International Citizenship Education Research: An Annotated Bibliography of Research using the IEA ICCS and IEA CIVED Datasets

Ryan T. Knowles, Utah State University
(Corresponding Author)
Ryan.knowles@usu.edu

Marialuisa Di Stefano, Utah State University

Introduction

In November 2015, a group of researchers[1] met to discuss the role of large-scale international studies to inform social studies research and practice. The conversation focused on published analyses of the IEA 1999 Civic Education study (CIVED) of 14-year-olds in 28 countries (Torney-Purta, Lehmann, Oswald, & Schulz, 2001), and the 2009 International Civic and Citizenship Study (ICCS) of comparably defined populations in 38 countries (Schulz, Ainley, Fraillon, Kerr, & Losito, 2010). IEA also collected data, from 17-19 year olds in 16 countries in 2000 (reported in Amadeo, Torney-Purta, Lehmann, Husfeldt, & Nikolova, 2002) with very few secondary analyses.

In its discussion, the group meeting in 2015 also noted the relatively small number of publications from the two studies of 14-year-olds that have appeared in journals with wide readership among educators in the social studies or citizenship education. This is probably the result of several factors, including the fact that the United States, where social studies scholarship is particularly active, participated in the 1999 CIVED Study but did not participate in the 2009 study. However, Torney-Purta, Amadeo, and Andolina (2010) also acknowledged that the interdisciplinary nature of large-scale secondary analysis

---

[1] This meeting was funded through a grant from the Spencer Foundation. Meeting participants include: Judith Torney-Purta (University of Maryland), Carolyn Barber (University of Missouri-Kansas City), Patricia Avery (University of Minnesota), Antonio J. Castro (University of Missouri), Christopher H. Clark (University of Minnesota), Taehan Kim (Kettering Foundation), Julia Higdon (Avenues: The World School), Natallia Sianko (Clemson University), Greg White (University of Maryland), Ryan T. Knowles (Utah State University), Susan Jekielek (Inter-university Consortium for Political and Social Research), and Rhoda Freelon (Spencer Foundation). In the preparation of this bibliography Judith Torney-Purta provided editorial assistance, and Wolfram Schulz provided references to material collected at the International Study Center for ICCS. Both are gratefully acknowledged.

tends to create a fragmentary picture of civic engagement. Indeed, researchers using CIVED and ICCS data work in diverse fields including political science, educational psychology, sociology, and social studies education. The interdisciplinary nature of this research certainly represents a strength; however, the publication of large-scale international citizenship research at different times and in different venues hampers the visibility of important findings to social studies educators. Thus, the central question we propose for consideration in this publication is this: How can we bring attention to empirical research using CIVED or ICCS data within the field of social studies education?

We conducted an extensive search of peer reviewed secondary analysis and theoretical work directly related to large-scale international datasets (especially the IEA studies of 1999 and 2009). This was completed through three steps. To begin with, we knew that several people involved in the meeting had published articles using these datasets.   Secondly, we searched through the works' reference sections to identify additional articles. Finally, we searched on Google Scholar and ERIC: Institute of Education Services for additional studies. We asked Judith Torney-Purta, active in both studies, to contact some European scholars for their publications. Each of the articles was then reviewed and summarized giving particular attention to the statistical methods utilized and the essential findings. The resulting annotated bibliography in this document represents a comprehensive collection of research conducted using CIVED (sometimes referred to as Civ-Ed) or ICCS data (though some studies published in journals not widely available in the U.S. or studies that did not make explicit reference to IEA, to CIVED or to ICCS may have been missed). We did not include conference papers or those published only in a language other than English. Where the publication is not readily available through library searches, the web address is included in a footnote.

The collection of studies provided within this work can aid in promoting future research among social studies educators. In the past, scholars interested in analysing large-scale data were tasked with searching for articles across disciplines.   Even with electronic databases it was difficult to be comprehensive. Considering the growing interest in quantitative research within social studies scholarship (Fitchett & Heafner, forthcoming; Heafner, Fitchett, & Knowles, 2016; Passe & Fitchett, 2012), large-scale international data sets provide an invaluable opportunity for future quantitative analysis. Much of the research using CIVED or ICCS represents robust empirical research that considers the role of schools in developing students' civic knowledge, attitudes and behaviors. This could provide valuable insights for all social studies educators and advocates. In addition, this document could serve as a resource for organizing literature reviews and theoretical frameworks in a manner that effectively builds on previous scholarship (for a recent example with a different topic and purpose see Torney-Purta, Cabrera, Roohr, Liu & Rios, 2015).

The majority of the works described within the annotated bibliography are empirical studies. However, each of them is rooted within theoretical frameworks relevant to the field of civic engagement research. There are several handbooks that should act as theoretical companions for any researcher interested in these data sources, including the *Handbook of Civic Engagement in Youth* (Sherrod, Torney-Purta, & Flanagan, 2010), the *Sage Handbook of Education for Citizenship and Democracy* (Arthur, Davies, & Hahn, 2008), and the *Handbook of Research in Social Studies Education* (Levstik & Tyson, 2008; Manfra &

Bolick, forthcoming). Also, the recent *Handbook of Educational Psychology* includes a chapter on Civic Education (Carretero, Haste, & Bermudez, 2016).

The theoretical framework should be chosen by researchers and be appropriate for their research questions. Some may be interested in the communities of practice model presented by Torney-Purta, Amadeo, and Andolina (2010), which considers all aspects of learning as situated within social contexts. This model can help generate research questions involving a set of independent variables assessing *person* (e.g., age, gender, ethnicity, immigrant status), *context* (e.g., country region, economic situation, opportunities to learn), and *process* (e.g., observational learning). Further it can be used to predict a series of dependent variables, which include *content knowledge/meaning, identity* (e.g., someone with a particular image of themselves as part of a group), *agency/efficacy* (e.g., general external, general internal, or other motives), *practice/action* (e.g., electoral, volunteer, voice in debate). An early attempt to use this framework in relation to teacher preparation can be found in Torney-Purta & Richardson (2003). Under this framework a variety of approaches could be incorporated including developmental theory (Wilkenfeld, Lauckhardt, & Torney-Purta, 2010) or less commonly applied theories within secondary analysis such as critical theory (Dejaeghere & Tudball, 2007; Diemer & Rapa, 2015).

The next wave of large-scale international datasets (to be collected in 2016 from the IEA Study ICCS) will become available in about 2017-18. This wave of ICCS data will add to our knowledge and conceptualizations across time. While this is exciting there remains ample opportunities to further our knowledge with 1999 CIVED and 2009 ICCS data. Indeed, international and comparative citizenship education using large-scale datasets is a dynamic area of inquiry.

The annotated bibliography below list studies alphabetically by author. Each of the descriptions emphasizes the statistical methods, major constructs, and essential findings from each study.

Annotated Bibliography

Alivernini, F., & Manganelli, S. (2011). Is there a relationship between openness in classroom discussion and students' knowledge in civic and citizenship education? *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 15*, 3441-3445.

This article explores the responses of eighth graders using Italian ICCS data to gain a better understanding of the associations between students' perceptions of openness in classroom discussion and students' civic knowledge. Using a two-level multilevel regression model, there is a strong positive association between the students' civic knowledge scores and their experiences of an open classroom climate for discussion. The implications of this study suggest that teachers should encourage the implementation of open classroom climate for respectful discussion of issues in schools. The authors recommend longitudinal study on Italian samples to further investigate the points raised in this study.

Arensmeier, C. (2016). Swedish students' conceptual knowledge about civics and citizenship: An interview study. *Citizenship Teaching & Learning, 11*(1), 9-28.

This article reports a qualitative individual and group interview study that was administrated to 29 eighth-grade students in Sweden. The aim of this study was to understand the relationship between students' civic knowledge and their performances in the ICCS 2009 survey. The author focused on the problems that can be identified when students are asked to think aloud about some of the most difficult knowledge items in the ICCS 2009 study. Using an inductive analytical approach, the authors found that: (a) students are not familiar with some of the concepts included in the ICCS 2009 study's questions (some of them essential to civic understanding, such as civil liberties); (b) students have a limited understanding of democratic and social principles; (c) students' general reading ability influences their performance on tests like the ICCS 2009 study; and (d) immigrant students face additional challenge when asked to answer survey questions like these. Implications of the study suggest that deliberative teaching methods, such as discussions in small groups, and a focus on language, reading comprehension and conceptual understanding would be beneficial for civic learning. The author acknowledged that there are limitations in the size of the study's sample.

Avery, P. (2007). Civic education in the United States: Increased challenges. *Citizenship Teaching and Learning, 3*(2), 22-39.

This article explores research and development in the US in the years following the publication of the 1999 IEA CIVED study. Young people are currently voting at a higher rate and are more supportive of the rights of minority groups than they were in the past. Nevertheless, the challenges to promote active citizenship education continue to be important, especially considering the increased emphasis on testing and accountability, which takes time from civic-related education (above all in the elementary grades). Publications from the IEA CIVED study have increased knowledge about practices that can help to increase the level of social and political engagement among youth.

Barber, C., Fennelly, K., & Torney-Purta, J. (2013). Nationalism and support for immigrants' rights among adolescents in 25 countries. *Applied Developmental Science, 17*(2), 60-75.

This article explores responses from 14-year-old native born students in 25 countries who participated in the 1999 CIVED study (excluding Cyprus, Hong Kong, and Latvia, where the authors could not locate required national-level data). The aim of this study is to gain a better understanding of the relationship between citizenship policies and national identities (national demographics, histories, and policies), and adolescents' nationalism and attitudes toward immigrants' rights. Using a multilevel analysis (a two-stage, stratified cluster design, also using bivariate correlations) the authors found that protective nationalism is associated with less support for immigrants' rights only in some countries. This relationship depends on multiple factors at country level (e.g., old or new democracy, religious diversity, etc.). This analysis "demonstrated the importance of considering context at several levels to interpret the relation between protective nationalism and support for immigrants' rights, especially among young people who are still in educational environments that are often explicitly charged with fostering intergroup tolerance" (p. 72). The authors concluded that attitudes and interventions from long-standing democracies should not necessarily be generalized and applied to newer democracies.

Barber, C., Sweetwood, S. O., & King, M. (2015). Creating classroom-level measures of citizenship education climate. *Learning Environments Research, 18*, 197-216.

This article explored the United States data from the 1999 CIVED study. It considers the relationship between the openness of classroom climate and the development of knowledge, skills, and dispositions for students to become involved citizens. From this consideration, this study aimed to determine the reliability of aggregate measures across classroom of the openness of classroom discussion climate as reported by students. Using three-level hierarchical linear model (HLM), student-level covariates, a single-level and a multi-level analyses, the authors found that "students have individual experiences and attitudes that shape their perceptions of their classrooms" (p. 14). In other words, there are different students' variables (e.g., levels of civic engagement, prior experiences, attitudes, knowledge of civic content) that may intervene and lead students to view "the classroom climate as positive, regardless of the classroom's 'true' openness" (p. 14). This study confirms that "an open classroom climate for discussion relates to higher civic knowledge, stronger expectations of voting, more trust in the government, and a willingness to extend social and political rights to others" (p. 14). The authors recommend that test developers include teachers' and principals' perspectives in surveys or pilot surveys along with students' perceptions of classroom openness. They also recommend that researchers consider controlling some variables at the classroom level in their analyses.

Barber, C., & Torney-Purta, J. (2009). Gender differences in political efficacy and attitudes to women's rights influenced by national and school contexts: Analysis for the IEA civic education study. In D. P. Baker & A.W. Wiseman (Eds.), *Gender equality and education from international and comparative perspectives* (pp. 357-394). Bingley, UK.: JAI Press.

This article explores data from the cross-national sample of young people surveyed in the CIVED study to gain a better understanding of the relationship between certain characteristics of students, schools, and countries (e. g., students' gender, average expectations of further education, home literacy, proportion of girls in schools, etc.) and gender gaps in support for women's rights and internal political efficacy. Using multilevel modeling techniques, the authors found that "both proximal and distal social contexts shape gender gaps in each of these areas – support for women rights and internal political efficacy – in specific ways" (p. 383). They also noted that the association between school factors and gendered civic development varies depending on opportunity structures for women available in a given country. Males had higher political efficacy than females, while females had higher support for women's rights. They concluded that "the gender gap is smaller when students attend schools in which women's political participation is valued and where associated issues are openly discussed, and educational expectations are sufficiently high to meet the demands of civic participation" (p. 388). An open classroom climate for discussion is especially important in enhancing male students' support for women's rights. The authors highlighted the need to improve educational experiences and opportunities of young people in schools, taking into account the particularities of each country.

Barber, C., & Torney-Purta, J. (2012). Comparing attitudes in the 1999 and 2009 IEA civic and citizenship education studies: Opportunities and limitations illustrated in five countries. *Journal of Social Science Education*, *11*(1), 47-63.

This article begins by identifying a lack of comparability at the level of attitude scales between the 1999 IEA Civic Education Study (CIVED) and the 2009 IEA International Civics and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS). So the authors compared items (rather than scales) focusing on young people in five countries in the European Nordic region (Denmark, Estonia, Finland, Norway and Sweden). The aim of this study was to explore whether young people's attitudes toward support for immigrants' rights and trust in institutions changed between 1999 and 2009. Using an item-level analysis with t-tests, and chi-square analysis – the authors performed a cross-cohort comparison of attitudes. They found that in general the attitudes of young people toward immigrants' rights remained stable in four countries (Estonia, Finland, Norway and Sweden), while institutional trust increased in three countries (Estonia, Finland and Sweden). An exception was Denmark, where the immigrant rights' support was higher but the level of institutional trust was lower. The differences in young people's demographic profiles may be a limitation to this comparison. The authors concluded that overall there is the potential for comparison of attitudes between the CIVED and ICCS cohort (see Torney-Purta, Malak-Minkiewicz & Barber, in press).

Barber, C., Torney-Purta, J., Wilkenfeld, B., & Ross, J. (2015). Immigrant and native-born adolescents' civic knowledge and attitudes in Sweden and the United States: Emergent citizenship within developmental niches. *Research in Comparative and International Education*, *10*(1), 23-47.

This article explores data from immigrant and native-born 14-year-olds in Sweden and the United States from the 1999 CIVED study to gain a better understanding of the relationship between formal education and out of school experiences (e.g., students' experiences in families and peer groups). The outcomes of interest were students' civic knowledge and support for women's rights. Using hierarchical linear modeling (HML), the authors found that "immigrants had lower civic knowledge and less support for women's rights than their native-born peers in both countries" (p. 23). However, many of the same classroom experiences (such as having an open classroom climate) were predictive of knowledge and of support for women's rights for both immigrant and native born groups and in both countries. An interesting finding regarding out-of-school experience was the association between the amount of time spent in the evening with peers and lower scores on women's rights and on civic knowledge. The authors recommend further research that considers "how immigrant status intersects with other identities in shaping the development of citizenship" (p. 40).

Campbell, D. E. (2008). Voice in the classroom: How an open classroom climate fosters political engagement among adolescents. *Political Behavior*, *30*(4), 437-454.

This article explores data from students in the United States using the 1999 IEA CIVED study to gain a better understanding of the association between civic instruction in schools and the political engagement of adolescents. The author aimed to explore three hypotheses, related to whether and how an open classroom climate can lead to the development of students' greater civic knowledge, appreciation for the role of conflict in the political process, and disposition toward being politically engaged. The author found support for the three hypotheses; there is a positive and statistically significant relationship between having an open classroom climate and civic knowledge, the appreciation of conflict, and expected political participation in voting. The author also highlighted that "classroom climate has a considerable impact on students who do not expect to obtain much education and, therefore, are likely to be of low SES" (p. 450). An implication of this study is that open classroom climate can be considered a promising strategy to boost youth political engagement, especially for low SES youth.

Campbell, D. & Wolbrecht, D. (2006). See Jane run: Women politicians as role models for adolescents. *The Journal of Politics, 68(2),* 233-247.
Wolbrecht, D. & Campbell (2007). Leading by example: Female members of Parliament as political role models. *American Journal of Political Science, 51*(4), 921-939.

The analyses in these two articles used data from CIVED 1999 along with other large scale surveys of adults (such as the European Social Survey). In the first article the authors looked at US electoral districts in which there were one or more viable women candidates and related this to the likelihood of voting expressed by females students in that district tested in the IEA CIVED survey (using regression analysis). They found that in districts where there were visible and viable female candidates female 14-year-olds

expressed a higher likelihood of voting than males. They concluded, "contrary to conventional wisdom, this effect does not appear to be mediated by beliefs about the appropriateness of politics for women….Instead an increased propensity for political discussion, particularly within families, appears to explain the role model effect" (p. 233). In the second article using the international CIVED data set, anticipated political activity by males and females in a given country was plotted against percentage of women in the legislature of that country. Anticipated political activity by females was higher in countries with larger percentages of women in the legislature. At the highest percentage levels, male and female activity was nearly equal. The authors interpreted these as "role model effects," and encouraged others to study gender differences in adolescents' inclinations toward political participation.

Caro, D. H. & Schulz, W. (2012). Ten hypotheses about tolerance toward minorities among Latin American adolescents. *Citizenship, Social and Economic Education, 11*(3), 213-230.

Discrimination affects the wellbeing of minorities and of society in general. Research in North America underscores the importance of contact with diverse networks, intergroup discussion, gender (being female), and school climate among other factors in explaining variation in tolerance toward minorities. Such work in Latin America has been limited by the lack of quantitative data. This article used regression models to evaluate 10 hypotheses about tolerance using data from nationally representative samples of 8th graders in six Latin American countries who participated in the IEA International Civic and Citizenship Education Study in 2009. Females were more tolerant in all but one of the countries. In a smaller number of countries students from families of higher SES were more tolerant, as were those with extended social networks, those who experienced discussion of these issues at school, and those with higher civic knowledge. Countries with relatively more positive views of minorities tended to exhibit relatively small differences in tolerance attitudes among students of varying socio-demographic characteristics and, apparently, more effective mechanisms for promoting tolerance in schools. The authors suggest further analysis within regions.

Chin, K., & Barber, C. E. (2010). A multi-dimensional exploration of teachers' beliefs about civic education in Australia, England, and the United States. *Theory & Research in Social Education*, *38*(3), 395-427.

This article explores civic-related teachers in Australia, England and the U.S. surveyed in the IEA CIVED study to gain a better understanding of the relation between teachers' beliefs (beliefs about subjects, learners and learning, teaching, and self-efficacy) and their organization of classes expected to have an impact on student learning in civic education. Using multi-dimensional analyses of variance and inter-correlations, they found that teachers in these three countries "hold beliefs that: (a) engagement-based civic activities are necessary components of citizenship, (b) students should learn about engagement, (c) civic education is valuable, and (d) they are confident in presenting these topics"(p. 395). The implications of this study are that civic education contexts reflect teachers' educational beliefs; teachers have a central role in shaping civic education; and the concept of citizenship is heterogeneous and is strongly connected with the particular political situation of each of the three countries analyzed in this study. The authors recommend further comparative analyses of the economic, social, and cultural influences on citizenship.

Cho, Y. & Kim, T. (2013). Asian civic values: A cross-cultural comparison of three East Asian societies. *Asian-Pacific Education Researcher, 22(1),* 21-31.

This study explored how lower secondary students from Korea, Chinese Taipei and Hong Kong perceive Asian civic values using data from the Asian Regional Module of the ICCS09 Study. Exploratory and confirmatory factor analyses were employed. Latent mean analysis then assessed between-nation mean differences. Overall East Asian students were negative about undemocratic government and unfairness based on *guanxi*. They were also moderately critical about issues related to the independence of the judiciary. There was moderate respect for the morality of politicians and the preservation of traditional culture. While perceiving collectivist and Confucian contexts positively, students in these societies have also assimilated from Western democratic contexts.

Chow, K. F., & Kennedy, K. J. (2014). Secondary analysis of large-scale assessment data: An alternative to variable-centred analysis. *Educational Research and Evaluation*, *20*(6), 469-493.

This article explores data from 14-year-old students in five Asian societies (Korea, Taiwan, Hong Kong, Indonesia, and Thailand) to understand variations in the students' orientation regarding civic participation. This article reports secondary analysis of the ICCS data focusing on the affective-behavioral domain of the international student questionnaire. Using a person-centered approach and a cluster analysis, the authors found that the five Asian societies showed heterogeneity in the orientation of students towards future civic participation. The study provided a useful model of a person-centered approach for future researchers.

Chow, J. K. F., & Kennedy, K. J. (2015). Asian students' conceptions of future civic engagement: Comparing clusters using person-centered analysis. *Research in Comparative and International Education*, *10*(1), 7-22.

Chow and Kennedy explored data from 14-year-old Asian students in Taiwan, Hong Kong, Korea, Indonesia, and Thailand to gain a better understanding of the relationship between the civic values of these five societies and students' intention to participate in future civic activities. Drawing from the ICCS 2009 data, cluster analysis was used to compare attitudes in five societies. Through this study, the authors identified four different groups of respondents – Active Participators, Conventional Participators, Radical Participators and Minimal Participators – groups that cut across national boundaries. They found that students' future civic participation was considerably diverse both within Asian societies and across Asian societies. In fact, the four groups are represented in each society and, although with some differences, there is similarity in the participation group proportion between countries. Asian students concerning future civic participation are not homogeneous, and are difficult to attribute to the history, politics and culture of each specific society. An implication of this study is related to the use of comparative analysis, especially through a person-centered approach, to identify and understand heterogeneity among students.

Claes, E., Hooghe, M. & Reeskens, T. (2009). Truancy as a contextual and school related problem: a comparative multilevel analysis of country and school characteristics on civic knowledge among 14-year-olds. *Educational Studies, 35*(2), 123-142.

These authors used the CIVED data and conducted multilevel analysis to differentiate between the individual, school and country levels as related to the incidence of truancy. First they noted that high truancy is associated with lower civic knowledge scores even when socioeconomic status is controlled. Their results show that schools can have a major impact on truancy levels by promoting school involvement among parents and providing an authoritative environment. Their results were significant in 24 of the 28 countries analyzed (not in Cyprus and not in Denmark, Norway, Sweden and Finland), where the phenomenon appears to differ. The authors conclude that truancy is associated with lower educational achievement but can be reduced by enhancing positive interactions between pupils, parents and schools and especially by bettering the overall school climate. They suggest these actions rather than more authoritarian approaches.

Cosgrove, J., & Gilleece, L. (2012). An international perspective on civic participation in Irish post-primary schools: results from ICCS. *Irish Educational Studies*, *31*(4), 377-395.

The authors analyzed data from students in Ireland who participated in the 2009 ICCS study, to gain a better understanding of the association between students' active participation in schools and parents' participation in school life, and students beliefs about and attitudes towards various civic and citizenship issues. Using bivariate analyses through the IDB Analyzer (a customized add-on SPSS instrument), the authors found that, in comparison with the international average, Irish students have a higher perception of the value of participation at school and a lower perceived level of influence on decision-making processes in schools. They also found that, based on principals' reports, parental participation in Irish schools was lower than the international average. The authors recommend further analyses that could take into consideration multiple school and students characteristics, for example associating qualitative data sources (e.g., interviews, focus groups, etc.) to the ICCS quantitative cross-sectional data.

Dejaeghere, J. G. & Tudball, L. (2007). Looking back, looking forward: Critical citizenship as a way ahead for Civics and Citizenship Education in Australia. *Citizenship Teaching and Learning, 3*(2), 40-57.

This article explores the impact of IEA CIVED study on teacher professional development and practice, and curriculum and assessment in Australia. Using critical citizenship lenses, this study analyzes "the civic realities and mega trends facing youth". "In particular, it suggested how ideas from a 'critical citizenship' framework could inform the 2009 IEA International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS) by including items related to immigration and refugees, globalization and environmental sustainability, and realities facing young people, such as youth violence" (p. 40). This study recommends that international and comparative scholars consider the critical approach to address the present realities of young peoples' lives in the changing democracies of the world.

Diemer, M. A., & Rapa, L. J. (2016). Unraveling the complexity of critical consciousness, political efficacy, and political action among marginalized adolescents. *Child Development, 87*(2), 221-238.

Diemer and Rapa analyzed data from working class African American and Latino/a ninth graders in the US who participated in the 1999 CIVED study, to gain an understanding of the relation between critical consciousness, political efficacy and political action and civic and political participation among marginalized adolescents. Using a structural equation model, they found that the perception of inequality and internal political efficacy are positively associated with the engagement in social action. In contrast, egalitarianism and sense of agency are negatively associated with reflection concerning critical action. This last point is important because it contrasted with previous scholarship. Consequently, the authors recommend further analyses on how different forms of agency can be related to perceived inequality and social action among marginalized youth in the US.

Ekman, J. (2013). Schools, democratic socialization and political participation: Political activity and passivity among Swedish youths. *Nordidactica: Journal of Humanities and Social Science Education, 2013*:1, 1-11.

This article analyzed data from Swedish 9th graders who participated in the 2009 ICCS study, in order to gain a better understanding of the relationship between school-related factors (private/public schools, socioeconomic status, classroom climate and students influence over civic education teaching), and citizenship competencies (political efficacy, political literacy, and political participation). Using Hierarchical Linear Modeling (HLM), the author found that only one factor, students' socioeconomic status, was positively related to the development of citizenship competencies. According to the author, the characteristics of the students populating the classroom is what make the difference. Therefore, schools should look for opportunities "to level out inequalities in background resources among students, in order to encourage political participation" (p. 8). From this analysis, it appears that in the Swedish society "schools mainly matter as political socialization contexts and less as political socialization agents" (p. 9). On this last point, the author recommends further analyses.

Ekman, J. & Zetterberg, P. (2011). Schools and democratic socialization: Assessing the impact of different educational settings on Swedish 14-year-olds political citizenship. *Politics, Culture and Socialization, 2(2),* 171-192.

The article investigates the role of schools in fostering students' political citizenship, especially providing them with the competencies and skills needed to realize their status as political actors in a democratic society. Internal political efficacy, political literacy, and political participation are analyzed using data from nearly 3500 Swedish students tested in the 2009 ICCS study. The student data is linked with data from the school questionnaire as well as census data providing reliable information about socioeconomic status. The authors conclude that "the development of political citizenship is determined less by what goes on in the classroom and more by the composition of the students that populate a school" (p 171). Further analysis on this point is provided in the Ekman (2013) article.

Gilleece, L., & Cosgrove, J. (2012). Student civic participation in school: What makes a difference in Ireland? *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice, 7*(3), 225-239.

This article analyzed data from 14-year-olds in Ireland who participated in the 2009 CIVED study, to gain a better understanding of the relationship between student and school characteristics and students' civic participation at school. Using a multilevel model, they found "boys have lower levels of civic participation at school than girls. Among boys only, civic participation at school varies with levels of perceived influence on decision making" (p. 1). The authors concluded that despite the Irish government's effort to recognize children and youth rights, "boys and students from lower socioeconomic backgrounds have fewer opportunities to exercise their rights of participation" (p. 13). As an implication of this study, the authors suggested that increasing youth civic participation may increase community participation and could promote future adulthood involvement in civic life.

Hahn, C. L. (2003). Democratic values and citizen action: a view from US ninth graders. *International Journal of Educational Research*, *39*(6), 633-642.

This article considered US ninth graders from the 1999 CIVED study. The study explored the development of democratic values, participation in social action as a young person, and anticipated participation as adult citizens. The purpose of this study was to gain a better understanding of the association between elements of effective education in the US and the development of democratic values. The author reported the percentages of students endorsing certain responses. Findings of the study suggest that civic education in the United States is generally effective though considerable room for improvement exists. In fact, students indicated that free elections, free expression and the presence of voluntary associations are important in their view of democracy, but they didn't consider the right to dissent as of equal importance for democracy. Other findings suggest that: (a) males are less likely to support women's rights than females; (b) non-immigrants are less likely to support rights for immigrants; (c) one-third of the students think that it is not important for good citizens to engage in political discussions; (d) US students are relatively unlikely to follow the news and discuss controversial issues in class; (e) school instruction differs by class, race, and ethnicity, as some groups of students consistently do not perform well on tests of civic knowledge. The author concluded that civic education in the US, as in other countries, is facing multiple challenges.

Hooghe, M. & Dassonneville, R. (2013). Voters and candidates of the future: The intention of electoral participation among adolescents in 22 European countries. *Young, 21(1),* 1-28.

There is growing concern about low voter turnout among those coming of age. The authors investigated the willingness to vote among 72,000 14-year-olds from 22 countries using the ICCS 2009 data. There is a clear gender difference. While girls are more likely to expect to vote, boys are much more likely to see themselves as candidates for office in future elections. An open classroom climate at school is associated with the likelihood of voting. A number of elements known to be related to adults' election turnout are not associated with the expectation of voting among adolescents. The authors recommend further investigation in light of the need to understand the downward trend in voting.

Hooghe, M., & Oser, J. (2015). The rise of engaged citizenship: The evolution of citizenship norms among adolescents in 21 countries between 1999 and 2009. *International Journal of Comparative Sociology*, *56*(1), 29-52.

The authors of this study compared the results of the 1999 CIVED survey with the 2009 ICCS study to observe the evolution of the duty-based citizenship norms. They performed a comparative analysis of trends in citizenship norms in 21 countries that participated in both studies (Bulgaria, Switzerland, Chile, Colombia, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Denmark, England, Estonia, Finland, Greece, Hong Kong, Italy, Lithuania, Latvia, Norway, Poland, Russia, Slovakia, Slovenia, and Sweden). Using a latent class analysis, they found that: (a) both engaged and duty-based citizenship are norms that can be empirically identified in the studies; (b) a shift toward engaged citizenship appears to be emerging.

Hooghe, M., Oser, J., & Marien, S. (2014). A comparative analysis of 'good citizenship': A latent class analysis of adolescents' citizenship norms in 38 countries. *International Political Science Review, 37*(1), 115-129.

This study explored the shift between duty-based citizenship norms and engaged citizenship norms. The authors performed a secondary analysis of the ICCS 2009 data collected in 38 countries. They aimed to gain a better understanding of citizenship norms, the status of the students taking the survey and the type of democracies to which they belong. Using a latent class analysis, the authors found that both duty-based and engaged citizenship can exist in diverse countries, but they do not cover the full range of normative concepts. An implication of this study is that "the 'good citizens' of the next generation do not intend to abandon civic engagement, but apparently they intend to relate to the political system in their own distinct manner" (p. 13).

Hooghe, M., & Stolle, D. (2004). Good girls go to the polling booth, bad boys go everywhere: Gender differences in anticipated political participation among American fourteen-year-olds. *Women & Politics, 26,* 1-23.

Hooghe and Stolle analyzed data from the 1999 CIVED study amongst 14-year-old students in the United States to gain a better understanding of gender differences in anticipated political participation. The authors found two main patterns: (1) the adult gender gap with regard to the level of participation has not fully emerged by 14 years of age, and (2) the kinds of action favored are different among boys (more explicitly political as well as radical and confrontational action) and girls (social movement-related action). These findings are integral to understanding past and future theories about the gender gap in political participation.

Hooghe, M., & Wilkenfeld, B. (2008). The stability of political attitudes and behaviors across adolescence and early adulthood: A comparison of survey data on adolescents and young adults in eight countries. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, *37*(2), 155-167.

The authors compared attitudes and behaviors across adolescence and early adulthood in 8 countries (Czech Republic, Denmark, Norway, Poland, Portugal, Slovenia, Sweden, and Switzerland), performing secondary analysis of the data collected in the 1999 CIVED study, the 2000 CIVED survey and the 2000

European Social Survey. Three age groups of participants took one of these surveys: 14 year-olds, 17 to 18 year-olds and 18 to 30 year-olds. The aim of this research was to gain a better understanding of the relationship between political attitudes and behavior and their stability at the different ages. Using correlation techniques and principal component analysis, the authors found that "political trust and attitudes toward immigrant rights are already well established by the age of 14" (p. 155), while the intention to vote and actual voting behavior are not as stable through these ages. An implication of this study is that adolescents have already incorporated fundamental attitudes associated with citizenship. Therefore, civic education should systematically address how citizenship attitudes are converted into behavior. The findings also argue for renewed attention to the reasons that females prefer less conflictual or partisan political engagement, preferring action for social justice.

Hoskins, B. L., Barber, C., Van Nijlen, D., & Villalba, E. (2011). Comparing civic competence among European youth: Composite and domain-specific indicators using IEA civic education study data. *Comparative Education Review, 55*(1), 82-110.

This article explores data from European youth (14-year-old) responding to the IEA Civic Education Study to gain a better understanding of the association between cognitive (knowledge and skills) and affective (attitudes and values) dimensions and how these fit into the broader concept of civic competence (citizenship values, social justice values and attitudes, participatory attitudes and cognitions about democratic institutions). Using a confirmatory factor analyses and item response theory at a preliminary phase, then moving to country comparisons, the authors found that "countries offering civic education as a discrete subject have higher rankings that would be expected based on other factors," such as history, transitions to democracy, socio-cultural influences, etc. (p. 105). The results also suggest that in some cases instability and transitions toward democracy facilitate civic participation, while greater democratic stability intensifies some dimensions of civic competence (at least in the short term). The implication of this study is to encourage scholars to look at the years since a country established democracy as a predictor of civic competence, and to look at citizenship education's potential.

Isac, M. M., Maslowski, R., Creemers, B., & van der Werf, G. (2014). The contribution of schooling to secondary-school students' citizenship outcomes across countries. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, *25*(1), 29-63.

This secondary analysis of the 2009 ICCS study, which used data from 31 countries, aimed to explore the impact of schooling on students' civic knowledge, conventional citizenship, social movement-related citizenship and intended participation. Using a multivariate multilevel analysis, the author found that "schools have a small influence on students' civic knowledge and hardly an impact on civic attitudes and intended civic behavior" (p. 29). With regards to the types of citizenship outcomes considered in this study, individual student characteristics and influences outside the school play a more influential role. At the school level the factors that seem to make a difference in students' civic competences are the use of free dialogue and critical debate on controversial political and social issues, which promote a stimulating democratic classroom climate.

Isac, M. M., Maslowski, R., & van der Werf, G. (2012). Native students' attitudes towards equal rights for immigrants. A study in 18 European countries. *Journal of Social Science Education*, *11*(1), 7-22.

Isac, Maslowski, and van der Werf looked at 14-year-olds in eighteen European countries (Austria, Belgium (Flanders), Cyprus, Denmark, England, Estonia, Finland, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Lithuania, Luxembourg, The Netherlands, Norway, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, and Switzerland) from the IEA ICCS study, to gain a better understanding of the relationship between immigrants' presence in the classroom (including variables at individual, classroom and country level) and native-born students' attitudes toward rights for immigrants. Using a three-level multilevel model, the author found that "the determinants of native student attitudes are mainly student-related, while classroom and country characteristics are likely to have only modest effects" (p. 17). The researchers recommend that future studies focus on the relationship between student attitudes and individual characteristics.

Kahne, J., & Middaugh, E. (2009). Democracy for some: The civic opportunity gap in high School. In J. Youniss & P. Levine (Eds.), *Engaging young people in civic life.* Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press.

This article explores responses in the1999 CIVED study (along with some other studies), to gain a better understanding of the relationship between students' race and academic track, and schools' average socioeconomic status and school-based civic learning opportunities. Using multiple linear regression, independent samples t-tests, and multilevel modeling, they found that "students who are more academically successful or white and those with parents of higher socioeconomic status receive more classroom-based civic learning opportunities" (p. 5). As an implication of this study, it emerged that schools "appear to be exacerbating inequality by not providing equal civic preparation to students in most need of civic skills and resources" (p. 5). The authors recommend: (a) to promote teachers' professional development and provide curricular support; (b) to develop "new initiatives focused on universal and/or low socioeconomic populations" (p.5); (c) to "undertake assessments that can inform and direct both policy and practice" (p. 6).

Kennedy, K. J. (2012). Asian students' citizenship values and their relationship to civic understanding: An exploratory study comparing Thai and Hong Kong students. *Research in Comparative and International Education*, *7*(2), 248-259.

Kennedy compared 14-year-old Asian students in Hong Kong and Thailand to gain a better understanding of the relationship between citizenship values in these two societies and the development of students' civic understanding and knowledge. Drawing from the ICCS data, the author used six scales to represent a range of personal values held by students. The author conducted both scale- and item-level *t*-tests to determine the statistical significance of the difference between Hong Kong and Thai students. The results suggest that strong civic values are not always associated with strong civic knowledge in students. In fact, Thai students scored relatively higher on civic values than on civic knowledge; while Hong Kong students did the opposite (lower civic values and higher civic knowledge). The author found that contextual factors emerging from the proximal environment and the local contexts are likely to influence students' citizenship identity. In addition, the comparison between

these two Asian societies suggests "there is no single 'Asian' citizenship identity" (p. 258). The implications of this study are related to secondary analysis of ICCS data. The author recommends further analysis of variables that intervene in different way to shape multiple citizenship identities in Asia.

Kennedy, K. J., Hahn, C. L., & Lee, W. O. (2008). Constructing citizenship: Comparing the views of students in Australia, Hong Kong, and the United States. *Comparative Education Review, 52*(1), 53-91.

Each of the authors served as a national research coordinator for the IEA Civic Education Study in Australia, the United States and Hong Kong, respectively. The authors used both insider and outsider perspectives. This article explores a comparative cross-national analysis of 14-year- old students tested in CIVED in these three countries. The purpose was to gain a better understanding of the relationship between: (a) political, cultural, economic, and educational variables that characterize the three societies and (b) the views of students regarding what "good" citizens do, how they see themselves participating in their political communities in the future, and what their attitudes are toward rights for different groups in the community. The authors looked for "indications of young people developing attitudes that might support either a thin or thick conception of democratic citizenship" (p. 85). They found that young people in the three societies adhere to a thin view of conventional or political citizenship. In fact, young people think that being a good citizen is synonymous with voting, respecting leaders, and knowing their country's history. It is less important to join a political party or to follow and discuss issues. In addition, although young people in the three countries give priority to similar citizens' activities, their level of endorsement of these activities is different across the three societies. The authors also found that young people in the three countries are relatively supportive of rights for women and immigrants. They concluded that the thin and thick citizenship conceptions should not be dichotomized. There are multiple similarities and differences among students across the three countries, but these characteristics are difficult to explain by considering only the geographical and socio-cultural-historical contexts of their societies. One important implication is that "political socialization appears to be a much more unpredictable process than traditional paradigms might suggest" (p. 88).

Kennedy, K. J., Huang, X., & Chow, J. K. F. (2012). Hong Kong students' levels of political trust ten years after the return to Chinese sovereignty. *Journal of Social Science Education*, *11*(1), 23-46.

Hong Kong's "retrocession" to China occurred in 1997. This article explored the CIVED and the ICCS data from samples students in Hong Kong to understand their conception and level of trust in political institutions. The authors aimed to gain a better understanding of the relationship between Political Trust and Civic Knowledge and Citizenship Responsibilities. They performed 't'-tests to assess statistical significance of differences between cohorts at the item level (on the trust scales) and Cohen's 'd' to indicate effect size. To provide another perspective they used additional analyses – an Exploratory Factor Analysis (EFA), Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA), Multi-Group Confirmatory Factor Analysis (MGCFA). They found that 15-years-old students in Hong Kong, both in 1999 and 2009, understood political trust as a multidimensional construct. Their results suggest that "Hong Kong 15 year olds have remained alert to their institutional environment, are able to make nuanced responses to differentiate

between institutions and are aware of the role that different institutions play in the local context" (p. 41).

Kennedy, K. J., Kuang, X., & Chow, J. K. F. (2013). Exploring Asian students' citizenship values and their relationship to civic knowledge and school participation. *Educational Psychology*, *33*(3), 240-261.

This article explores 14-year-old students in five Asian societies (Korea, Taiwan, Hong Kong, Indonesia, and Thailand) using data from the 2009 ICCS study to gain a better understanding of the relationship between students' traditional citizenship values (the Asian Regional Module) and their civic learning and civic action. Using multilevel regression the authors found that "young people in the participating societies hold traditional values associated with a conception of citizenship that is passive rather than active" (p. 18). However, the societies to which these students belong cannot be considered passive, especially considering the strong protest culture found in some Asian countries. Young people in these five Asian societies embrace both tradition and change. Therefore, civic education needs to integrate these two perspective into school and community programs. This study also showed that students from these five Asian societies "have distinctive citizenship values and these operate in different ways within and across participating societies" (p. 18).

Knowles, R. T. (2015). Asian values and democratic citizenship: Exploring attitudes among South Korean eighth graders using data from the ICCS Asian Regional Module. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education, 35*(2), 191-212.

This article explores 14-year-olds in South Korea from the 2009 ICCS study to gain a better understanding of the relationship between traditional Confucian Asian values and attachments to democratic citizenship. Using secondary analysis (multilevel modeling and structural regression) the author identified two substantial factors, which are the Asian civic values and the obedience to authority. The findings suggest that intrinsic characteristics of Confucian Asian civic values, such as state, moral–state, civic morality, and social harmony, support the key aspects of democratic citizenship; however the obedience to authority is "negatively associated with democratization" (p. 15). The study also showed that female students are more likely to support Asian civic values. The findings of this study imply that there is the possibility of reconciliation between traditional Asian values and democratic citizenship. The author recommends that future studies consider that Confucianism and democracy are not a dichotomy. The author also encourages future research on South Korean civic education, considering: (a) the role of school curriculum, pedagogy and climate in influencing traditional values and civic orientations; (b) society influences on Asian traditional values among youth; and (c) attachment to traditional values and democratic orientations across demographic groups.

Knowles, R., & McCafferty-Wright, J. (2015). Connecting an open classroom climate to social movement citizenship: A study of 8th graders in Europe using IEA ICCS data. *The Journal of Social Studies Research, 39*(4), 255-269.

Knowles and McCafferty-Wright consider "the potential for open classroom climates to foster political efficacy and civic knowledge among 8th grade students in 14 Western European countries" (p. 255)

including Austria, Flemish Belgium, Switzerland, Denmark, England, Spain, Finland, Ireland, Italy, Liechtenstein, Luxembourg, Malta, Norway, and Sweden. The authors aimed to gain a better understanding of the connection between an open classroom climate, civic knowledge, political efficacy, and social movement citizenship. They utilized data from the IEA International Civic and Citizenship Study (ICCS). They used descriptive statistics, multilevel regression, and path analysis. They found that "an open classroom climate promotes higher levels of civic knowledge and political efficacy" (p. 11). In addition, the study shows that civic knowledge and political efficacy fostered in an open classroom are associated with an increased attachment to social movement citizenship. These findings support previous studies, which emphasized the importance of classroom climates in encouraging students to actively construct knowledge and skills. In addition, this study shows that there is an inconsistent relationship between civic knowledge and social movement citizenship. Finally it confirms a relatively strong relationship between students' socioeconomic status and civic knowledge. The authors showed that "creating a democratic atmosphere through an open classroom climate promotes efficacy and knowledge" (p. 12). This study encourages future researchers to focus on: (a) how students gain knowledge and skills; (b) how the variations of open classroom climates influence different populations and contexts; and (c) whether an open classroom climate influences various groups in different ways.

Lauglo, J. (2013). Do more knowledgeable adolescents have more rationally based civic attitudes? Analysis of 38 countries. *Educational Psychology, 33*(3), 262-282.

The author links the knowledge and attitudinal portions of ICCS09 (with some references to CIVED99 data). He also incorporates indicators on corruption, government effectiveness and national standard of living from other statistical sources. At the country level he finds that students' average trust in government is correlated with these indices of governmental performance. He also finds some positive associations between students' knowledge and their trust in government. However, this is not true for Latin American countries. Further his analysis shows that students with higher civic knowledge scores are more likely to expect to vote and to support women's political rights (with a positive but less strong association with support for ethnic group rights). He concludes that: "the findings fit the explanation that better knowledge promotes more rationally based civic attitudes." (p 262). The author suggests further exploration of this under-studied approach.

Ljunggren, C. & Unemar Ost, I. (2012). Teachers' dealing with controversial issues – A typology from the 2009 IEA/ICCS study. *Politics, Culture and Socialization, 2/3.*[2]

The aim of the article was to consider how Swedish teachers deal with controversial issues and to contextualize that information by comparing the Swedish data with ICCS data from other countries. The

---

[2] http://www.budrich-journals.de/index.php/pcs/article/view/7073

authors present a typology that describes the position of the teacher in these debates. The following four types were identified: *the debate leader, the tutor, the mediator, and the rejector*. The authors conclude that the position of the teacher in the discourse about controversial issues can have a decisive impact on these classroom discussions.

Malak-Minkiewicz, B. (2007) Civic education in times of change: The Post-Communist countries. *Citizenship Teaching and Learning, 3*(2), 58-70.

This article considers data from 14 year-olds in 11 post-Communist countries (Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Poland, Romania, Russia, Slovak Republic, Slovenia) who participated in the 1999 CIVED study, to gain a better understanding of the relationship between epochal change in these countries and development of citizenship concepts and attitudes in adolescents (government responsibilities, attitudes of trust in government, attitudes toward women's rights, and expectations of voting). Comparing the scores of these students with those of students in Western European countries, it emerged that students in "several of these eleven countries scored quite high on civic knowledge, but the level of trust in government and support for women's rights" was relatively low (p. 58). The author recommended further analysis comparing the 1999 CIVED study data with the 2009 CIVED study data. [Additional consideration of factors operating in the Post-Communist countries can be found in Torney-Purta, Malak-Minkiewicz & Barber, in press.]

Mangenelli, S., Alivernini, F., Lucidi, F., & Di Leo, I. (2012). Expected political participation in Italy: a study based on Italian ICCS data. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *46*, 1476-1481.

This article explores data from 14-year-olds in Italy who participated in the 2009 CIVED study to gain a better understanding of the relationship between school characteristics (openness in classroom discussion and value of students' participation) and students' characteristics (civic knowledge and political efficacy) and students' expected political participation. Using a multilevel regression model, they found that positive significant correlations exist between the independent variables and the students' expected political participation. On the basis of these findings, the authors suggest that schools should offer more opportunities for the development of civic knowledge in an open classroom climate, while facilitating students' participation in decision making processes and political activities. The authors recommend longitudinal designs in studies to corroborate these findings and generalize them across different national contexts.

Menzer, M. & Torney-Purta, J. (2012). Individualism and socio-economic status distributions as related to schools' levels of aggression in fifteen countries. *Journal of Adolescence, 5,*   1285-1294.

The purpose of this secondary analysis was to examine two aspects of the context for peer aggression -- individualism as a value at the national level and distributions of socioeconomic status in a particular school. The sample comprised 990 school principals/headmasters from nationally representative samples of schools in 15 countries surveyed as part of the 1999 IEA CIVED Study. Administrators for each school had reported on their perceptions of the frequency of bullying and violence in their schools. Schools with high socioeconomic diversity had more bullying than either homogeneously low or

homogeneously high socioeconomic status schools. Results suggest that bullying and violence should be investigated as separate constructs. Furthermore, contexts such as national culture and schools' socioeconomic diversity, are important in understanding the prevalence of bullying and violence in schools internationally.

Mirazchiyski, P., Caro, D. H., & Sandoval-Hernández, A. (2014). Youth future civic participation in Europe: Differences between the East and the rest. *Social Indicators Research*, *115*(3), 1031-1055.

Mirazchiyski explored data from 14 year-olds in 22 European countries (9 post-communist and 13 established democracies) who participated in the 2009 ICCS Study to gain a better understanding of the relationship between social transformations and civic participation among young people. The authors intended to assess differences in the levels of expected civic participation across European countries and to evaluate the empirical model fit in regard to political division of the countries (new and established democracies). Using multiple linear regression models, they found that new democracies have lower levels of intended future civic participation in comparison with established democracies. However, this study also found that levels of participation in new or established democracies cluster according to cultural and historical similarities (as well as educational and socioeconomic variables). This may have led to a different quality of the democratic regimes across Europe regardless whether they are new or well established.

Quintelier, E. & Hooghe, E. (2013). The relationship between political participation intentions of adolescents and a participatory democratic climate at school in 35 countries. *Oxford Review of Education, 39*(5), 567-589.

The authors used a three level multilevel analysis to explore the association of a participatory democratic climate at school with four types of expected participation: legal protest, electoral participation, party membership/candidacy for office, and informal political activities. Data from 35 countries participating in the ICCS 2009 study were used (excluding the three countries where no teacher data had been collected). Students' perceptions of a participatory democratic climate at school (especially open and respectful class discussion) were related to all four types of participation. However, teachers' perception of this climate were related only to students' electoral participation. In general teachers' and students' perceptions of school climate were not strongly correlated, arguing that it is the student's own experience of participation opportunities that counts.

Reimers, F. (2007). Civic education when democracy is in flux: The impact of empirical research   on policy and practice in Latin America. *Citizenship Teaching and Learning, 3*(2), 5-21.

Reimers provided a discussion of the IEA CIVED study's influence on the curriculum revision and policy discussions in Chile and Colombia. In these countries, the IEA Civic Education study contributed to the focus on the importance of citizenship education, on the strategies to provide it, and the challenges for scholars and practitioners to develop democratic competencies. These elements are pivotal for the future of democracy at large in these regions of Latin America. [See also Torney-Purta & Amadeo, 2004.]

Richardson, W. & Torney-Purta, J. (2008). Connections between concepts of democracy, citizen engagement, and schooling for 14-year-olds across six countries. In B. Rubin & J. Giarelli (Eds.), *Civic education for diverse citizens in global times: Rethinking theory and practice* (pp. 79-104). New York: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

The authors examined CIVED data from Chile, Estonia, Finland, Greece, Switzerland and the United States using regression analysis. They looked at predictions of intension to be an informed voter, to join a political party, and to volunteer. For example, intent to be an informed voter was predicted by belief in the importance of voting in democracy (in 4 countries) and by holding norms of good citizenship, by being taught about voting in school as well as by civic knowledge, trust, confidence and interest (in all 6 countries). Intent to join a political party and intent to volunteer were less strongly associated with a similar set of predictors. Implications are drawn for enhancing school-based social studies education. The authors conclude by recommending attention to enhancing civic education at school: "Schools are sensitive to policy directions in a way that families and youth organizations are not" (p 97).

Schulz, W., Fraillon, J. & Ainley, J. (2013). Measuring young people's understanding of civics and citizenship in a cross-national study. *Educational Psychology*, *33*(3), 334-356.

The development of knowledge and understanding is widely reported as a key aim of civic and citizenship education and as an important aspect of being prepared for active citizenship. Measurement of knowledge and understanding in this domain has grown as a focus of educational research both as an outcome in its own right and to underpin the systematic investigation of factors associated with the development of effective active citizenship. Given that civics and citizenship is often seen as a set of cross-curricular capabilities rather than an established discipline, it is crucial to articulate clearly what is being measured and to be sure that measurement is based on sound psychometric properties. This article describes how knowledge and understanding of civics and citizenship was conceptually defined and measured in the IEA Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS 2009) conducted in 38 countries. [Note that some of the items included in this study come originally from the IEA CIVED Study of 1999.]

Stevick, D. (2007). Qualitative comparison in civic education: An ethnographic perspective. *Citizenship Teaching and Learning, 3*(2), 71-78.

Stevick presents a qualitative researchers' assessment of the limitations of the CIVED studies in focusing too much on quantitative methods and suggests developing future studies based on mixed methods. The author recognized the IEA CIVED studies' important contributions in conceptualizing large-scale qualitative and comparative research. However, he argued that the quantitative method may have overshadowed the qualitative research. He recommended to consider adopting an ethnographic perspective as a valid method to study the impact of different cultures on the development of adolescents' civic knowledge and engagement.

Toots, A. & Lauri, T. (2015). Institutional and contextual factors of quality in civic and citizenship education: Exploring possibilities of qualitative comparative analysis. *Comparative Education, 51*(2), 247-275.

The authors investigated whether a systematic association exists between national quality assurance policies in education and achievement in citizenship education. The key assumption is that high civic knowledge is produced by a set of factors embedded in different configurations of quality assurance and evaluation systems operating together with contextual factors in educational systems. By using fuzzy set Qualitative Comparative Analysis (fsQCA), they investigated pathways that were systematically associated with civic education success (test score improvement) in 30 countries. To do this they compared CIVED results with ICCS results in countries participating in both. Then they examined the Quality Assurance policies in these countries. The analysis revealed six configurations of contextual and institutional factors. From these configurations two paths toward a country's success in improving civic and citizenship education could be identified– the participative decision-making pathway (the absence of strict regulations but strong participation by educators) and the accountability pathway (heavily reliant on testing often originating outside the schools). Overall, the model was able to account for the success of some established Western European democracies in improving civic achievement.

Torney-Purta, J. (2002). The school's role in developing civic engagement: A study of adolescents in twenty-eight countries. *Applied Developmental Science*, *6*(4), 203-212.

This article summarizes the samples, methods, analysis and results of the 1999 IEA CIVED study, conducted over eight years in nearly thirty countries and explores its implications. The major findings of this study are: (a) students in these countries are exposed to different modes of engaged citizenship; (b) the average US student possesses skills in political communication but doesn't perform as well when asked about fundamental concepts in democracy; (c) students from low socio-economic status and homes with low literacy resources have relatively low levels of civic knowledge and relatively little interest in voting; (d) students in the US are relatively supportive of active political participation; (e) open and respectful classroom climates for discussion encourage civic knowledge and sense of engagement; (f) explicit instruction about voting can encourage students' willingness to vote; (g) students' peer interactions in school organizations are important for the development of students' civic engagement; (h) students' gender and residency status (e.g., native-born or immigrant) influence political identity development. The implications of this study encourage schools to offer more and richer civic education opportunities and to reach out to cooperate with other organizations in moving toward improved civic education.

Torney-Purta, J. (2002). Patterns in the civic knowledge, engagement, and attitudes of European adolescents: The IEA Civic Education Study. *European Journal of Education, 37*(2), 129-141.

Torney-Purta analyzed data derived from the CIVED study across 23 European countries, to gain a better understanding of similarities and differences among countries in average performance on the IEA test, and to identify factors within countries that are associated with high and low performance. Using a summary of data on civic knowledge, engagement, and attitudes by country, overall findings suggested that students placed a greater emphasis on voting, obeying the law, and garnering support for social

movements than on political party membership and discussion of political issues. This study suggests that civic education is multi-faceted and complex, which requires identifying effective education models that may be particular to each country.

Torney-Purta, J. (2009).   International psychological research that matters for policy and practice. *American Psychologist, 64(3),* 825-837.

The author argues that psychological research that matters is research that can be reflected in policy change, in the practice of educators or psychologists, and/or in the mindsets of the next generation of researchers. She believes that person-centered analysis has this potential, and illustrates this point with a cluster analysis of attitudinal data from the IEA CIVED study. Data from ten countries were included – an equal number of Eastern European countries and countries sharing the Western European tradition. Using these data, five clusters of students were identified: those who supported social justice but were not participative, those active in conventional politics and the community, those indifferent to civic matters, those who were disaffected, and a problematic cluster of alienated adolescents (characterized by very low trust in government and anti-immigrant attitudes). The Western and Eastern European results were similar but not identical. The author concludes with a discussion of the dynamics of successful internationally collaborative research.

Torney-Purta, J. & Amadeo, J.A. (2003). A cross-national analysis of political and civic involvement among adolescents. *Political Science and Politics, 36,* 269-274.

This journal is published by the American Political Science Association for faculty members teaching students in post-secondary education; the article was tailored to that audience. Results from both the CIVED study of 14-year-old in 1999 and the study of 17-18 year olds in 2000 were described (for the countries participating in both – which did not include the United States). Across countries lower levels of political trust, higher expectations of government's involvement in ensuring economic well-being, and higher levels of expected voting were observed among the older respondents. Gender differences were similar across the two age groups.

Torney-Purta, J., & Amadeo, J. A. (2013). International large-scale assessments: Challenges in reporting and potentials for secondary analysis. *Research in Comparative and International Education*, *8*(3), 248-258.

The authors consider issues with the presentation of analysis of the international large-scale assessment (ILSA) instruments such as those used in the IEA CIVED and ICCS studies (but also in other subject areas, for example, in TIMSS and PISA). They describe the weaknesses and distortions of using country averages and rankings of counties when using these datasets. They argue for more resources put into extensive secondary analysis of these data. In addition, they put forth a model for analysis that could produce a better understanding of the relationship between person-related (e.g., age, gender), context-related (e.g., country, school) and process-related variables (e.g., learning opportunities, community engagement) and students' learning outcomes. Based on their model they concluded that "ILSAs have the potential to inform teaching and learning processes and foster interdisciplinary and international

collaboration" (p. 255). They advise against reliance on country rankings using these data and recommend secondary analysis addressing persons, contexts and educational processes.

Torney-Purta, J., Amadeo J-A., and Andolina, M. W. (2010). A conceptual framework and multimethod approach for research on political socialization and civic engagement. In L. R. Sherrod, J. Torney-Purta and C. A. Flanagan (Eds.), *Handbook of research on civic engagement in youth* (pp. 497-523). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley, 2010.

This chapter presents a comprehensive and inclusive conceptual framework and multimethod approach to research on youth civic engagement. The authors "argue for studies that combine quantitative measures (such as surveys) with qualitative measures (such as focus groups or interviews). The purpose of this chapter is to provide suggestions for better ways of aligning studies and their research questions with designs and methodologies" (p. 497). The authors emphasize the importance of stating a clear conceptual framework and congruent research questions. Authors' recommendations include: (a) the support of federal agencies and private foundations to design new studies starting from cumulative reviews of findings and secondary analysis of existing datasets; (b) the creation of specific approaches to connect researchers' methodologies and findings; (c) the cooperation between scholars, organizations and institutions involved in the development and assessment of civic engagement programs; (d) the elaboration of cumulative reviews and information displays summarizing their context; (e) "support for multimethod studies that employ both quantitative and qualitative measures, capitalizing on the advantages and minimizing the disadvantages of each" (p. 519).

Torney-Purta, J., Amadeo, J-A. & Richardson, W. (2007). Civic service among youth in Chile, Denmark, England and the United States: A psychological perspective. In M. Sherraden & A. McBride (Eds.), *Civic service worldwide: Impacts and inquires* (pp 317-331). Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe.

The authors used data from the CIVED study from 4 countries to examine individuals who participated in the equivalent of "service learning" in comparison to individuals who did not participate in such activities. CIVED (but not the subsequent ICCS study) included students' reports of the extent to which they had learned in school "to contribute to solving problems in the community." A separate question asked whether the student had participated in "an organization that conducted voluntary activities to help the community." The following groups were compared using one-way analysis of variance. Group 1 had neither volunteer nor school-based discussion of community problems. Group 2 had learned about these problems in school but had not volunteered. Group 3 had volunteered but had not learned about community problems in school. Group 4 had volunteered and had also learned about community problems in school (the equivalent of a "service learning" experience). In the United States Group 4 (the service learning group) had higher civic outcomes than the other groups (for example, on holding norms of good citizenship, trust in government institutions and sense of political efficacy). The second highest group on these outcome in the U.S. had learned about community problems in school (but had not volunteered). In England, however, group 3, which had only volunteer experience tended to be similar to the group with service learning experience (Group 4). The differences in Chile and Denmark were similar to the U.S. but with smaller differences between groups. This analysis suggests that the context

for service learning is important and that neither service learning nor volunteering can provide a universal solution for the problem of enhancing students' civic development.

Torney-Purta, J., & Barber, C. (2005). Democratic school engagement and civic participation among European adolescents: Analysis of data from the IEA Civic Education Study. *Journal of Social Science Education*, *4*(3), 13-27.

This article explores 14-year-old students' CIVED data in 23 European countries to gain a better understanding of the relationship between democratic school engagement and students' civic participation. This article presented two types of analysis: (a) correlations between democratic school participation (curricular practices, classroom climate, participation in a school council, confidence in the value of participation) and perceptions of citizenship and expected civic participation in 25 countries (23 European countries, plus Australia and the US); (b) within-country correlation of citizenship attitudes and expectations (expectation of informed voting and expectation of community participation) in nine European countries (Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Denmark, England, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland, Italy and Germany). The authors found that "within the countries more democratic participation is associated with positive outcomes for students" (p. 22). Teaching about democracy and reading the newspaper are positively related to students' acceptance of norms and their beliefs in democratic values. Although students and teachers across countries agree on the importance of open classroom climate, not every teacher is skilled enough to guide discussions on political and social issues. The authors recommend linking schools with local organizations, bringing policy and practice together, improving students' participation in school management, enriching teacher training, bringing media discussions into class, and encouraging adults to mentor young people.

Torney-Purta, J., & Barber, C. (2011). Fostering young people's support for participatory human rights through their developmental niches. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, *81*(4), 473.

Torney-Purta and Barber (2011) performed a person-centered analysis of data from the IEA CIVED Study to uncover clusters or patterns of young peoples' attitudes with regards to civic issues and human rights. They identified five clusters across three Western European countries, the United States and Australia. The *social justice cluster* includes youth who support minority rights, immigrant rights, and women's rights (but do not plan to take action relating to their beliefs). The *conventionally oriented cluster* is characterized by adolescents who trust government and support involvement through voting and volunteering in the community. These students also tend to have at least moderate support for minority and immigrant rights. The *indifferent cluster* contains students who seek to do the minimum as a citizen. Those in the *disaffected cluster*, like the indifferent, seek minimal involvement in civic communities, except that they hold more negative beliefs about minorities' rights and about government. (p. 476). This group also seems less interested in political engagement. Finally, the *alienated cluster* contains youth who mistrust government, are negative about immigrants and minorities, and don't believe it important to obey the law. This cluster contains about 10% of young people in the United States (and countries like Australia, England, Finland and Sweden). Because of its strong negativity, it should be of concern.

Torney-Purta, J., Barber, C., & Richardson, W. (2004). Trust in government-related institutions and political engagement among adolescents in six countries. *Acta Politica, 39*(4), 380-406.

This article explores data from the IEA Civic Education Study in 1999 of 14-year-olds across six countries to gain a better understanding of trust and its relation to political socialization in young people. The article considers three types of institutional trust (in institutions with little or no daily contact, in schools, and in other people). Associations were examined between individuals' trust levels and three types of civic engagement (voting, other political participation, and community involvement). In most countries the correlations between trust in the government and civic knowledge were positive. The authors express the belief that a "threshold" level of trustworthiness must be established in order to foster participation civically and politically in young people.

Torney-Purta, J., Barber, C., & Wilkenfeld, B. (2006). Differences in the civic knowledge and attitudes of adolescents in the United States by immigrant status and Hispanic background. *Prospects*, *36*(3), 343-354.

This secondary analysis of the 1999 CIVED study focuses on the association between being an immigrant and Hispanic adolescent in the US and civic knowledge, conceptions of citizenship, political attitudes, and expectations of participation. The authors found that "immigrant and Hispanic students are much more likely than non-immigrant, non-Hispanic students to endorse rights and opportunities for immigrants," while there are no significant differences between these two groups in "understanding the concept of citizenship and in their expected political and civic participation" (p. 352). An implication of this study is the importance of recognizing cultural identities in adolescent development. The authors recommend further studies on civic education of subgroups within the immigration population.

Torney-Purta, J., Barber, C. H., & Wilkenfeld, B. (2007). Latino adolescents' civic development in the United States: Research results from the IEA Civic Education Study. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, *36*(2), 111-125.

This article compares Latino and non-Latino ninth-grade students in the US in terms of civic development. The analysis aimed to gain a better understanding of the relationship between school factors and students' civic developmental outcomes. The school (independent) variables considered by the authors were: the perception of open classroom climate, the study of political topics in the classroom, the teachers' use of interactive activities and their use of official materials in planning, and average parent education. The outcome (dependent) variables were: students' civic knowledge, students' expectations of informed voting, and students' positive attitudes toward immigrants' rights. The authors also considered: (a) Latino ethnicity predictors (student's report that they are of Latino ethnicity, and whether they attend schools with more Latino students than the average across all schools in the sample); (b) individual covariate predictors (not born in country of test, and not speaking English -- the language of test); and (c) home background (reading news in the newspaper, discuss political topics with parents, residence in the suburbs). The authors "analyzed the three outcomes with multilevel modeling techniques using HLM software" (p. 115). Their results shows that "non-Latino students have significantly more civic knowledge, are more likely to expect to vote, and are less likely to hold positive attitudes toward the rights of immigrants than Latino students. The gap is about half a

standard deviation for knowledge, and between a quarter and half a standard deviation for expected voting and immigrants' rights attitudes" (p. 117). These findings have implications for policy and for further research, especially for those who intend to consider how the school experience can make a difference for both Latino and non-Latin students.

Torney-Purta, J., Richardson, W. K., & Barber, C. H. (2005). Teachers' educational experience and confidence in relation to students' civic knowledge across countries. *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education*, *1*(1), 32-57.

This article explores data from teachers from 27 countries, who took the IEA teacher survey in the context of the CIVED study in 1999. The authors focused on the analysis of teachers' beliefs about their background knowledge and about civic education. The authors aimed to gain a better understanding of the relationship between teachers' confidence in their knowledge and beliefs and their students' civic knowledge. In particular they focused on teacher experience in terms of professional education and training, teachers' confidence in teaching civic subjects and teachers' attitudes towards civic education. The research methods used by the authors included: (a) descriptive analyses of teachers in eight selected countries (Australia, Denmark, Finland, England, Hungary, the United States, Czech Republic, and Norway); (b) exploratory factor analyses in the 27 countries; (c) average teacher scores per country compared with the average student knowledge at the country level across 27 countries; (d) a more detailed comparison of teachers' responses in three countries (Finland, Hungary, and the United States) with their students' civic knowledge. The authors found that across the 27 countries teachers' civic-related in-service experiences and holding of civic-related degrees related to students' civic knowledge. "The overall conclusion is that the context of a country, both the history of its political system and the extent to which teachers' preparation is consistent with the beliefs of the public and curricular policies governing education, are important components defining the effectiveness of educational programmes designed to raise teachers' content knowledge and pedagogical knowledge (as well as their confidence in teaching about civic-related topics)" (p. 49). The implications are that teacher preparation programs in citizenship education need to be developed considering country specific and educational contexts. The authors recommend future research that can expand the within-country models analyses beyond the three countries they most closely examined in this article.

Torney-Purta, J. & Wilkenfeld, B. (2009). *Paths to 21st Century Competencies through Civic Education Classrooms: An Analysis of Survey Results from Ninth-Graders*. Chicago: Division for Public Education American Bar Association.[3]

Civic education, especially when it is interactive and involves discussion of current issues, is an important way to develop the skills that young people need to succeed in the 21st Century workforce. In this publication students from four groups who were tested in the U.S. in the IEA CIVED 1999 project were compared. Group 1 contained students who reported experiencing interactive discussion-based civic education in combination with more traditional lecture-based civic education. Group 2 contained those who experienced discussion-based civic education only. Group 3 contained those who experienced lecture-based traditional instruction only, and Group 4 was those who experienced neither type of civic education. The group with discussion-based civic education experience (either by itself or combined with lectures and other traditional methods) scored the highest on a set of "21st Century Competencies," including working cooperatively with others (especially in diverse groups) and knowledge of economic and political processes. Students who experienced neither interactive nor lecture-based civic education had lower scores than the other 3 groups on all of the 21st Century competencies examined. This publication has implications for the workforce preparation of students in parallel with their civic preparation.

Torney-Purta, J., Wilkenfeld, B., & Barber, C. (2008). How adolescents in 27 countries understand, support, and practice human rights. *Journal of Social Issues*, *64*(4), 857-880.

This article explores 14-year-old students in 27 countries surveyed in the 1999 IEA CIVED study to gain a better understanding of between country differences in students' knowledge pertaining to human rights and associations with students' attitudes toward promoting and practicing human rights. Using hierarchical linear modeling they found that the country's context for recognizing human rights and the condition of civil and political rights in a country make a difference in adolescents' knowledge of the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the United Nations. In general, students, who in their schools are exposed to discussions of democracy, international issues, and open class climates and those who live in countries that pay attention to human rights in their intergovernmental discourse, are likely to perform better on human rights knowledge items. They are also more likely to engage with international topics and have a positive attitudes to immigrants' rights. Females across countries are more likely to support human rights but have a lower level of political efficacy. From this analysis the role that schools and other societal institutions can have in promoting the practice of human rights emerged, especially in supporting democratic practices and encouraging students to become informed about international issues. The

---

[3] http: www.anericanbar.org/content/dam/aba.images/public_education/civiclearningresource_booklet_lores.pdf

authors recommend future analysis to explore further aspects of national political contexts in relationship to young people's attitudes toward human rights.

Wilde, S. (Ed.). (2005). *Political and citizenship education: International perspectives.* Oxford   (UK): Symposium Books.

This book contains chapters reporting analysis from the IEA CIVED Study in the U.S. (Hahn), England (Kerr), Australia (Kennedy and Mellor) and Hong Kong (Lee). The authors served in national coordinating roles for the Study. They draw implications for civic education practice from the results and place them in the contexts of these educational systems. The authors decry the often inaccurate headlines produced about most international comparative studies. They argue that the value of international studies such as these goes far beyond comparison between countries to provide rich and useful data for national analysis that can be related to particular national contexts and issues.

Wilkenfeld, B., & Torney-Purta, J. (2012). A cross-context analysis of civic engagement Linking CIVED and US Census data. *Journal of Social Science Education*, *11*(1), 64-80.

Wilkenfeld and Torney-Purta examined the responses of adolescents in the US who participated in the 1999 CIVED study and linked these data to US census data to gain a better understanding of the association between direct and indirect family, peer, school, and neighborhood variables and adolescents' civic engagement. Using multilevel regression methods, they found that students' civic experiences and discourse in schools are positively correlated with higher civic engagement. This analysis confirmed that adolescents' civic engagement is also influenced by a large set of variables such as, school and neighborhood contexts, students' demographic characteristics, learning opportunities, school SES and school climate for open discussion in the classroom. Implications of this study are connected with conceptual understanding of development within contexts, methodological considerations, and educational practice. The authors recommend further analysis of differences relating to the social class of neighborhoods.

Zhang, T., Torney-Purta, J., & Barber, C. (2012). Students' conceptual knowledge and process skills in civic education: Identifying cognitive profiles and classroom correlates. *Theory & Research in Social Education*, *40*(1), 1-34.

This article includes two studies of US ninth graders using CIVED data. In Study 1, the authors gained an understanding of the relation between students' acquisition of basic conceptual knowledge and students' acquisition of more complex competence in the domain of civic knowledge. Using cognitive diagnostic modeling, the authors found that the acquisition of basic knowledge is necessary to acquire more advanced conceptual knowledge. Civic skills, however, may be acquired without much conceptual knowledge. In Study 2, the authors looked at the relationship between (a) teacher's approaches and students' experiences in civics or social studies classrooms and (b) students' mastery of civic concepts and of civic process skills. Using a two level multinomial hierarchical generalized linear model, the authors found that the exposure to civic concepts through classroom interactive engagement is a consistent predictor of conceptual civic achievement. They also argue that in the United States some

civic skills may be acquired in classes outside of the social studies. They remind readers that knowledge construction is also mediated by social factors, and call for more studies that could explore how these characteristics are related to conceptual knowledge and skill acquisition. The authors also caution that students who demonstrate mastery of civic conceptual knowledge and skills both in the test and in real life settings may have been exposed to more learning opportunities both inside and outside schools.

Zhang, T. & Torney-Purta, J., & Mislevy, R. J. (2016). Understanding civic cognitive assessment tasks: Associations between linguistic features and students' task performance. *Citizenship Teaching & Learning, 11*(1), 29-47.

This secondary analysis of the 1999 IEA CIVED study on the United States focused on the relationship between linguistic features and the overall performance of the adolescents who took the test. The authors used the software Coh-Metrix version 2.0 that analyzes Kintsch's categories such as words, syntax, and situation models, in addition to traditional readability formulas. The authors found that there is a correlation between the inclusion of certain types of words and certain sentence constructions in an item and that item's level of difficulty. They also related students' lack of ability to create an accurate situation model based on an item stem to the difficulty of CIVED test items. Implications of this study are related to the impact that reading comprehension has on students' performance in subject area cognitive assessments. The authors recommend further studies of texts formats and ways of enhancing students' ability to comprehend an item's stem in order to form an accurate situation model (and then to complete that situation model with the choice of a correct answer). This could create more valid assessment instruments.

Works Cited but Not Listed In the Annotated Bibliography:

Amadeo, J., Torney-Purta, J., Lehmann, R., Husfeldt, V. & Nikolova, R. (2002). *Civic knowledge and engagement: An IEA Study of upper secondary students in sixteen countries.* Amsterdam, NL: IEA.

Arthur, J., Davies, I., & Hahn, C. (2008). *The SAGE handbook of education for citizenship and democracy.* London, UK: Sage Publications.

Carretero, M., Haste, H., & Bermudez, A. (2016). Civic education. In L. Corno & E. Anderman (Eds.), *Handbook of educational psychology* (pp. 295-306). New York: Routledge.

Fitchett, P. G. & Heafner, T. (Forthcoming). Quantitative Research in Social Studies Education. In Manfra, M., & Bolick, C. (Eds.). *The handbook of social studies research*, New York, NY: Routledge.

Heafner, T., Fitchett, P. G. & Knowles, R. T. (2016). Using big data, Large-scale studies, secondary datasets, and secondary data analysis as tools to inform social studies teaching and learning. In A. R. Crowe & A. Cuenca (Eds.) *Rethinking social studies teacher education in the twenty-first century.* Switzerland: Springer.

Levstik, L. S., & Tyson, C. A. (Eds.) (2008). *Handbook of research in social studies education.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Manfra, M., & Bolick, C. (Eds.) (forthcoming). *The handbook of social studies research.* New York, NY: Wiley-Blackwell

Schulz, W., Ainley, J. Fraillon, J., Kerr, D. & Losito, B. (2010). *ICCS 2009 international report: Civic knowledge, attitudes and engagement among lower-secondary school students in 38 countries.* Amsterdam, NL: IEA.

Sherrod, L. R., Torney-Purta, J., & Flanagan, C. A., (Eds.) (2010). *Handbook of research on civic engagement in youth*. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons Inc.

Torney-Purta, J. & Amadeo, J. (2004). *Strengthening democracy in the Americas through civic education.* Washington, DC: Organization of American States (OAS).

Torney-Purta, J., Amadeo, J., & Andolina, M. W. (2010). A conceptual framework and multimethod approach for research on political socialization and civic engagement. In L. R. Sherrod, J. Torney-Purta, & C. A. Flanagan (Eds.), *Handbook of research on civic engagement in youth* (pp. 497-523). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons Inc.

Torney-Purta, J., Cabrera, J., Roohr, K. C., Liu, O. L., & Rios, J. A. (2015). *Assessing civic competency and engagement in higher education: Research background, frameworks, and directions for next generation assessment* (Research Report No. RR-15-34). Princeton, NJ: Educational Testing Service.

Torney-Purta, J., Lehmann, R., Oswald, H. & Schulz (2001). *Citizenship and education in twenty-eight countries: Civic knowledge and engagement at age fourteen.* Amsterdam, NL: IEA.

Torney-Purta, J., Malak-Minkiewicz, B. & Barber, C. (in press). Cross-national inequalities in preparation for democratic participation: The process and findings of the IEA Civic Education Study. In W. No, A. Brennan & D. Schugurensky (Eds.), *By the people: Participatory democracy, civic engagement and citizenship education.* Tempe, AZ: Participatory Governance Initiative at Arizona State University.

Torney-Purta, J. & Richardson, W. K. (2003). Teaching for the meaningful practice of democratic citizenship: Learning from the IEA Civic Education Study in 28 countries. In J. Patrick, G. Hamot & R. Leming (Eds.), *Civic learning in teacher education: International perspectives on education for democracy in the preparation of teachers* (pp. 25-44). Bloomington, IN: ERIC Clearinghouse for Social Studies/Social Studies Education.

Wilkenfeld, B., Lauckhardt, J., Torney-Purta, J. (2010). The relation between developmental theory and measures of civic engagement in research on adolescents. In Sherrod, L. R., Flanagan, C. A., & Torney-Purta, J. (Eds.) *Handbook of research on civic engagement in youth*, (pp. 193-219), Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.

Websites with Additional Information about CIVED99 and ICCS09:

For reports from CIVED99 and additional unpublished material (including the CEDARS report on additional scales):

http://terpconnect.umd.edu/~jtpurta

For access to the data from CIVED99 and ICCS09:

International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA). (2004). *IEA Civic Education Study, 1999: [United States].* [Data file]. Retrieved from http://www.icpsr.umich.edu/icpsrweb/ICPSR/studies/3892

International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA). (2008). *IEA Study Data Repository*. Available from the IEA Data Processing Center website: http://rms.iea-dpc.org/.

For reports from ICCS09:

http://iccs.acer.edu.au/index.php?page=initial-findings

For convention papers and technical reports about ICCS09: http://iccs.acer.edu.au/index.php?page=publications-and-papers