; the bureaucrats in the second grade, give first priority because of dignity and beneficial to the country; the huntsmen in the seventh grade; the prostitute in the eighth grad; the Confucianism in the ninth grade; the beggars in the tenth grade, play them down a low level because without benefit to the country. [42] Therefore, the 'symmetrical beauty' derived from the Confucian doctrine of the mean is not the only aesthetic concept and rule system. The emergence of asymmetric Bodhisattva in the third cave of Mogao Grottoes is a concrete reflection of this concept.

In north moral in the Mogao Cave 3 described two flies. One have black hair, high nose beam and big eyes, coiled up two buns, wearing flowers in the hair, the bodily form is chubbiness and wearing a long dress (Figure 5); the other have gold hair, coiled up two buns, also have high nose beam and big eyes, holding white lotus ride clouds from the sky. (Figure 6) The two flies have not seen the attitude and style of Buddhist flying sky, but are likes two Taoist fairchild.



Figure 5. Flying sky on the North Wall of Mogao Cave 3



Figure 6. Flying sky on the North Wall of Mogao Cave 3

The two flying shows the facial features of Central Asian and Western Asian nations. In the late Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty, the Dang-xiang 党项 national characteristics were integrated into the clothing and facial features. Sha Wutian 沙武田 and Li Guo noticed that the painting method of flying in a cloud like Cave 3 was the unique expression of Xixia(1038-1227), such as a circle of various auspicious animals on the top of Yulin Cave 3 and Cave 10 of, that is, the whole painting was in the cloud, belonging to the same artistic expression. This painting technique also allows us to think of the Buddhist nun image portraited on the south wall of aisles in Mogao Cave 61 of the Xixia(1038-1227) is also a similar method. [43] However, Mogao Cave 61 and Yulin Cave 3, as examples of the two evidences, are the caves of the Yuan Dynasty and belong to the royal caves of the Mongolian Bin family. [44] As for the Yulin Cave 10, in the author's opinion, it should also be refurbished in the Yuan Dynasty, it will be confirmed in the future.

In 20th century, The Germany Tu-lu-fan 吐鲁番 Expedition found a cave of the 5-6 century central Asian style fly image in eastern of Xinjiang province.(Figure 7) This flying image is a part of the sutra painting of the Tang Dynasty. The fly coiled up a high bun, peel silk and dress flutter backward upward, can be seen from the upward subduction downward posture. German scholar Lecock believed that this flying image was created by the image of Nike, the goddess of victory in Greek and Roman art, and gradually accepted the artistic style of Central Asia, and the downward posture is similar with the Fly in Mogao Cave 3. In contrast, the hair color and pupil color of the third cave are varied colors. The Semuren in Yuan dynasty, their appearance and colour are different from those of Mongolians, Hans and Nanren. They are mainly ethnic minorities in the northwest and include foreigners from India, Western Asia and Eastern Europe. [45]



Figure 7. Kumtura Grotto Cave 73 Central Asian artistic Flying Sky (Berlin Museum of Indian Art, Germany)

The Yuan Dynasty land area is vast territory, to the east can reach Liaodong 辽东, to the west can reach Central Asia, Western Asia, [46] so in the hinterland of the Yuan Empire there are many immigrants from Central and Western Asia, an important part of the 'Semu 色目'. The governor of Mongolia rose sharply depended on the rule of the Semu people represented by the Da-shi 大食, Uighur, Tibetan and Xixia(1038-1227) adherents, so the political status of the Semu people in the Yuan Dynasty was high and their activities were frequent. [47] Such as Liu-zi-zhen-yan-jie 六字真言碣 in the Mogao Cave wrote by six languages, Sanskrit, Tibetan, Uighur, Basiba, Xixia(1038-1227) and Chinese. The people who using Tibetan, Uighur and Xixia(1038-1227) languages all are part of 'Semu 色目'. A number of builder of Liu-zi-zhen-yan-jie 六字真言碣 have Muslim background. Such as the host of builder, Su-lai-man 速来蛮, the name root in transliteration of the Arabic(Sulaimān), means creditably; Yangasha, the first son of Sulaiman, his name is comprised of Turkic(Yaghan) and Farsi(Shāh); Sudansha, the second son of Sulaiman, his name is comprised of transliteration of Arabic(Sultān) and Farsi(Shāh). The original intention of Sultān means 'power' or 'authority' and Shāh means 'King'. Shāh used to be called the ruler of the Muslim country, here as a name; the city piers of Chuangyang City in Guazhou 瓜州 are round, which is obviously affected by Islamic culture. [48] Facial features of flying in Mogao Cave 3 reflect the long-disappeared features of the Western Regions, which are related to the appearance of coloured people in the Yuan Dynasty.

5. Characteristics of Yuan Dynasty in Mogao Cave 3 from Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城, Shanxi 山西) Murals

Yuan dynasty divide people into four grades, Han-ren 汉人 and Nan-ren 南人 were discriminated. Many literati and officialdom were frustrated because there have highly talented, but their careers were bumpy and repeatedly excluded. In addition to the influence of Zen, the concept of peace and quiet and doing nothing(on purpose) in the philosophy of birth was in line with the mood of literati and

officialdom at this time. Therefore, they lived in seclusion and lived in a clear and bitter life. They expressed their personal aspirations by calligraphy and painting, so that, they did not pursue the rich and beautiful artistic style and highlighted the expressive power of ink painting. The pursuit of the nothingness and ease of the screen, in this social fashion, the Southern Song Dynasty aristocratic descendants Zhao Mengfu 赵孟頫 proposed:

Painting is important to use ancient techniques, if there is no ancient meaning, although delicate, but no meaning. People only know that neat, colorful, they feel that they are experts. But do not know if there is no ancient painting techniques, there will be a lot of problems. My paintings seem simple, but they follow the rules of ancient techniques. [49]

Because of this, Zhao Mengfu 赵孟頫 abandoned the style of painting that lacked the intensity of content and only focused on rich forms, and advocated the pursuit of the style of the Jin and Tang Dynasty. For example, Gu Kaizhi 顾恺之, a painter in the Eastern Jin Dynasty, Wu Daozi 吴道子, and Li Gonglin 李公麟 etc. Yun Ge 恽格, one of the artist in Qing Dynasty", commented on the achievements of Yuan Dynasty painting's brush and ink is perfect. [50]

The aesthetic fashion of the Yuan Dynasty not only appeared in the mural creation in the Central Plains, but also in the Arzhai Grotto in Inner Mongolia. Arzhai grotto is located in the Albas Sumu Hudug village, Etuoke Banner, Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region. The murals mostly show the images of Tibetan Buddhism and Mongolian folk life. The mural pictures in the 31st cave of the Yuan Dynasty (Figure 8) [51] of the Arzhai grotto appear to have been repeatedly modified, but the writing method is pure, the lines are coarse and uniform, and the lines are extremely smooth. The basic belongs to the gaogu yousimiao 高古游丝描 shows a superb technical level, which is valued by the academic circles.



Figure 8. Arzhai Cave 31 Pishamen Heavenly King (Yuan Dynasty)

There are supporters in the east wall of the 31st cave in the Arzhai Grotto, but they are not as prominent as Dunhuang Grottoes in the Tang and Five Dynasties, but drawn in a

secondary position, they are relatively rough and should not be drawn during the prosperous period of Mongolian aristocrats. [52] In addition, the six-track circuit diagram of the west wall of the 31st cave in the Arzhai Grotto is mixed with all aspects of Mongolian folk customs in the composition of the content. In particular, in the second layer of the six-track circuit diagram, there are scenes of confrontation between the two forces, which should reflect the social unrest and frequent wars in the Mongolian area. [53] According to the inheritance of artistic style and the content and form characteristics of murals in Cave 31 of Arzhai Grotto, it can be inferred that the construction time of Cave 31 of Arzhai Grotto should be in the middle and late Yuan Dynasty.

The Yuan Dynasty land area is vast territory, and the trend of restoring the ancients by line drawing, which was rising from literati painters, was not confined to the Central Plains, but the Inner Mongolia grassland area that was not the sacred place of Buddhism and the cultural center. It can be seen that the influence of literati painting in the Yuan Dynasty was very profound and broad. Therefore, it was reasonable that the literati painting fashion spread to Dunhuang, the Buddhist activity center that had been incense throughout the ages, and was respected and referenced by mural painters. This may be the reason why the murals in Cave 3 of Mogao Grottoes had a strong style of literati painting in the Central Plains. In the blank of murals in the 31st and 32nd cave of Arzhai Grotto, it is found that Mongolian words about mural production methods such as 'no paint', 'colorless', 'blank' or 'green' and 'blue' are marked. It can be seen that the painters at that time knew Mongolian and used Mongolian as a communication language. [54] Arzhai Cave 31 and Cave 32 are represented by Tibetan esotericism, and the master of Cave 31 is a thousand-handed and thousand-eyed audio-visual statue. [55] The repeated repetition of the synonyms of 'no pigment' 'colorless' 'blank' and may be the emphasis on the picture requirements — blank. In contrast, Mogao Cave 3 is also a secret religious theme with thousands of hands and thousands of eyes. Not only is there a large number of white left in the murals, but also the headwear and clothing of auspicious days, Ni-qian-zi 尼乾子 and two flying days in the northern wall are decorated with green color. Combined with the marking notes of the Arzhai grotto painters, it may be bold to speculate that the large number of blanks left in the murals of the third grotto in the Mogao Grottoes may be an important reason for the picture requirements for the production of the dense religious murals in a specific period of the Yuan Dynasty, in addition to the reasons for the use of white drawing as a technique of expression.

Since ancient times, the painters who participated in religious painting in the history of Chinese painting have been divided into two categories. One is folk painters, and the other is literati painters. [56] Although Mogao Cave 3 cannot be determined from which type of painters, it can be concluded that there should be no painting academy in the Yuan Dynasty, and the cultural policy of the Yuan Dynasty was also very loose. The cultural level of the Yuan rulers was not high, so many rules and systems were not formulated. [57] Therefore, folk painters will be affected by literati painters to a certain extent. Two Hercules, (Figure 9) under the north wall of Mogao Cave 3, their beards and hair stand like hedgehogs, eyes are cracked, six arms are arranged as a wheel, with swords, pestle and other magic weapons. The ribbons, clothing, hair and thick and powerful muscles around him are characterized by various painting methods such as cloud flow

drawing, high ancient travel drawing and nail head mouse tail drawing, and strive to express different textures with different pen and ink techniques.

The image description of tian-peng marshal 天蓬元帅 in the murals of the Sanqing 三清 Palace of Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西) it was shelved for various reasons. It was not until the 2nd year Yuan-tai-ding 元泰定 (1325) of that the murals in the palace were completed. In the paintings, (Figure 10) had a pig mouth with two heads and four arms. He held spears, three-day fire prints, emperor clocks and spears, and beards and hair stand like hedgehogs. [58] Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西) fresco pen summary concise, lines are powerful, smooth and elegant, and strive to change, strengthen the decorative effect, make the picture full of realism. [59] The line drawing features of the Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西) are also reflected in the heaven dragon the eighth episode [60]in Yulin Cave 4 and the two hercules on the north side of Mogao Cave 3.



Figure 9. Luxuries under the south wall of Mogao Cave 3



Figure 10. Shanxi Ruicheng Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西) Tianpeng Marshal

Occasionally, the north wall of Mogao Cave 3 thousand hands thousand eyes below the sound of Bodhisattva on both sides of the painted auspicious heaven and Niganzi, auspicious day one hand holding lotus, one hand standing palm, solemn ; Niganzi clasping hands, and his brows were frowning, showing the two sight of seeing the Bodhisattva worship of Shiyin with thousands of hands and eyes. Although the green lotus crown and beard worn by Niganzi (Figure 11) are not very clear, they are generally similar to Xin-wen-zi 辛文子 (Figure 12), one of the ten sons of Xuan-yuan 轩辕 in the murals of the Sanqing 三清 Palace in the Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西). Mogao Cave 3

auspicious crown and facial features are also quite close to the Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西) murals in the fragrance of jade. Thus it can be seen that the image elements of Taoism on the infiltration of Christian murals.



Figure 11. Ni-qian-zi 尼乾子 on the south wall of Mogao Cave 3



Figure 12. Shanxi Ruicheng Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西) Xin-wen-zi 辛文子

In addition to the similarities between Mogao Cave 3 Grottoes and the murals of Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西), there is Shi-er-gong 十二宫 and the Er-shi-ba-xing-xiu 二十八星宿 in the south wall of the corridor in Mogao Cave 61,it should be the same auxiliary gods, and in the later period, there are cases where they are mixed with the animal images of the twelve zodiac signs. The origin of the zodiac is also related to the constellations in the sky, and the personification of the zodiac began after the Wei, Jin, Southern and Northern Dynasties. [61] The twenty-eight constellations in the Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西) are after the constellations are humanized (Figure 13), and the icons of the constellations are painted in the circle above the head, which is consistent with the expression of the twelve palaces in the corridor south wall of Mogao Cave 61 ,especially the twelve palaces. The Virgo in the middle, the two children are all dressed in typical Mongolian clothing (Figure 14), so early scholars generally presume that they were painted in the Yuan Dynasty. [62]



Figure 13. Er-shi-ba-xing-xiu 二十八星宿 in Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西)



Figure 14. Er-shi-ba-xing-xiu 二十八星宿 in the corridor north wall of Mogao Cave 61

The dragon pattern has been a noble totem symbol since ancient times, and the Yuan Dynasty was no exception. There are exquisite and unusual dragon patterns in the banners behind the Brilliant Light Buddha on the south wall of Mogao Cave 61. Different from ordinary dragon patterns, the dragon patterns in the banners have a unique feature that the lower jaw of the dragon is turned up (Figure 15), the head of the dragon hardly shows the upper jaw, and it has a short nose similar to that of a pig. Some scholars assert that this kind of lip-turning dragon is not seen in the Yuan Dynasty, and is more common in the relics of the 10th to 12th centuries (approximately equivalent to the Northern Song, Southern Song, Xixia(1038-1227), and Jin), so it is presumed that the Mogao Cave 61 belongs to the Xixia(1038-1227) dynasty. However, the author found more than one architectural component of the lip-turning dragon in the unearthed relics of the Sa-ban-Ling-gu 萨班灵骨 Tower site in Liangzhou 凉州, which conforms to the description above. There are lip-turning dragon patterns on the flags and seats of the Princess of the East and the Xi-wang-mu 西王母 in the murals of the San-qing 三清 Palace of the Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西) (Figure 16). It can be seen that in the Yuan Dynasty, the lip-turning dragon pattern was still active in sculpture and murals, and it is presumed that the murals in the corridor of Mogao Cave 61 belongs to the Xixia(1038-1227) dynasty are completely unreliable.



Figure 15. The lip-turning dragon on r south wall of corridor in Mogao Cave 61



Figure 16. Lip-turning dragon in the Yongle Palace(Ruicheng 芮城,Shanxi 山西)

6. Conclusion

Mogao Cave 3 is the only cave with Avalokiteśvara belief as the theme in the late Dunhuang grotto. Flying sky feature of Cave 3 of Mogao Grottoes is a Western Asian style that has disappeared for a long time, which is related to the large number and high status of Semu people in the Yuan Dynasty. In the painting, the Taoist murals elements infiltration in the Buddha, and the Bodhisattva image appeared obvious secular tendency. From a historical point of view, the Mongolian Bin family stationed in Guazhou 瓜州 and Shazhou 沙州 in Yuan Dynasty, and implemented large-scale land reclamation, which became the model of land reclamation in Yuan Dynasty. The political status and economic development level of the two places were significantly improved compared with the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty. All this is enough to infer that the third cave of Mogao Grottoes was constructed in the Yuan Dynasty, not the Xixia(1038-1227) Dynasty.

References

- [1] LIANG Yuying : Dunhuang Grottoes Art · Mogao Grottoes No.464,3,95,149 (Yuan dynasty)', Nanjing : Jiangsu Fine Arts Publishing House, 1997, p. 23.
- [2] YANG Fuxue & LIU Jing: Yulin Cave 3 was constructed on the Xixia Adherents in the Yuan Dynasty, Dunhuang Research,2022,No.4, (to be published).
- [3] DUAN Wenjie: Late period of Mogao Grottoes Art ', Dunhuang Research edited (Volume 5) of Chinese Grottoes · Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes , Beijing : Cultural Relics Press, 1987, p. 174 ; duan Wenjie : ' Late Mogao Grottoes Art ', ' Dunhuang Research ' No. 3,1985, p. 15.

- [4] LI Yuebo: Viewing the Artistic Achievements of Chinese Line Drawing from Cave 3 of Mogao Grottoes, *Dunhuang Studies*, No. 2, 2001, p. 16.
- [5] JIN Zhongqun :A Preliminary Study on the Mural Art of Yuan Dynasty in Dunhuang Qianfodong No.3 Cave, *Art*, 1992,No.2. p. 64-67; WANG Huiqin : The Light of Spirit - The Artistic Features of the Yuan Dynasty Murals in the Third Cave of Dunhuang Thousand Buddha Cave , *The Journal of Beauty and Times Fine Arts*, No. 10,2009, pp. 75-76 ; HAO Xiuli :Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes third cave thousand hands thousand eyes watching audiovisual plastic arts ', ' contemporary art ' 2011 No.3, p. 51-52. These papers are mostly focused on the description of mural art achievements, the argument is based on ' Ganzhou Shi Xiao Yu Bi ' notes, it is difficult to establish.
- [6] GUAN Youhui : Dunhuang Grottoes mural decoration style and related issues in Song and Xixia dynasty, *Dunhuang Academy* edited ,2004, Grotto Research International Academic Conference Papers ' (II), Shanghai : Shanghai Ancient Book Publishing House, 2006, p. 1110-141.
- [7] SHA Wutian&LI Guo: Mogao Cave 3 was constructed in the Xixia Dynasty, *Dunhuang Research*, No.4,2013, p. 1-11.
- [8] SHI Weixiang: The mural art of Mogao Grottoes and Yulin Grottoes in Tang dynasty,the Period of Five Dynasties,Xixia Dynasty and Yuan dynasty, *The Complete Works of Chinese Fine Arts · Painting Series 15 Dunhuang Frescoes (2)*, Shanghai : Shanghai People ' s Art Publishing House, 1985, p. 192. HE Shizhe : ' Look at the construction time of some caves in Mogao Grottoes from the record of the supporters, The record of the supporters of Mogao Grottoes in Dunhuang ' edited by Dunhuang Research Institute, Beijing : Cultural Relics Press, 1986, p. 233 ; Su Bai : ' Tibetan Buddhist Relics in Yulin and Mogao Grottoes, aboriginal 'Tibetan Buddhist Temple Archaeology', Beijing : Cultural Relics Press, 1996, p. 247 ; LIANG Weiyong : *Dunhuang Grottoes Art · Mogao Grottoes 464,3,95,149 (Yuan)* ', Nanjing : Jiangsu Art Publishing House, 1997, p. 23 ; REN Jiquan : Shi Xiaoyu and Qianshou Qianyan Guanyin murals, *Silk Road No.17*,2010, p. 58-61.
- [9] HUO Xiliang : The New Division of the Mogao Grottoes Uighur and Xixia Grottoes ', ' The Summary of the 1994 Dunhuang International Symposium Papers ', *Dunhuang Academy*, 1994, p. 54 ; Guan Youhui : ' Dunhuang Song Xixia Grottoes mural decoration style and related issues ', *Dunhuang Research Institute* edited ' 2004 Grotto Research International Academic Conference Papers ' (II), Shanghai : Shanghai Ancient Book Publishing House, 2006, pp.1136-1137 ; shawutian and Li Guo : The third cave of Mogao Grottoes is the research of Xixia Grottoes, *Dunhuang Research*, No.4,2013, p. 4-5.
- [10] YANG Fuxue : Call in Question to ' xixia art style ' in Dunhuang grottoes ', ' Heihe College journal ' 2019 issue 10, p. 26-29.
- [11] LIU Yuquan : Xixia Cave Periodization about Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes and Anxi Yulin Grottoes, *Dunhuang Research Collection*, Lanzhou : Gansu People ' s Publishing House, 1982, pp. 273-318.
- [12] SHA Wutian&LI Guo: Mogao Cave 3 was constructed in the Xixia Dynasty, *Dunhuang Research* ', No.4,2013, pp.10-11.
- [13] YANG Fuxue&LIU Jing : Yulin Cave 3 was constructed on the Xixia Adherents in the Yuan Dynasty, *Dunhuang Studies* Issue 4, 2022 (to be published).
- [14] WEI Ping&YANG Fuxue, Eastern thousand-buddha Cave 2 reconstructed in Yuan Dynasty rather than Xixia Dynasty. (to be published).
- [15] *Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes Content Directory* edited by Dunhuang Cultural Relics Research Institute, Beijing : Cultural Relics Press,1982, p.1.
- [16] *Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes Content Directory* edited by Dunhuang Cultural Relics Research Institute, Beijing : Cultural Relics Press,1996,p5.
- [17] Tian- xi-zai translated:Fo-shuo-da-mo-li-zhi-pu-sa-jing, *Da Zhengzang*, No.1257,p267a.
- [18] Tian- xi-zai translated:Fo-shuo-da-mo-li-zhi-pu-sa-jing, *Da Zhengzang*, No.1257,p267a.
- [19] LIU Yongzeng:Mandala Image Explanation of Molizhitian in Dunhuang Grottoes ', ' *Dunhuang Research* ' 2013 No. 5, pp. 1-11.
- [20] LIU Yongzeng: Mandala Image Explanation of Molizhitian in Dunhuang Grottoes ', ' *Dunhuang Research*, No. 5,2013,p10.
- [21] *Western Regions Art : British Museum (1)*, Tokyo : Lectures Society, 1982, Fig.18-1.
- [22] Taipei Palace Museum Editorial Board ' Guanyin Special Exhibition ', Taipei : Palace Museum, 2000, p. 58-59.
- [23] SHA Wutian&LI Guo: Mogao Cave 3 was constructed in the Xixia Dynasty, *Dunhuang Research*, 2013, o.4, p.61.
- [24] SHA Wutian&LI Guo: Mogao Cave 3 was constructed in the Xixia Dynasty, *Dunhuang Research*, 2013, o.4, NO.4, p.6.
- [25] XU Chang:Textual Research on the Fragments of The General Mirror of Zizhi from the North Mogao Grottoes, *Dunhuang Research*, 2011, No.5, pp.71-72.:
- [26] YANG Fuxue&LIU Jing : ' Rediscovering Yulin Cave 3 as the royal cave of Yuan Dynasty rather than the royal cave of Xixia ', ' *Image History Research* ' 2022 No. 2 (to be published).
- [27] YANG Fuxue & ZHANG Haijuan: The Mongolian Lord Bin Family and the Northwest Border Defense of the Yuan Dynasty, A Study of the History and Geography of China 's Border Areas ', 2012, No.2, pp. 31-32 ; YANG Fuxue & ZHANG Haijuan: From Lord Bin of Mongolia to Grand Chief of Yugur, *Gansu Culture Press*, 2017, pp. 79-81.
- [28] LI Yongning: *Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes Inscriptions and Related Issues (2)*, *Dunhuang Research*, 1982,No.2,p.110-114.
- [29] YANG Fuxue: Yugur and the Late Dunhuang Grottoes ', ' *Dunhuang Studies* ', No. 6,2017, p. 52-53.
- [30] SHI Jinbo&Nie Hongyin&BAI Bin annotation: *Tiansheng Revision of the Old and New Laws*, Beijing : Law Press, 1999, pp. 529-531.
- [31] Maria L. Rudova, "The Chinese style paintings from Khara Khoto", Mikhail Piotrovsky (ed.), *Lost Empire of the Silk Road. Buddhist Art from Khara Khoto (X-XIIIth Century)*, Electa: Thyssen-Bornemiza Foundation, 1993, p. 89.
- [32] Е. И. Кычанов, "Аосударство и буддизм в Си Ся", Л. П. Делюсин (ed.), *Буддизм ц осударсмво на Дальнем востоке*, Москва: Наука, 1987,стр. 143.
- [33] Л. П. Меньшиков, *Омсанце кцмайской часмц коллекци цз Хара-хото <фонд П. К. Козлова.>*, Москва: Наука, 1984, стр. 29.
- [34] Kira Fyodorovna Samosyuk, *The Art of the Tangut Empire.A Historical and Stylistic Interpretation*, Mikhail Piotrovsky (ed.), *Lost Empire of the Silk Road.Buddhist Art from Khara Khoto(X-XIIIth Century)*, Electa: Thyssen-Bornemiza Foundation, 1993, p. 82.
- [35] Robert Bruce-Gardner, "Some Observations on Comparative Technique Tibetan Style Paintings from Khara Khoto", Mikhail Piotrovsky (ed.), *Lost Empire of the Silk Road. Buddhist Art from Khara Khoto (X-XIIIth Century)*, Electa: Thyssen-Bornemiza Foundation, 1993, p. 100.

- [36] Kira Fyodorovna Samosyuk, "The Art of the Tangut Empire. A Historical and Stylistic Interpretation", Mikhail Piotrovsky (ed.), *Lost Empire of the Silk Road. Buddhist Art from Khara Khoto (X-XIIIth Century)*, Electa: Thyssen-Bornemisza Foundation, 1993, p. 66.
- [37] YANG Fuxue : *Yugur and the Late Dunhuang Grottoes* , *Dunhuang Studies*, 2017, No. 6, p. 52-53
- [38] SHI Jinbo : *A Study of Buddhism in Xixia* ', *Yinchuan : Ningxia People 's Publishing House*, 1988, p. 169.
- [39] HE Song : *A Study of Buddhism in Xixia* ', *Yinchuan : Ningxia People 's Publishing House*, 1988, p. 169.
- [40] SHAO Jun: *Overview of World Buddhist Painting Art* ', *World Buddhist Art Dictionary · Painting 1* ', Kaohsiung : Fo Guang Shan Zong Committee, 2013, p.18.
- [41] GAO Liangquan: *On the Reasons for the Prosperity of Quanzhen Doctrine in Jin and Yuan Dynasties*, *Journal of Shandong University (Philosophy and Social Sciences Edition)* ,2001, No.2, p. 36.
- [42] XIE Fangde ,*Die-shan-ji* ,*Song-fang-bo-zai-gui-san-shan-xu*,Vol.4,No.6.
- [43] SHA Wutian&LI Guo: *Mogao Cave 3 was constructed in the Xixia Dynasty*, *Dunhuang Research*, 2013, o.4, NO.4, p.6.
- [44] YANG Fuxue , : *Mogao Cave 61 Corridor Murals constructed by Xixia adherents in Yuan Dynasty* , *Xi-xia-xue* 2017 No. 2 (Total No. 15), Lanzhou : Gansu Culture Press. Yang Fuxue, Liu Jing : ' *Yulin Cave 3 was constructed on the Xixia Adherents in the Yuan Dynasty* , *Dunhuang Research*, No.4, 2022 (to be published).Yang Fuxue and Liu Jing : *Rediscovering Yulin Cave 3 as the royal cave of Yuan Dynasty rather than the royal cave of Xixia* , *Image History Research*,2022 No. 2
- [45] ZHANG Yonglu , : *Semu people in the Yuan Dynasty and cultural exchanges between China and the West* ', *Journal of Northwest University* ', 1986, No.2, 18-24 ,Stephen G. Haw, *The Semu ren in the Yuan Empire – who were they?* Paper presented at the conference 'Mobility and Transformations: New Directions in the Study of the Mongol Empire' (Joint Research Conference of the Institute for Advanced Studies and the Israel Science Foundation), Jerusalem, June 29-July 4, 2014.
- [46] SONG Lian,etc.: *Metahistory • Geography* ,Beijing, Zhonghua book company,1976,p.1245.
- [47] Chuantian Shanzhi 's 'Semuren' 'Mixiang-Yuanno Domination Policy ' *Shinika* No.11 2001, 16-21; Stephen G. Haw, *The Semu ren in the Yuan Empire – who were they?* Paper presented at the conference 'Mobility and Transformations: New Directions in the Study of the Mongol Empire' (Joint Research Conference of the Institute for Advanced Studies and the Israel Science Foundation), Jerusalem, June 29-July 4, 2014.
- [48] YANG Fuxue, *Dunhuang Islamic Culture in the Yuan Dynasty*, *Dunhuang Studies*, No.2,2018, pp.11-21.
- [49] TANG lin: *Commentary on Chinese Painting Theory • Yuan Dynasty Volume*, ZHAO Mengfu,Ding-wu-lan-ting-ba,Wuhan, Hubei Fine Arts Publishing House,2009,p27.
- [50] YU Anlan, *Painting Theory Series*,YUN Ge,Nan-tian-hua-ba, Beijing, People 's Art Publishing House,1963,p183.
- [51] BATU Jirigala& YANG Haiying ,WANG Dafang (proofreading), *Arzhai Grotto*, Cultural Relic Protection Management, Erdos, Otog Banner, Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region,2006,p96.
- [52] LI Yumeng : ' *Inner Mongolia Alzhai grotto 28-31 grotto murals observation* ', ' *Northern National Archaeology* ' episode 1, Beijing : Science Press, 2014, p. 354.
- [53] DONG Xiaorong,*Study on the Burial Customs of Mongolians and Six Roads in Cave 31 of Alzhai Grottoes* ', ' *Religious Studies* ' No. 4,2019, p. 112.
- [54] LI Shaobing, *Alzhai Grottoes*, Inner Mongolia Cultural Relics Archaeology ,2010, No. 2, p.109.
- [55] Batujiri Gala, Yang Haiying indigenous, Wang Dafang audit school ' *Alzhai grottoes* ', Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region, Ordos City, Etoke Banner Cultural Relics Protection Institute, Alzhai grottoes Protection Institute, 2006, p. 72-73.
- [56] SHAO Jun: *Overview of World Buddhist Painting Art* , *World Buddhist Art Dictionary · Painting 1* , Kaohsiung : Fo Guang Shan
- [57] HAN Qi&HOU Xinghai, *The Role of Confucianism, Taoism and Chan in Yuan Dynasty Painting*, *Art Observation*, No. 9, 1998, p. 62.
- [58] ZHANG Yinong&JING Kunjun : *Yongle Palace*, Taiyuan : Shanxi People 's Publishing House, 2006, p. 45.
- [59] ZHANG Yinong&JING Kunjun : *Yongle Palace*, Taiyuan : Shanxi People 's Publishing House, 2006, p. 47.
- [60] XING Yaolong & YANG Fuxue : *The fourth cave of Yulin Grottoes is the new evidence of the cave of Yuan Dynasty* , ' *Art History Research* ' Issue 26, Guangzhou : Zhongshan University Press, 2021, pp. 101-102.
- [61] 'The Transformation of the Image of the Twenty-eight Stars' in Chinese Paintings - A Case Study of the Murals of Yongle Palace in the Yuan Dynasty and the Water-and-Land Paintings of Baoning Temple in the Ming Dynasty, "Discussion with Artists, Number 10, 2008, p. 35.2008,No.10, p35.
- [62] *Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes Content Directory* edited by Dunhuang Cultural Relics Research Institute, Beijing : Cultural Relics Press, 1982, p. 21.Shi Weixiang:'The mural art of Mogao Grottoes and Yulin Grottoes in Tang dynasty,the Period of Five Dynasties,Xixia Dynasty and Yuan dynasty ', ' *The Complete Works of Chinese Fine Arts · Painting Series 15 Dunhuang Frescoes* ' (2), Shanghai : Shanghai People 's Art Publishing House, 1985, p. 192 (Revenue ' Indigenous ' *Studies on Dunhuang History and Mogao Grottoes Art* ', Lanzhou : Gansu Education Press, 2002, p. 328).