

## TRANSLANGUAGING - A TOOL FOR IGNITING ETHNIC SENSITIVITIES IN MULTI-ETHNIC SINDH, PAKISTAN

**Ameer Ali**

*University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan*

Email: ameer7037@gmail.com

**Maya Khemlani David**

*University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Email: mayadavid@yahoo.com

**Syed Abdul Manan**

*Graduate School of Education, Nazarbayev University Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan*

Email: syed.manan@nu.edu.kz

APA Citation: Ali, A., David, M. K., Manan, S. A. (2021). Translanguaging – A tool for igniting ethnic sensitivities in multi-ethnic Sindh, Pakistan. *Indonesian EFL Journal*, 7(2), pp. 105-120.  
<https://doi.org/10.25134/ieflj.v7i2.4564>

Received: 19-03-2020

Accepted: 18-05-2021

Published: 15-07-2021

**Abstract:** This study examines translanguaging as a political tool in Pakistan used to exploit ethnic sensitivities of speech communities. Building upon the grounded theory, concept of translanguaging was reconsidered to examine the politicized use of codes. The modified concept has been used to analyse the discourse of politicians and to demonstrate that such a mixed code has generated three tactical outcomes: politicization of language use, manipulation of general will, and exploitation of electoral support. The data comes from speeches of Pakistani politicians in Sindh, Pakistan between 2018 to 2020. This study demonstrates the politics of translanguaging, that is, the exploitation of language use for political purposes and argues that language policy experts should be made aware of such ramifications of the use of translanguaging as a political tool.

**Keywords:** ethnic sensitivities; exploitation; language policy; Pakistan; Sindh; translanguaging.

### INTRODUCTION

Translanguaging, as a pedagogical tool, originates from the Welsh, bilingual education system (Lewis, Jones, and Baker, 2012). Cen Williams, a Welsh educationist, introduced the idea of translanguaging in 1980s (Lewis, Jones, and Baker, 2012) and produced a Welsh word ‘trwasieithu’ that is an English equivalent of the term ‘translanguaging’ (Conteh, 2019). Scholars define ‘translanguaging’ as multilingual, verbal intercourse and use of different, written languages (García, 2009). “Translanguaging is the act performed by bilinguals of accessing different linguistic features or various modes of what are described as autonomous languages, in order to maximize communicative potential” (García, 2009, p.140).

Translanguaging was purposefully developed as a cross-curricular strategy for simultaneous, systematic teaching and learning of the same lesson. (Conteh, 2019). Nowadays, educationists have

begun to recognize the pedagogic value of translanguaging in manners that is also advantageous for other language users (Wei, 2018). Additionally, translanguaging has become an effective way of understanding multilingual practices (Beiler, 2020). According to Vogel and García (2017), bilinguals/multilinguals use translanguaging to make meaning and negotiate communicative contexts. However, in multilingual contexts where language activists are calling for mother tongue education and where languages are playing an influential role in construction of ethnic identities, translanguaging has become a political tool of igniting ethnolinguistic sensitivities. Similarly, in Sindh, which is a multilingual province of Pakistan, translanguaging has been exploited by politicians to achieve their goals and perpetuate their interests. Since there is much support for Sindhi language in Sindh, politicians make use of translanguaging in their speeches to

provoke Sindhis and thereby win political support within the province.

Therefore, it is argued in this research that the politics of translanguaging produces the effects of exploiting electoral results and general will of Sindhis and other ethnic communities in Sindh. Since Sindh is a multilingual province where languages are associated with ethnic identity, it is common that politicians exploit its multilingual reality through translanguaging. The use of translanguaging incites the ethnic sensitivities of Sindhis, because the Sindhis have been advocating for the official status of the Sindhi language (for more details see Ali and David, 2021).

Sindh, a province of Pakistan, was the cradle of the Indus Valley Civilization in the third millennium BC (Mukherjee, 2020) and represented the glorious past of Sindh (Solangi, Laghari, and Kabooro, 2017). Over centuries, Sindh bore the brunt of foreign invasions which brought different faiths, and ways of life to Sindh (Syed, 2010). According to Pathan (1978), Buddhism and Hinduism were religions of many Sindhis in Sindh before the Muslims came to Sindh in the seventh century AD. In 1947, when the subcontinent was divided into Pakistan and India, Sindh became a part of Pakistan where many Sindhis lived. The Sindhi language, that has been considered as an Indo-Aryan language, has evolved over a period of two millennia (Mukherjee, 2020) and is now an official language of Sindh.

Sindh is a multilingual province where Sindhi, Urdu, Baluchi, Brahui, Seraiki, Punjabi, and many other languages are spoken. Although the Sindhi language is native to Sindhis of Sindh, the Urdu language is spoken by the Muslim migrants who fled to Sindh during the partition of the subcontinent in 1947. Therefore, Sindh is a highly mobile province characterized by historical displacements and contemporary mobilities. In the wake of increasing diversity, mobility and negotiation of complex attachments and affiliations emerge a conventional form of politics that is known as politics of conviviality (Williams and Stroud, 2013). Consequently, the politics of language is and has been central to Pakistan's Sindh province where misguided language policies have often resulted in ethnic riots between Urdu speaking Muhajirs and Sindhi speaking natives (for details see Ali and David, 2021).

According to Malik (1997), politicians have exploited language and ethnic issues resulting in ethnic conflicts in Sindh. Ethnic clashes among Urdu speaking Muhajirs, Pashto speaking Pashtuns, Punjabis and Sindhis have claimed the lives of about 2000 people in the province (Kennedy, 1991). Different language communities in Sindh are divided over ethnic lines and their ethnic identities are misused by politicians using a number of linguistic strategies.

Given this background it is the aim of this research to determine the play on languages used by politicians in Sindh and their use of translanguaging as a political tool to divide and rule the people of Sindh. Speeches from leaders belonging to Pakistan's different political parties have been critically analyzed. These political parties include Pakistan People's Party, Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz, Pakistan Muslim League Functional, and Baluchistan National Party (Mengal). Pakistan People's Party and Pakistan Muslim League Functional have the majority of Sindhi followers who are based in Sindh. Baluchistan National Party is based in the Baluchistan province of Pakistan and is mostly supported by Brahui and Baluchi speaking people in the province. The Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz has its followers in the Punjab province of Pakistan. In the National Assembly, Pakistan People's Party and Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz are in opposition, while Pakistan Muslim League Functional is in alliance with the Tehreek-e-Insaaf-led government.

The politics of translanguaging plays an influential role in igniting ethnic sensitivities of Sindhis in Sindh. Politicians in Sindh use translanguaging as a tool of linguistic exploitation, and their use of Sindhi along with Arabic and Urdu in their speeches incites the emotions of the Sindhi speech community in Sindh. This politicized use of translanguaging also brings about in Sindh what Smith et al (2020) have identified as a tension between the urges of pluralism and collectivism.

The politics of translanguaging has become a strategic tool of politicians in Sindh who use it to achieve their political goals. Political speech involves highly influential, complex processes (Smith, 2009). It is "usually the product of a three-tiered authorship comprising media advisors, researchers, and drafters" (Smith, 2009, p.52). At every stage of decision making, and within each functional group, those who write/make political

speeches have impact on the final product (Smith, 2009). The aim of this research is to determine how politicians in Sindh, against the backdrop of language policy, make use of translanguaging as a tool to ignite the ethnic sensitivities of Sindhis in Sindh. In addition, verses are also used in their speeches. Sindhi politicians make use of Sindhi verses which they derive from the poetry of a famous seventeenth century poet, Shah Abdul Latif Bhittai. In Sindh, many politicians use Urdu to demonstrate national interest, Sindhi to accommodate to the listening public, religious terms in Arabic to denote they are Muslims, and English to denote power and education. It is not only the politicized choice of these named languages that wins the hearts of people but different genres of poetry which are embedded in these speeches are also effective tools of translingual politics.

Language policy/regime in Pakistan's Sindh province is exclusionary, and many Sindhis in Sindh have been actively engaged in a struggle for their language rights. In Sindh, two languages Sindhi and Urdu along with English are used as official languages, however, the language activists of Sindhi language are passionately calling for the implementation of the Sindhi Language Bill (1972) that gave Sindhi language official status (for details see Ali and David, 2021). The use of the two languages-Sindhi and Urdu- have different implications- Urdu is seen as a language of national integrity and cohesion, while Sindhi is seen as a marker of ethnic identity of the Sindhis in Sindh.

Sindh's history of language policy is replete with critical junctures. Critical junctures are acts of protest or resistance which attempt to counter oppressive language policies much like other governmental policies (for details on critical junctures see Ali and David, 2021). According to Cardinal and Sonntag (2015), these critical junctures tend to influence language policy. Language agitation and protests become inevitable in a multilingual region where languages become markers of identity.

Pakistan is a multilingual country, and language is a marker of identity that renders it a politically sensitive subject. Ethnicity in such a multilingual country incites the feelings of people on the basis of identity symbols, such as language, religion or experience to gain some share in goods and services (Rahman, 2002). Therefore, multilingualism has been considered as problem rather than asset in

Pakistan's successive language policies (Manan, David, and Dumanig, 2017). Gordon (2005) reporting on multilingual reality of Pakistan says that there are seventy-two languages spoken in Pakistan. For details on the major languages of Pakistan see Table 1:

Table 1. *Major languages of Pakistan and their speakers (Rahman, 2002)*

Language Speakers	Their Percentage in Pakistan
Punjabi	48.17%
Pashto	13.14%
Sindhi	11.77%
Seraiki	9.83%
Urdu	7.60%
Balochi	3.02%
Hindko	2.43%
Brahvi	1.21%

Note: other minor languages spoken in Pakistan number more than 50.

In Pakistan, English and Urdu are languages of power, while the other languages have been downplayed, and language activists are calling for teaching students in their indigenous languages (Rahman, 2002). This activism for less powerful languages has been a result of what Rasool and Mansoor (2007) call the partition of India in 1947. The fractures and displacement of the division have caused ethnolinguistic conflicts which are still prevalent in Pakistan (Rasool and Mansoor, 2007). The exclusion of indigenous languages and therefore multilingualism in Pakistan has been due to orthodox beliefs of ELT practitioners which discourage them from using mother tongues as a tool to learn the target language (English) (Manan and Tul-Kubra, 2020).

According to Rahman (1996), there is inextricable link between language and politics in Pakistan. In his book, he (1996) argues that the linguistic conflict is related to political dominance in Pakistan. Using historical data, he examines British-era language policies, Urdu-Bengali controversy, and how the politics of identity formation inspired Bengali, Baluchi, Pashto, Punjabi, Sindhi, and Seraiki movements in Pakistan. After the influx of Urdu-speaking immigrants to Sindh in 1947, "the teaching of Sindhi has become an ethnic, identity symbol for the Sindhi nationalists. Thus, it is promoted by the Sindhis and resisted by the Urdu speaking Muhajirs" (immigrants from India who came to Pakistan's

Sindh province after the partition of the subcontinent in 1947) (Rahman, 1999, p.21).

In such a linguistically diverse region where languages have become a symbol of ethnic identity, language-based politics becomes a norm, and different language groups struggle for their upward linguistic mobility. These ethnolinguistic emotions have been exploited by politicians in Sindh much to their advantage through translanguaging. In their speeches, the tactical use of translanguaging has been identified critically to derive a theoretical lens. The theoretical framework used in this research has been developed after codifying the data culled from the politicians' speeches in Sindh. The concept of translanguaging has been reconsidered and modified to better understand the politicized use of translanguaging and its repercussions in Sindh. Central ideas developed from the collected data are presented here.

Translanguaging is a politicized process that ignites and exploits ethnic emotions. It appeals to ethnic identity of different speech communities in a multi-ethnic region; it is a dynamic practice which codifies politicians' multi-lingual, political speech acts. Politics of translanguaging incites ethnic groups' sensitivities through popular culture, language choice and nationalist discourse. Consequently, it leads people into believing that their culture, language and identity are being taken care of by their leaders, however, it is a tactic used to win political support of different ethnic communities.

Sometimes, politicians who strive to make use of translanguaging lack diverse, linguistic repertoire. Consequently, they memorize a few popular sentences of different languages so that they may use these to demonstrate their translational practices. However, it is a political tactic of fabricating translanguaging to influence opinions of multi-ethnic audience. This fabricated translanguaging is more effective strategy because it convinces the multi-ethnic audience in to believing that their leaders are trying their best to converge to ethnolinguistic diversity. In Sindh's context, for instance, using Arabic demonstrates the act of fabricating translanguaging because many politicians cannot speak or write in Arabic. However, they use it to gain support of those people who respect Arabic language because it is language of the Quran, a sacred book of Muslims.

Whether it is fabricated or not, translanguaging renders certain repercussions on society where it is used. Usually, it results in encouraging translational practices among languages of major ethnic groups. Therefore, it is right to say that it is majoritarian translanguaging that politically encourages major social, ethnic groups and their languages, while at the same time discourage minority groups and their languages. In this way, translanguaging helps politicians gain general support, on the one hand, whereas divide society across majority and minority lines, on the other hand. The political unity that it induces is beneficial for politicians, while the social division that it causes is harmful for minority language groups.

Translanguaging, therefore, is not always a mechanism of encouraging linguistic inclusion, cultural independence and democratic representation rather it is a process of going beyond language boundaries promoting fixed political interests. Linguistic fluidity and dynamism facilitates politicians to promote their political interests by using multilingual repertoire. 1.4 Segment Breakdown

In the first section, topic has been introduced contextualizing it to Sindh province of Pakistan, and grounded approach towards politicized use of translanguaging in Sindh has been explained. In the second section, concepts of translanguaging have been reviewed to show how they lack rigour to analyze politicized use of translanguaging in a multilingual context. The third section describes research methodology adopted in this research. Analysis has been conducted in the fourth section, while the fifth segment is about discussion. The sixth section concludes the research article.

Now, theories/concepts of translanguaging and codeswitching are to be critically discussed to demonstrate how these lack in their critical underpinnings and thereby are not suitable to examine politics of translanguaging in a multi-ethnic region. Previous concepts/theories of translanguaging show its democratic role and inclusive nature. However, none of these concepts/theories to the best of our knowledge, showed how translanguaging becomes a tool of igniting ethnic sensitivities and its repercussions on the society in general and Sindhi society in particular. Moreover, none of these concepts elaborated why politicians usually switch among languages of wider communication and how

translingual practices help them achieve their goals of influencing general will of their multi-ethnic audience. Against this backdrop, we propose a theoretical concept of translanguaging which seeks to problematize linguistic fluidity and dynamism in politicians' speeches. It is hoped that this research fills the theoretical gap by showing how translanguaging cashes on linguistic, cultural concerns of a multi-ethnic audience and how political interests are translanguaged beyond linguistic boundaries.

The nation state's expectations police the linguistic behaviour of students and other citizens (Blommaert et al., 2009). However, multilingual environments, "for instance, new media (e.g., the internet and computer games) create translocal moments of activity and...thus offering multiple forms of allegiance (Blommaert et al., 2009, p.204), and ethnic association is one of the forms of allegiance. Their view also refers to the emerging fact that ethnolinguistic struggles come about in multilingual, virtual environments and how translanguaging can be easily missed as an opportunity of developing hybrid, translocal opportunity precisely because ethnic interests are stressed more than translocal priorities.

García (2009) views translanguaging as a strategy of maximizing communicative skills. In contrast, it is a strategy of inciting ethnic emotions that is designed to serve political interests in multi-ethnic regions. Erdocia, (2020) states that translanguaging causes linguistic exploitation when used by politicians as a tool. Erdocia's (2020) critical, qualitative analysis contextualized in Catalonia, Spain demonstrates how politicians invoke international educational standards, such as translanguaging/plurilingualism as a tool to achieve their political goals. Erdocia's view of translanguaging puts light on political exploitation through translanguaging, however, it does not demonstrate how politicians use it in their speeches to achieve their goals.

Smith et al (2020) argue that translanguaging also causes clash between political forces of pluralism and collectivism. They conceptualize it as pluralists' strategy used against proponents of monolingual collectivism. They implicitly claim

that it encourages linguistic pluralism and cultural diversity. Their view lacks critical approach towards translanguaging, especially how politicians exploit it in multi-ethnic regions. Paulsrud and Rosen (2019) critically reviewed empirical studies on translanguaging conducted in different countries to show how translanguaging in educational, and political contexts manifests, negotiates, and challenges both implicit and explicit language ideologies. Their research focusses on the connection between language ideologies and translanguaging in different political contexts.

In Sindh's context, Ali (2021) has qualitatively discussed how translanguaging is a pedagogical tool for language learning. Ali views translanguaging as a tool of acquiring second language. In Sindh's context, politicians' use of translanguaging has increased in recent years that is politically, linguistically, and socially affecting different speech communities. Therefore, translanguaging and its role inside classroom or out of the classroom context cannot be taken for granted and there is dire need to problematize linguistic fluidity and dynamism in all multi-ethnic contexts.

## METHOD

This research is qualitative in its form and content because the grounded theory was used to reconsider the concept of translanguaging in the out-of-classroom context in Sindh.

### *Data collection*

Secondary data, such as politicians' speeches made between 2018 and 2020 in Sindh, was collected for conducting analysis. Speeches were chosen from this period because ethnolinguistic awareness was resurging in Pakistan and Sindh. Ten political speeches made through translanguaging in Sindhi, Urdu, English and Arabic taken from YouTube channels belonging to Pakistani news channels were purposively selected, manually transcribed and translated into English. Data was collected from these channels because they were virtual, easily accessible domains of Pakistan's media outlets. Details of YouTube channels are given below, see Table 2.

Table 2. *YouTube Channels*

YouTube Channel Name	Web-link
1. News HD	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LRFx2p6164Q&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR3">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LRFx2p6164Q&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR3</a>

		IEbwWI9tzhypOHVvLbYD9CdMfFTwWrLlI81ShXCCqKmrj0oERXuUngPc.
2.	ARY News	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lpJyCa1BpCg&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR2ogkeww19mUjUxD6nLFuAk2SGnUAbyyMTgvBzg78r9_ebU4_dX5KxC4HE">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lpJyCa1BpCg&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR2ogkeww19mUjUxD6nLFuAk2SGnUAbyyMTgvBzg78r9_ebU4_dX5KxC4HE</a> .
3.	Charsadda Journalist	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SFL6x7uKj10&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR2DNyssakxzqlW3vwyssC0i19EhfeKEaCFWeJuStOv5i_Hhw4g3R_uBHNc">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SFL6x7uKj10&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR2DNyssakxzqlW3vwyssC0i19EhfeKEaCFWeJuStOv5i_Hhw4g3R_uBHNc</a> .
4.	Naya Daur TV	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5sHmTSzMuY8&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR0hFE1-QVPBI2YKnI9-0N8fNrOF00IJ6iQcSddgvP-8hooo8IhVvVvIrw0">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5sHmTSzMuY8&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR0hFE1-QVPBI2YKnI9-0N8fNrOF00IJ6iQcSddgvP-8hooo8IhVvVvIrw0</a> .
5.	News Line	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mtrvWkO25Ws&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR3JRC7fOJgWC2cBxhsIsk_QoP6wFLqeOeX7ckaKSCG-DLk0nTF2LQZZj2A">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mtrvWkO25Ws&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR3JRC7fOJgWC2cBxhsIsk_QoP6wFLqeOeX7ckaKSCG-DLk0nTF2LQZZj2A</a> .
6.	SAMAA TV	Link 1: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nFtxc8KpTas&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR1EUXuoUqmDMh6fa9FIfw_tZQtgggATxtLcVnP3k1ImC6Aiq-YnJ8228Ek">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nFtxc8KpTas&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR1EUXuoUqmDMh6fa9FIfw_tZQtgggATxtLcVnP3k1ImC6Aiq-YnJ8228Ek</a> .  Link 2. <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PoGoSoUQhdo&amp;t=919s">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PoGoSoUQhdo&amp;t=919s</a>
7.	Sindh TV News	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KYrF7Mz0ziQ&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR0qwVXQyMoi9EmSf_NzpruUPMwmX5UwUaTOkYbVTU2j9WGxsEZ4WoEIxJw">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KYrF7Mz0ziQ&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR0qwVXQyMoi9EmSf_NzpruUPMwmX5UwUaTOkYbVTU2j9WGxsEZ4WoEIxJw</a>
8.	Syed Sardar Ali Shah- Official	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6vNS8qqz7i0&amp;t=300s">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6vNS8qqz7i0&amp;t=300s</a> .
9.	United TV	<a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iZNz_wCAFQQ&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR2kNSRe1nc0Q4qA2fjhGHpr7KE7D8WRnBMkNaBHP-GbZD-FGdpgwEu2ByU">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iZNz_wCAFQQ&amp;feature=share&amp;fbclid=IwAR2kNSRe1nc0Q4qA2fjhGHpr7KE7D8WRnBMkNaBHP-GbZD-FGdpgwEu2ByU</a> .

#### Coding

The collected data was coded into three broader themes based on insights derived from the careful, contextual reading of the politicians' speeches. These speeches were codified into broader themes which are Translanguaging: A Mechanism of Political Selectiveness of Languages in Sindh, A Politicized Nexus of Poetry and Speech Genre through Translanguaging, and Translanguaging: A Tool of Manufacturing Popular Consent. Moreover, these broader categories also enabled us to develop theoretical generalizations in Sindh's context.

#### Theoretical sampling

The three broader categories developed during the coding process were used as theoretical concepts to analyze the data culled from the known speeches.

The three concepts were critically applied to demonstrate how politicians in Sindh make use of translanguaging which is politically motivated. In this way, a theory of the politicized use of translanguaging was developed in Sindh's context to better understand politics of translanguaging.

#### Details about the politicians

The speeches were either from party leaders or people's representatives in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh who represent a large portion of the people in Sindh and Pakistan. The politicians belong to Pakistan's different political parties which have been earlier described. They made speeches either in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh or in their political shows. Details about the politicians are given here, see Table 3:

Table 3. Details about the politicians

Politician Name	Gender	Political Affiliation	Province
1. Riaz Chandio	Male	Jiye Sindh Mahaz (Leader)	Sindh
2. Murad Ali Shah	Male	Pakistan People's Party	Sindh
3. Maryam Nawaz	Female	Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz)	Punjab
4. Qaim Ali Shah	Male	Pakistan People's Party	Sindh
5. Nusrat Sehar Abbasi	Female	Pakistan Muslim League (Functional)	Sindh
6. Nisar Khoro	Male	Pakistan People's Party	Sindh
7. Akhtar Mengal	Male	Baluchistan National Party (Mengal)	Baluchistan
8. Sardar Ali Shah	Male	Pakistan People's Party	Sindh

#### RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Excerpts culled from political speeches of politicians in Sindh show a number of instances in which they make use of politics of translanguaging

to achieve their goals of igniting ethnic sensitivities. The political speeches clearly demonstrate that in some speeches translanguaging occurs among languages, such as Sindhi, Urdu, or English, while

in other speeches translanguaging takes place among Arabic, Sindhi, or English.

Patterns and mechanisms of politics of translanguaging in political speeches have been used by politicians in Sindh as a basis for igniting ethnic sensitivities which have often resulted in critical junctures and controversial language regimes and policies (for more details see Ali and David, 2021). In Sindh's context, politics of translanguaging, like critical junctures is basically aimed at language accommodation, influencing general will, and thereby impacting electoral results.

Information about the alternating processes of languages in the politicians' speeches through translanguaging can be studied by language researchers as a basis for igniting ethnic sensitivities of Sindhis and other speech communities living in Sindh. In some educational contexts, translanguaging will signify some appreciative remarks about the translanguaging user and the norm is to accept the practice (Romanowski, 2019). However, translanguaging also causes linguistic exploitation when used by politicians as a tool (Erdocia, 2020). Therefore, in this research, politicians' use of translanguaging has been analysed based on three themes: Translanguaging: A Mechanism of Political Selectiveness of Languages in Sindh, A Politicized Nexus of Poetry and Speech Genre through Translanguaging, and Translanguaging: A Tool of Manufacturing Popular Consent.

Please note in the following examples, colours, such as red for Sindhi, green for Urdu, blue for Arabic and purple for English have been used. Also, the same has been done in the Roman scripts of the languages, and their translations in English have also the same colour.

#### *Translanguaging: A mechanism of political selectiveness of languages in Sindh*

Translanguaging is a political tool that facilitates politicians in Sindh to politically involve themselves in multilingual practices to attract support of multiple language groups. Therefore, politics of translanguaging appears to have similar exploitative patterns in different language contexts (Erdocia, 2020; Smith et al, 2020; Muelder et al, 2019). Example 1 taken from Riaz Chandio's speech, a Sindhi nationalist party Jeaye Sindh Mahaz leader, shows how translanguaging is used

by nationalist politicians in Sindh. In Karachi, a city in Sindh where the speech is sited and which witnessed ethnic conflicts between Sindhis and Urdu speaking Muhajirs in 1970s, it is a political tactic to translanguaging, and it is the translanguaging user who is perceived as being a heroic figure representing interests of Sindhis. Thus, the politics of translanguaging and the ethnic sensitivities associated to it is an act of politically exploiting Sindhis in Sindh.

Riaz Chandio, Jeaye Sindh Mahaz Leader addressing at Karachi Press Club in Sindh province makes a political use of translanguaging. Jeaye Sindh Mahaz is a Sindhi nationalist party in Sindh, and its inspiration comes from the political discourse that the non-Sindhis are exploring the Sindhis and their land and resources. In the speech, Chandio demonstrates his dynamic, linguistic practice by politically selecting two languages which are Sindhi and Urdu. He employs Sindhi language to point out the economic exploitation of Sindhis in Sindh at the hands of their rulers, simultaneously, he shifts to Urdu holding rulers responsible for many Sindhis' appalling condition. Through these politicized, bilingual choices, he is trying to appeal to the emotions of the Urdu speaking, and the Sindhi speaking communities of Sindh and thereby exploiting the provincial multi-ethnicity. Also, the dynamic, linguistic practice in Sindhi and Urdu allows him to ignite both the speech communities against their oppressive rulers, he claimed.

#### Example 1

اوہن ان خوشحال سنڈ جیکا کریں دالر توہان جی خزانی پپری  
ثی، توہان منہنجی سکروڑن ترتبی تھیں، منہنجی مارن،  
منہنجی بچڑن، پیٹن کی جیکو معاشی طرح بدھال کیوں آ دنیا  
تھی، یے پریس کلب کراچی کے میدان سے، یے جیہی سندھ  
محاذ کے سرخ جہنوں میں ہم یے کھنے ہمارے بھوک اور  
افلاس، یے جبر، یے سیاہی، حکمرانوں نے ہم پر مصلحت کی  
---

#### Roman script

...^Awah un Khushaal Sindh jeka kharabein dollar  
tawajay khazany mn bharay thee, tawa munja  
karorein dharti dhanyun, munjay maorin, munjay  
bachiran, bhenum khy jeko muashi Tarah badhaal  
kayo aw. Dunya disay yeh press club Karachi Kay  
maiden sey, yeh jea Sindh Mahaz kay surkh jhandon  
mn hum yeh kehtay hn kay hamaray bhook aur aflas,  
yeh Jabir, yeh siyahi, hukuranon nay hum per  
musalat ki hay...

Riaz Chandio, Jeaye Sindh Mahaz Leader addressing

at Karachi Press Club (United TV, 2020).

English Translation

...You have looted the Sindh which pays you billions of dollars, you have economically plundered countless indigenous Sindhis, my mothers, my children, and my sisters. Let the world see us draped with the red flags of Jeay Sindh Mahaz here at Karachi Press Club, we are saying that this hunger and poverty, this oppression, this darkness have been imposed on us by our rulers.

In the same manner, example 2 culled from Chief Minister of Sindh Murad Ali Shah's speech at Ghotki, a small town in Sindh where the Muslim Sindhis live in majority, shows how the politics of code selectivity through translanguaging ignites ethnic sensitivities of Sindhis and impacts electoral reality. Since Shah is in an official position, he uses Arabic, Sindhi, and Urdu languages in his translingual process. To make his translingual practice much more effective, Shah has employed Islamic way of greeting and starting his speech using Arabic language to stir the religious feelings of Muslims in Sindh (saying greetings and starting speeches with the name of Allah). Speaking translingually, Shah's linguistic practice shows that he is fabricating translanguaging because it is neither his first language nor his second language. He has memorized these greetings and solutions to appeal to religious feelings of Muslims belonging to different ethnic groups in Sindh.

Additionally, Shah's politics of translanguaging is tactically placed on two linguistic choices. On the one hand he shows through translanguaging by using Sindhi how people in Sindh are suffering, while on the other hand by using Urdu he demonstrates how the Prime Minister who is his political opponent is showing his enmity towards Sindhis by not allowing their leaders to contest election. Shah's politics of translanguaging, thus, reflects the fact that Sindhis are being oppressed by a non-Sindhi prime minister of Pakistan and thus Sindhis should keep themselves away from his party and should support Shah's political party by voting for him in the next election. At the same time, he switches to Urdu and criticizes the prime minister. Thus, through his dynamic practice of translanguaging he is politically choosing linguistic codes to win support of Sindhi and Urdu and other Muslim speech communities.

Example 2

بِسْمِ اللّٰهِ الرَّحْمٰنِ الرَّحِيْمِ  
اسلام علیکم، جبی پتو! آع ٿورا تو آهیان علی نواز خاں مهرجو  
جنهن دعوت ڏئی ... ٿورواردو ۾ گلھائندس ... یے جو اب آیا ہے  
کے جس طریقے سے وہ سندھ کے ساتھ دشمنی کر رہا ہے --  
کوششیں کی گئی ہمارے بڑے لیڈرس کو الیکشن نہیں لٹھے گیا۔

Roman script

(Bismillah Rehman Raheem,

...Asslam o Alaikum, ^jiye Bhutto! Aoa thraito ahya  
Ali Nawz Khan Maher jo jehn dawat dini...thoro  
Urdu mn galhaindus yeh joh ab ayah Hai (New prime  
minister of Pakistan) k jis tareeqay si woh Sindh k  
sath dushmani kar raha ha...koshishen ki gaen  
hamaray bary leaders ko election nhn larnay day  
gaya.

Chief Minister Sindh Murad Ali Shah 2018 at Ghotki.(SAMAA TV, 2018).

English Translation

[In the Name of Allah, the Most Kind and the Most Merciful](#)

...peace be on you. Long live Bhutto!

I am thankful to Ali Nawaz Maher who invited us...I will speak a bit in Urdu...this new prime minister of Pakistan is showing his enmity towards Sindh...efforts were made to prevent our leaders from partaking in election.

In addition to the politicians of Sindh, some politicians of the Punjab province of Pakistan also employ politics of translanguaging to stir up ethnic sentiments of Sindhis living in Sindh. Example 2 that has been taken from Maryam Nawaz's speech who is a Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz Punjabi leader in Pakistan contains politically inspired dynamic choices of language. The speech was made during the death anniversary of a Sindhi politician Benazir Bhutto near Larkana that is a small town to the north of Sindh. Nawaz though an ethnic Punjabi intentionally uses Sindhi. Also, it shows an instance of fabricating translanguaging on her part when she tries to use a few memorized, Sindhi sentences because Sindhi is neither her first nor her second language. She accommodates to Sindhis' ethnic language so as to build rapport with them. Her linguistic, dynamic practice allows her to translanguange in Arabic, Sindhi, and Urdu languages. Using Sindhi language, she appreciatively says that Sindhis are her brothers and sisters and their land is peaceful. This translanguaging by a Punjabi politician enables her to use the ethnic card as a political strategy of

language accommodation or what Giles (2016) calls language convergence. Additionally, she switched to Arabic and Urdu to gain support of the Urdu speaking Muslim community in Sindh and Pakistan.

Example 3

بِسْمِ اللّٰهِ الرَّحْمٰنِ الرَّحِيْمِ

جناب محترم اصف زرداری صاحب، جناب پاکستان بیلز پارٹی  
چنر میں بلاول بہتو صاحب، پی دی ایم کے محترم قاءدین  
منہنجا پارو، منہجون پینڈروں، بیلز پارٹی کے جیلو، محترمہ  
شہید اور بہتو شہید کے ماننے والوں سندھ درتی کے بیٹو، آپ کو  
سندھ کی بیٹی سمیرم نواز کی طرف سے اسلام علیکم

اج مان سندھ جی امن جی سرزمین تی ای آہیاں...

Roman script

Bismillah Rahman Raheem,

Janab Mohtram Asif Zardari sahib (.) janab Pakistan People's Party chairman Bilawal Bhutto sahib, PDM (Pakistan Democratic Movement) kay Mohtram qaideen, ^ mohnja bhairo, muhnjoon bhainroon, people's party k jiyalo, Mohtarma Shaheed aur Bhutto Shaheed Kay mannay walo, Sindh dharti kay beto, apko Sindh ki beti...Maryam Nawaz Ki taraf sey assalam o alaikum.

Aj mawn Sindh Jay amun ji sarzameen Tay ae ahya (people applauding and clapping) ...

Maryam Nawaz N-league leader during Benazir Warsi at Garhi Khuda Baksh Bhutto, 27<sup>th</sup> December 2020 (ARY News, 2020)

English Translation

In the name of Allah, the Kindest and the most Merciful.

Respected Asif Ali Zardari sahib, respected chairman of Pakistan People's Party, Bilawal Bhutto sahib, the respected leaders of PDM (Pakistan Democratic Movement), my brothers, my sisters, the followers of Pakistan People's Party, the believers of Mohtarma Shaheed and Bhutto Shaheed, sons of Sindh, the daughter of Sindh..., I, Maryam Nawaz wish you peace. Today, I have come to the land of Sindh which is the land of peace... (people applauding and clapping).

Moreover, the similar type of political selectiveness through translanguaging has been shown in the following example.

Example 4

میرے جیلو اور جیالیو  
(.)  
اسلام علیکم  
جيءى بېڭۈ!

تو هان اج نیازی صاحب کی پیغام ڈی چیو آ... سندھ وارا سداین

ابوچہ ناہن... ہن اگبی تاریخ ثا ہی آ ۽ ضیالحق کان ن مڙیا.  
ٻڪتئُن کان ن مڙیا... ^

Roman Script

(Mere jiyallo (an Urdu word for Men followers of Pakistan People's Party) or jiyaleo (an Urdu word for women followers of Pakistan People's Party) (. ) assalam o alaikum. Jeaye Bhutto! ^

Tawa aj Niazi sahib khy paigham dae chadyo aw...Sindh wara sada ae abojah nahin. Hinan agay ee tareekh thahee aw aen Zia-ul-Haq kha na murya. Hee ^dictataran kha na murya...)

Qaim Ali Shah 2019, 21 June in Nawab Shah Jalsa (Sindh TV News, 2019)

English Translation

My jiyalo (Pakistan People's Party Men followers) and my jiyaleo (women followers of Pakistan People's Party in Sindh), peace be on you. Long live Bhutto!

Today, you have sent out a message to Niyazi sahib...that people of Sindh are not naïve. They have made history and Zia ul Haq could not suppress them. Dictators could not suppress them...

Qaim Ali Shah, a Sindhi member of Pakistan People's Party government in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh, also makes political use of translanguaging through politicized selectiveness of languages during his formal address to his party activists in Nawabshah, a district in Sindh. Much like Nawaz, Shah has also employed his multilingual repertoire to translanguange his political interests beyond linguistic boundaries Shah politically selects three languages, such as Arabic, Urdu, and Sindhi through translanguaging to help Sindhis recall their struggle against dictatorships in the past. Use of Urdu and Sindhi represent Shah's majoritarian translanguaging; Shah's obsession with majority languages and negligence of minority languages is politically beneficial for his party but socially harmful for minority language groups. Translingual strategy and historical knowledge also allow him to ignite ethnic sensitivities of Sindhis against his political opponent, Prime Minister of Pakistan who he calls 'Niazi sahib' (This expression is sarcastically used by members of opposition to refer to Pakistan's current Prime Minister Imran Khan).

When viewed in the backdrop of Sindh's language policy, Shah is complying with it, because he is effectively using both of the official languages

Sindhi and Urdu. Additionally, Shah's speech also involves an Islamic way of greeting using Arabic (Assalam o alaikum) which he also employs to convey his political message effectively to his followers whom he calls 'jiyalo' (a man follower of Pakistan People's Party) and 'jiyaleo' (a woman follower of Pakistan People's Party).

*A politicized nexus of poetry and speech genre through translanguaging*

In example 5, Nusrat Sehar Abbasi, a Sindhi member of an opposition party in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh, makes use of politics of translanguaging through political mechanism of selectiveness. Abbasi belongs to Pakistan Muslim League Functional Party, and she is a staunch critic of the ruling party in Sindh that is Pakistan People's Party (PPP). She tactically selects a sarcastic stanza in Sindhi and chooses English and Urdu to express her complaints against the governing politicians in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh.

Example 5

جڏهن ڪريت هتي حكمران ٿيندا  
ايو سنڌي چون تونجا نقسان ٿيندا  
جڏهن حق انصاف جوتن سان ٿئجي  
پو چون سنڌي تنهنجا نقسان ٿيندا

سر آء نو کے ٿائيں بہت کم ملے کا۔

Roman Script

Jaden corrupt hitay hukmran thenda,  
Ay Sindhri chona tunja nuqsan thenda.  
^Jaden haq insaf jootan san thadjay,  
^Poi chona Sindhri tunja nuqsan thenda.

Sir I know, k time bohot Kam milayga =

Nusrat Sehar Abbasi 2020, 22 June in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh (24 News HD, 2020).

English Translation

When the corrupt become rulers,  
They will ruin generations.

When justice is not done,  
It will be harmful for beloved Sindh.

Sir I know that I will be given a very little time...

Ethnic sensitivities are also reflected in her politicized discourse of translanguaging because she claims that much harm is being done against Sindh by neglecting justice. Her politics of translanguaging demonstrates material aims of preserving her party's political interests beyond language boundaries. Employing her linguistic

repertoire, she is trolling her political opponents that they are corrupt, and they are plundering Sindh. Moreover, she has also relied on majoritarian translanguaging by satirically reciting a Sindhi quadruplet in the beginning of her speech. The quadruplet raises ethnic feelings of Sindhis in Sindh by telling them that their land is being looted by the corrupt rulers and therefore they should stop this exploitation. Then, she moves ahead to speak in English and Urdu complaining that she will not be given much time, because she would be criticizing her political opponents in the assembly.

Her politics of translanguaging contains three languages which are Sindhi, Urdu, and English. Her speech in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh, therefore, is subject to Sindh's official language policy that allows the use of all the three languages in official domains. Thus, she has relied upon official policy through tactical use of translanguaging accommodating linguistic concerns of majority groups and simultaneously out-administering her political opponents in Sindh.

Politicians' use of translanguaging relies upon the use of poetic verses which are effective in instigating deprived Sindhis living in Sindh. Example 6 taken from a speech of Nisar Khorro who is Pakistan People's Party The Provincial Assembly of Sindh member shows how popular poetry intertwines through translanguaging with political discourse in igniting Sindhis' ethnic sensitivities. The politician in example 6 has relied upon Shah Abdul Latif's influential stanza. Through translanguaging, he exploits the semantic force of the stanza and incites Sindhis to rise with weapons and take on his political opponents, who he claims, have brought about marginalization of the Sindhis in Sindh.

In addition, using Sindhi poetry and Urdu slogans as a political tool through translanguaging, the politician creates an emotional bond between Sindhis and their cherished leader late Benazir Bhutto to awaken emotions of the former. Furthermore, through translanguaging he also preserves political interests by going beyond one language boundaries.

Example 6

اچو هڪ نعروٽ هُتون! جيئي پتو!  
هاڻي ...  
سور هڀ مرڙ هين سوپ کي تـ دل جـا وـ هـمـ وـ سـارـ  
هـڻـ پـالـاـ، وـڙـهـ پـاـڪـرـينـ اـڳـيانـ يـالـ مـڏـارـ  
مـڻـ تـيزـ تـرارـ مـارـ تـماـرـوـ تـئـينـ.

یہاں۔ قیادت بیٹھی ہے اور یہ لوگوں کو دیکھ رہی ہے۔ اور یہ بیبی میں آپ کو کہہ رہا ہوں، بیبی یہ تمہیں سلام کرنے آئے ہیں۔۔۔

#### Roman script

(...Acho hik naro ta Hanaon ^ Jiye Bhutto!

Hany...

Suriyah mariean sobh khy, ta dil ja waham wisar,  
Han bhala, wirh bhakren, ageyan dhal ma dhar,  
^Mathan tez tarar mar ta mataro thean).

Yaha...qayadat bethi ha aur yeh logo ko dekh rehi ha  
(.) Aur yeh ^ bibi mn ap ko keh raha hn, bibi yeh tumhen salam karnay aye hn...

Nisar Khoro PPP leader at Garhi Khuda Baksh  
(Naya Daur TV, 2020).

#### English Translation

Let's raise a slogan! Jeaye Bhutto!

Now...

Oh, brave if you want to achieve success, forget your fears,  
Strike spears, fight hard, be not coward,  
Strike your sword hard and achieve success.

...here leadership is sitting and putting their hopes in people, and Bibi I am telling you this that Bibi they have come here to greet you...

#### Translanguaging: A tool of creating popular consent

Translanguaging is an instrument used by politicians in Sindh to arouse people's emotions of populism by accommodating to local languages. This goal is usually achieved through fluid, linguistic practices which enable politicians to use different languages at the same time and thereby build rapport with different speech communities. Moreover, their linguistic accommodation is mixed with content of popular culture and discourse. For instance, while switching to Sindhi, politicians tend to speak highly of Sindhi culture and nation. This is also applicable to other speech communities and their languages. In this situation, translanguaging becomes a tool through which politicians manage to create a sense among their diverse audience that their politicians/leaders are much attached to them. Example 7 also shows this.

#### Example 7

اس مجموعے میں بیٹھے ہوئے پاکستان بیلز پارٹی کے ورکروں ساتھیوں، مختلف سیاسی پارٹیوں سے تعلق رکھنے والوں دوستوں، سب سے پہلے تو میں شکریہ ادا کرنا چاہتا ہوں پاکستان بیلز پارٹی

کے چونمیں۔۔۔ آپ کی اجازت سے کیونکے سندھ کی درتی پر ایا ہوں تو یہ عجیب بات ہو گئی کہ سندھ کی میٹھی زبان میں بات ناکروں سندھ جی ترتی سان تعلق رکھ وارڈ اوہان کی جیتری اوہان کی ان جی مٹی عزیز آ۔۔۔ اوہان کی ان ترتی جی مٹی سان پیار آ۔۔۔ تونہان جو استقبال کیوں۔ سندھ جی تفاقت، سندھ جی مہمان نوازی جو جیکو نکشو بیش کیوں۔۔۔ آع شکر گزار آہیاں۔۔۔ دل ت چوی ٹی سجی تقریر سندھی پر کیا۔ لیکن کچھ مجبوریوں آهن۔۔۔  
کچھ  
بیون پولیون گلہائیندڑ ب آیا آهن

#### Roman Script

...Iss mujmuay mn bethay huye Pakistan People's Party k workron (.) Sathyo, mukhtalif siyasi partyun say taluq rakhnay walay dosto (.) sabh say pehlay toh mn shukrya ada karna chahta hn Pakistan People's Party k chairman...aap ki ijjazat sey kyunkay Sindh ki dharti pay ayah hn tou yeh ajeeb bat hogi kay Sindh Ki meethi zaban mn baat na karun.

(.) Sindh ji dharti san taluq rakhan warao, jetri tawah khy inaji miti aziz aw...awah khy ina dharti ji mitea san pyar aw...^team tawah asanjo istaqbal kayo. Sindh ji saqafat, Sindh ji mehmawazi jo aj jeko awha naqsho paish kayo...aon shukar guzar ahya...dil ta chaway thi sajee taqreer Sindhi mn Kaya. Lekin kujh majbooryun ahen. Kujh byun boolyun galhaindar bhi Aya ahen...

Akhtar Mengal (chairman of Balochistan National Party (Mengal)) in PPP Jalsa at Garhi Khuda Baksh 27 December, 2020 (Charsadda Journalist, 2020).

#### English Translation

...the workers of Pakistan People's Party, companions, friends belonging to different political parties sitting in the crowd, first of all I would like to thank Pakistan People's Party chairman...with your permission, since I have come to land of Sindh, it would be strange not to talk in sweet Sindhi language.

The people belonging to Sindh, to the extent you love Sindhs land...the same extent of love you have demonstrated by welcoming us, the way you represented Sindhs culture and hospitality...I am feeling thankful...my heart is telling me to make my entire speech in Sindhi language. But there are some constraints. People speaking other languages have also come...

In example 7, while making his speech in Garhi Khuda Baksh, a small village near Larkana, Sindh, Akhtar Mengal, a Brahui chairman of Balochistan National Party (Mengal), was involved in bringing forth popular consent through translanguaging by sharing his appreciative views of Sindhi language and culture. Mengal's manufacturing process contains two popular languages which are Sindhi

and Urdu. Furthermore, his translational practices reflect how translanguaging can facilitate politicians with influencing multi-ethnic, majoritarian groups using their multilingual repertoire..

Mengal translanguagingly employs Sindhi language, because he is making his speech in Sindh where Sindhi language users are much attached to their language. Moreover, this tactical use of Sindhi language enables him to revive emotions of Sindhis by admiring their culture and land. Although using his multilingual repertoire, he recognizes the ethnic value of Sindhi language, but he openly confesses that there are other language users as well and thus starts speaking in Urdu being conscious of getting their consent as well. This clearly shows that he is consciously translanguaging to appeal to his diverse, multi-ethnic audience. Therefore, for him translanguaging becomes a political tool that enables him to translanguaging in languages of wider communication and propagate his political agenda, .

Additionally, analysis of example 8 shows that translanguaging has been used by Syed Sardar Ali Shah who is a Sindhi minister of The Provincial Assembly of Sindh. He belongs to the ruling party in Sindh that is Pakistan People's Party. The deep, contextualized analysis shows how the provincial minister is using translanguaging as a tool by emotionally talking about the unity of Sindh employing the national language (Urdu) and the official language (English). The use of English is associated with education and power, while Urdu is linked with Pakistan's unity. He has used these languages of power to construct discourse of populism because his claim implies that he is representing Sindhis' interests by rejecting the federal government's proposal to divide Sindh on ethnic lines.

Building upon his bilingual repertoire, the minister emotionally raises the issue of Sindh's integrity in the provincial assembly by emphatically saying that Sindhis will not allow the division of Sindh, because Sindhis are emotionally and spiritually attached to their motherland, Sindh. In this way, the minister has used translanguaging as a tool to construct goodwill among Sindhis so that his party can get more votes in the upcoming election.

**Example 8**

سندھ کے لوگ اموشنا لی انوالوں ہیں۔ یہ بات وحدت کی ہے سندھ کی، یہ بات محبت کی ہے سندھ کی، یہ بات عشق کی ہے سندھ کی، یہ بات عقیدے کی ہے سندھ سے۔ اور آئین تو کیا آسمان سے

صحیفہ بھی آئے تو ہم سندھ کی تقسیم قبول نہیں کریں گے، نہیں کریں گے!...اگر ایک بھی سندھی زندہ ہے کوئی انکھ اٹھا کر بھی دیکھ نہیں سکتا۔ سندھ کا ہے پاکستان کے بنے کے۔

Roman script

...Sindh Kay log emotionally involved hn. Yeh bat ^ wahdat ki Hai Sindh Ki, yeh bat ^ mohabat ki Hai Sindh ki, yeh boat ^ ishq ki ha Sindh sey, yeh bat ^ aqeeday ki ha Sindh sey. Aur aaein toh kya, ^ asman sey sahifa bhi aye toh hum Sindh Ki taqseem qabool nhn karengy, nhn karengy!

...agar ek bhi Sindhi zinda hai, koi ankh utha kar bhi dekh nhn sakta... Sindh ^cause ha Pakistan Kay baninay ka..."

Syed Sardar Ali Shah PPP MPA in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh (News Line, 2019).

English Translation

...Sindh's people are emotionally involved in this matter. This is a matter of Sindh's unity, this is a matter of affection towards Sindh, this is a matter of love of Sindh, this is a matter of a faith in Sindh. Not mention to the constitution, even if divine scriptures are revealed, we will not allow the division of Sindh at any cost! If one Sindhi is alive, no one will dare separate Sindh...Sindh is not a toy, Sindh is a cause of Pakistan's coming into being.

One more example (9) of translanguaging that contains English and Urdu has been culled from Syed Murad Ali Shah's speech who is a Sindhi Chief Minister of Sindh in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh. In his speech, he employs his multilingualistic repertoire to say that he endorses freedom of institutions, however, the members of opposition in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh exert their political influence to persuade Sindh police to do what they desire illicitly.

The political address allows him to translanguagingly propagate his policies in different languages; it also enables him to pose as a victim of institutional malpractice in front of Sindhis who were watching his live speech made in the assembly. Furthermore, through translanguaging he means to influence Sindhis' opinions by telling them that institutions are being politically influenced by his opponents. The translanguaging practice in two languages of power make him emerge as a heroic figure of Sindh's majority communities because he sarcastically claims that the Inspector General of Sindh Police is being misused by his political rivals.

**Example 9**

میں پولیس کو چھوڑتا ہون کے اندپینڈنٹی کام کرے، لیکن پولیس جب پارٹی بن جائے، بکاڑ دی انسپیکٹر جنرل اف پولیس کے حی جیسے کہیں گے کروں گا۔

#### Roman script

...Mn police ko chorta hn k independently kam Kary, lekin police jab party ban jae, because the Inspector General of police has become a party... k ji yeh jaisay kahengay mn karunga...

CM Sindh Murad Ali Shah in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh (SAMAA TV, 2020).

#### English Translation

...I allow police to work independently, but when police become a party, because the Inspector General of Police has become a party...trying to seek their help in deciding what to do....

In example 10, one more Sindhi minister in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh, Syed Sardar Ali Shah raises through translanguaging the ownership issue of islands which are currently disputed between Pakistan's federal government and Sindh's provincial government. He is engaged in productive process of translanguaging using Urdu and Sindhi languages. His politicized condemnation of the federal government's proposal on Sindh's islands in Sindhi and Urdu ignites ethnic sensitivities of Sindhis who were in those days protesting against the federal government's proposal. He uses Sindhi to arouse and attract the support of Sindhi nationalists because voicing their concerns he condemns the federal government's claim to Sindh's islands. This process also allows him to create feelings of trust among Sindhis towards his party. Moreover, he switches to Urdu to tell the concerned authorities that these are not mere islands but (switches to Sindhi in a very emotional tone) these are Sindh's assets which came into being for many centuries.

Hence, translanguaging has been used in Sindh for political purposes by different politicians in their speeches, while not being able to defend the rights of their Sindhi constituencies.

#### Example 10

اسان سپ چون ٹاں فورم پرست جماعتون هجن جیکی اج رستن تی  
پیتن جی خلاف مظاہرا کن ٹیون، جیکی سپ سموری تنظیموں  
هجن، سپ جو سپ اجو ڈ اسین توہان سان گڈ بیہنداسین... اج تو  
ملہابر آهي ...  
جزیروں کی بات ہے جنابے اسپیکر، سمنیں نے بیہان بھیٹھے ہوئے  
اردوکی چار لائنیں لکھیں، جنابے اسپیکر یے جزیرے نہیں ہیں، ان  
کو فقط جزیرے تصور نہیں کئے جانا چاہیے... ہی صدین کان پاٹی

#### مان نزوار ٹی نکتا آهن۔

#### Roman script

...Asan sabh chaon tha ta qoum parast jamaitoon hujan jekay aj rastan tay betan jay khilaf muzahira kanthyun, jekay sabh samoori tanzeemon hujan, sabh ja sabh acho ta Aseen tawah san gad behandasen...aseen jeki bhi Sindh ja manhoon ahyu sey sabh tosan gadeji behandsen...aj tou malhayo ahe... jazeeron ki bat ha janabay speaker,...meinay yaha bethay huay Urdu Ki char linean likhen, janabay speaker yeh jaziray nhn hn, inko faqt jaziray taswar nhn Kiya Jana chaye...hi sadiyan kha panea mawn nirwar thee nikta ahen...

MPA Sindh in The Provincial Assembly of Sindh. Syed Sardar Ali Shah (Syed Sardar Ali Shah-Official, 2020).

#### English Translation

...All of us say that the nationalist parties that are protesting against islands (construction), we call on all the parties that come ahead we stand with you...we all Sindhis will stand with you (gesturing towards an MPA who has changed his side on the issue of islands) ...Today, you have proved your loyalty with Sindh...Respected speaker, this is a matter of islands...while sitting here I composed a quadruplet in Urdu. These are not islands and these should not be considered just islands...they have journeyed over a course of centuries to emerge over the surface of the sea...

#### Discussion

The intertwining of translanguaging and political discourse within Sindh's local context necessitates the need for developing critical apparatus to investigate the political speeches which in the words of Smith (2009) involve highly influential and complex processes. Such critical apparatus should contain a wide range of tools which question ethnically inspired translanguaging in its political context. When politicians make translingual speeches, this should not be seen as an incidental act or a signal of creativity/virtue. Their speeches are manifestations of dynamic practices which also demonstrate their language ideologies (Vogel and García, 2017). A translingual act can be in fact an expected move towards achieving political support of ethnically diverse language groups. García (2009) suggests that translanguaging ensures linguistic security and identity investment of different speech communities while simultaneously guaranteeing social justice. However, against this generally held view, this research presents a case

where politicians' use of translanguaging in social domains arouses ethnolinguistic sensitivities among the various speech communities of Sindh.

This research analysis shows how the politicians demonstrated emotional undertones and ethnic consciousness when publicly making their speeches in Sindhi, Urdu, English, and Arabic in socio-political contexts generally resulting in fluid language practices. The conscious use of translanguaging can be plausibly explained by considering the context in which the politicians are situated. This discussion suggests a link between the politicians' observed persistence and the nationalist ideology of language found in ethnonationalist conflicts, where the neglect of the Sindhi language has been historically associated with oppressive language regimes. "Conflicts promote homogenizing discourses in terms of both language and collective identity" (Charalambous, Charalambous, and Zembylas, 2016, p.347), and it is very likely that the politicians' awareness of these ethnic conflicts motivate their political use of translanguaging.

Investigating the politics of translanguaging in a context of ethnically sensitive province makes one rethink fluidity assumption in linguistically diverse settings. There is a need to pay heed to the ideological processes which structure and control social life. Rampton et al. (2015) invite researchers to go beyond celebrating superdiversity (linguistic diversity and translanguaging) and look critically at the ideological processes and social stratification which surround it. In Sindh, the intersection between diversity and conflict has given rise to the dynamics of fluidity: firstly, the nationalist assumption that equates 'speaking Sindhi' with 'being Sindhi' and secondly, the federalist assumption of 'using Urdu' implies 'being Pakistani'. There is also religious ideology that involves employing Arabic to show religious sentiments and using English signifies education and power.

The translanguaging critic's role is to provide such critical apparatus to initiate critical questioning of politically inspired translingual practices across different contexts. The translanguaging critic cannot give exhaustive information about the politics of translanguaging in different contexts, however, he/she can effectively help in raising people's consciousness about what Erdocia (2020) calls political exploitation of translanguaging. People of

different ethnic backgrounds, once made aware of the politics of translanguaging and its repercussions, can be made critically aware of this abuse of translanguaging in certain contexts.

It is imperative to note here that the political speeches in which politics of translanguaging is embedded are similar in their goals in different countries. What is critically considered as political exploitation through translanguaging in Catalonia, Spain (Erdocia, 2020) might also be relevant to different multilingual contexts, such as Sindh.

Translanguaging enables politicians in Sindh to use Sindhi, Urdu, English and Arabic languages to achieve their political goals effectively against the backdrop of language policies and regimes. Politicized strategy of translanguaging causes ethnic tensions which politicians exploit much to their interests. Therefore, it is recommended that language policy experts should seriously examine how the use of translanguaging has been exploited and used as a political tool in Sindh, Pakistan.

## **CONCLUSION**

In this research, politics of translanguaging in Pakistan's Sindh province was critically analysed using the modified concepts of translanguaging. Excerpts taken from politicians' speeches were analysed to show how they used translanguaging to ignite ethnic sensitivities and obtain consent of Sindh's speech communities. Also, it was found that using poetry in translanguaging was effectively used by politicians to make their speeches effective. This research was limited to politicians' speeches in Sindh, however, further research on the politics of translanguaging in the context of Pakistan's other provinces can be conducted. Finally, it is recommended that raising awareness about the politicized use of translanguaging might help the layman in a number of multilingual countries become aware of the importance of critical thinking when listening to translanguaged political discourses.

## **REFERENCES**

- 24 News HD. (2020). Nusrat Abbasi Hard-Hitting Speech in Sindh Assembly [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LRFx2p6164Q&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR3IEbwWI9tzhyphOVvLbYD9CdMfFTwWrLII81ShXCCqKmrj0oERXuUngPc>. Accessed 26 January 2021.
- Ali, A. (2021). Understanding the role of translanguaging in L2 acquisition: Applying Cummins' cup model.

- Journal of Cultura and Lingua*, 2(1), 15-25.  
<https://doi.org/10.37301/culingua.v2i1.10>. Accessed 27 January 2021.
- Ali, A., & David, Maya K. (2021). A Historical Institutional Approach to Politics of Languages of Pakistan. *JHSSR*, 3(1).
- ARY News. (2020). Maryam Nawaz Speech in Garhi Khuda Bakhsh Larkana Jalsa [Video]. YouTube. [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lpJyCa1BpCg&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR2ogkwew19mUjUxD6nLFuAk2SGnUAbyyMTgvBzg78r9\\_ebU4\\_dX5KxC4HE](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lpJyCa1BpCg&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR2ogkwew19mUjUxD6nLFuAk2SGnUAbyyMTgvBzg78r9_ebU4_dX5KxC4HE). Accessed 28 January 2021.
- Beiler, I. R. (2020). "Marked and unmarked translanguaging in accelerated, mainstream, and sheltered English classrooms." *Multilingua*, 40(1), 107-138. doi:10.1515/multi-2020-0022.
- Blommaert, J., Kelly-Holmes, H., Lane, P., Leppänen, S., Moriarty, M., Pietikäinen, S., & Piirainen-Marsh, A. (2009). Media, multilingualism, and language policing: An introduction. *Language Policy*, 8(3), 203-207. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10993-009-9138-7>
- Cardinal, L., Sonntag, S. (2015). State traditions and language regimes: A historical institutionalism approach to language policy. *De Gruyter Open* (8)1. 5-21. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1515/auseur-2015-0010>. <https://content.sciendo.com/view/journals/auseur/8/1/article-p5.xml?language=en>. Accessed 11 September 2020.
- Charalambous, P., Charalambous, C., & Zembylas, M. (2013). Old and new policies in dialogue: Greek-Cypriot teachers' interpretations of a peace-related initiative through existing policy discourses. *British Educational Research Journal*, 40(1), 79-101. <https://doi.org/10.1002/berj.3030>.
- Charsadda Journalist. (2020). BNP Akhtar Jan Mengal Speech in Sindhi [Video]. YouTube. [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SFL6x7uKj10&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR2DNyssakxzqlW3vwyssC0i19EhfeKEaCFWeJuStOv5i\\_Hhw4g3R\\_uBHNC](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SFL6x7uKj10&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR2DNyssakxzqlW3vwyssC0i19EhfeKEaCFWeJuStOv5i_Hhw4g3R_uBHNC). Accessed 28 January 2021.
- Conteh, J. (2019). Translanguaging. *ELT Journal*, 72(4), 445-447. <https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/ccy034>. Accessed 28 January 2021.
- De Meulder, M., Kusters, A., Moriarty, E., & Murray, J. (2019). Describe, don't prescribe. The practice and politics of translanguaging in the context of deaf signers. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 40(10), 892-906. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2019.1592181>. Accessed 29 January 2021.
- Erdocia, I. (2020). The politics of plurilingualism: Immersion, translanguaging, and school autonomy in Catalonia. *Linguistics and Education*, 60, 100865. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.linged.2020.100865>. Accessed 25 January 2021.
- García, O. (2009). Education, multilingualism and translanguaging in the 21st century. In: Ajit Mohanty, Minati Panda, Robert Phillipson, and Tove Skutnabb-Kangas (eds). *Multilingual Education for Social Justice: Globalising the local*. New Delhi: Orient Blackswan, pp. 128-145.
- Giles, H. (2016). *Communication Accommodation Theory: Negotiating Personal Relationships and Social Identities Across Contexts*. Cambridge University Press.
- Gordon, R. (ed) (2005). Ethnologue: languages of the World 15th edition Dallas, Tx: SIL International. Online version: <http://www.ethnologue.com/>.
- Government of Sindh. (1972). The Sindh Government Gazette. [Sindhlaws.gov.pk](http://sindhlaws.gov.pk/Setup/Publications_SindhCode/PUB-17-000003.pdf). [http://sindhlaws.gov.pk/Setup/Publications\\_SindhCode/PUB-17-000003.pdf](http://sindhlaws.gov.pk/Setup/Publications_SindhCode/PUB-17-000003.pdf). Accessed 24 January 2021.
- Kennedy, C. (1991). The politics of ethnicity in Sindh. *Asian Survey*, 31(10), 938-955. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2645065>.
- Lewis, G., Jones, B., & Baker, C. (2012). Translanguaging: Origins and development from school to street and beyond. *Educational Research and Evaluation*, 18(7), 641-654. doi:10.1080/13803611.2012.718488 Accessed 28 January 2021.
- Malik, I. (1997). Sindh: The politics of authority and ethnicity. *State and Civil Society in Pakistan*, 190-222. [https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230376298\\_10](https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230376298_10)
- Manan, S. A., & Tul-Kubra, K. (2020). Beyond 'two-solitudes' assumption and monolingual idealism: generating spaces for multilingual turn in Pakistan. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, 1-22. doi: 10.1080/14790718.2020.1742722
- Manan, S. A., David, M. K., & Dumanig, F. P. (2017). Ethnolinguistic dilemma and static maintenance syndrome: A study of languages policies and language perceptions in Pakistan. *Language Problems and Language Planning*, 41(1), 66-86. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1075/lplp.41.1.04man>
- Mukherjee, S. (2020). (PDF) Sindhi language and its history. Retrieved from [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/341767214\\_Sindhi\\_language\\_and\\_its\\_history](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/341767214_Sindhi_language_and_its_history). Accessed 1st January 2021.
- Naya Daur TV. (2020). PDM Jalsa LIVE [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5sHmTSzMuY8&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR0hFE1-QVPBI2YKnI9-0N8fNrOF00IJ6iQcSddgvP-8hooo8IhVvVvIrw0>. Accessed 29 January 2021.

- News Line. (2019). Sardar Shah Speech in Sindh Assembly [Video]. YouTube. [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mtrvWkO25Ws&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR3JRC7fOJgWC2cBxhsIsk\\_QoP6wFLqeOeX7ckaKSCG-DLk0nTF2LQZZj2A](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mtrvWkO25Ws&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR3JRC7fOJgWC2cBxhsIsk_QoP6wFLqeOeX7ckaKSCG-DLk0nTF2LQZZj2A). Accessed 29 January 2021.
- Pathan, M. H. (1978). *History of Sindh Series*, Vol 3. Hyderabad: Sindhi Adabi Board.
- Rahman, T. (1996). *Language and Politics in Pakistan*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Rahman, T. (1999). Language, Politics and Power in Pakistan: The Case of Sindh and Sindhi. *Ethnic Studies Report*, 17(1), 1730-1848.
- Rahman, T. (2002). *Language, ideology, and power: Language learning among the Muslims of Pakistan and North India*. Karachi; Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Rassool, N., & Mansoor, S. (2007). Contemporary issues in language, education, and development in Pakistan. In Rassool, Naz (Ed.), *Global Issues in Language, Education, and Development: Perspectives from Postcolonial Countries* (pp. 218-244). Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- Romanowski, P. (2019). (PDF) Translanguaging as a norm in multilingual education: An example from Poland. ResearchGate. Retrieved January 28, 2021, from [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/337548148\\_Translanguaging\\_as\\_a\\_norm\\_in\\_multilingual\\_education\\_an\\_example\\_form\\_Poland](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/337548148_Translanguaging_as_a_norm_in_multilingual_education_an_example_form_Poland). Accessed 21 January 2021.
- SAMAA TV. (2018). CM Sindh Murad Ali Shah speech at Jalsa in Ghotki [Video]. YouTube. [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nFtxc8KpTas&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR1EUXuoUqmDMh6fa9FlfW\\_tZQtgggATxtLcVnP3k1ImC6Aiq-YnJ8228Ek](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nFtxc8KpTas&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR1EUXuoUqmDMh6fa9FlfW_tZQtgggATxtLcVnP3k1ImC6Aiq-YnJ8228Ek). Accessed 29 January 2021.
- SAMAA TV. (2020). Murad Ali Shah Speech in Sindh Assembly. YouTube. Retrieved April 22, 2021, from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PoGoSoUQhdo&t=919s>.
- Sindh TV News. (2019). Syed Qaim Ali Shah Speech in Nawabshah Jalsa [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KYrF7Mz0ziQ&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR0qwVXQyMoi9E> mSf\_NzpruUPMwmX5UwUaTOkYbVTU2j9WGxsEZ4WoEIxJw. Accessed 29 January 2021.
- Smith, C. (2009). Contemporary political speech writing. *Southern Speech Communication Journal*, 42(1), 52-67. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10417947609372332>. Accessed 29 January 2021.
- Smith, H. J., Robertson, L. H., Auger, N., & Wysocki, L. (2020). Translanguaging as a political act with Roma: Carving a path between pluralism and collectivism for transformation. ePrints - Newcastle University. <https://eprint.ncl.ac.uk/195450>. Accessed 28 January 2021.
- Solangi, F., Laghari, M. A., & Kaboor, N. (2016). A Glimpse in to the Conditions of Sindh before Arab Conquest. Retrieved from <https://sujo-old.usindh.edu.pk/index.php/Grassroots/article/viewFile/2965/2255>. Accessed 24th December 2020.
- Syed, G. M. (2010). *Sindhudesh (1st ed.)*. Karachi, Pakistan: Indus Academy.
- Syed Sardar Ali Shah-Official. (2020). Sardar Shah's historical speech on Sindh islands issue in Provincial Assembly of Sindh. YouTube. Retrieved April 22, 2021, from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6vNS8qqz7i0&t=300s>.
- United TV. (2020). "Karachi is Sindh" Clarifies Tahaffuz-e-Sindh Rally of JSM [Video]. YouTube. [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iZNz\\_wCAFQQ&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR2kNSRe1nc0Q4qA2fjhGHpr7KE7D8WRnBMkNaBHP-GbZDFGdpgwEu2ByU](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iZNz_wCAFQQ&feature=share&fbclid=IwAR2kNSRe1nc0Q4qA2fjhGHpr7KE7D8WRnBMkNaBHP-GbZDFGdpgwEu2ByU). Accessed 21 January 2021.
- Vogel, S., & García, O. (2017). Translanguaging. CUNY Academic Works. [https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gc\\_pubs/402/](https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gc_pubs/402/). Accessed 28 January 2021.
- Wei, L. (2018). Translanguaging and co-learning: beyond empowering the learner. *EAL Journal Spring 2018*, (5), 32–33.
- Williams, Quentin Emmanuel., & Stroud, Christopher. (2013). Multilingualism in transformative spaces: Contact and conviviality. *Language Policy*, 12(4), 289-311. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10993-012-9265-4>