HARMONIA : Journal of Arts Research and Education 15 (1) (2015), 1-8 p-ISSN 1411-5115
Available online at http://journal.unnes.ac.id/nju/index.php/harmonia e-ISSN 2355-3820
DOI: 10.15294/harmonia.v15i1.3690

THE DEVELOPMENT OF ART LEARNING MODEL AT SCHOOL (A REVIEW OF MUSIC EDUCATION LEARNING IN INDONESIA)

✉**Dieter Mack**
University of Music, Lübeck, Germany
✉Musikhochschule Lübeck, Große Petersgrube 21, 23552 Lübeck, Germany
E-mail: kamasan@t-online.de

Received: April 22, 2015. Revised: May 5, 2015. Accepted: June 13, 2015

Abstract

At the present time, art education is often ignored. Focus on teaching and learning at school seems to accentuate other subjects, such as: science, economics, and technology. This trend is becoming more concerning for the arts is a field of study, which draws attention to the development of perceptual sensitivity, creativity, as well as social responsibility. However, if art education, in this case is music education, is taught theoretically based on other cultural materials, then the consequences will be worse for students. This study is aimed to draw outlines of music education which hopefully can answer the three aspects of music which are previously described. The outlines are arranged based on recent discoveries in audio perceptions.

Keywords: Art Learning Model; Music Education Learning; Indonesia

How to Cite: Mack, D. (2015). The Development of Art Learning Model at School (A Review of Music Education Learning in Indonesia). *Harmonia: Journal of Arts Research And Education*, 15(1). doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.15294/harmonia.v15i1.3690

INTRODUCTION

Before explaining the core problems of art education learning materials, there are three main factors related to music education at school which need to be noted:

The first aspect is that art education materials need to be based on the local cultural resources on each of the students, according to their physiological development. Actually, this first factor does not need to be explained here since it has become one of the concerns of experts in the field of music education all this time. It is hoped that assumptions related to implementation of Western music as the central material of music education can get decreased for the sake of appreciating the diversity of local cultures.

Another reason behind the proposed idea is because a Western art has its own culture with its typical history which is essential can be understood as the Western cultural context and may influence the awareness of students live in Western countries. In Germany, we also do not initiate the music education teaching with lesson related to *talempong* or Javanese *Gamelan.*

However, some experts believe that Western arts have been widely known and entrenched in Indonesia, especially in the field of popular music. This assumption is true, however, there are two comments regarding to this, as follows:

First, popular music does not need to be given as music materials at school since it has been extensively disseminated through the media on a massive scale.

Second, during my teaching in Indonesian schools (since 1992), all experiences have proven that (with various exceptions) the use of Western music's grammar is still being implemented with local awareness, such as in the teaching of music intonation.

The majority of Indonesian music teachers are still teaching Western musical intonation tone by using Indonesian music intonation tone. As a consequence, the results are not in accordance with the required necessity. If changes in short intervals are the characteristic of the majority of musical works in Indonesia, therefore –with many reasons– what occurred in Europe is the otherwise. It seems that what happened in the explanation above is not only resulted from the influence of habit, but also influenced by environment. Even, a genetic nuance has determined various standards which are impossible to be implemented at every turn in a relatively short time.

The second aspect is closely related to us who have role as teachers. A high-quality art education needs to be opened to all kinds of art works, in particular those which are less popular since popular art has been hugely exposed through mass media. Inculcating diversity will develop the ability to appreciate art as a recent complex human expression. However, it needs to be noted that there are differences between quantitative and qualitative appreciation. It means appreciation towards a variety of arts in a relatively short time will not instill a series of common sensitivity, not only to the musical aspect. It will be explained further in the following section.

In this endeavor, types of Western arts are possible to be implemented as learning materials at school by constructing a strong mental representation foundation with regard to local arts prior the implementation.

The third is related to curriculum. It has become a regular activity in Indonesia that in every shift of government in power, the education system is one of the topics which is often debated under a claim that the curriculum needs to be revisited and revised. Since 1992, the time when I first paid my attention to music education in Indonesia, the curriculum has been amended as much as four or five times. Unfortunately, I have not seen significant improvements in the learning process up to these days. In my own opinion, the curriculum is not the essential part in the learning which needs to be revised, but the teaching methodology that usually does not incorporate in the curriculum.

Moreover, do not perceive curriculum as a text that can be transferred in the ratio 1:1. Generally, a curriculum can only offer certain suggested ideas related to classroom teaching learning process that needs to be adapted and adjusted based on the conditions in the actual classroom.

PERCEPTION AS THE FOUNDATION OF MUSIC EDUCATION

In a recent study entitled "How the Brain Learns Music?" has been proven that an education process which is generally cognitive is unable to develop musical competency, even though it has an appreciative aspect within the learning process. Edwin E. Gordon states that:

The purpose of music education is to provide one with understanding so that he can express himself aesthetically to the extent his attitudes allow, with both his body and surrogate abstractions. In this way he will also understand the works of others. Aesthetic reaction, or appreciation, provides one insight into himself and into the nature of his relationship to his environment. The more one understands, the more one is able to appreciate, although one does not necessarily like all that one understands. The assumption that exposure to music, with supplementary historical information and metaphoric descriptions will produce favorable emotions which will endure throughout life is becoming increasingly suspect.

Audiation takes place when one hears music through recall or creation, the sound not being physically present (except

of course when one is engaging in a performance) and derives musical meaning. Aural perception and usually conception takes place when one listens to music actually being performed by others. However, to aurally perceive and conceive music in a meaningful manner, one must be capable of audiating music, for referential and comparative musical purposes, heard at a previous time (long-term memory). And while listening to music, one audiates what has just been heard (short-time memory) as a basis for audiating what will be heard. Without audiation, which is not necessarily nor usually a matter of memorization, even repetition and sequences could not exist and thus there would be no form in music (Gordon, 1980).

Both quotations emphasize relatively new ideas in the field of music education. It is said as 'relatively new' because the ideas explained above are considered to be new but not really new. Both ideas above are not new since the ideas stated above explain the natural process on how humans learn music, which are by direct experience and practice. Here, the representation of musical grammatical mental in music is accidentally developed on its place. This is one of the reasons why music around the students' environment is considered essential as the foundation of the learning process.

However, the statements are also considered to be rather new since these very fundamental thoughts have been ignored for a long time by practitioners in the field of formal education, both in Indonesia and other countries abroad. Most people often assume that knowledge related to the history, background and theory of music are more important rather than the music itself. The reasons behind the assumption themselves will not be discussed further, here. Today, knowledge of perception has been able to give a strong natural foundation in order to fundamentally change the learning process of music.

The human's brain is analogous as empty drawers. Through experiences, practices, and comparisons, those drawers are always filled. What makes it interesting, these contents –here are called as mental representation- are not always stable, even in the process of continuous change, based on the number of experiences that are collected by people. Until now, experts have not agreed about when this mental representation will be getting increased, and when will it is no longer developed. Temporary results show that the process of change and adaptation are always possible to be occurred. Which has been proven is that in the age of 40 above, the rapidity of adaptation is getting decreased.

In the knowledge of perception, there are two types of learning:
Declarative knowledge is a knowledge which is presented in a form of definition, declaration, etc. In other words, (declarative knowledge is to know about certain things and to think about an act). This knowledge should not be a point of foundation for the musical experience or the process of music learning.

On the other hand, procedural knowledge is knowledge through active/ practical activities. In other words, (it is to know how, thoughts which are resulted to practical acts). It has to become the start of every effort in the process of learning music, because this is the only thing which can develop mental representation.

According to the previous statement, cultural insights which need to be conveyed simultaneously with auditory materials tentatively tend to interfere. The materials do not support the development process of the musical representation itself. Knowledge related to the background and the theory of music does not automatically refer towards the enhancement of musical competency, unless when it is initiated with the development of a long and deep musical representation.

In the process of learning process, singing and dancing are the basic ways to develop true musical representations. In this case, the term "singing" is not allowed to be interpreted narrowly, which is by singing children's songs, folk songs, or

anthem only.

In this study, what is meant by practical activities in music education is more general, which is the vocalization of everything that needs to be learnt. As a result of this learning process, there will be several strong and stable musical representations. Then, the learning process can be continued to develop theoretical knowledge, or cultural knowledge, or cultural context. It means, in that stage, we only "recreate music arrangement" (the process of rearranging data inside the brain) systematically from what actually has been known/ represented.

Musical representation is usually started with the "figural" representation (concrete form) as the prerequisite to the development of "formal" representation (the more abstract structural). Therefore, firstly, music needs to be taught musically (practical/ active) for the sake of developing the true "musical thoughts" ("audition") rather than only focusing on formal knowledge, explicitly or definitively (Gruhn, 200).

If a certain status has been developed with the help of musical representation, the relation between cultures can become one of the topics that can be discussed. An educational process, on the other hand, generally tends to be filled. Knowledge related to data that are repeatedly asked, as in the written tests after a series of theoretical learning are given, is only give several representation imagination about certain things, since the data are only contained of information. The knowledge of data cannot be equated with the musical competence.

The above issue can be seen as if the process of learning language. Knowing about the grammar of a language does not guarantee that one can speak the language fluently. However, if we examine how babies learn to speak, it is clear that the process of learning language is initiated by imitation which is then associated with particular meanings. Therefore, network of mental representations is developed which allows the autonomous communication to happen (the figural knowledge has been transformed to formal knowledge). The process of learning music is more or less the same.

Moreover, it is argued that even visual aid seems to less conducive to develop formal musical representation:

The more we listen and understand intensively and actively, the more representation can be activated. However, this representation has to be always musical. Visual aid will avoid the auditive perception development, if it occurs before the establishment of musical representation. Frequently, pedagogical impatience creates the willingness to accelerate the process of learning to hear something. Whereas, if it happens, only the actual knowledge that can be hindered (Gruhn, 1998, p. 174).

Examples

Supposed that the theme discussed in classroom teaching is the musical scales of Balinese *karawitan* music (the traditional music of Bali island), and the time allocation is 90 minutes or more. The following are several possible teaching scenarios.

Example A: Teacher does not have recordings at all. Thus, he gives the students a declarative knowledge related to two common systems of scales in Bali, *pelog* and *slendro. Pelog* is the system of scale with the range between tones is considerably different from one to another, however, in *slendro,* the range between tones is relatively similar from one to another . Here, I will not problematize the truth of this definition, since definition still has several deficiencies. Possibly, the teacher still relates the material with the Javanese culture, or he is making a differentiation with the statement that: According to the types of *gamelan, pelog* is based on the system of 7 tones, which is dragged by several special scales, each with five tones and different distance from one tone to another.

Example B: Teacher has recordings from two types of scales, for instance, from sets of *gender wayang* and *gong kebyar* which is given to the students to be listened. Afterwards, the teacher's way in explaining

the materials more or less is as same as the previous scenario. The rest of the allocated time is filled by giving declarative information about the culture of Bali as well as several existing types of Balinese *Gamelan*.

Example C - Teacher has a recording with 20 examples of Balinese *gending* which are played one by one. In the end, it is explained that the 20 types of *gending* is created based on variety of *gamelan*'s genres in Bali, however, basically every scale belongs to either *pelog* or *slendro*. Then, at the next meeting, learning will be continued by discussion related to the theme of scale in other local cultures.

D - Teacher starts to sing a song/ the sequence of tone (his own creation) in certain scale, or he plays one of music instruments (it will be better if he uses his vocal only). Then, students are given the chance to imitate their teacher. During this process, the teacher is suggested to only deliver a short melodic phrase and easy to be imitated. After that, this model can be varied several times. The teacher needs to be aware that those imitations need to be controlled carefully in order to guarantee "the cleanness" of the intonation. Later, students will be also asked to create their own short melody based on the *pelog* or *slendro* scale.

At the next meeting, most of the time available is used to repeat the process of practice that has been done by students at the last meeting. Then, the teacher discusses results of the students' homework.

The second process is started with another musical scale; however, the teaching is done by implementing the same method. The third and fourth meetings have the relatively similar processes, although the level of students' activity can be more intense.

Until now, in model D, there is no context or name mentioned, or other theories. All elements of the theory will not be delivered for the present since students are expected to draw their own conclusions based on their views or the development of their practical experiences.

On the next step, students are asked to listen to several original audio samples from traditional music types with the scales that have been practiced before. At a time, students also need to be able to sing or improvise several scales which the auditive representation has been developed spontaneously, both at the figural and formal levels. Students can also be asked to appreciate several variations of scale that have been represented, so that the intervals tolerance range can become the aspects of consciousness.

Later, perhaps teacher may problematize the relation between cultures in general and discuss the background story of the scales in the context of certain culture.

DISCUSSION

Based on the fourth ways of approaches above we can discuss and conclude as follow:

Model A should be completely avoided, since the educative impact is totally insignificant. Knowing two types of scale is completely useless if there is no representation of the sound during the teaching and learning music. In fact, an effort in giving students the abstraction of 7 basic tone that can be created into several musical scales, each with 5 tone, is significantly far from one's level of perception (not only for students!). However, in the reality, this model seems to be the current most popular teaching model applied by music teachers since by implementing this model, students are more easily evaluated by using written test.

Model B is slightly better, since the teacher only presents two samples of audio at a glance without paying attention to the process of auditive representation development. This model of appreciation seems to not enough to develop the functional auditive competence since the samples are presented too fast and without practices. Thus, cultural information is not functional.

Model C is slightly similar to model B, even though, seems that teacher has attempted to present a variety of Indonesi-

an diverse aspects to students. Up to this point, the lack is on the presence of quantitative data which is not automatically enhancing the qualitative appreciation.

The process of giving a considerable number of materials (examples) appreciatively has not allowed the enhancement of musical competence, but only supports the needs to explain numbers of musical scale's type to students based on various types or genres of the *Gamelan* itself.

Model D can be regarded as the only model that can solve the problems in model A to C. It is said so, since the teacher attempts to first embed the musical representation fundamentally, although this process needs longer time.

This competence - which initially belongs to "declarative knowledge" - sooner or later will turn to "formal knowledge", where students are able to transfer their knowledge into the abstract systematic network inside their brain.

If students listen to other types of scale later in the future, they will be able to give detailed and relative information about the scales and relate it to the previous information that has been previously received by them. This kind of ability is called as musical competence. Moreover, this competence is tentatively apart from cultural competence in general.

Educational process in that way automatically needs the teacher's effort to take certain decisions on his own. A "complete" music education is an illusion which has never been achieved either in Indonesia or other cultures.

LEARNING EXAMPLES THAT SUPPORT THE REVITALIZATION OF TRADITIONAL ARTS IN MUSIC EDUCATION

The main consequence of every requirement and prerequisite of the competencies described above is the need to prioritize practice rather than theory. However, the demand of this practice has been often mischaracterized, even by practitioners in the field of arts themselves. Based on their professionalism as an artist, they argue that the practice of arts at school is no more than one form of art. It means that the learning of music -in this case is the Balinese gamelan- needs to be held by using all music instruments in this genre of music.

This kind of demand is not wrong, however, it is not realistic.

Learning related to certain music instrument cannot depend on the availability of the music instrument.

The time allocation at school is commonly limited, so that, only the simple form of arts that can be realized.

The pure art practice can be included as one of the topics in extracurricular to the chosen students; however the theme raised here is the implementation of music teaching in classroom learning.

The main problem here is that the process of learning as demanded by experts in arts mentioned above does not pay attention to the educative methodology since the term "tradition" is psychologically still interpreted as negative by most of our students. Therefore, we ought to start with a neutral first step and without certain connotations.

We only attempt to attract students' attention as well as to enhance the creativity of students. However, what is meant by practice and creativity need to be differently interpreted.

One of the possibilities is to arrange the traditional material without changing the meaning contained in the song. Of course, this strategy does not need to be known by students. As for instance, the final aim of teaching is to make students understand *angling dogdog leisure* and art awareness in its ritual context. During the learning, the teacher is expected to not mention the purpose of learning as stated in the previous sentence. Further, the learning process can be initiated by presenting a music arrangement. The next step is to allow students to practice with the given arrangement. In the following paragraphs, the audio results are going to be presented. There are two samples shown in this study: the original

version of *angklung dogdog lojor* music as well as the actual arrangement that relates closely to its original version. The samples are (1) Audio Sample I namely *Angklung Dogdog Lojor,* "Bale Agung" by Ciptarasa from Sukabumi, and (2) Audio Sample II "Ala Dogdog Lojor", by Oya Yukarya.

The second audio sample is realized together between teachers and the students. Of course, the single song is not sung by the students, but by the teacher himself. It is not a bad idea. In fact, it is good to stimulate the students' activity. In addition to this is the back song which is highly possible to be arranged or modified by the students themselves. Here, the content of the text is considered not too important. Students may create something phonetically or by using their own language.

After implementing this model of experience, the original version of *angklung dogdog lojor* performance (appreciation) is generally can be accepted more positively by students since it brings a practical experience that relates to the following points: (1) it is appropriate with the students' ability, (2) it does not interfere the students' music world, and (2) it does not feel too traditional, although the tradition is actually the source of the music.

By using this "secret" or "hiding" approach, the process of "back to the actual source" does not become a problem. However, if it is started with the original version, especially by stating a statement, e.g. *this is the refined traditional art..*, students generally tend to directly decline it.

This attempt can be implemented to all types of art and is not limited to the example presented in this study only. Another positive aspect of this teaching model is that this model does not need to be equipped with original music instruments since all of the musical functions can be transferred to vocal or simple tools created by students themselves.

One other possibility that is closer towards the elements of musical competence, for instance the popular *senggak* vocal style, can be practiced through the simple contemporary works, as for example in "Ronda Malam" by Slamet A. Sjukur. Even though this work is actually created to be played by *angklung,* the Sundanese traditional music instrument, an arranger named Dedi Hernawan has created the vocal version based on the similar scores structure. Audio Sample III, "Ronda Malam", by Slamet A. Sjukur, *angklung* version and Audio Sample IV, "Ronda Malam", by Slamet A. Sjukur, vocal version by Dedi Hernawan.

Through this practice, students have experienced several musical aspects, especially the rhythmical one. This practical experience supports the understanding as well as interest towards other traditional arts. Later, the other traditional arts can be presented appreciatively. However, by only appreciating the arts will be wasted if it is not initiated by doing practical steps as exemplified above.

CONCLUSION

If we compare the fourth ways of approaches above, only the alternative of **model D** that can fulfill the expectation of learning which is aiming to develop musical competence as its main purpose. Therefore, it is hoped that the concept of developing musical competence as the main purpose of music department is clearer. Competency in the field of music needs to be defined as mental representation of the music which is the sound itself. This mental representation is obtained through practice and audio experience, but not from the descriptive information of musical form. Art education, in this study is music, should not be mistakenly understood as cultural education. Theories and knowledge about terms do not belong to the initial competence, but may become the second part after the practical and appreciative first part is accomplished.

In addition to this, the core of learning music purposes is supposedly not resist to the need of cultural education. However, it considers important to separate the two purposes of the two kinds of education during the learning process at

school if the chosen auditive material to the development of mental representation still comes from local culture. Only in the second or third steps, this local foundation can be extended to other types of culture or other cultures, but using the same practical learning process.

It may have been clear that the term "competency" is actually not related to the curriculum, but more related to methodology, or results of certain methodology. It is also obvious that curriculum as we apply today, is also included at one of utopia which has never been totally realized in terms of the objective perspective of the "competency".

REFERENCE

Diana, D. (1999). *The Psychology of Music*. San Diego:Academic Press.

Hesse, Hors-Peter. (2003). *Music & Emotion*. Wien: Springer-Verlag.

Goldstein, E. Bruce. 2002). *Sensation and Perception*. New York: Spriger Pubication.

Gordon, Edwin E. 1980. *Learning Sequences of Music*. Chicago: G.I.A. Publication.

Gruhn, W. (1998). Der Musikverstand. Hildesheim: Olms-Verlag.

Gruhn, W. (2000). "Performing Arts and the Problems of Art Education in Indonesia" Paper presented in International Seminar. Surakarta 2000.

Mack, Dieter. (2002). Pendidikan Musik-Antara Harapan dan Realitas. Bandung: MSPI

Mack, Dieter. (2002). *Musik Kontemporer*. Bandung: Arti-line.

Mack, Dieter. (2004). *Musik aus Bali und Westjava*. Oldershausen: Lugert-Verlag

Roeder, Juan G. (1995). *Introduction to the Physics and Psychophysics of Music*. New York: Springer Publication.

Schafer, Murray R. (1976). *Creative Music Education*. New York: Schimer Publication.

Suharto. (2006). Musikus yang Berkompromi dengan Ideologi dan Berbaju Barat. *Harmonia: Journal of Arts Research and Education*, 7(1), 82-85.

Pynter, John. (1992). *Sound & Structure. Cambridge*: Cambridge University Press.

Wilfried Gruhn, W. (1998). *Der Musikverstand.* Hildesheim.