

The Impact of Extracurricular Tutoring on the English Achievement of Junior High School Students

-- Examining the influence of various factors in extracurricular tutoring

Jiaying Chen *

University College London, Institution of Education, London, WC1E 6BT, The United Kingdom

*stnzjc0@ucl.ac.uk.

Abstract: This paper employs quantitative research to examine the potential effects of English extracurricular tutoring on the academic achievement of secondary school pupils. The data utilized are sourced from the China Education Tracker 2013-2014, maintained by the China Centre for Data Surveys and Data (CEPS) at Renmin University of China. The analysis involved controlling variables to examine the impact of various influencing factors. These factors encompass the familial background of students, their economic standing, and the amount of time they dedicate to self-study. In summary, extracurricular tutoring has a beneficial effect on student accomplishment. Specifically, students who engage in extracurricular tutoring are more likely to attain superior academic outcomes compared to their peers who do not participate in such activities. Extracurricular tutoring has been a subject of intense controversy for a long time. The necessity of participating in extracurricular tutoring is constantly questioned, including the specific subjects covered and the level of student involvement.

Keywords: Extracurricular Tutoring; Qualitative Analysis; Student Achievements.

1. Introduction

The matter of extracurricular tutoring is consistently a subject of intense controversy. However, various variables influence extracurricular tutoring, regardless of the perspective. This scenario is quite widespread, especially in China. Due to the stringent college entrance exam rules, students are compelled to enhance their academic performance by using their particular learning aptitude to achieve higher marks. As a result, individuals have to participate in counseling sessions to enhance their level of proficiency. This trend contributes to the popularity of counseling classes [4]. Unlike other subjects, English tutoring classes are a popular choice for parents because English learning requires students to actively incorporate the language into their daily lives. There is considerable debate on the efficacy and impact of extracurricular tutoring on a student's academic achievement. In fact, extracurricular tutoring can be approached from various perspectives. The tutor's qualifications and teaching methods, as well as the student's motivation and family history, impact tutoring outcomes [6].

The potential influence of extracurricular tutoring on students' academic performance, its capacity to increase psychological stress among kids, and the question of whether parents should enroll their children in extracurricular tutoring has been a subject of extensive debate for several years. Currently, with the ongoing advancement of technology, there is a growing interest in incorporating information technology into the conventional practice of after-school tutoring [15]. The majority of individuals hold the belief that the utilization of emerging technology can significantly enhance the efficiency of teachers' instructional methods. Additionally, it can offer pupils a more comprehensive and easily transportable educational setting. Integrating emerging technology into after-school tutoring helps broaden instructional materials, so granting pupils in remote places

more access to supplementary knowledge [3,6].

Extracurricular tutoring is subject to differing opinions and perceptions across different countries. For instance, in the United States, extracurricular tutoring often focuses on specialized seminars that aim to foster students' interests and enhance their cognitive abilities. Tutoring classes in China mostly prioritize academic performance. This study aims to examine the potential impact of extracurricular tutoring on students and evaluate its effectiveness. To do this, questionnaires from the China Data Survey and Data Centre of Renmin University of China will be utilized.

2. Literature Review

Extracurricular tutoring is a frequently employed method to enhance student academic achievement. Based on the most recent national statistics, 65.6% of students at general junior high schools in China participate in educational tutoring. However, according to scholars' statistics from recent years, in certain regions, the percentage reaches 87%, and within a specific school, as high as 92.7% of students engage in extracurricular tutoring [14]. Extracurricular tutoring is commonly described as a voluntary effort to participate in additional educational programs and private instruction. The emergence of extracurricular tutoring is a widely discussed topic that has a lengthy historical background. During the Spring and Autumn and Warring States Periods, Confucius established a private school to educate his students on Confucian rituals and laws [10]. This initiative can be interpreted as a form of self-directed learning. Additionally, since Confucianism was not the prevailing ideology during that time, this private schooling can also be considered as supplementary education. Indeed, tutorial institutions called *frontistiria* emerged in Greece at the close of the 19th century, influenced by similar establishments in other countries [7].

Extra-curricular tutoring is commonly perceived as a means to enhance competitiveness, which is why many

parents opt for it. This choice aligns with the human capital theory, an economic theory that views an individual's skills and abilities as valuable assets that can be cultivated and utilized. Individuals have the potential to enhance their future advantages by making investments in their skills and capabilities [12]. An example of such an investment is education and training. By enrolling youngsters in supplementary extracurricular tutoring, parents can enhance their future productivity, hence boosting their competitiveness and job performance, resulting in greater employment prospects and higher income. Most parents tend to consider the investment and benefit ratio in this manner [5]. However, there is an additional dimension to participating in extracurricular tutoring. For instance, some parents desire the chance to assess their child's requirements or to receive personalized one-on-one tutoring that is especially customized to their child's needs [2]. This is related to the concept of Mastery Learning. This notion pertains to the delivery of customized instruction and assistance to individual pupils, while simultaneously addressing the requirements of the entire group. That is one of the primary motivations for the widespread availability of tutorials [4]. Indeed, extracurricular tutoring is widespread, particularly in language disciplines. Researchers have undertaken research to analyze the factors that influence parents' selection of extra-curricular English training providers, taking into account the confluence of several disciplines. The primary results indicate that parents with a solid general foundation, regardless of age, hold the belief that English proficiency will enhance their children's future employment prospects [8]. Furthermore, it is observed that parents' personal experiences, educational background, and income level may influence their knowledge of the importance of learning English. The process of acquiring a new language is commonly categorized into four distinct components: auditory comprehension, oral communication, written comprehension, and written expression [11]. After-school tutoring frequently offers additional time and a customized approach to education, allowing pupils to acquire enhanced information. Nevertheless, there exist numerous divergent conjectures regarding the influence of extracurricular tutoring on pupils, with three prevailing notions frequently observed. One benefit is that extracurricular tutoring has a favorable influence on students. The second point is that extracurricular tutoring does not exert any influence on kids. The third point is that the impact on students must be assessed by considering various intricate elements, including psychology and background [3].

2.1. Advantages of Extracurricular Tutoring

Extra-curricular tutoring also offers numerous benefits, allowing pupils to acquire new knowledge and expand their access to information. Regarding the tutorials themselves, Simoncini offers a thorough examination of the severity, scope, cost, and influence of extracurricular tutoring. An analysis is conducted on the effects of extracurricular tuition on the school, society, and the economy. Regarding the effect on education, a perspective suggests that tuition has a beneficial influence. Efficient supplementary instruction can assist students in bridging educational gaps and addressing inadequacies, so enhancing their self-assurance [13]. Additionally, it can provide high-achieving students with opportunities to expand their knowledge beyond the traditional classroom setting. Liu believes that extracurricular

tutoring primarily has a placebo effect on the academic disposition of most primary school students and can enhance their perception of proficiency in acquiring similar knowledge [8]. In other words, while tutoring may not always result in a direct good effect on the student, I derive a feeling of reassurance from the fact that I have acquired knowledge through the additional effort I have invested in learning [6]. Simultaneously, engaging in extracurricular tutoring can yield favorable outcomes in terms of the student's interpersonal connections and social integration, including enhanced communication skills and an expanded social network. Additionally, this implies that personalized education can be more effectively implemented. Indeed, several educators will possess their instructional approaches and effective learning strategies, which can be more effectively showcased through tutorials [15]. Hence, students might use this opportunity to acquire additional learning strategies and enhance their problem-solving abilities. Simultaneously, tutorials serve as a means of regulating and mentoring pupils who lack self-motivation in their studies.

2.2. Disadvantages of Extracurricular Tutoring

Nevertheless, counseling classes might also have adverse effects to some degree [7]. One significant aspect is that tutorials are frequently scheduled on weekends or holidays, so consuming a substantial amount of students' leisure time. This, in turn, amplifies the students' load, including both academic and psychological stress [4]. The requirement for students to complete a substantial amount of academic assignments and the resulting reduction in leisure time significantly constrains their capacity to achieve holistic development [2]. If kids experience excessive internal pressure, there is a likelihood that they will develop psychological issues. Furthermore, extracurricular tutoring institutes face challenges in achieving flawless instructional administration [11]. Thus, it is simple to possess a state of nomenclature without substance, as well as a deficiency of care and appropriate instruction for kids. Simultaneously, engaging in extracurricular tutoring will compromise the equity of education. Extracurricular tutoring necessitates a significant financial investment, making it unaffordable for certain families [16]. As a result, extracurricular tutoring is mostly accessible to individuals from the middle and upper socioeconomic levels [9]. This exacerbates the disparity in schooling. Simultaneously, engaging in additional academic support outside of regular school hours will escalate the cost obligations for families, so imposing a monetary strain on them.

2.3. The Use of New Technology in After-school Tutoring

However, the utilization and influence of emerging technologies in classroom instruction are frequently employed for analysis. The education business has progressively incorporated internet technology in accordance with the changing times. Its primary benefits include the abundance of resources and the ease of information dissemination [12]. Online interactive English teaching can enhance students' intercultural communication skills and offer flexible time management. Utilizing network information technology, students can effectively utilize their available time and engage in more frequent interactions with teachers [10]. For instance, interactive relationships can be more effectively established using tools such as the

whiteboard and PowerPoint. In addition, films and animations can enhance students' attention and facilitate knowledge acquisition. Furthermore, according to xx, these multimedia tools can help enhance students' concentration. Nevertheless, the utilization of novel technical methodologies can also include significant drawbacks. For instance, the proliferation of the internet and technical advancements frequently result in diminished interpersonal communication and interaction among students[8]. Although current educational technology enables remote learning and autonomous study via online platforms, it might result in a decrease in possibilities for students to engage and cooperate with their peers. Based on this premise, it has the potential to diminish pupils' passion for learning. Simultaneously, these factors will increase the likelihood of students becoming reliant on the Internet. In addition to not ensuring complete access to online educational resources, etc [5].

3. Research Programmes

In this investigation, the research examine the influence of extracurricular tutoring on English performance and identify the specific components that are influenced. In principle, this study can enhance the understanding of social and human capital by assisting students in developing valuable social connections and gaining access to resources through extracurricular tutoring, which can be associated with future job opportunities. In practical terms, this research can enhance the formulation of policies that efficiently allocate resources, as well as facilitate the assessment and enhancement of school administration programs, while also

generating insights for the education market. I conducted a quantitative research study on this topic. The research hypothesis was that students who engaged in extracurricular tutoring and training in English would have a notable enhancement in their performance compared to those who did not, while taking other factors into account. The independent variables consisted of junior high school students who engaged in extracurricular tutoring. These variables encompassed factors such as grade level, gender, and locality, as well as the students' self-internal motivation and attitudes towards learning.

Factors such as the duration of participation in extracurricular tutoring, distractions in the tutoring environment, disparities in the school curriculum and teaching approaches, and the availability of technology in both school and tutoring programs impact the dependent variable, which is the potential change in students' English performance. Socio-economic status, including family income, degree of parental education, and availability of educational resources at home, is one of the factors that can influence the variables [1].

The variables that can be controlled for include the level of parental support and involvement in their child's education, the duration and frequency of tutorial sessions, the quality and qualifications of the tutors, and the amount of time the students dedicate to homework and self-study. The acquired data will undergo additional analysis using the statistical software Stata. Outliers were eliminated and the data was assigned values.

3.1. Descriptive Statistics

Table 1. Descriptive Statistics Table of Students
Descriptive statistics table

VarName	Obs	Mean	SD	Median	P25	P75	Min	Max
Midterm English results	17868	70.22	9.82	72.258	63.871	77.424	11.349	107.816
Gender	17868	0.51	0.50	1.000	0.000	1.000	0.000	1.000
Student's Family Economic Status	17868	1.66	1.16	1.000	1.000	3.000	1.000	5.000
Attendance of English Learning Classes	17868	1.24	0.43	1.000	1.000	1.000	1.000	2.000
Family economic status before primary school	17868	2.53	1.18	2.000	2.000	2.000	1.000	6.000
Educational level of student's father	17868	9.50	4.67	9.000	9.000	12.000	0.000	19.000
Educational level of the student's mother	17868	8.37	5.22	9.000	9.000	12.000	0.000	19.000
Time spent in out-of-school tutorial classes	17868	0.92	1.89	0.000	0.000	1.000	0.000	24.000
Monday to Friday homework hours	17868	2.35	2.39	2.000	1.000	3.000	0.000	24.000
Weekend Homework	17868	2.80	2.38	2.000	1.000	4.000	0.000	24.000

The initial step involves examining a descriptive statistics table, which provides an overview of the analysis conducted on the midterm English scores of 17,868 students and the factors associated with these results. As shown in table 1, the average value of students' midterm English scores is 70.22, with a standard deviation of 9.82, indicating a significant dispersion of values. The gender distribution was about equal, with males comprising 51 percent. The average value of students' present family economic position is 1.66, indicating that the majority of students' families have a moderate to

favorable economic condition. A mere 24% of the pupils participated in English learning sessions, suggesting that extracurricular English tutoring was not prevalent. The average economic status of pre-primary families was 2.53, suggesting that the overall economic situation was favorable. The dads' educational attainment was 9.50, while the women' educational attainment was 8.37, indicating a significant level of parental education. The average amount of time students spent in out-of-school tutorials was 0.92 hours per week. This was considerably less than the time they spent on homework

during weekdays (2.35 hours) and weekends (2.80 hours). This suggests that students primarily relied on their regular homework time for their studies, rather than out-of-school tutorials.

3.2. Correlation Analysis

And the next step was to analyse the correlations.

Correlation analysis refers to the analysis of two or more elements of a variable that are correlated in order to measure the closeness of the correlation between two elements of the variable. There needs to be a certain link or probability between the correlated elements for correlation analysis to take place.

Table 2. Correlation Coefficient Table

	Correlation Coefficient								
	Midterm English results	Student's Family Financial Situation	Whether to attend English learning classes	Family economic status before primary school	Student's father's education level	Educational level of student's mother	Hours of tutorial classes outside school	Week day homework time	Weekend homework time
Midterm English results	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Student's Family Financial Situation	-0.032***	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Whether to attend English learning classes	0.076***	0.077**	1	—	—	—	—	—	—
Family economic status before primary school	-0.031***	0.308**	-0.012	1	—	—	—	—	—
Student's father's education level	0.088***	0.100**	0.251**	0.042***	1	—	—	—	—
Educational level of student's mother	0.068***	0.137**	0.260**	0.058***	0.567***	1	—	—	—
Hours of tutorial classes outside school	0.042***	0.044**	0.441**	0.006	0.216***	0.226**	1	—	—
Weekday homework time	0.014	0.032**	0.044**	0.037***	-0.000	0.016**	0.125**	1	—
Weekend homework time	0.037***	0.020**	0.057**	0.022***	0.036***	0.027**	0.138**	0.475**	1

As shown in table 2, firstly, the correlation coefficients indicate a substantial association between midterm English scores and various variables. The link between midterm English achievement and current family economic status was found to be weak and negative ($r = -0.032$, $p < .001$). This suggests that pupils from lower-income families had somewhat lower English achievement. Furthermore, there was a negative link between the economic position of pre-primary families and midterm English scores ($r = -0.031$, $p < .001$). The data revealed a significant positive relationship ($r = 0.076$, $p < .001$) between students' involvement in ELL classes and their midterm English scores. This indicates that students who took part in extracurricular English tutoring achieved higher scores. Furthermore, the educational attainment of parents had a notable and favorable impact on students' midterm English scores. Specifically, there was a

strong positive correlation between the education level of both fathers ($r = 0.088$, $p < .001$) and mothers ($r = 0.068$, $p < .001$) and the scores achieved by children. The amount of time dedicated to out-of-school tutorial classes showed a positive correlation with midterm English scores ($r = 0.042$, $p < .001$), suggesting that participating in out-of-school tutoring had a beneficial impact on English scores. Nevertheless, there was no significant link between the amount of time spent on homework from Monday to Friday and midterm English scores ($r = 0.014$, $p > .05$). However, there was a weak positive correlation between the amount of time spent on homework on weekends and midterm English scores ($r = 0.037$, $p < .001$). This suggests that the additional studying that students engage in on weekends has a more significant impact on their grades. Hence, when considering all factors collectively, the attendance of English learning sessions, the

degree of parental education, and the duration of out-of-school tutoring classes were found to be the primary determinants of kids' midterm English performance. While family economic position does have an impact on English achievement, the association between the two is quite weak. Furthermore, a regression analysis was performed. Regression analysis is a statistical tool used to establish the quantitative relationship between two or more interdependent

variables. It is a statistical analysis method that effectively illustrates the significant association between independent variables and dependent variables. Its purpose is to quantify the extent to which many independent variables influence a dependent variable.

3.3. Regression Analysis

Table 3 Regression Table of English Results

Regression Table	
	(1)
	Midterm English results
Gender	0.000
	(.)
Gender (male)	-5.554***
	(-39.53)
Financial situation of the student's family (very rich)	-3.195**
	(-2.45)
Financial situation of the student's family (relatively rich)	-0.155
	(-0.76)
Financial situation of the student's family (very difficult)	-0.024
	(-0.07)
Financial situation of the student's family (relatively difficult)	-0.567
	(-1.43)
Attendance at English language classes	1.305***
	(6.98)
Family financial situation before primary school (very well off)	0.210
	(0.71)
Family financial situation before primary school (relatively well off)	-3.888***
	(-4.23)
Family financial situation before primary school (medium)	0.440
	(1.23)
Family financial situation before primary school (relatively difficult)	-0.665*
	(-1.72)
Family financial situation before primary school (very difficult)	-0.138
	(-0.25)
Educational level of the student's father	0.140***
	(7.60)
Educational level of the student's Mather	0.034**
	(2.03)
Hours of out-of-school tutorial classes	-0.036
	(-0.85)
Monday to Friday homework hours	-0.043
	(-1.30)
Weekend working hours	0.079**
	(2.36)
cons	70.981***
	(202.80)
year	No
industry	No
N	17868
R ²	0.096
Adj. R ²	0.09

As shown in table 3, the regression analysis conducted in this study indicates that students from highly affluent homes exhibit a noteworthy decrease in English scores ($\beta = -3.195$, $p < .05$), while the influence of other family economic statuses is not statistically significant. Participating in English learning classes had a substantial positive impact on students' midterm English scores ($\beta = 1.305$, $p < .001$), suggesting that extracurricular English tutoring significantly improved students' scores. The pre-primary family economic status was shown to be significantly lower for wealthier kids ($\beta = -3.888$, $p < .001$) and marginally lower for more challenging individuals ($\beta = -0.665$, $p < .10$). This suggests that the economic backgrounds of students may have an impact on

their early educational resources. The educational attainment of parents had a notable and positive impact on student achievement. Both the educational attainment of the father ($\beta = 0.140$, $p < .001$) and the mother ($\beta = 0.034$, $p < .05$) significantly influenced student achievement in English. This indicates that the level of education within the family plays a crucial role in students' academic performance. The amount of time dedicated to out-of-school tutorial classes and weekday homework did not have a substantial impact on midterm English scores. However, the time spent on homework during weekends had a notable and positive effect on the scores ($\beta = 0.079$, $p < .05$). This suggests that students who devoted more time to studying on weekends achieved

higher scores. In general, factors such as gender, involvement in English Language Learner (ELL) classes, family economic situation, and parents' education level had a substantial impact on students' midterm English achievement.

However, the improvement of students' English performance is influenced by their participation in extracurricular tutoring classes. Both correlation and regression analyses indicate a significant positive relationship between students' English achievement and their involvement in extracurricular tutoring. Thus, this study establishes that English tutoring programs have the potential to enhance the academic performance of domestic junior high school students to a certain degree. Simultaneously, there are additional variables that impact English proficiency, such as the amount of time dedicated to independent writing and the extent to which homework is completed. Furthermore, the educational background of parents can also influence students' performance, potentially indicating the influence of home-based education. Additionally, it is challenging to fully separate changes in English grades from other influencing factors. In summary, English extracurricular classes can have a beneficial influence on students, but it is important not to regard them as distinct from other academic activities [2].

4. Summary Analysis

In fact, the questionnaire and the data analysis have some drawbacks, for example, there are some shortcomings in the data collection of the questionnaire, and at the same time, it is not possible to give some guidance to the policy and situation when analysing the data, because it is not possible to avoid some potential risks in data processing.

At the same time, performance can be affected by both intrinsic and extrinsic factors, including emotional factors such as lack of self-confidence, excessive stress, and high self-esteem. These factors are closely related to the learner's own situation. Although English classes are offered in primary schools from the third grade onwards, some schools differ in terms of teachers' strength and the degree of importance they attach to it, while some students have a poor English foundation, and when they go to junior secondary schools, they have a big gap compared with other students with a better English foundation, thus developing an inferiority complex. Some students are not quite used to the way of teaching English in junior high school, and they underestimate the difficulties, so when they do not get enough sense of achievement in English learning, they lose interest in this subject and even become anxious [7]. From the point of view of external factors, it is more multifaceted external such as the examination and evaluation system, the teaching environment, the role of teachers and so on. For example, teachers' attitude. Some teachers are not very patient with students who are slow to respond and poor in foundation, they are too impatient and sometimes too harsh.

Sometimes they are too strict, and this kind of attitude will lead to the decline of students' motivation and self-esteem in English learning, and even cause students' antipathy and resistance to English. Secondly, teachers' teaching methods. Forced by the pressure of the examination, teachers' teaching is more confined to the words directly related to the examination content, and seldom start from the angle of interest and so on. The large number of students participating in extracurricular tutoring also shows that students need to make changes and readjustments to the teacher's research and teaching in the classroom at school [9].

5. Conclusion

In summary, the issue of extracurricular tutoring has long been a matter of concern for parents and students. This study analyzed a total of 17,868 students using data from the China Education Tracker 2013-2014, which is managed by the China Centre for Data Surveys and Data (CEPS) at Renmin University of China. The study concluded that while extracurricular tutoring can enhance students' English scores to some degree, its effectiveness is influenced by various other factors. The study determined that while extracurricular tutoring can enhance students' English proficiency to a certain degree, it remains influenced by additional factors. Thus, schools, parents, and kids must prioritize their inherent drive to learn English and integrate various elements to facilitate significant progress.

References

- [1] Cleves, M. (2008). An introduction to survival analysis using Stata. Stata press.
- [2] Cai-Feng Qu, Cai-Hsia Yang, Qing-Ping Zhang & Ping-Hua Yang. (2023). Application of information technology in extracurricular tutoring of higher mathematics. *Science and Technology Wind* (34),133-135+157. doi:10.19392/j.cnki.1671-7341.202334045.
- [3] Chen, Ling, Jing Zhang & Jing Liu. (2022). How to promote online mobility of high-quality teacher resources under the 'double-decrease' policy: An analysis of the factors influencing teachers' intention to continuously participate in extracurricular online tutoring services. *Modern Distance Education Research* (02), 11-20.
- [4] Chen, H.L.. (2017). The Positive Effects of Extracurricular English Tutoring on Students in Junior High Schools and Implications for English Teaching in Schools Master's Degree (Dissertation, Huazhong University of Science and Technology). M.A.
- [5] Feldman, A. F., & Matjasko, J. L. (2005). The role of school-based extracurricular activities in adolescent development: A comprehensive review and future directions. *Review of educational research*, 75(2), 159-210.
- [6] He, S. Q.. (2013). A study on the reasons for primary school students' participation in extracurricular English tutoring and its advantages and disadvantages Master's Degree (Dissertation, Huazhong Normal University). M.A.
- [7] Kelly, S. (2008). Race, social class, and student engagement in middle school English classrooms. *Social science research*, 37(2), 434-448.
- [8] Liu, S. Y.. (2023). A study on the influence of parents' educational expectations on the choice of extracurricular tutoring in primary schools under the "Double Reduction" policy, Master's Degree (Dissertation, Jinan University). Master's degree. <https://link.cnki.net/doi/10.27166/d.cnki.gsdcc.2023.000706doi:10.27166/d.cnki.gsdcc.2023.000706>.
- [9] Li, Xinrong. (2022). A Survey Study on Primary School Students' Participation in Extracurricular Tutoring M.A. (Dissertation, Liaoning Normal University). Master <https://link.cnki.net/doi/10.27212/d.cnki.glnsu.2022.000941doi:10.27212/d.cnki.glnsu.2022.000941>.
- [10] Meier, A., Hartmann, B. S., & Larson, R. (2018). A quarter century of participation in school-based extracurricular activities: Inequalities by race, class, gender and age?. *Journal of youth and adolescence*, 47, 1299-1316.
- [11] Qu Zhe. (2023). A study on the challenges of English teacher development in extracurricular tutoring institutions under the double reduction policy MA (Dissertation, Beijing Foreign

- Studies University). Master <https://link.cnki.net/doi/10.26962/d.cnki.gbjwu.2023.000410>doi:10.26962/d.cnki.gbjwu.2023.000410.
- [12] Shulruf, B., Tumen, S., & Tolley, H. (2008). Extracurricular activities in school, do they matter?. *Children and youth services review*, 30(4), 418-426.
- [13] Simoncini, K., & Caltabiono, N. (2012). Young school-aged children's behaviour and their participation in extracurricular activities. *Australasian Journal of Early Childhood*, 37(3), 35-42.
- [14] Shulruf, B. (2010). Do extra-curricular activities in schools improve educational outcomes? A critical review and meta-analysis of the literature. *International Review of Education*, 56, 591-612.
- [15] Zhou Yanghui. (2018). Exploration of junior high school English teaching mode in extracurricular tutoring institutions. *Overseas English* (22), 158-159.
- [16] Zhang, Xiuzhi. (2016). Analysis of the effectiveness of extracurricular tutoring in online interactive English teaching. *New Silk Road (Late)* (04), 99+101. doi:10.19312/j.cnki.61-1499/c.2016.04.061.