

System Transfer, Education, and Development in Mozambique

JOSE COSSA
Maguigane Consulting

ABSTRACT: In this study the author used conceptual historical method to assess the phenomenon of system transfer and the association between education and development in Mozambique. The assessment was administered through critical analysis of documents pertaining to the Salazar (1924-1966), Machel (1975-1986), and Chissano (1986-2005) administrations. The findings were that (a) the colonial government created economic and educational systems for colonizing Mozambique, whereas the Machel and Chissano administrations adapted foreign systems of government and education (i.e., Socialism, Soviet, Democracy, Portuguese, etc.) to their particular context without altering the inherent theoretical basis of the systems transferred; (b) the Machel and Chissano administrations, implicitly or explicitly, perceived the relationship between education and development as circular causality rather than a unidirectional linear causality, while the Salazar administration perceived it as unidirectional linear causality; and (c) while the Machel and Chissano administrations focused on primary education, literacy campaigns, and education of women and girls, they differed in the reasons for such focus.

Cossa, J. (2011). System Transfer, Education, and Development in Mozambique. *International Journal of Education Policy and Leadership* 6(2). Retrieved [date] from <http://www.ijepl.org>.

Introduction

This article focuses on why the unidirectional linear or circular causal perceptions of the association between education and development continue to permeate education policy. To achieve this end, the author uses historiography and, more specifically, the conceptual historical method (Leedy, 1997) by assessing the impact of an idea or concept on perceptions. Employing this method, the author explores the impact of system transfer in Mozambique during Salazar's imperial administration within the framework of economic nationalism, Machel's social-democratic administration within the framework of Marxist-Leninist theory, and Chissano's liberal democratic administration within the framework of liberal theory.¹ These theories are described in detail within the context of their appearance in text. The author conjectures that the inherent perceptions of the relationship between education and

development within a given transferred system continued to exert influence in the country even after the administration that introduced it had ceased to rule. This conjecture, if supported herein, might serve as evidence that change in policy is more rapid than, and sometimes not a guarantee of, structural changes; thus explaining why the wholesale structural adjustment programs or policies in developing nations failed to generate the results envisioned.

System transfer is of concern to various entities that have experienced a form of domination in their past or are suspicious of neocolonial or dominant trends in today's global environment. In this article, the author explores why the phenomenon of system transfer influences perceptions of association between education and development in Mozambique. The term *system transfer* refers to the "passing down" or borrowing of methods and structures from one country or

organization to another. It is often associated with the relationship between colonial and postcolonial structures as well as that of international policy and its implications in the developing world. In recent literature, the terms used to refer to some form of system transfer include *educational transfer*, *educational lending*, and *educational borrowing*. Leading scholars of comparative and international education who have intentionally addressed transfer in this fashion include Steiner-Khamsi (2004), Phillips (1989), and Phillips and Ochs (2004). In the context of this article, system transfer refers specifically to the passing down of social, political, economic, and educational practices characteristic of one government or organization of the "developed world" to another of the "underdeveloped" or "developing" world. The key to the analysis of system transfer, in this article, are the theories embedded in the phenomena of system transfer.ⁱⁱ

Advocates of Pan-Africanism, such as Kenyatta, Nyerere, and Nkrumah, and advocates of African Renaissance, such as Mbeki, Musseveni, and Cheikh Anta Diop, have been suspicious of system transfer.ⁱⁱⁱ In a meeting held on September 28 and 29, 1998, in Johannesburg, South Africa—which had as main objectives to define African identity and Africa's place in the global community and to formulate practical strategies and solutions for future action that would benefit the African masses (Magkoba, 1999, p. i)—Thabo Mbeki, who is famous for his African Renaissance speeches and role in the African Millennium Plan (NEPAD, 2001) and similar developmental projects, provided participants with definitions; objectives; and historical, conceptual, and theoretical frameworks for an African Renaissance that would equip the participants to react against system transfer and to advocate for indigenous systems in various sectors of African life.^{iv} Mbeki's speech emphasized the need to advance developmental agendas that would bring Africa to a competitive position in the world economy. His objectives included economic growth, social and human resource development, the building of a modern economic and social infrastructure, the cancellation of Africa's debt, improvement in trade, increase in domestic and foreign investment, expansion of development assistance, and better access to African products in the markets of the developed world. To map the strategy to achieve these objectives, Mbeki (1998) said:

I am convinced that a great burden rests on the shoulders of Africa's intelligentsia to help us to achieve these objectives...we have arrived at the point where the enormous brain power which our continent possesses must become a vital instrument in helping us to secure our equitable space within a world affected by a rapid process of globalization and from which we cannot escape. (n.p.)

Mbeki argued that education holds the key to Africa's development and that without a strong education system, Africa is susceptible to domination rather than being an equitable partner in the process of globalization. In other words, educated Africans are the prerequisite to restore Africa's dignity and identity, define her future, and develop her to a level of competitor in today's world economy. Mbeki explicitly advocated for a unidirectional linear causal linkage between education and development in which education is the independent variable for Africa's development. However, there is in the speech an implicit propensity toward circular causality in which development presupposes education and education can only be advanced successfully if a certain level of development is achieved. The argument of circular causality is paradoxical because a country would have to be already developed and have a high-income economy and enough capital to sustain good educational programs; yet it needs to educate a large number of its people in order to achieve a significant level of development. This paradox constitutes a dilemma for postcolonial economies, because most of them fall into the low-income group category.^v An additional dilemma is that even most of the advocates of the African Renaissance do not question the concept and nature of education in Africa. Although there may be some exceptions, the underlying assumption is that we all understand that "Western" education for Africans is essential for Africa's development.

The association between development and education is the thrust of Mozambique's *Plano Estratégico de Educação 1999–2003*, adopted by the Ministério Nacional da Educação (now Ministério da Educação e Cultura) in 1998. The document highlights cost and sustainability as current problems in Mozambican education. Cost and sustainability are indeed problems in the entire continent, often requiring intervention by foreign organizations and governments. For instance,

Mozambique received U.S. \$66.5 million in aid from the Danish Government to assist with cost and sustainability in education ("Dinamarca apoia educação," 2002).

The following sections address the methodology; limitations; system transfer, education, and development—the Salazar administration (1924-1966), the Machel administration (1975-1986), and the Chissano administration (1986-2005); findings and conclusion; implications for the policy community; suggestions for further research; and references.

Methodology

The author uses historiography and, more specifically, the conceptual historical method (Leedy, 1997), by assessing the impact of an idea or concept on perceptions. Cropley and Harris (2004) argued that the conceptual historical method is historiography when used to research the history of concepts, since ideas and concepts can influence history, people, and events. For Leedy and Ormrod (2001), this method is distinct from conventional historical research in that its focus is on the description of ideas and their dynamics rather than the description and interpretation of events. The focus in this article is on the description and dynamics of *ideas* within, rather than on, the description and interpretation of *events* characteristic to three political administrations in Mozambique.

The assessment was administered through a critical analysis of primary source documents, as well as a variety of additional primary and secondary source documents, pertaining to the Salazar (1924–1966), Machel (1975–1986), and Chissano (1986–2005) administrations. The data consist of speeches, newspaper articles, proceedings from meetings, reports, and statistical information gathered from libraries and the Internet. Validity was established by means of internal evidence to determine the authenticity of the documents, and external evidence to determine the historical context and the meaning of the documents. The author analyzed each document in the context of its history by taking into consideration the date of publication and events surrounding it, the author's motivations and intentions implicit in the text, the disposition of the intended audience (e.g., people of a recently independent nation), and interpreted meaning from the overall information. Also, the author has as-

certained whether documents are original, copies, or forgeries or have been tampered with at some time, by obtaining data in reputable educational resource centers such as the Africana library of Northwestern University, the electronic database of the Ministry of Education of Mozambique, the electronic database of the World Bank, and the Loyola University Libraries.

Limitations

While conducting the study, the author was limited in the following ways: to substantiating the influence of systems transfer to perceptions of association between formal education and economic development; by the availability of relevant literature written in Portuguese; to mentioning only those details of the association between education and development that are related to the purpose of this study; and to covering historical details of colonialism and postcolonialism in Mozambique that are immediately related to the study's purpose.

System Transfer, Education, and Development

Preston (1982, p. 3) claimed that "the so called 'discovery of the third world' is as significant for present-day social theory as was that nineteenth-century 'discovery of industrialization' for the classical theorists of political economy and the 'founding fathers' of sociology." The labels "discovery of the third world" and "discovery of industrialization" highlighted by Preston to show their inadequacy in today's political context are crucial both to the former imperial states and to the developing world, because implicitly they portray the existence of, and a relationship between, a "discoverer-people" and a "discovered-people." In these claims is embedded the core belief of superior and civilizer that was upheld by imperial states, and the implicit claim of power of the "discoverer" over the "discovered."

Some scholars, such as Wa Thiong'o (1998) and Bassey (1999), implied that the dichotomous relationship discoverer-discovered influenced, and continues to influence, African countries in their dealings with former colonial powers and the developed world in general. Bassey (1999) highlighted the monopolistic nature of colonial systems of education and inferred

that these systems embodied the inherent philosophies and theories of the colonial powers, whether under the church's pretext of advancing the evangel or the colonial state's pretext of aiming at producing adequate human capital and fostering the colonies' allegiance to the colonizing state. Bassey's analysis focused on the goal of colonial education and is founded on a careful and concise description of the form and structure exhibited by French, British, Portuguese, Belgian, and German colonial powers. One goal common to all colonizers highlighted in Bassey's work is that of training elites through the school system. Each of these colonizers aimed at training elites, although from different structural and strategic standpoints, which would facilitate these colonizers' aspiration for a hegemonic status in world politics.

The Privy Council Report of 1867 recommended that "there should be a correlation between education and economic development" and devised a curriculum that would serve the purpose of the recommendation (Bassey, 1999, p. 31). Although this is a direct reference to education within the context of British colonialism, it is relevant to the author's interest in the perception of association between education and development within the context of colonial and postcolonial education in Mozambique. In this article, I assess why system transfer influenced perceptions of association between education and development in Mozambique during the Salazar (1924–1966), Machel (1975–1986), and Chissano (1986–2005) administrations. The author conjectures that the inherent perceptions of the relationship between education and development within a given transferred system continued to exert influence in the country even after the administration that introduced it had ceased to rule.

The Salazar Administration (1924–1966)

In an attempt to situate the impact of Salazar's economic nationalism in Mozambique, Wuyts (1979) divided Portuguese colonialism into the following three periods:^{vi} (a) plantation economy and labor reservoir, 1885–1926; (b) economic nationalism, 1926–1960; and, (c) crisis and reconstruction, 1960–1963/64.^{vii} Wuyts' criteria of division are based on the various phases of class conflict in the colony, namely, alteration in the relationship between capital and labor as well as

competition between capitals, Portuguese and foreign, within the colony.

Wuyts (1979) described the Portuguese capital as weak and unable to effectively organize the development of labor. Portugal divided Mozambique into two economic regions: the South was transformed into a reservoir of labor, and the Center and the North were subjected to the control of companies and resulted in the development of a plantation economy. According to Mondlane (1975) and Wuyts (1979), Portugal substituted slave trade with forced labor in an attempt to simultaneously comply with the antislavery movement and maintain a means of acquiring an adequate labor force to serve its economy, an effort that failed to restore Portugal's economy, leaving Portugal less developed than most other Western states. The Salazar administration was characterized by an effort to restore Portuguese capital after the crisis of the 1930s (Wuyts, 1979). In a 1967 speech to municipality representatives in Maputo (then Lourenço Marques), Salazar (1967) declared that the colonies would be the logical solution for the problem of overpopulation in Portugal by becoming depositories of Portuguese nationals and producing raw material to be sold, at low prices, to the "motherland" in exchange for manufactured products. Here lies the core of Salazar's economic nationalism—to use the colony of Mozambique as a means to enrich Portugal. In the following paragraphs, the author analyzes Salazar's speech by employing economic nationalism and the historical outline presented in Wuyts (1979).^{viii}

According to Gilpin (1987, pp. 31–33), the central idea of economic nationalism is that economic activities are subordinate to the goal of state building and the interest of the state. Economic nationalists stress the role of economic factors in international relations and view the struggle among states for economic resources as pervasive and inherent in the nature of the international system itself. Economic nationalists originate from a tendency to concentrate wealth and to establish dependency or power relations between the strong and the weak economies. Gilpin describes defensive economic nationalism as a form of nationalism that often exists in less developed economies or advanced economies in decline and that is characterized by the government's pursuit of protectionism in order to protect the economy or domestic interests. The author argues that defensive economic nationalism is

the most suitable description of the Salazar administration.

At the time of Salazar's address to the Municipality of Mozambique (Salazar, 1967), Portugal was faced with the threat of losing two of its sub-Saharan colonies that served as main sources of raw material and the pillars of its imperialistic pride: Angola and Mozambique. Both countries were engaged in armed wars against Portugal's fascist regime, and there was evidence of an imminent end to Portuguese colonialism as more nations around the world were becoming supportive of colonial withdrawal and granting independent status to colonized countries. Salazar's speech reflected this anxiety in his description of errors in the policy to Africa. In defense of Portugal's colonial interests, he issued the following warning to other European states:

If the evolution of the counties of North Africa takes place on the basis of enmity in relation to Europe and of close ties with the East, that carelessly neglected evolution will reduce the European power of resistance along the entire Mediterranean border, and in a manner such as we may consider it to be dangerous for its security...and that will be a new source of preoccupations or dangers, nor will the financial support of the West and the repeated declaration of friendship and good neighborliness succeed in altering the situation. (p. 5)

Salazar feared that the independencies of North African states, which he termed Afro-Arab Africa, were increasingly becoming a bad influence for the other parts of Africa he called the typically African Africa and Euro-Africa.^{ix} Salazar hoped to succeed in his appeal for the protection of Euro-Africa, in this case Mozambique, against the growing influence of Arab nationalism in North Africa and Pan-African ideals in sub-Saharan Africa (Salazar, 1967). He prophetically cursed the newly independent African nations as doomed to failure due to what he termed an inadequacy to sustain efficient administrations. Nonetheless, one should view this prophecy in light of Salazar's understanding of the role of Portugal toward indigenous peoples. Salazar viewed the Portuguese as sons and heirs of an ancient civilization, whose mission was to educate and train "other peoples" to a higher idea of

life, to form real men through the subjection of matter to spirit, of instinct to reason.

Salazar's speech to the Municipality of Mozambique (Salazar, 1967) reiterated the Portuguese agenda in its colonies. Bassey (1999, p. 33) stated that the Portuguese regarded Angola and Mozambique as their overseas territories, in which childlike Africans must be educated and civilized gradually to attain Portuguese status. In order to achieve the aim of civilizing Africans and developing their economy in Portugal, the Portuguese designed a system of education that trained elites and transformed the colonies into a depository of labor force to produce raw material for Portuguese industries in Portugal (Wuyts, 1979). According to Bassey, based on the concordat of 1940, the Catholics fashioned two subsystems of education in Mozambique (and Angola): *ensino de adaptaçao*^x and *ensino oficial*.^{xi} These education systems, which constituted the ideological pillar for the advancement of Salazar's economic nationalism, gave to a minority of Mozambicans the opportunity to participate as elite and to a majority of Mozambicans the ill fate to participate as mere labor force to produce capital for Portugal.

Salazar (1967) believed that the creation and maintenance of a Portuguese civilization through education in Angola and Mozambique was responsible for the colonies' closeness with Europe and consequently was an economic advantage to the Southern African region. However, Wuyts (1979) argued that with all its elite and a large number of first-generation Portuguese whites—as opposed to South Africa and Zambia, which had second- to third-generation European whites (Salazar, 1967)—Portuguese capital remained weak within Mozambique and stronger in the neighboring countries.

In summary, despite the limited investment in the education of the indigenous people of its colonies, evidence shows that the Salazar administration perceived the relationship between education and development as a unidirectional linear causality in which education was the condition upon which development depended. The education of indigenous people, apart from that of its elite, was an instrument to produce human capital that would serve the economic interests of Portugal; therefore, such education had to be done in the Portuguese way to reflect accurately the culture and ideologies of Portugal.

The Machel Administration (1975–1986)

Salazar's speech to the Municipality of Mozambique (Salazar, 1967) sets a mood of desperation from which the author launches his discussion of the Machel administration. Salazar stated the following:

Material interests have not been the essential aim of Portuguese action in the world, rather have we sacrificed them to the progress of the populations. Europe today laughs at "paternalism" towards certain not yet evolved races and at the "missionary spirit," because the fact is they do not appear to believe any more in their civilizing mission, as they no longer believe in the superiority of their own civilization. (p. 12)

He further suggested the following solution to this problem:

There are ideologies in Africa which lead to subversion, and there are also interests which swim through chaos and with it are hoping to obtain facilities and privileges...therefore when we see that the West begins to understand they are being undermined by communism in Africa, the absurd, we might say sacrilegious, coalition which has been maintained so far, will cease to exist, and the attitudes towards the African problems will become different. (p. 13)

In the above quotes, Salazar proposed the end of the Organization of African Unity (OAU), the Communist influence, and the liberation wars. The appeal to return to "superior civilization" characterized the emotional despair of Salazar's administration as Mozambique was engaged in a war and its independence was imminent. Led by its founding president Eduardo Mondlane (1975), Mozambique's liberation movement FRELIMO^{xii} had conquered areas of the North of Mozambique, in which it established a new system of governance (FRELIMO, 1972; Machel, 1975; "O Processo," 1975). In this section, the author discusses this system of governance, the politico-economic theory it held, and the perception of association between education and development.

The Machel administration came into power aware of the difficulties faced by, and the shrewdness of, the

fascist government of Portugal, and therefore the administration aimed at substituting policies made by Portugal with policies that it believed adequate for a new republic (Hanlon, 1991; Machel, June 25, 1975). It is in this context that Machel delivered a series of speeches to the Mozambican public highlighting the ideological and political line that the new Republic would adopt. In this section I analyze the speech (Machel, 1970) entitled, "Educar o Homem para Vencer a Guerra, Criar Uma Sociedade Nova e Desenvolver a Patria."^{xiii} Machel (1970) and FRELIMO (1972) advocated a unidirectional linear causal relationship between education and development. Education provided knowledge of Mozambican history, geography, and nationalism that would lead to the development of the economy. The core intention was to develop the new nation, because the Portuguese political and economic policies based on economic nationalism did not develop the nation, but focused on developing Portugal (Hanlon, 1991). Machel, invoking social reproduction theory, recognized that:

[s]ociety aims at securing their survival by...transmitting the sum of its knowledge and experience. However, because society exists in its structures, it's obvious that its survival demands the permanence of its structures, no matter how oppressive they might be. It is in this context that the transmitted education, when reflecting the concrete form of society presents itself as its (society's) justification and justification of its economic structures, social habits, ethical concepts, art; in summary, of the society's culture.^{xiv} (Machel, 1970, pp. 8–9)

While the Salazar administration and its colonial system of government were based on economic nationalism and focused on developing Portugal rather than its overseas territories, the Machel administration was based on Marxism-Leninism and focused on developing Mozambique. According to FRELIMO (1972), this transition would only be successful by means of a complete revolution. The Machel administration firmly believed that the Portuguese administration had only brought misery to the indigenous people of Mozambique as well as to those who believed in human rights; therefore, it was imperative to structure the new society in a way that would guarantee the protection

and promotion of human rights ("O Processo," 1975). That structure was to be built on a Marxist foundation.^{xv}

The main postulates of Marx and Lenin are evident in the language and the political goal of the Machel administration. In education, for example, the new administration rejected both the traditional, or indigenous, system of education and the colonial system. Following Marx and Engel, as well as Lenin, the administration utilized dialectical interpretation of Mozambique's history by identifying the battle between the old, individualistically oriented system and the new, traditional, and superstitious system. Machel believed that both systems were detrimental to the nation and acknowledged the necessity of science and technology. He asserted that in order to establish the basis for a prosperous and advanced economy, it is imperative that science defeat superstition.

The promotion of superstition in traditional societies and the misuse of science by turning it into a weapon of exploitation of the masses in the colonial administration were identified in Machel's speech as the core enemy of independent Mozambique (Machel, 1970). Because arms were unable to win the ideological battle, and the new government often feared sabotage of the economy, education was promoted as the means to eradicate the ideological enemy ("Samora Machel," 1975). The Machel administration viewed education as a means to create a society where everyone, indiscriminately, shares in serving the people, produces goods and services, respects manual labor, exerts initiative and a sense of responsibility, and consequently participates in the economic development of the new nation. Education was imperative to reach these and other related aims, and Mozambique placed an emphasis on education for all within its borders (Munslow, 1985). Machel stated the following:

We want to create conditions such that in this generation disease, hunger, poverty, illiteracy and ignorance should begin to vanish forever from our country. Just as we emerged victorious from the struggle against colonialism, just as we smashed the racist aggregation of the illegal Smith-Muzorewa regime, so we shall also emerge victorious from this battle, because once again we shall be able to bring together the energy and intelligence of the entire people

for peace, progress, prosperity and plenty. It is a task of us all to organize society so that we can conquer underdevelopment. (Munslow, 1985, p. 141)

Machel based his argument on the Marxist premise that a dominated majority in society is at odds with those who possess the means of production; therefore, the Portuguese regime was not the only enemy of Mozambique—so were other capitalist regimes that advocated for a domination of one people over another and promoted underdevelopment and dependence in the third world. Waging war on illiteracy was the remedy to combat the effects of the colonial system of education that had produced a massive number of uneducated adults in Mozambique—mostly proletariat and indigenous farmers. Because of its literacy campaign, even before independence, FRELIMO already boasted a high rate of literacy and believed that the elimination of illiteracy would be the key to the country's economic development (Machel, 1970).^{xvi}

In summary, during the Machel administration there was a clear association between education and development. Although the end of the armed struggle meant the establishment of a new system of education, such a system was foreign to Mozambique and was based on a foreign politico-economic theory. Marxism and the socialist (Soviet) system of education had become the standard against which to measure education.

In addition, the administration adopted Portuguese as the only official language and justified it as a means to facilitate the communication of scientific knowledge and to communicate FRELIMO's ideals of national unity and progress. That Machel's speech of 1970 and all other speeches discussed here were conducted in Portuguese reflects a transfer of Portuguese cultural elements to the new system of government and consequently to the school system, because language does not exist in isolation. Many years later, Mazrui (1999) argued against this phenomenon:

In the secondary schools in Africa the literature taught to many African children is sometimes still European literature. But what is more to the point is that the African literature taught to African school children is almost never in indigenous languages. The European other haunts the African Self from a young age

in a post-colonial school. Have we been witnessing a clash of civilizations in African schools? Or does literature provide a cover for dependency? (p. 1)

In relation to the Machel's administration, one could safely say that the European and Socialist "other" haunted the Mozambican "self" from a young age in postcolonial Mozambique. As one who grew up during the Machel administration and was educated in such an era during his formative years, the author is the embodiment of Mazrui's contention with regard to cultural transfer in schools and Bassey's system transfer. As a young child he was encouraged to learn and speak Portuguese fluently, both at school and at home, with the pretext that this would lead him to excel in the educational system and thus become a productive citizen who would help the country in its development.

The Chissano Administration (1986–2005)

In the latter years of the Machel administration, when the administration implemented the *Plano de Reabilitação económica* or PRE (trans. Plan for Economic Rehabilitation), Mozambique had begun a transition from a basic socialist economy to an open market economy (Hanlon, 1991). Joaquim Chissano became president of Mozambique in 1986, after the death of Machel, and it was under his government that FRELIMO changed its system of government from a socialist democracy to a liberal democracy and opened the country's doors even wider to international organizations such as the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund (IMF), and various multinational corporations. The change of the country's name from *República Popular de Moçambique* to *República de Moçambique* and the privatization of the economic sector were some of the indications that a new system of governance was operating in the new Mozambique.

Hanlon (1991) described the situation of Mozambique in the last years of Machel's and the beginning of Chissano's leadership as a road to structural adjustment. Although the Machel administration initiated talks with the West and began a process of modification in its socialist policies, it was during the Chissano administration that the IMF and the World Bank began

open dialogue with the Mozambican government. These dialogues led to an adoption of a liberal theory of economics as a means to restore what was believed to be Mozambique's deteriorating economy of the 1980s. Hanlon argued that by the end of the 1980s, the *Plano de Reabilitação económica* had failed and the administration was looking for a new system that would succeed in fostering development in the country. In this section, the author analyzes the Chissano Administration within the theoretical framework of liberalism.

According to Gilpin (1987, p. 27), liberalism may be defined as a doctrine and set of principles for organizing and managing a market economy in order to achieve maximum efficiency, economic growth, and individual welfare. He argued that liberals see no necessary connection between the process of economic growth and political developments such as war and imperialism; these political evils affect and may be affected by economic activities, but they are essentially caused by political and not economic factors. With Gilpin's definition in mind, one can better understand the course of the negotiations between Mozambique, the IMF, and the World Bank in the 1980s, and the consequent adoption of liberalism as a means to escape underdevelopment (Hanlon, 1991). The author's intention in this section is to analyze the *"Plano Estratégico de Educação, 1999–2003: Combater a Exclusão, Renovar a Escola"*^{xvii} in light of the liberal theory adopted by the Chissano administration.

According to Gilpin (1987), liberalism ranges from those giving priority to equality and tending toward social democracy and state interventionism to achieve this objective, to those stressing liberty and noninterventionism at the expense of social equality. The author's analysis in this article hinges on the framework of liberalism that gives priority to equality and tends toward social democracy and state interventionism to achieve its objective. The Ministry of Education of Mozambique (now Ministry of Education and Culture)^{xviii} compiled the strategic plan document with the aim of advancing education in Mozambique, and in it there is a predominance of economics-related language. The context of the document is set within an economic framework characterized by terms such as *fiscal*, *expenditure*, *macroeconomic*, *economic growth*, *economic development*, and *poverty reduction*. In establishing the rationale for the strategic plan, two rea-

sons were presented and both were linked to economic aspects: to respond to the exigencies of the Mozambican economy and to respond to the pressures and opportunities from a more integrative and competitive global economy. The latter response is immediately called for within the Southern African context under the auspices of the Southern African Development Community (SADC).

Moreover, from the document's structural functionalist rationale, it is clear that Mozambican education is a means to respond effectively to economic needs. It is contingent on this rationale that the three main objectives were formulated: (a) to increase access to educational opportunity in all levels of education, (b) to maintain and ameliorate the quality of education, and (c) to develop an institutional and financial board that will sustain Mozambican schools and pupils in the future. In the section entitled "Estabilização, Crescimento e Apoio aos sectores Sociais" (MINED, 1998, pp. 2–3), there are contradictions regarding MINED's strategy. On one hand, there is recognition that the adoptions of a structural adjustment program and macroeconomy stabilization are not generating positive results; on the other hand, the government plans to pursue the same economic strategies to further reduce the levels of poverty. This contradiction reflects either the manifestation of hope in spite of the measurable results or a manifestation of dependency on development theorists' call for change of strategy.

The Ministry of Education's focus on human resource development and on women, in the Chissano administration, is a result of a purely economic reason rather than an immediate moral reason. Economists (e.g., Psacharopoulos & Patrinos, 2002), argued that women receive higher returns on their schooling investments; however, during the Machel administration, human resource development and the focus on women resulted primarily from the administration's belief that women should be emancipated because they had been victims of exploitation for many years. Thus, in 1975 (Machel, 1975; "Constituição da República," 1975), the Machel administration ruled as illegal the practices of polygamy and lobola.^{xix} In order to validate the document, the Ministry of Education claims to have consulted interest groups (e.g., Ireland, Holland, and the World Bank) and reckons that the participation of these groups in the implementation of the strategic plan will be a determinant factor for its success. How-

ever, the ministry clearly highlights its responsibility to define the policies and direction of the strategic plan, and to coordinate the actions of its partners. Taking into account the relationship between the Ministry of Education and its partners, who favor the full integration of women in society for the value of their contribution, it is not surprising that the emphasis on women and girls has continued to be a focus of strategic planning in Mozambique. However, in contrast to the Machel administration, the Ministry of Education refrains from the socialist jargon and nationalistic models that characterized the Machel administration (e.g., creation of one national organization for women with a political character such as the *Organização da Mulher Moçambicana*, or OMM).^{xx} In 1999, the same year of the creation of the Strategic Plan, the United Nations (UN) issued in its General Assembly the following act on gender, in which the UN:

[a]ffirms the need to apply a gender perspective in the implementation of the right to development, inter alia, by ensuring that women play an active role in the development process, and emphasizes that the empowerment of women and their full participation on a basis of equality in all spheres of society is fundamental for development. (UN, 1999, Act 11)

The Ministry of Education dedicates a section on the UN initiative for Africa, which highlights the UN effort to mobilize the acquisition of additional financial resources to invest toward the acceleration of Africa's development and poverty reduction plans. The ascription of approximately two-thirds of the funds to be invested in education is a sign that education is perceived as an essential part in development plans. When describing the priorities of the Strategic Plan, the Ministry of Education places greater emphasis on the role of the Universidade Pedagógica in preparing educators for the various levels of education and to consequently contribute to the development of Mozambique. Again, this is evidence of the Ministry of Education's perception of the role that education plays in the development of the nation by preparing a high amount of, and higher-quality, human capital. Further evidence is seen in the fact that although the GDP decreased from 22.9 percent in 1994 to 16.1 percent in 1996, the state's public expenditures for education

increased from 14.4 percent in 1994 to 17.4 percent in 1996 (MINED, 1998, table 2).

The Ministry of Education draws two scenarios to project Mozambique's educational costs; in the first scenario, costs are projected to increase from a total investment of \$18,144 in 1997 to \$37,085 in 2006, and in the second scenario, costs are projected to increase from \$18,144 in 1997 to \$43,204 in 2006.^{xxi} There is a projection of U.S. \$47 million per year from 1998 to 2002 for the construction of classrooms for primary education alone in order to accommodate the desired 90 percent increase in enrollments by the year 2002. The Ministry of Education admits that the current projections are not reachable by the Mozambican government alone, but can only be possible with great support from its international and national partners:

The viability of the Plano Estratégico de Educação depends, decisively, in the willingness of the national and international partners. The Government's bilateral and multilateral partners must provide about 50 million USD per annum. The viability will depend on unit cost for construction of classrooms, growth rate of teachers' salary, and percentage of students receiving assistance from the scholarship fund.^{xxii} (MINED, 1998, p. 32)

The recognition of economic weakness as a hindrance to educational quality, coupled with the persistence in designing and implementing an adequate strategic plan to achieve quality education as a means of economic development, reflects that the association between education and development is perceived as circular rather than as a unidirectional linear causality.

Findings and Conclusion

The ninth president of the World Bank, James D. Wolfensohn (2002), stated in a meeting to the World Bank's development committee:

I am pleased that education is a special topic of attention in the Development Committee agenda because it is so central to the development process. Education is fundamental to the construction of modern societies, to globally competitive economies, and to the empowerment of individuals because of its role in reducing poverty and inequality, in

promoting sustained economic growth, and in providing the underpinnings for good governance and effective institutions. It is an indictment on the entire international community that more than one-half of the developing countries are unable to provide a minimum of five years of quality primary education for their citizens. (p. 7)

In response to the Strategic Plan, the World Bank (2002) reported:

The Board of Executive Directors of the World Bank today approved a \$60 million IDA credit in support of the Mozambique Higher Education Project. The project builds on prior support in this field and will fund substantial reform, modernization and quality and efficiency improvements of Higher Education in the country, consistent with the 10-year National Higher Education Strategic Plan. (p. 1)

The World Bank further presented the following reason (2002):

To sustain the economic growth, investments, public service delivery and leadership necessary for continued development and poverty reduction, Mozambique needs nationals with high-level professional skills. The country's impressive economic growth has exacerbated the lack of skilled professionals and educated cadres. (p. 1)

To reiterate, this article focuses on why the unidirectional linear or circular causal perceptions of the association between education and development continue to permeate educational policy. The author conjectures that the inherent perceptions of the relationship between education and development within a given transferred system continued to exert influence in the country even after the administration that introduced it had ceased to rule. The author claimed that this conjecture, if supported herein, might serve as evidence that change in policy is more rapid than, and sometimes not a guarantee of, structural changes; thus explaining why the wholesale structural adjustment programs or policies in developing nations failed to generate the results envisioned. The findings support the conjecture. The findings were that (a) the colonial

government created economic and educational systems particularly for colonizing Mozambique, whereas the Machel and Chissano administrations adapted foreign systems of government and education—namely, Socialism, Soviet, Democracy, Portuguese, and so on—to their particular situation without altering the inherent theoretical bases of the systems transferred;^{xxiii} (b) the literature revealed overall that the Machel and Chissano administrations, implicitly or explicitly, perceived the relationship between education and development as circular causality rather than a unidirectional linear causality, as part of the rhetoric seemed to suggest, while the Salazar administration perceived it as unidirectional linear causality; and (c) the Machel and Chissano administrations focused on primary education, literacy campaigns, and education of women (and girls) but differed in the reasons for such focus—the Machel administration believed that the education of women would enhance their politico-cultural emancipation and the Chissano administration believed that women were imperative for the development of the country.

As conjectured, change in policy without altering the theoretical bases of the systems transferred in all the administrations covered in this article serves as evidence that change in policy is more rapid than, and sometimes not a guarantee of, structural changes; thus explaining why the wholesale of structural adjustment programs or policies in developing nations failed to generate the results envisioned. This deeply rooted influence of systems transfer, partly evidenced in the failure of structural adjustment programs in developing nations (e.g., Bangladesh, Ecuador, Ghana, Zimbabwe, Mexico, Philippines, Uganda, Hungary) is overt through liberalization policies in general, labor market reform, privatization programs, public expenditure policies in education and healthcare, and other related policies implemented by Western-based financial institutions (e.g., World Bank, IMF, and the WTO) in the hopes that they would improve the economic status of developing nations, but ended up contributing to the 'perpetual' economic crisis faced by these nations.^{xxiv}

Following the analysis of the texts and findings in this study, the author's conclusion is that the phenomenon of system transfer influences various aspects of a nation's life. The understanding of the phenomenon and its influence becomes, in the hands of the

researcher and policy community, a powerful tool to understand the present and plan the future. Moreover, the developing world faces, among others, the following difficulties: lack of an in-depth understanding of the power of system transfer, and lack of a powerful starting point to create a system both unique to, and at the level of, the exigencies of the current world. These difficulties may be due to the power of the systems already transferred or of those not-yet transferred systems already perceived to be more effective and ready for use.

Implications for the Policy Community

The study has the following implications for the policy community: first, an understanding of the manifestations of the phenomena of system transfer in Mozambique will assist the policy community to understand better the difficulties that Mozambique is facing in overcoming underdevelopment and its related problems, such as poverty and difficulty in reaching development goals.

Second, an understanding of the manifestations of the phenomena of system transfer in Mozambique might encourage Mozambicans to develop indigenous systems of education and indigenous means to combat poverty rather than relying on foreign conceptions and formulas of development.

Third, an understanding of the manifestations of the phenomena of system transfer in Mozambique might foster a careful reflection about Western education's real impact on the life of the average Mozambican citizen.

Fourth, an understanding of the manifestations of the phenomena of system transfer in Mozambique might foster dialogue between the policy community and civil society about ways to overcome the cycle of system transfer given the fact that little, if any, progress has been achieved by Mozambique, despite the presence of three foreign educational and politico-economic systems since colonialism.

Fifth, an understanding of the manifestations of the phenomena of system transfer in Mozambique can help the Mozambican government in decision making about reforms claiming the association between Western education and economic development as the developmental solution for Mozambique.

Sixth, an understanding of the manifestations of the phenomena of system transfer in Mozambique can help Mozambicans, particularly decision makers, to realize that an inherent dependency is consented to when relying on foreign systems to provide solutions to a country's problems.

In general, these implications are relevant to the policy community in the developing world; however, contextual nuances of individual countries must be taken into consideration in developing policy recommendations from the perspective of system transfer. As evidenced by the attempts to reform African education through structural adjustment programs, it would be erroneous to assume that educational policy and the perception of system transfer in the developing world are uniform.

Suggestions for Further Research

Some questions that may necessitate further investigation are: (a) to what extent does the perception of the concepts, or constructs, such as education and development change with the change of systems?; (b) is there a necessary and sufficient condition for forming a global perception of association between education and development that is compatible with all systems and contexts?; and (c) can generalizations of the findings in this study be drawn and applied to Southern Africa?

References

- Amos, S. K., Keiner, E., Proske, M., & Radtke, F. (2002). Globalization: Autonomy of education under siege? Shifting boundaries between politics, economy and education. *European Education Research, 1*(2), 193–213.
- Bassey, M. O. (1999). *Western education and political domination in Africa: A study in critical and dialogical pedagogy*. Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.
- Constituicao da República Popular de Moçambique. (1975, June 25). Notícias, artigo 20. Maputo, Moçambique.
- Cossa, J. (2008). *African Renaissance and Higher Education: A View through the Lenses of Christian Higher Education*. Germany: VDM Verlag Dr. Müller.
- Cropley, D. C., & Harris, M. B. (2004, June 20–24). Too hard, too soft, just right...Goldilocks and three research paradigms in SE. In *Proceedings of the Fourteenth Annual International Symposium of the International Council on Systems Engineering*, Toulouse, France.
- Dinamarca apoia educação com 66,5 milhes de USD. (2002, November 7). *Jornal Notícias*, p. 1. Maputo, Moçambique.
- Diop, C. A. (1974). *Black Africa: The economic and cultural basis for a federated state*. Paris: Editions Presence Africaine.
- Diop, C. A. (1996). *Towards the African Renaissance: Essays in culture and development, 1946–1960* (Egbuna P. Modum, trans.). London: The Estate of Cheikh Anta Diop and Karnak House. Originally published in French as Diop, C. A. (1990). *Alerte sous les tropiques*. Paris: The Estate of Cheikh Anta Diop and Présence Africaine.
- FRELIMO. (1972, April/May). Combater, produzir, estudar. *Voz da Revolução, 9*, 496–508.
- Gilpin, R. (1987). Three theories of international political economy. In *Political economy of international relations* (pp. 25–41). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University.
- Hanlon, J. (1991). *Mozambique: Who calls the shots?* Bloomington, IN: Indiana University.
- Kenyatta, J. (1938). *Facing Mount Kenya: The tribal life of the Gikuyu*. London: Secker and Warburg.
- Leedy, P. D., & Ormrod, J. E. (2001). *Practical research planning and design*. New Jersey: Merrill Prentice-Hall.
- Leedy, P. D. (1997). *Practical research: Planning and design* (6th ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- O Processo da Revolução Democrática Popular em Moçambique: A Natureza do Inimigo e os Seus Interesses Face as Massas Populares. (1975, June 25). *Jornal Notícias*, pp. 19–20. Maputo, Moçambique.
- Machel, S. M. (1970). *Educar o homem para vencer a guerra, criar uma sociedade nova e desenvolver a pátria*. Maputo, Moçambique: Spanos Gráfica, Ltd.
- Machel, S. M. (1975). Samora Machel na Abertura do Comité Central: Nesta Reunião Propomos Discutir o Futuro do País. *Jornal Notícias*, p. 3. Maputo, Moçambique.

- Machel, S. M. (1975, June 25). Moçambique Independente: A Mensagem da Proclamação. *Jornal Notícias*, p. 1. Maputo, Moçambique.
- Makgoba, M. W. (Ed.). (1999). *African Renaissance*. Sandton, South Africa: Mafube.
- Mazrui, A. A. (1999, November 23). *The African Renaissance: A triple legacy of skills, values and gender*. Paper Presented at the "African Renaissance—From Vision to Reality" Conference, London, Africa Centre.
- Mbeki, T. (1996, May 8). *Statement of Deputy President Thabo Mbeki, on behalf of the African National Congress, on the occasion of the adoption by the constitutional assembly of "The Republic of South Africa Constitution Bill 1996."* Retrieved May 2, 2008, from <http://www.anc.org.za/ancdocs/history/mbeki/1996/sp960508.html>
- Mbeki, T. (1998, April 9). *The African Renaissance, Africa, and the world*. Retrieved May 2, 2008, from <http://www.unu.edu/unupress/mbeki.html>
- MINED. (1998). *Plano estratégico de educação 1999–2003: Combater a exclusão, renovar a escola*. Maputo, Moçambique: Ministerio da Educação de Moçambique.
- Mondlane, E. C. (1975). *Lutar por Moçambique*. Lisboa, Portugal: Sá da Costa.
- Munslow, B. (Ed.). (1985). *Samora Machel: An African revolutionary*. London: Zed Books.
- NEPAD. (2001). *The new partnership for Africa's development*. Retrieved from www.avmedia.at/cgi-script/csNews/news_upload/NEPAD_2dCORE_2dDOCUMENTS_2edb.NEPAD%20FRAMEWORK%20DOCUMENT%20ENGL.pdf
- Nkrumah, K. (1970). *Africa must unite*. New York: International Publishers.
- Nkrumah, K. (1970). *Consciencism: Philosophy and the ideology for decolonization*. New York: Monthly Review.
- Nyerere, J. (1967). *The Arusha Declaration and Tanu's policy on socialism and self-reliance*. Arusha, Tanzania.
- Ochs, K. & Phillips, D. (2004). Processes of educational borrowing in historical context. In D. Phillips & K. Ochs (Eds.), *Educational policy borrowing: Historical perspectives*. *Oxford studies in comparative education* (pp.7–23). Oxford: Symposium Books.
- Phillips, D. (1989). Neither a borrower nor a lender be? The problems of cross-national attraction in education. *Cross-National Attraction in Education, Special Issue, Comparative Education*, 25(3), 267–274.
- Phillips, D. & Ochs, K. (2004). Researching Policy Borrowing: Some Methodological Problems in Comparative Education. *British Educational Research Journal*, 30(6), 773–784.
- Preston, P. W. (1982). *Theories of development*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Psacharopoulos, G., & Patrinos, H. A. (2002, September). *Returns to investment in education: A further update* (World Bank Policy Research working paper 2881). Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Salazar, A. O. (1967). *Salazar says: The policy in Africa and its errors*. Lisboa, Portugal: Secretariado Nacional de Informação.
- Samora Machel Historiou Vitórias da Frelimo: Denúncias Futuras Manobras do Imperialismo. (1975, June 21). *Jornal Notícias*, pp. 3, 7. Maputo, Moçambique.
- Steiner-Khamsi, G. (2002a). Re-framing educational borrowing as a policy strategy. In M. Caruso & T. Heinz-Elmar (Eds.), *Internationalisierung—internationalisation* (pp. 57–89). Frankfurt, Germany: Lang.
- Steiner-Khamsi, G. (2002b). Re-territorializing educational import: Explorations into the politics of educational borrowing. In A. Novoa & M. Lawn (Eds.), *Fabricating Europe: The formation of an education space* (pp. 69–86). Utrecht, The Netherlands: Kluwer.
- Steiner-Khamsi, G. (Ed.)(2004). *Lessons from elsewhere: The politics of educational borrowing & lending*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Turbin, J. (2001). Policy borrowing: lessons from European attempts to transfer training practices. *International Journal of Training and Development*, 5(2), 96–111.
- United Nations. (1999). *UN right to development: General assembly A/RES/53/155*. New York: United Nations.
- Wa Thiong'o, N. (1998). *Penpoints, gunpoints, and dreams: Towards a critical theory of the arts and the state in Africa*. Oxford, UK: Clarendon.

- Wolfensohn, J. D. (2002, April). *President's note to the development committee. DC2002-0007/Rev1, April 12*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- World Bank. (2002). *Classification of economies*. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. Retrieved from: <http://www.worldbank.org/data/countryclass/countryclass.html>
- Wuyts, M. (1979). Salazar e a economia colonial. In *Textos de apoio* (p. 26). Maputo, Mocambique: Centro de Estudos Africanos..

ⁱ Economic nationalism was first known as mercantilism (Gilpin, 1987).

ⁱⁱ For further reading on system transfer, see Steiner-Khamsi (2002a, 2002b); and Amos, Keiner, Proske, and Radtke (2002); Turbin (2001); and, Cossa 2008.

ⁱⁱⁱ For readings on Pan-Africanism, see Kenyatta (1938), Nyerere (1967), and Nkrumah (1970). For readings on the African Renaissance, see Makgoba (1999), Mbeki (1996, 1998), and Diop (1974, 1996).

^{iv} Thabo Mbeki formally introduced the term African Renaissance in an address to the Corporate Council on Africa in Chantilly, Virginia, in April 1997. For further reading on the relationship between education and the African Renaissance see Cossa (2008).

^v Income group: Economies are divided according to 2001 GNI per capita, calculated using the World Bank Atlas method. The groups are: low income, \$745 or less; lower-middle income, \$746–\$2,975; upper-middle income, \$2,976–\$9,205; and high income, \$9,206 or more. This information is available online at <http://www.worldbank.org/data/countryclass/countryclass.html>. Most African countries belong to the low-income group. South Africa, Cape Verde, Algeria, Morocco, and Namibia belong to the lower-middle income group. Botswana and Libya belong to the upper-middle income group.

^{vi} This text was prepared by the Centro de Estudos Africanos of the University of Eduardo Mondlane exclusively for internal use (lecture and investigation) and was accessed from Africana Library, Northwestern University Linear files, folder entitled "Mozambique."

^{vii} The original division in the Portuguese text is: (a) Economia de Plantações e Reserva de Mão-de-obra, 1885–1926; (b) Nacionalismo Económico, 1926–1960; (c) Crise de Restauração, 1960–1963/64.

^{viii} The speech by Prime Minister Dr. António de Oliveira Salazar, on November 30, 1967, was an acknowledgment of a tribute made to him by the representatives of the municipalities of Mozambique.

^{ix} African Africa refers to the territories South of Sahara and North of the Rovuma River. Euro-Africa refers to the territories South of Rovuma.

^x Ensino de Adaptação (Lit. Education for Adaptation) was toward the training of a population of peasants to work in the plantations and industry, as cheap labor force, in order to facilitate the Portuguese economic agenda of accumulation of capital in Portugal. According to Wuyts (1979), Portugal needed to accumulate capital in its main territory in order to consolidate the Portuguese Bourgeoisie.

^{xi} Ensino oficial (Lit. Official Education) was toward the training of African elites and Portuguese whites in the colonies.

^{xii} FRELIMO (Frente de Libertação de Moçambique) is the liberating and founding party of the Republic of Mozambique.

^{xiii} Educate Man to Win the War, Create a New Society and Develop the Nation.

^{xiv} Author's translation from Portuguese.

^{xv} For a detailed and foundational treatment of Marxism, see Marx, K. (1867, 1976).

^{xvi} At independence, under the colonial administration, adult literacy was less than 15 percent; and, due to the literacy campaigns initiated in the preindependence zonas libertadas (trans. liberated zones) under FRELIMO's control in the north of Mozambique, by 1980 the number of qualified school leavers had increased fourfold in both primary and secondary education (Hanlon, 1991).

^{xvii} Translation: Strategic Plan for Education, 1999–2003: Combat Exclusion, Renew the School.

^{xviii} MINED or Ministério da Educação.

^{xix} From the Southern African Nguni languages, such as Xi Rhonga, Shangaan, and Zulu. In this study, it refers to what is commonly labelled as bride-price.

^{xx} OMM refers to the Organization of Mozambican Women.

^{xxi} MINED (1998). TABELA A6: Projecção de Custos, Caixa Escolar.

^{xxii} Author's translation (of this quotation) from Portuguese.

^{xxiii} The Chissano administration inherited also the legacy of the Salazar and Machel administrations.

^{xxiv} For a more detailed treatment of this subject, see "The Policy Roots of Economic Crisis and Poverty: A Multi-Country Participatory Assessment of Structural Adjustment. Based on Results of the Joint World Bank/Civil Society/Government Structural Adjustment Participatory Review Initiative (SAPRI) and the Citizens' Assessment of Structural Adjustment (CASA) Prepared by the Structural Adjustment Participatory Review International Network (SAPRIN). Structural Participatory Review International Network (SAPRIN), April 2002. Available: http://www.saprin.org/SAPRI_Findings.pdf

IJEPL is a joint publication of the Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, the Faculty of Education at Simon Fraser University, and the College of Education and Human Development at George Mason University. By virtue of their appearance in this open access journal, articles are free to use, with proper attribution, in educational and other non-commercial settings 90 days after initial publication. Copyright for articles published in IJEPL is retained by the authors. More information is available on the IJEPL Web site: