

Epçaçan, C. (2022). The evaluation of the invalidated teacher guidebooks in accordance with teachers' opinions. *International Online Journal of Education and Teaching (IOJET)*, 9(4). 1444-1457.

Received : 12.05.2022 Revised version received : 07.07.2922 Accepted : 10.07.2022

THE EVALUATION OF THE INVALIDATED TEACHER GUIDEBOOKS IN ACCORDANCE WITH TEACHERS' OPINIONS

(Research article)

Cahit EPÇAÇAN (0000-0002-8090-4442) Siirt University, Turkey epcacan@hotmail.com

Biodata:

Prof. Dr., Siirt Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Türkçe Öğretmenliği Bölümü Öğretim Üyesi. Biodata(s): No more than 40 words for each author.

Copyright © 2014 by International Online Journal of Education and Teaching (IOJET). ISSN: 2148-225X. Material published and so copyrighted may not be published elsewhere without written permission of IOJET.

THE EVALUATION OF THE INVALIDATED TEACHER GUIDEBOOKS IN ACCORDANCE WITH TEACHERS' OPINIONS

Cahit Epçaçan

epcacan@hotmail.com

Abstract

The use of teacher's guidebooks, which were prepared to assist teachers based on the curriculum implemented within the framework of the constructivist model, was discontinued in the 2018-2019 academic year. This study was based on a case study and prepared to examine the teacher's guidebooks that were removed from the curriculum in the 2018-2019 academic year. The study group consists of 20 teachers who work in Siirt and have at least 5 years of experience in public schools. The data were collected with a semi-structured interview form prepared by the researcher and the content analysis technique was used in the analysis of the data. The research findings revealed that most of the teachers felt the lack of guidebooks and could not perform their learning-teaching strategies in a healthy way after the removal of the guidebooks, listening education, which is one of the basic language skills, was largely neglected and the implementation of the guidebooks by the Ministry of Education would be beneficial in the education and training process.

Keywords: Textbooks, teacher's guidebooks, Turkish teacher, Turkish language teaching.

1. Introduction

Rapidly changing technology, innovations in Science, and the reflections of these innovations on education have pushed innovation itself to make breakthroughs that can be called reforms. Following these changes and innovations, Turkey has adopted the constructivism applied in the education system of more than forty countries in the world, especially in developed countries (Güneş, 2009). In constructivist learning, it is not important that the information is received and accepted by the learner, but how the individual makes sense of the information and produces it. Information is produced by the existing value judgments and experiences of the learner (Şaşan, 2002). The purpose of constructivism is to create high-level cognitive skills and to ensure the permanence of learning (Demirel, 2005; MEB, 2005; Şaşan, 2002). In this context, the Ministry of National Education has changed the curriculum of many courses and has created and implemented curriculums, one of which is Turkish Language Teaching Programs as one of the most important building blocks of Turkish language lessons.

Since 2005, when the constructivist approach was put into practice, curricula were organized within the framework of the principles of the relevant approach, and curricula, textbooks, teaching methods and techniques were renewed. Yet another change occurred in the teacher's guidebooks, which were designed to assist teachers. Guidebooks play a crucial role in the more regular and systematic teaching of the lessons in education, providing



academic support to teachers in enlightening and guiding the teachers about the constructivist approach as well as in the implementation process of the activities in the textbooks. In-class and extra-curricular activities and practice studies, as well as issues such as how and at what stage activities should be done, are detailed in the guidebooks based on the constructivist theory, which enables teachers to process the lessons more effectively and efficiently. In addition, the guidebooks inform the teachers about the teaching methods and techniques to be and are designed to help the teacher carry out the lectures in accordance with the constructive approach. Thus, the permanence of learning is provided more effectively. The constructivist approach is based on the belief that students are more active in learning and thus, the student is at the center of the activities and lesson practices. The teacher also guides the student in the implementation of the activities in the textbooks and is an audience. The guidebooks have an important effect on the correct and appropriate achievements of the activities in the textbooks prepared within the framework of the constructivist approach. Guidebooks have fulfilled an important task in introducing this novel approach to teachers. Since teachers in Turkey have certain teaching habits depending on conventional approaches, guidebooks have a great role in helping them adapt to the constructivist approach, which is novel.

Helping teachers in the planning of educational activities and lessons, guidebooks also contribute to the disciplined and orderly teaching of the lessons, as they are in a structure that predetermines which subject should be taught as well as when, how, and for how long the relevant subject should be taught. Along the same lines it was emphasized by the Ministry of National Education in 2004 that teacher guidebooks should be designed in a manner to improve the missing knowledge and skills of teachers, to inform them about new teaching methods and techniques, to make them be a guide, and to facilitate their work (Ceyhan & Yiğit, 2003; Kesercioğlu and Aydoğdu, 2005; Turan and Karabacak, 2008). A well-designed teacher's guidebook is expected to serve to guide the entire teaching process, from lesson planning to evaluation. Teacher's guidebooks are the teacher's basic reference book for preparing for the lesson, planning, choosing a method, and teaching, applying, measuring, and evaluating the lesson (Ayvacı and Çoruhlu, 2011).

2. Objective

The guidebooks, which are in use with the constructivist approach and used by the teachers, have been removed from the curriculum as of the 2018-2019 academic year. There are few studies in the literature about how the removal of such books, which are known to have offered benefits in previous years and provided unity throughout the country, will make a gap (Erden and Dilekçi, 2022; Yurtbakan and Cerrah Özsevgeç 2019; Baş et al. 2017; Göçer and Aktürk), 2015; Erdogan, 2007;). It is known that these books guide teachers in activities such as attracting attention, motivation, performing the lesson activity in accordance with the teaching principles, and making an evaluation. It was an important auxiliary resource especially for novice teachers who were novice at work, attended non-branch courses, and worked as paid teachers. The lacuna seems to raise a question. The literature review has demonstrated that there is not much research on this issue. Therefore, this study is believed to fill this gap in the field.



In consideration of the abovementioned issues, this study seeks to determine the current situation in line with the opinions of teachers about the Turkish language guidebooks, which were removed from the curriculum in the 2018-2019 academic year. The sub-objectives determined in line with this main purpose are as follows:

- 1) On which subject do teachers need Turkish language guidebooks the most while teaching?
- 2) What are the benefits of Turkish language guidebooks in applying learning and teaching strategies?
- 3) What are the conveniences provided by Turkish language guidebooks for assessment and evaluation studies?
- 4) What is the effect of removing Turkish language guidebooks on teachers' classroom management?
- 5) What is the effect of Turkish language guidebooks on teaching basic language skills?
- **6)** How does the removal of Turkish language guidebooks affect teachers' productivity in the lesson?
- 7) What are the views on the re-implementation of Turkish language guidebooks?

3. Method

This study was designed on a case study. Qualitative research, which started to attract more attention with the implementation of the constructivist education paradigm, is based on the interpretative approach. Having started to attract more attention with the implementation of the constructivist education paradigm, qualitative research is based on the interpretative approach. The qualitative research method is a concept that includes the attitudes and strategies followed in qualitative research aiming to understand how people understand, experience, interpret, and produce the social world (Sandelowski, 2004: 893). Case study, which is one of the qualitative research designs, provides rich and detailed data to researchers, while case studies in which different units can be handled from a single individual to a school are not aimed at generalization as in other qualitative research approaches (Lichtman, 2006: 73-77).

3.1.Study Group

The study group was determined by the purposive sampling technique. Purposive sampling is a type of sampling in which researchers use their own judgment when choosing embers of the population and choose the ones most suitable for their purpose (Balcı, 2006). The criteria determined in this context are as follows:

- To be working in secondary schools affiliated to the Ministry of National Education in the province of Siirt,
 - To have used Turkish guidebooks,
- To be a Turkish language teacher for at least 5 years in schools within the Ministry of National Education.

The study group consists of 20 Turkish language teachers working in secondary schools in Siirt and having at least 5 years of teaching experience.



3.2.Data Collection Tool

A semi-structured interview form called "Teacher's Opinions about Guidebooks" prepared by the researcher was the data collection tool. During the development of the measurement tool, the researcher paid attention to the validity and reliability studies of qualitative research. The index of fit between practitioners in the pilot implementation was found .80. In the original application, the fit index among practitioners was found to be .85. In this context, the semi-structured interview form prepared by the researcher was first shaped in line with the expert opinions of 2 academic staff working in the field of Turkish language education and 2 Turkish language teachers working in schools affiliated to the Ministry of National Education, and then the measurement tool was tested by making a pilot application to 3 Turkish teachers. As a result of the analysis of the pilot study, expert opinion was taken again and the measurement tool was given its final shape.

3.3.Data Collection

A semi-structured interview form was used as a data collection tool in this study on teacher's guidebooks. The interview covers an interactive communication process, which is conducted for a predetermined and serious goal, and receives responses by asking questions to the interviewee. The process mentioned in the definition expresses the continuous and dynamic nature of this mutual communication. This dynamic nature requires establishing a relationship based on mutual interaction. The planned and purposive nature of the interview process makes the interview technique different from being a conversation, making it a projected data collection effort. The question and answer method used in the interview can also be described as a way of establishing a relationship and accessing data while collecting data (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2005). Semi-structured interviews are advantageous in terms of asking in-depth questions on a specific subject and making the situation more descriptive by asking questions again if the answer is incomplete or unclear (Çepni, 2007).

3.4.Data Analysis

The data were first transcribed into a computer environment by the researchers and then analysed using content analysis. As a result of the analysis, the research data were interpreted after being organized with codes, categories, and themes. The objectivity of qualitative research was increased by restructuring the code guide created during data analysis based on expert opinion.



4. Findings

4.1. Findings Regarding the Importance of Guidebooks in Teaching Lessons

Yes (14T)	No (3T)	Partially (3T)
 Daily plan Self-confidence Preliminary Preparation Saving of time Listening texts The teaching of the lesson more concisely Guidance Keeping students' interest alive during the lesson Preparation for the next lesson Lack of experience for beginners 	 The teacher should be able to manage her/his own educational process with the strategies s/he has prepared. They make the teacher lazy. They inhibit the creativity of the teacher The activity does not go beyond a book with answers. They can be useful if new studies and arrangements are made. They should offer the teacher a choice; they should not impose a single path. I know what to do and can apply techniques that allow me to use activities appropriate to the text with the experiences I have 	 I think they are slightly useful. They were helping me with the Daily plan. I mainly feel incomplete while making an entry in the daily lesson notebook.

In the interview with the teachers, 14 teachers felt the lack of the guidebooks, 3 teachers expressed no feeling of the lack of the guidebooks, and 3 teachers partially felt the lack of the guidebook. The teachers expressing that they feel the lack of the guidebooks gave the following answers to the question of which subject they felt lacked the most. After the guidebooks were removed, most teachers felt the lack of the guidebooks in issues such as preparing a daily plan, self-confidence, preparing for the lesson, saving time, applying the listening texts, teaching the lesson more systematically, guiding the teacher, keeping the students' attention throughout the lesson, the lack of experience in the preparation process for

gained.



that they do not feel the lack of guidebooks explained the potential reasons as follows. It may be beneficial for the teachers to guide the education process with the strategies they prepared, that the guidebooks make the teachers accustomed to laziness, that the guidebooks hinder the creativity of the teachers, that the guidebooks and activity books do not go beyond a book with answers, that the guidebooks should offer options to the teacher, that they should not impose a single path on the teacher, that new studies can be useful. And they said what they should do with the experiences they gained, and that they could apply techniques that could use activities appropriate to the text. The teachers, who partially felt the lack of the guidebook, made the following statement. They said that it was useful even a little, it helped with the daily plan, and they felt the lack of it while writing the daily plan in the lesson book.

They stated that the teachers should be able to manage their own educational process with their strategies as guidebooks make the teacher lazy, inhibit the creativity of the teacher, and contains activities that do not go beyond a book with answers. Besides, they further suggested that guidebooks can be useful if new studies and arrangements are made and should offer the teacher a choice instead of imposing a single path and that they know what to do and can apply techniques that allow them to use activities appropriate to the text with the experiences they have gained.

4.2.Findings regarding the Benefits of Guidebooks in Applying Learning-Teaching Strategies

The answers to the question "What are the benefits of the guidebooks in applying learning-teaching strategies?" are generally as follows:

What are the Benefits of Guidebooks in Applying Learning-Teaching Strategies?

- They help to make good use of the teaching process
- They create coherence between the strategies while teaching.
- They save the lesson from monotony and enable the student to be more active and enjoy the lesson.
- They are equipped to guide students to a discussion in activities.
- They refer to a very important step in gaining experience.
- Points that cannot be understood through plain lectures become clearer with the help of guidebooks.
- They are very useful for newly appointed teachers as they inform what needs to be done in terms of applying learning and teaching strategies correctly.

It has been reported by the participants that guidebooks help to make good use of the teaching process, create coherence between the strategies while teaching, save the lesson from monotony and enable the student to be more active and enjoy the lesson. Besides, it has also been suggested that guidebooks guide students to a discussion in activities and serve as an important step in gaining experience as well as make incomprehensible points clearer and allow novice teachers to be informed about what to do while applying learning and teaching strategies correctly.



4.3. Findings regarding Turkish Language Teaching in Non-use of Guidebooks

I had difficulty (8T)		I had no difficulty (12T)							
-	Guidebooks are better resources in this subject.	-	Ιn	nake pre	elimi	nary p	reparatio	ons.	
-	They help a lot while teaching.	-		teach perience		full	based	on	my
_	They serve as a guide.	-	I was fed up with guidance.						

8 participants reported that they could not clearly teach Turkish while 12 participants reported that they could easily teach Turkish without the use of guidebooks. 8 participants who had positive opinions suggested that guidebooks were better resources and guides as they allowed them to teach better with learning and teaching strategies available in guidebooks. On the other hand, 12 participants with negative opinions suggested that guidebooks were not needed as they already made preliminary preparations and taught lessons based on their own experiences.

4.4. Findings Regarding the Effect of Assessment and Evaluation Contents in the Guidebooks on Practice

The answers of the participants to this question were as follows: 9 Teachers benefited from the assessment and evaluation part of the guidebooks. 11 teachers did not benefit from this part of guidebooks. Finally, the answers given by 9 teachers to the question regarding the convenience provided by the guidebooks to the measurement and evaluation study were as follows:

- Guidebooks provide convenience in the assessment of whether goals related to language skills are achieved or not,
- Guidebooks are useful in the assessment of all goals,
- Guidebooks contain richer content,
- Guidebooks contribute to the complete cohesion between the subject and assessment,
- Guidebooks contain more functional assessment and evaluation strategies,
- Guidebooks provide more valid, reliable, and objective assessments.

The codes obtained from the participant answers to the question "How are you performing the assessment and evaluation section right now?" and the comments on these codes are as follows:

- Through my own assessment and evaluation strategies,
- Through my daily plan,
- Through the test, multiple-choice test, leaf test, and work papers that I prepared myself
- Through activities suitable for the class level,
- According to the success scales of each student
- By performing this process through additional resources and websites.



4.5. Findings regarding the Effect of Removal of Guidebooks on Classroom Management

While 14 of the participants reported that the removal of the guidebooks affected classroom management negatively, 6 teachers stated that the removal of the guidebooks did not have any effect on classroom management. Those with positive opinions believe that the classroom management is the same in both cases as they make preliminary preparations and maintain classroom management in the best possible way.

The codes obtained from the answers of the participants to the question "What are the positive and negative effects on classroom management after the removal of the guidebooks" and comments on these codes are as follows:

4.5.1. Positive effects

- Guidebooks prevented disciplinary problems that could occur by providing effectiveness throughout the lesson.
- Guidebooks provided the teacher with self-confidence and prevented all negativities that could sabotage the lesson.
- Guidebooks helped save time.
- Guidebooks guided the teacher in organizing the lesson.
- Guidebooks guided the teacher with instructions on how to behave in situations such as classroom management and crisis intervention for newly appointed teachers.

4.5.2. Negative effects

- Disciplinary problems arose in the classroom.
- Teachers had difficulties in directing and managing the classroom.
- Self-confidence in teachers was shaken.
- Time was not well managed.
- The lesson could not have been organized in a better way.
- Lack of experience was felt for newly appointed teachers.

4.6. Findings regarding the Effect of Removal of Guidebooks on Teaching Basic Language Skills

Negative effects (16T)	No effects at all (4T)		
- Guidebooks neglected listening skills.	- I prepare language skills according to the annual plan.		
- I have difficulty in reaching the listening texts.	- I teach language skills by experience.		
- There was a negative effect on writing skills.	- I teach language skills according to the daily plan.		

16 participants reported that guidebooks negatively affected methods and techniques in the field of basic language skills while 4 participants reported no effect. Those with



negative opinions suggested that guidebooks neglected listening skills along with difficulty in reaching listening texts, leading to inefficient teaching of listening texts. They also mentioned the lack of adequate guidance of guidebooks. On the other hand, the participants thinking that there was no effect at all suggested that they make preparations for listening skills based on the annual and daily plans and teach language skills by experience.

4.7. The codes obtained from the answers of the participants to the question "How did the removal of the guidebooks affect your productivity in the lesson? Why?" and the comments on these codes are as follows:

Decrease (10T)

No effect at all (8T)

Partial effect (2T)

- Guidebooks help gain self-confidence
- Guidebooks help gain all acquisitions
- Guidebooks help be more concentrated
- Guidebooks help with guidance
- Guidebooks keep the interest of the students alive throughout the lesson
- Guidebooks make the lesson more enjoyable

- I endeavor to increase productivity with my own plans.
- If I am prepared for the lesson, then the lesson is most likely to be productive.
- Taking full control of the lesson increases productivity.

- I experience some inadequacies.
- I feel a lack of self-confidence a bit.

While 10 teachers stated that their productivity decreased after the removal of the guidebooks, 8 teachers thought that there was no effect. 2 teachers stated that the removal of the guidebooks partially affected their productivity in the lesson. Teachers who had less productive in the lesson stated that guidebooks helped gain self-confidence, more concentration and provided guidance so that they were successful in keeping the students' attention on the subject throughout the lesson, and thus the lesson was more fun and enjoyable. The teachers reporting no effect on their productivity stated that they attempted to increase productivity with their own plans and the lesson was already productive if they were prepared for the lesson, adding taking full control of the lesson was a factor that also increased productivity. Teachers believing that guidebooks partially affected their productivity stated that there were some inadequacies along with a lack of self-confidence.



4.8. Findings Regarding Re-implementation of Guidebooks

Yes (15T)

- Guidebooks serve as a guide
- Guidebooks are paid products and help out-of-branch teachers
- Guidebooks contain a Daily plan
- Guidebooks are consumer source of experience
- Guidebooks help teachers gain selfconfidence
- Guidebooks provide a saving of time
- Guidebooks provide unity and cohesion in education
- Guidebooks contain rich and productive content

No (3T)

- Guidebooks make teachers lazy
- Guidebooks provide free-riding content
- Guidebooks lead to routinized teachers
- Guidebooks inhibit teachers' creativity

Undecided (2T)

- If there is a Daily plan, there is no need for guidebooks.
- Guidebooks may serve as a better resource if used additional studies and activities.

When asked "Do you think guidebooks should be distributed again?", 15 teachers responded as "yes", 3 teachers responded as "no", and 2 teachers were undecided on this issue. Teachers responding as "yes" believe that guidebooks provide guidance for teachers and a helpful resource for paid and non-paid teachers as well as help teachers with their daily plan as a source of experience, help teachers gain self-confidence, and save time. They also suggested that guidebooks should be distributed all over the country because they provide cohesion and unity for education and training activities and contain productive and rich content. Teachers responding as "no" reported that guidebooks make the teachers lazy with free-riding content, lead to routinized teachers and inhibit the creativity of the teachers. Finally, undecided teachers believe that if they have a daily plan delivered to them, there is no need for guidebooks and where guidebooks should be distributed; they should be enriched with additional resources and activities.



4.9. Findings regarding the Effect of Removal of Guidebooks on Teacher Guidance

Negative effect (11T)	No effect at all (9T)
- Guidebooks provided guidance.	- I made preparations.
- Guidebooks helped us teach a better	- I was the guide.
lesson.	
- Guidebooks made the lesson fun.	

While 11 participants reported that the removal of the guidebooks negatively affected teacher guidance, 9 teachers thought that the removal had no effect. The teachers with negative opinions reported that while there were guidebooks, the teacher was in a guiding position and could guide the lesson thanks to the guidebooks. However, after the guidebooks were removed, the teacher became passive in this case. Teachers thinking that the removal of the guidebooks had no effect on teacher guidance reported that in both cases they were the guides.

5. Discussion, Conclusion and Recommendations

This section includes the results obtained from this research aiming to determine the current situation in line with the opinions of teachers regarding the Turkish language guidebooks, which were removed from the curriculum in the 2018-2019 academic year.

Interviews with the teachers revealed that while the majority of the teachers generally reacted negatively to the removal of the guidebooks, some teachers found it positive. Therefore, teachers mainly believe that guidebooks should be prepared and distributed to teachers and included in the curriculum as a part of education and training tools. Teachers who find the removal of the guidebook application positive also believe that the guidebooks make the teachers lazy, hinder their thinking skills, and blunt their creativity. In terms of experienced teachers, the removal of guidebooks is thought to reflect teachers' experiences in more classrooms. In addition, it can be argued that the newly appointed teachers enter the lesson more unprepared than before without the support of the guidebook. In general, teachers are of the opinion that reintroducing guidebooks is beneficial for the efficient and healthy implementation of the education and training process. The results of some other studies in the literature overlap with and underpin the results of this study. Erden and Dilekçi (2022), who evaluated the opinions of Turkish teachers about guidebooks and lesson plans, reported that Turkish teachers see teacher guidebooks as a need for a more productive lesson. In addition, Yurtbakan and Cerrah Özsevgeç (2019) shed light on the opinions of classroom teachers about the necessity of guidebooks and reported that the guidebooks are suitable for the constructivist approach, the activities in the guidebooks provide psychomotor skills and support all intelligence areas, and the guidebooks should be distributed to the classroom teachers. This refers to another similar result to that of this study focusing on the necessity of guidebooks. Besides, Göçer and Aktürk (2015) scrutinized the perceptions of primary and secondary school teachers towards guidebooks through metaphors and reported that teachers see guidebooks as guides and define guidebooks with metaphors such as the pole star, compass, and lighthouse. These results coincide with and support the results of this study in



terms of the necessity of guidebooks. Baş et al. (2017) conducted a study on 5th-grade Turkish study and teacher's guidebooks and concluded that guidebooks have a crucial role in offering guidance for teachers. Based on this study and the other studies mentioned above, it is possible to state that guidebooks play an important role in teachers' effective teaching and help organize regular and systematic in-class activities and increase the academic efficiency of the course.

Based on the findings and results mentioned above, it can be recommended that the relevant practice of the Ministry of National Education should be re-evaluated by considering both newly appointed and experienced teachers.



References

- Ayvacı, H. Ş. & Çoruhlu, T. Ş. (2011). İlköğretim 7. sınıf fen ve teknoloji öğretmen kılavuz kitabının öğretmen görüşlerine dayalı olarak değerlendirilmesi. *Erzincan Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, *13*(1), 24-38.
- Balcı, A. (2006). Sosyal Bilimlerde Araştırma Yöntem, Teknik ve İlkeler. Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Baş, B; Turhan, O & Karaca, F (2017), Türkçe Öğretiminde Etkinlik Stratejisi Geliştirmeye Yönelik Bir Durum Tespiti: 5. Sınıf Türkçe Çalışma ve Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitabı Örneği, *Journal of Mother Tongue Education*, 5(4), 717-746.
- Ceyhan, E. & Yiğit, B. (2003). Konu Alanı Ders Kitabı Incelemesi. Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.
- Çepni, S. (2007). Araştırma ve Proje Çalışmalarına Giriş (Gözden geçirilmiş baskı). Trabzon: Celepler Matbaacılık.
- Demirel, Ö. (2005). *Eğitimde Program Geliştirme: Kuramdan Uygulamaya* (8. Baskı.). Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Erden B. & Dilekçi A. (2022), Türkçe Öğretiminde Bir İhtiyaç Olarak Kılavuz Kitaplar ve Ders Planı, *Milli Eğitim Dergisi*, 51(233), 623-642.
- Göçer, A & Aktürk Y. (2015), İlk ve Ortaokul Öğretmenlerinin Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitabına Yönelik Algıları: Metafor Analizi, *International Journal of Turkish Education Sciences*, 4, 186-199.
- Güneş, F. (2009). Türkçe Öğretiminde Günümüz Gelişmeleri ve Yapılandırıcı Yaklaşım. Mustafa Kemal Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 6(11),1-21.
- Kesercioğlu, T. & Aydoğdu, M. (2005). İlköğretimde Fen ve Teknoloji Öğretimi. Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.
- Lichtman, M. (2006). *Qualitative Research in Education a Users' Guide*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Turan, İ. & Karabacak, N. (2008). Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitaplarının Öğretimdeki Yansımaları. *Milli Eğitim Üç Aylık Eğitim ve Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 177, 138-151.
- Sandelowski, M. (2004). Nitel Araştırmayı Kullanma. *Nitel Sağlık Araştırması*, *14*(10), 1366-1386.
- Şaşan, H. H. (2002). Yapılandırmacı Öğrenme. Yaşadıkça Eğitim Dergisi, 74-75, 49-52.
- Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2005). Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri. Ankara: Seçkin Yayınları.
- Yurtbakan E. & Cerrah Özsevgeç L. (2019), Kılavuz Kitapların Gerekliliği Hakkında Sınıf Öğretmenlerinin Görüşleri, *Milli Eğitim Dergisi*, 2019, 48(222), 127-147.

