

Role of Media in the Fifth Generation Warfare: The Indian Information War against Pakistan

Aqeel Ahmad Gichki

Abstract

This paper seeks to study 'Role of Media in the Fifth Generation Warfare: The Indian Information War against Pakistan.' Wars can turn the wheel of history. Technological developments have made the media a significant tool to frame perceptions. Pakistan is located in an important strategic location, where two global and regional powers are fighting for supremacy. The traditional rival has been creating fault lines within Pakistan. Where conventional war is unlikely between the nuclear-powered neighbors of South Asia, non-conventional means of war are preferred. As a result, they are employing fifth generation warfare (5GW) tools against Pakistan to destabilize it internally and to achieve their nefarious designs. Adversaries are using media tools to spread misinformation, disinforming reports, and false news. India has been using the media as a tool of warfare against Pakistan, which includes the recent example of exposing DisinfoLab. The Indian disinformation campaigns against Pakistan are aimed at creating a false perception internationally and creating an institutional divide domestically. Finally, the paper would highlight the challenges of 5GW faced by Pakistan and would devise a national media strategy to counter Indian information warfare.

Key Words: Fifth Generation Warfare (5GW), Media, Information War, Misinformation, Disinformation.

Introduction

“The supreme Art of War is to subdue the enemy without fighting,” says Chinese strategist and philosopher Sun Tzu. Advancements in technology have dramatically changed the techniques and strategies of war. The advancement in conventional and nuclear weapon capabilities of states has made wars more deadly, costly, and less likely to occur. Since the dawn of technological advancements, the generations of war have transformed from first generation to current 5GW while heading towards sixth in the near future. On War, Carl von Clausewitz states, ‘Each age has its own kind of war, its own limiting conditions, and its own peculiar preconception’. States have developed other means of waging war against their rivals. Now, the war is not fought on battlefield but on different avenues. The war methods have extended and are not limited only to conventional means but to non-conventional techniques and strategies. The nature of warfare has also changed in the modern world. In the present era, internet and information technology have changed the nature and dynamics of warfare. The role of media and internet is growing in the realm of warfare. Media and internet are the main tools used in the latest generation warfare. The latest generation of warfare is the battle of perception and information. It is waged when it becomes impossible for a state to destroy its rival state through direct military attack. Hence, propaganda, disinformation, use of non-state actors, and media campaigns are launched to generate anarchy, chaos and resentments. Media campaigns are out of proportion and beyond the control of a state. The rise of social media has led to new trends in the domain of warfare. Social media tools particularly Facebook, WhatsApp, Instagram and Twitter etc. have become instruments of the fifth generation warfare. Fake news, misleading reports and falsified propaganda are spread through these modern media tools.

Pakistan has a substantial geo-political location. It has always played a constructive influence at the regional and global level in this regard. Because of its strategic location, nuclear capabilities, ties to China, a

rising regional power and the commencement of the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), Pakistan has a significant place in the global power structure. As a result, enemy intelligence services are waging cyber warfare against it. In order to generate confusion and uncertainty in Pakistan, the opponents are waging this sort of warfare, using weapons of hybrid warfare, to undermine the country's internal security. A conventional war has been impossible to wage against Pakistan since it became a nuclear power in 1998. Opponents are now more likely to wage a hybrid war against Pakistan. On Pakistan's Defense Day, General Qamar Javed Bajwa said Pakistan and its security forces are facing a slew of threats to their reputation. The enemies are trying hard to disrupt internal security of the country by using electronic, print and social media, NGOs disgruntled elements and other means as tools of the fifth generation warfare. Anti-Pakistan elements are engaged in inciting sectarianism in Pakistani society. Fifth generation warfare undertaken by adversaries against Pakistan has multiple negative impacts which include social unrest, ethnic and sectarian divisions, defamation of Pakistan globally, economic unrest, and many more. Pakistan is making efforts to counter nefarious agenda of the enemy by preparing itself for fifth generation warfare. This research paper highlights challenges of fifth generation warfare to Pakistan that include, propaganda war, media campaigns, spread misinformation, disinforming reports, and false news.

Research Methodology

The paper investigates “Role of Media in the Fifth Generation Warfare: The Indian Information War against Pakistan”. In this study, the researcher emphasizes on media and information warfare, which are being utilized as tactics of fifth generation warfare against Pakistan. Data for this study has been acquired using primary and secondary sources. Different data collection tools have been used in completing this research. Using secondary sources, the researcher used books, scholarly articles, research journals, official reports and media and for primary sources, the author used his own analysis to acquire important data for this research.

The Use of Kautilyan Undeclared Warfare Strategy

In Arthashastra, Kautilya, a famous military strategist and advisor to Chandragupta Maurya, clarified the strategies used by a king to meet this objective. To obtain political objectives, the ruler should first wield all

forms of power, whether economic, social, or military. According to Kautilya, there are three kinds of warfare: "open warfare, concealed warfare, and silent warfare". Whereas the concept of open war is self-evident, Kautilya was referring to guerilla warfare when he speaks of concealed war. His original contribution, however, was the concept of silent war. According to him, "silent war" is a type of warfare with another state in which the ruler and his ministers-and, unknowingly, the people-act explicitly as if they are at peace with the opposing state, while secret agents and spies assassinate key leaders in the other state, create divisions among key ministers and classes, and spread propaganda and disinformation with the ultimate goal of undermining and enslaving it. India and Pakistan, both being nuclear states, could not directly engage each other by conventional means. Instead, they utilize non-conventional means such as asymmetrical and irregular warfare, which are generally covert operations used to accomplish political goals. The Pakistan Army Chief General Qamar Javed Bajwa stated, "We are facing the challenge that has been imposed on us in the form of the fifth generation or hybrid war." Its purpose is to discredit the country and its armed forces and spread chaos. We are well aware of this danger. We will surely succeed in winning this war with the cooperation of the nation, by the will of Almighty Allah". India knows that it cannot directly hit a nuclear-armed country like Pakistan, so the only possible way to target Pakistan is by utilizing the Kautilya silent war strategy. Through a silent war strategy, India is trying to weaken Pakistan within its borders. The Indian tactics include Indian movies, social media applications like Instagram, Facebook, Twitter, think tanks, websites, news channels, misinformation and disinformation means. As a large country, India aspires to be the hegemon of South Asia, and in order to achieve this goal, it is constantly battling its adversaries on all fronts, as described in the following assertions.

India's Fifth Generation Warfare against Pakistan

"We must remember that in times of war, what is said on the enemy's side of the front is always propaganda, and what is said on our side of the front is truth and righteousness, the cause of humanity and a crusade for peace," said by Walter Lippmann. India and Pakistan have fought four wars and are currently facing skirmishes on their border since independence. After the evaluation of nuclear deterrence between India and Pakistan, the source of conflict was transited from direct war to

5GW or hybrid warfare. For India, 5GW has emerged as a primary tool to destabilize Pakistan. Certainly, in India's serious plan to undermine Pakistan, Islamabad has developed a contemporary capability to disgrace Delhi's hybrid attack and funding towards separatist groups. India continued its consistent support for multiple anti-state organizations. Numerous Indian networks have been uncovered for creating social trouble and disturbing the peace. Because of this, sixteen Indian officials were dismissed from Islamabad. Furthermore, Pakistan's foreign ministry Shah Mahmood Qureshi narrated, "the evidence provided by Pakistan is sophisticated evidence of Indian financial and material sponsorship for several terrorist organizations, including UN-designated terrorist organization Jamaat-ul-Ahraar, Baloch Liberation Army (BLA) and Tehreek-e-Labbaik Pakistan".

The recent Tehreek-e-Labbaik Pakistan protests in Pakistan portrayed the signs of Indian propaganda. Besides, protests were displayed in India as a rising civil war in Pakistan. Similar activities have projected India's major involvement in Pakistan's domestic instability. Pakistan's domestic instability is exploited through Baloch vulnerability. Balochistan province is drenched in socio-economic backwardness and has minimal control over resources. Certainly, Indian propaganda and disinformation movements have resulted in a psychological distance between the establishment and separatist groups (BLA). This organization is funded by India and conducts terrorist attacks throughout the country in order to achieve its primary goal of destabilizing Pakistan.

Undoubtedly, for the past several years, India has been extensively involved in hybrid tactics to destabilize Pakistan on the internal and external fronts. In 2020, Pakistan handed over a dossier of RAW is involved in terrorist activities particularly in Balochistan province. The dissemination of fake news and propaganda, the creation of a specific media perception of Pakistan, the incitement of anti-state sentiments and identity-based conflicts through informational domains, the support of certain separatist and militant groups, and the attempt to sabotage the CPEC project are some of the key media tactics being used against Pakistan.

The Indian Chronicles: Building misperceptions

In 2019, the EU DisinfoLab found a massive operation targeting international organizations and advancing Indian interests. The

operation, entitled "Indian Chronicles," revived dead media, think tanks, and NGOs. It also raised the dead. This network operates in Brussels and Geneva, creating and amplifying anti-Pakistan propaganda. Fake media, think institutes, and NGOs favoring Indian interests were exposed in 2019. According to EU DisinfoLab data, over 750 Indian-backed websites have operated in 119 countries to destabilize Pakistan in the previous 15 years. The perpetrators utilized multiple names and imitated prominent outlets like the EU Observer, The Economist, and Voice of America. They registered websites with false phone numbers and submitted fictitious addresses to the UN. Indian Chronicles also staged allegedly multi-stakeholder events where everyone speaking was bound to them. In addition, they registered the names of deceased persons to attend events five years after their deaths, and created dozens of journalist identities. They used false media layers that would quote and republish each other. To fulfil geopolitical interests, they employed politicians who truly cared about women's or minority rights, and they offered far-right politicians a platform when their goals aligned.

Fake News and Informational War (IW)

Furthermore, the war of hash-tags has played its part to spread fake news against Pakistan. One such example is proliferation of disinformation and anti-state content through Twitter, Facebook, Web Links and YouTube. According to Digital Rights Monitor (DRM), a look at the data analysis of a hashtag 'Civil war in Pakistan' campaign on twitter fraudulently claiming a civil war in Pakistan, uncovers that India is responsible for 61% of the tweets. New Delhi contributes the most tweets to the trend, accounting for 10% of the total volume of tweets. This hashtag had generated a total of 84,000 tweets, replies, and retweets, with 6688 tweets per hour being generated at the peak of the trend. As many as 85 percent of the tweets in the hashtags are retweets, indicating that any trend is being artificially and purposefully amplified. Mumbai, Bangalore, Hyderabad, Lucknow, Pune, and Jaipur are among the top ten cities contributing to the hash tag. One of most replied-to, retweeted-to, and influential accounts contributing to the false hashtag are all from India, which included accounts with a public history of disseminating anti-Pakistan propaganda. Major Gaurav Arya, a Twitter account known for consistently tweeting anti-Pakistan propaganda, is one of these accounts. V K Sharma, another Indian account, is also one of the trend's top influencers.

This trend of disinformation using fake pictures, videos, and other chaos-based content to build an anti-narrative against the state has been investigated in a report by the Digital Rights Foundation. The report illustrates that pro-Indian Twitter accounts were identified in campaigning against Pakistan, particularly from October 21, 2020 to October 23, 2020, when the case of Pakistan's status in the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) was under review. According to the report, the main trends in executing deception through this campaign included the following elements:

1. There were two categories of Twitter accounts, i.e., verified and unverified accounts, which were used to shape the operation. Verified accounts uploaded content linked to civil war and turbulence in Pakistan by manipulating the Karachi bomb blast episode and the protests of the opposition. In addition, they tried to propagate how Punjab, the major province, and Karachi, the hub of financial activity, are being subject to anarchy and unrest.
2. Mostly, pictorial content has an immediate and considerable psychological effect. Fake pictures were uploaded on Twitter accounts to disseminate misinformation.

In 2020, Twitter was asked by Pakistan Telecommunication Authority (PTA) to take action against the culprits who proliferate anti-Pakistan propaganda on Twitter. The Hashtag (#) used against Pakistan were 18,700 and 3,384 tweets respectively.

Misinformation has long been used by India to spread propaganda against Pakistan. In October 2020, claims of civil war in Karachi, Pakistan were circulated on Indian Twitter accounts. Despite the fact that the claims were false, the story was extensively disseminated on Indian news websites. The recent hashtag appears to be following a similar pattern, with top influencers of the trend including both Indian Twitter accounts and Indian websites. One of the most frequently tweeted links comes from a media outlet that bills itself as an "India Focused, International Strategic News Portal." This website's story, which is the second most shared link in the hashtag, alleges that "civil war has erupted in Pakistan over many days".

Indian Disinformation Tactics

Another tactic of propaganda and disinformation employed by India is the outsourcing of news content in support of Baloch separatist groups in Pakistan. A number of Indian websites have been found to publish sympathetic and glorifying content for anti-Pakistan groups. The following Indian news outlets and YouTube channels are one of the few that share and support terrorist groups in Pakistan.

Table 1: Indian websites and YouTube channels that share anti-Pakistan content

YouTube Channels		Total Views
WION https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Peva7kGUplk	It shares disinformation related to Pakistan.	2.74B
<u>Study IQ education</u> https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BEGc16SFj7Y	Anti-Pakistan information	2.83B
Hindustan Times (YouTube channel and Website) https://www.youtube.com/c/htdotcom/videos	This shares content related to separatist groups in Balochistan.	2.02B
<u>Defensive Offensive</u> https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XEE06VropnQ	Share anti-Pakistan sentiments, glorify terrorist groups and provoke the youth against	134M

	Pakistan.	
Websites		
News Intervention (website and Twitter) https://www.newsintervention.com/ https://twitter.com/NewsIntervene?s=20	Support Militant groups in Balochistan	50K Dec,2021
The Hindu (Website) https://www.thehindu.com/search/?q=Balochistan+Liberation+Army&order=DESC&sort=publishdate	Share news of insurgent attacks on security forces in Pakistan.	25.9M Dec, 2021
Hindustan Times https://www.hindustantimes.com/	Content related to separatist groups in Balochistan.	83.0M Dec, 2021

Propaganda in Indian Films

India is fully aware of the situation and knows that it cannot wage a full-scale war with nuclear-armed Pakistan. It has used hybrid means of warfare, such as using media tactics, to undermine the willpower of Pakistani youth and bring about a bad image of Pakistan in the international community. Its news channels not only played war drums during the last few years but also engaged a large number of audiences in their grasp of propaganda. Other than its media outlets, Indian movies are a key tool in proliferating very negative propaganda against Pakistan.

The two archrivals have been enemies since their inception, but India, being a larger country with a larger economy and population has utilized its negative propaganda tactics against Pakistan more than any other country could ever initiate. In India, Bollywood movies are being used to deliver anti-Pakistan messages to the world. A large number of movies have portrayed Pakistan as a failed state. Other than that, Pakistan has been shown as a country that harbors terrorist organizations. Many of its movies show Pakistan as a hub for the Taliban, where they can easily move from one place to another. The Hindu nationalist government has increased and activated their propaganda machinery in the Indian film industry, producing a number of anti-Pakistan movies each year.

The movies may not seem to affect Pakistan as a whole, but the hidden messages that they keep delivering will affect the image of Pakistan in the world. Although citizens from both countries strive to collaborate through sports and the arts, radical forces in various professions do not want the countries to begin peacefully. In the last six decades, the Indian film industry has produced innumerable anti-Pakistan films. Because of the vast number of films, it produces and releases each year, the Indian film industry is widely regarded as the most important. The origins of Bollywood films may be traced back to the early 1900s. When India gained its independence in 1947, the country's film industry exploded all over the world. Romance, love, and action films were being made. However, films about specific events were also produced and published, as movies are regarded as the easiest and least expensive means of conveying a message and altering people's mindsets at the same time.

The following Indian movies share and support anti-Pakistan messages and portrays Pakistan as a failed state and a hub of terrorism.

Table 2: Indian movies that are anti-Pakistan

Shershaah (2021)	Against Pakistan army and anti-Pakistan
Sooryavanshi (2021)	Against Pakistan army
The City of Bombay (1995)	Anti-Muslims
Border (1997)	Against Pakistan army and anti-

	Pakistan
Train to Pakistan (1998)	Against Pakistan and anti-Muslims
Hindustan ki Qasm (1999)	Anti-Pakistan
Sarfrosh (1999)	Anti-Pakistan
Gadar (2001)	Against Pakistan and anti-Muslims
Pinjar (2003)	Anti-Muslims
Haider (2014)	Against Pakistan and anti-Muslims
Children of War(2014)	Against Pakistan army
Phantom (2015)	Anti-Pakistan
Sarbajeet Singh (2016)	Against Pakistan army and anti-Pakistan
Bajrangi Bhajan (2016)	Against Pakistan army
A Wednesday (2016)	Against Pakistan and anti-Muslims
Partition 1947(2017)	Against Quaid-E-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah
Uri: The Surgical Strike (2019)	Anti-Pakistan

Implications for Pakistan

Currently, New Delhi has been engaged in exploiting non-attributable means like cyber, information warfare, surprise, deception, and extensive use of proxy forces to jeopardize Pakistan's national security. According to the findings of Comparitech, (Comparitech is a pro-consumer website providing information, tools, reviews and comparisons to improve their cyber security and privacy online), Pakistan ranked seventh among the

worst cyber security countries. It is vulnerable to cyber challenges such as cyber-terrorism, data espionage, data and information theft, and cyber warfare. There are ramifications for Pakistan because both countries have nuclear weapons and are aware that a conventional war will escalate into a nuclear Armageddon if they want to fight it out fully. However, there is still the possibility of war since states continue to compete and wage war in a hybrid warfare capacity. General Qamar Javed Bajwa, the head of Pakistan's military, made a clear statement in 2018, that the country has entered a hybrid conflict phase and must be prepared for it Invalid source specified..As a result, policymakers, members of the strategic establishment and analysts in Pakistan are more aware. After seeing India's reluctance to carry out conventional strikes in 2019, Pakistan has now realized that nuclear strikes are an even later option for them. Now, India is attempting to use non-linear, non-conventional, and psychological warfare Invalid source specified..

Similarly, Pakistan's counter-attack will be identical. As a result, in South Asia and around the world, nuclear-armed states will perceive this as a prominent domain. Greater powers are now using asymmetrical techniques of warfare against lesser ones. It might also be used by India, which is a large country in the region. Pakistan faces two distinct types of difficulties. Military Force and Kinetic Force that are considered the essence of "hard power," while non-kinetic and intangible "soft power" is used instead. It is all about the A-to-Z spectrum in the spectrum. Maligning techniques, racial and sectarian exploitations, and even terrorism itself will only be used by the kinetic methods.

The traditional military also conducts strikes, which Pakistan considers a transition from tactical to operational and operational-to-technical level operations. Then there is nuclear power, which is a full spectrum. Pakistan did well in the field of hard power. In February 2019, Pakistani soldiers debunked a myth that had persisted for fifty years: that India possessed the conventional upper hand by destroying the Indian air force. Additionally, their submarine was spotted as soon as their naval forces arrived. Detection of a submarine makes it a sitting duck. Because of the likelihood of heavy Pakistani retaliation, the Indians withdrew their Brahmos missiles. Consequently, this long-standing fallacy was finally

debunked. People are not aware that when India's myths were shattered, Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi launched into a nuclear rhetoric. In most cases, traditionally nuclear-armed governments that are better off or in a better position than their adversaries are avoid using nuclear rhetoric in their communications. Pakistan used nuclear rhetoric in 2002; however, Pakistan made no mention of nuclear rhetoric this time. "We have not maintained nuclear weaponry for Diwali", "night of massacre," were some of the phrases used by India. Pakistan is capable of defending itself in the realm of hard power.

Pakistan's soft power, such as through the media, is fragile. Pakistan has never been able to explain why some news is favorable to them while other news is unfavorable. The media is not to blame because it is working in this area, but education needs to be improved. The people of Pakistan are not in harmony with the political leadership, which is used by the enemy, and this is a problem for the country. Every slack left by the people is being exploited by India. As long as Pakistan continues to raise the Kashmir problem, India will use the Balochistan card, as well as assist and grant media access to anti-Pakistan organizations. A big danger to Pakistan's future development aspirations will come from India's nationalist administration, which is investing more in 5GW than any previous government in India.

Moreover, for decades, Indian "hybrid warfare" has targeted Balochistan. On March 3, 2016, Lt. Comd. Kulbhushan Jadhav, an Indian Navy officer, was captured in Mashkel, Balochistan, near the border region of Chaman, during a counterintelligence raid. Destabilizing Balochistan and Pakistan from Iran since 2013. Jadhav funded Baloch separatists and militants; causing sectarianism throughout the country. Balochistan is further targeted by India, using the vulnerabilities of Baloch people and anti-Pakistan groups as a tool to destabilize Pakistan. Another issue that Pakistan faces is controlling social media and internet sources. The youth are engaged in the media and they frequently watch Indian-made anti-propaganda videos, intentionally or unintentionally, where people like Major Gaurav Arya change perceptions of young people and portray Pakistan as the enemy of them.

Policy Recommendations for Pakistan

Defending against the IW threat will demand increased government and non-governmental activities in the twenty-first century. IW has become a realistic weapon for potential adversaries because of the country's

growing dependence on information and information-based technology. There has been a dramatic increase in the vulnerability of "information" and the infrastructures that support it. Information-based warfare may now be waged from anywhere in the world, and adversarial forces can do it while remaining completely anonymous. Thus, the ability to recognize and defend against this new kind of warfare is critical to Pakistan's national security infrastructure's existence.

Although Pakistani security policy discourse has begun to accept "hybrid warfare," it still has to be properly secured. Therefore, the government will build the Hybrid Warfare Stratagem Center (HWSC). The Center will work with the Center of Pakistan and International Relations (COPAIR) to assist in building up the potential to enable Pakistani decision makers to fully comprehend the hybrid warfare hazard concept effectively develop metrics to get a grip on incidents, comprehensively identify security flaws, and ponder how hybrid threats might develop in the future. While the Center is also looking into public-private partnerships (PPPs) to strengthen its capabilities against hybrid warfare.

The HWSC will also create an integrated information sharing system extending over all government offices, intelligence agencies, and the armed forces. The civilian law enforcement agencies' 'coordination apparatus requires reorganization to suit the demands of the current time. Today, multiple departments/institutions (police and intelligence agencies) sharing information and collaboration are weak. They ought to be trained and equipped to apply artificial intelligence, etc. Moreover, the government needs to create a culture of sharing information and cooperatively chalk out remedies between different provincial and central law enforcement organizations. They have to resist the approach of reacting in solitude. Hence, a pyramid strategy framework is built from bottom to top in information collection and decision-making processes from top to bottom.

Pakistan has to do radical changes in its attitude towards this new threat and below is the few more policy recommendations that can be utilized to counter Indian IW.

i. Pakistan has to make sure that the ideology of Pakistan is clearly comprehended by the youth. By doing so, it can prevent anti-Pakistan elements from changing perceptions regarding the actual ideology.

ii. The media is fragile and it needs to be stronger in terms of understanding what is favorable for the country and what is

- not. Pakistan has never been able to explain why some news is favorable to them while other news is unfavorable.
- iii. The government ensures that the Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority (PEMRA) efficiently imposes regulatory laws on media houses to prevent misinformation, disinformation, and fake news.
 - iv. Media should be used for narrative building.
 - v. Improve the capacity of civilian law enforcement agencies to undertake, manage, combat, and squash sub-conventional threats effectively to secure both society and the country internally.
 - vi. Instead of showing movies, series, and cartoons from other countries, Pakistan should produce its own content to deliver its own messages and prevent any anti-Pakistan content from reaching the audience, especially the youth
 - vii. India produces more than 700 movies a year and Pakistan produces less than 50 movies, this gap should be filled by promoting film industry of Pakistan and should also be used to produce films on historical events and influential people like Quid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, Allama Iqbal, and others.
 - viii. A mature media will always be beneficial for the country so Pakistan should enhance the credibility of media and educate the youth and journalists.

Conclusions

It has become second nature for India and other like-minded countries to use 5GW techniques to degrade Pakistan's national security in recent years. In addition to the use of terrorism, they have also spread misinformation and fueled societal unrest by disseminating it on social media. They have exploited the power of cyber technology and social rifts. By creating military tension along the border and repeatedly violating international border norms by firing across the Line of Control, India has engaged with Pakistani armed forces while at the same time alienating society and causing a wedge among state institutions. In the same way, India has gotten involved in Balochistan and has aided anti-government forces there. Using cinema and misinformation has been the tactic of India to defame Pakistan and break harmony between state

institutions and its people. A hybrid warfare or 5GW is an example of India's efforts to maintain asymmetrical ties with Pakistan, which are currently evident in its policies. This distrust has put Pakistan in a predicament. In order for India to carry out a limited military operation against Pakistan while keeping the threshold of engagement below the nuclear escalation checkpoint, this looks to be an effort to give India an advantage in the conventional domain.

However, any such action would have far-reaching consequences, which must be kept in mind. As long as India and Pakistan go to war, nuclear clouds will hang over the entire region because there is no guarantee that such limited offensives would always remain "limited." A 5GW attack on both society and the state would necessitate a major rethinking of Pakistan's national security strategy, which the country's ruling class must undertake in order to protect itself. Implementing a comprehensive strategy to combat 5GW would be necessary to avoid a national disaster.

References:

(1950). The West Punjab Muslim Personal Law (shariat) Application Act (IX of 1948) and 'Muslim Personal Law (Sindh) Amendment Act.

1951). Census Report on India and Pakistan.

(1954). Census of Pakistan, Karachi, 1951. Debates, CAP.

(2005). Karachi Mega Cities Preparation Project. Asian Development Bank.

(2015). HRCP Report on Government Schools in Karachi. Karachi: HRCP.

Abbas, R. (1969). *Social Welfare Administration in Pakistan*. Lahore: Alhamra Academy.

Ahmed, A. S. (1997). New York: Routledge.

Ali, M. (1996). What is Darse-e-Nizamiyah. In *Ulema, Sufi and Intellectuals* (pp. 134-136). 1996: Fiction House.

Asif Iqbal, H. K. (2004). *Nonprofit Sector in Pakistan- The Historical Background*. Pakistan: SPDC.

Hasan, A. (2000). *Housing for the Poor*. Karachi: City Press.

Hasan, A. (2016). *Emerging Urbanization Trends: The Case of Karachi*. Retrieved September 25, 2016, from <http://cdpr.org.pk/images/UrbanizationTrendsInKarachi.pdf>

Hughes, A. W. (1874). *A Gazetteer of the Province of Sindh*. London: George Bell and Sons.

Katrak, S. (2007). *Karachi During the British Era: Two Histories of a Modern City*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.

Kramer, M. E. (n.d.). *The Competitive Advantage of Corporate Philanthropy*. Harvard Business Review.

Laurent Gayer. (2014). *Karachi – Ordered Disorder and the Struggle for the City*. Noida (India): HarperCollins Publishers.

Lester M. Salamon, H. K. (1996). *Social Origins of Civil*

Society: Explaining the Nonprofit Sector Cross Nationally .

Baltimore: John Hopkins University, Institute of Policy Studies.

Miles, K. (1963). *Dynamo in Silk - A Brief Biographical Sketch of Begum Rana Liaquat Ali Khan*. Rome.

Qasim, S. (2021). Role of Information Technology to Spread Sectarianism in Context of 5th Generation-Hybrid Warfare in Pakistan. *Karachi Islamicus*, 1(2).

Newcombe, V. Z. (1960). *A Town Extension Scheme: At Karachi*. Karachi.

Paskeviciute, C. J. (2006, November). "How Ethnic and Linguistic Heterogeneity Influence the Prospects for Civil

Society: A Comparative Study of Citizenship Behavior". *The Journal of Politics*, 68(4), 783–802.

Rehmatullah, S. (2002). *Social Welfare in Pakistan*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.

Richard Steinberg, i. .: (2006). "Economic Theories of Nonprofit Organizations". In W. W. (eds.), *Nonprofit Sector: A*

Research Handbook (second edition ed., pp. 119-121). New Haven, USA: Yale University Press.

Sadiq, D. M. (1989). *Sindh Tareekh k Aaeene me*. Karachi: Naoka- Daniyal.

Samuelson, P. A. (n.d.). "The Pure Theory of Public Expenditure". *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 36(4), 387-389.

Watkins, K. (1995). *Oxfam Poverty Report*. Oxford: Oxfam Publications.