

ISSN 2579-4396 E-ISSN 2579-440X

# Journal of Government Civil Society

Jour a	nal of Government nd Civil Society	Volume 6	No. 2	Pages 183 - 320	October 2022	ISSN 2579-4396
	- T			4	Ca	0.00
Sik	Bint		Sa	man	SEA	
No.				ab.	amb	
ac	Dos	Tar				
	PNE	"arak	502	Sp. Al.	Amisulu	
		0	P	r	~ nipela	
			I.		LAN	
				17200		
	mer a					
3		N.X.				
BI	akassal	27	>			
2	Lesu .		~	00	3	Jul ?!
	april	1	8	- Constant		



Published By: Government Science Study Program Faculty of Sosial and Political Sciences Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang





# Daftar Isi (Table of Content) Journal of Government Civil Society

100 000	Strengthening Pancasila in Religious Life: Pioneering a New Form of Relations between Islam and Pancasila					
183 - 203	Ma'mun Murod <sup>1</sup> , Ali Noer Zaman <sup>2</sup> , Djoni Gunanto <sup>3</sup> , Usni <sup>4</sup>					
	(1.2.3.4 Political Science Department, Universitas Muhammadiyah Jakarta, Indonesia)					
	The Global Role of Cities Government on Tackling Covid-19					
	Dyah Estu Kurniawati¹, Eko Priyo Purnomo², Ali Roziqin³, Rizka Zahrotun Khairina⁴					
204 - 226	( <sup>1</sup> Department of International Relations, Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, Indonesia) ( <sup>2</sup> Department of Government Affairs and Administration, Jusuf Kalla School of Government, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia) ( <sup>3</sup> Government Studies, Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, Indonesia) ( <sup>4</sup> Center of Intermestic Studies, Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, Indonesia)					
	National Program, Local Response: Dynamic of Unconditional Cash Transfer Distribution to Poor Families in Maros Regency, Indonesia					
227 – 245	Jaelan Usman <sup>1</sup> , Muhammad Rusydi <sup>1</sup> , Mahnoor Farooq <sup>2</sup>					
	( <sup>1</sup> Department of Public Administration, Postgraduate Program, Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia) ( <sup>2</sup> Department of Public Administration, Lahore College for Women University, Pakistan)					
	Civil Society Organisations' Responses to The Effects of The Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Pandemic in Ghana					
246 - 275	Solomon Kofi Amoah					
	(Department of Sociology, University of Ghana)					
	Human Ecosystem Approach to The Dynamics of Sustainable Development in Komodo National Park, Indonesia					
276 - 291	Imelda Masni Juniaty Sianipar <sup>1,2</sup> , Aarce Tehupeiory <sup>3</sup> , Arthuur Jeverson Maya <sup>1</sup> , Huynh Le Anh Huy <sup>2,4</sup> , Huynh Quoc Tuan <sup>2,4</sup> , I Wayan Koko Suryawan <sup>5,6</sup>					
	<ul> <li>(<sup>1</sup> Department of International Relations, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Kristen Indonesia, Indonesia)</li> <li>(<sup>2</sup> Asia-Pacific Regional Studies, College of Humanities and Social Sciences, National Dong Hwa University Hualien 974, Taiwan)</li> <li>(<sup>3</sup> Doctor Program of Law Department, Postgraduate Program Universitas Kristen Indonesia, Indonesia)</li> </ul>					

	( <sup>4</sup> Faculty of Sociology - Social Work - Southeast Asian Studies, Ho Chi Minh City Open University, Vietnam) ( <sup>5</sup> Department Environmental Engineering, Faculty of Infrastructure Planning, Universitas Pertamina, Indonesia) ( <sup>6</sup> Natural Resources and Environmental Studies, College of Environmental Studies, National Dong Hwa University Hualien 974, Taiwan)					
	Government Capacity Gap in Handling Covid-19 in Lampung Province					
202 200	Robi Cahyadi Kurniawan¹, Dodi Faedlulloh², Arizka Warganegara³, Dedy Hermawan⁴					
292 - 308	<ul> <li>(<sup>1,3</sup> Departement of Government Science, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Lampung)</li> <li>(<sup>2,4</sup> Departement of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Lampung)</li> </ul>					
	Home Care Dottoro'ta As a Development Program Smart City in Makassar City, Indonesia					
309 - 320	Wahdania Suardi <sup>1</sup> , Titin Purwaningsih <sup>2</sup> , Ihyani Malik <sup>3</sup> , Ahmad Taufik <sup>4</sup>					
509 - 520	( <sup>1,2</sup> Department of Government Affairs and Administration, Jusuf Kalla School of Government, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta, Indonesia) ( <sup>3,4</sup> Department of Government Studies, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia)					



# National Program, Local Response: Dynamic of Unconditional Cash Transfer Distribution to Poor Families in Maros Regency, Indonesia

Jaelan Usman<sup>1\*</sup>, Muhammad Rusydi<sup>1</sup>, Mahnoor Farooq<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Public Administration, Postgraduate Program, Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup> Department of Public Administration, Lahore College for Women University, Pakistan

\*Email Correspondence: jaelan.usman@unismuh.ac.id

#### ABSTRACT

This study aims to explore the implementation of social assistance programs in improving the welfare of the poor affected by Covid-19 in Maros Regency. This is based on the consideration that the Family Hope Program is a conditional social assistance program, namely Beneficiary Families in supporting the improvement of the welfare of the poor between generations. We investigated the contribution of various possible pathways to the program's overall impact, including education, health, consumption, caregiver stress levels and life satisfaction, perceived social support, and participation in hard and unpleasant work. The method used is qualitative-explorative with a phenomenological approach, to explore the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) program to help the poor during the COVID-19 pandemic in Maros Regency, data analysis using Nvivo 12 Pro to interpret phenomena more deeply to get the best findings. The results of this study underline that unconditional cash grants are used on a scale that is getting bigger as part of Indonesia's national social protection system. Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) distributed to poor families in Maros Regency aims to ease the economic burden due to Covid-19 Pandemic. Then the Maros Regency Government integrated social programs in collaboration with the Central Government, Regional Social Institutions, and Ombudsman to help poor families avoid economic, health, and education difficulties during Covid-19 Pandemic in Maros Regency.

Keywords: Unconditional cash transfer (BLT), pandemi Covid-19, poor families, maros, Indonesia

#### ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengeksplorasikan pelaksanaan program bantuan sosial dalam peningkatan kesejahteraan masyarakat miskin yang terdampak akibat Covid-19 di Kabupaten Maros. Hal ini didasarkan pertimbangan bahwa Program Keluarga Harapan adalah program bantuan sosial yang bersyarat, yaitu Keluarga Penerima Manfaat dalam mendukung peningkatan kesejahteraan masyarakat miskin antar generasi. Kami menyelidiki kontribusi berbagai kemungkinan jalur untuk dampak program secara keseluruhan, termasuk pendidikan, kesehatan, konsumsi, tingkat stres pengasuh dan kepuasan hidup, dukungan sosial yang dirasakan, dan partisipasi dalam kerja keras dan tidak menyenangkan. Metode yang digunakan kualitatif-eksploratif dengan pendekatan fenomenologi, untuk mengeksplorasikan program bantuan langsung tunai (BLT) untuk membantu masyrakat miskin di masa pandemi covid-19 di Kabupaten Maros, analisis data menggunakan Nvivo 12 Pro untuk menginterpertasikan fenomena lebih mendalam untuk mendapatkan temuan terbaik. Hasil penelitian ini menggarisbawahi bahwa hibah tunai tanpa syarat, yang digunakan dalam skala yang semakin besar sebagai bagian dari sistem perlindungan sosial nasional di Indonesia. Bantun Langsung Tunai (BLT) yang disalurkan untuk keluarga miskin di Kabupaten Maros bertujuan untuk meringankan beban ekonomi akibat pandemi covid-19. Kemudian Pemerintahan Kabupaten Maros melalukan integrasi program sosial yang bekerjasama dengan pemerintah pusat, lembaga sosial

Citation : Usman, J., Rusydi, M., & Farooq, M. (2022). National Program, Local Response: Dynamic of Unconditional Cash Transfer Distribution to Poor Families in Maros Regency, Indonesia. *Journal of Government and Civil Society*, 6(2), 227–245. https://doi.org/10.31000/jgcs.v6i2.6150

daerah, dan Ombusman untuk membantu keluarga miskin terhindar dari kesulitan ekonomi, kesehatan dan pendidikan selama pandemi Covid-19 di Kabupaten Maros.

Kata Kunci: Bantuan langsung tunai (BLT), pandemi Covid-19, keluarga miskin, Maros, Indonesia

### INTRODUCTION

Economic disparities or the distribution of income distribution between low-income groups and low-income groups as well as poverty or the number below the poverty line are two that are often experienced by developing countries, not Indonesia (Kanbur, R., & Sumner, A., 2012; Fosu, A. K., 2017; Prianto, 2012; 2013; 2017; Hamrun, et.al, 2020; Malik, et.al, 2020; 2021). Poverty is a condition of economic inability to meet the average basic needs in an area (Palmer, M., 2011). This condition is characterized by a low ability to meet the basic needs of food, clothing, and housing (Salaputa, et.al, 2013; Buheji, M. et al., 2020). Low-income ability will not only result in not meeting basic needs but will also have an impact on the inability to meet the average standard of living such as public health standards and education standards (Baird, S. et al., 2013; Angeles, G. et al., 2019; Luhur and Abdillah, 2020).

There are an estimated 274 million people in need of humanitarian assistance by 2022 due to increased extreme weather events, conflicts and pandemics. People affected by humanitarian crises have higher rates of poor health outcomes due to increased vulnerability to violence, infectious diseases, food insecurity, and chronic disease (MoF, 2022; Laia, K., 2022). Collectively, the humanitarian crisis during the COVID-19 pandemic and climate change requires innovative and impactful solutions that address complex health challenges including the prevention and treatment of communicable and non-communicable diseases, water and sanitation, nutrition, and access to sexual and reproductive health and health services. mental and psychosocial support (Prianto, et.al, 2022; 2021; Ministry of Finance, 2022; Laia, K., 2022). One possible intervention to improve outcomes across these health challenges is the provision of cash transfers to affected communities (van Daalen, K. et al., 2022; Pega, F. et al., 2022).

In the 2020-2024 National Mid-Term Development Plan, the poverty reduction strategy rests on three pillars, namely: comprehensive social protection, improvement of basic services, and sustainable livelihoods. The Indonesian government has implemented various social protection and poverty reduction programs. It is known that in addition to the Healthy Indonesia Card and the Smart Indonesia Card, other social assistance programs have also been held, such as the subsidized rice program for poor families which later turned into prosperous rice, the Hopeful Family Program, the Child Social Welfare Program, Joint Business Groups, Social Assistance for Advanced Neglected Age, Social Assistance for People with Disabilities, to Unconditional Cash Transfer programs to the community.

However, Indonesia's experience in providing welfare through the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) without conditions has triggered multifaceted conflicts in the community. Unlike Conditional Cash Assistance (BTB), which can be seen as cash benefits for poor households, especially to bring their children to schools and basic health services to promote long-term social investment (Sumarto, M., 2021; Khaerah, et.al, 2021), the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) is temporary cash assistance that is distributed for homes Poor stairs as compensation for reducing fuel subsidies to help them access basic needs (Sumarto, M., 2021; Rasyid, M., 2022).

However, the inaccuracy of targeting the poor in poverty alleviation is quite a public concern. In many cases, the poor and vulnerable do not receive comprehensive social protection services, and even a few poor families do not receive benefits from the available social assistance programs even though they deserve it. As an illustration, about 65% of the elderly population in rural areas do not have health insurance, old age insurance, or pensions. Various studies investigate the context of large-scale and short-term unconditional cash transfer (UCT) programs in Indonesia. After cutting regressive fuel subsidies, the Indonesian government provided nearly 19 million households with quarterly transfers of about 30 USD – roughly 1/8 of the average quarterly household expenditure at baseline – between October 2005 and September 2006. nationally representative and timely. panel-level data from the National Socio-Economic Survey, Susenas to identify household spending and labor supply responses over two timeframes: (i) the short-term period after the beneficiary household receives one or two quarterly transfers and (ii) the medium-term when the program has been discontinued (Bazzi, S. et al., 2012). In figure 1 (Overlay Visualization) below, the research problem identified and analyzed through Vosviewer with the keyword "unconditional cash transfer" from 700 previous research articles indexed on Google Scholar in 2010-2022, found the novelty of research from the keyword "unconditional cash transfer". " identified and analyzed in 2015 to 2018 namely; (1) Unconditional cash transfers affect a number of groups of women; (2) Unconditional cash transfers have an impact on the mental health of the poor; (3) Unconditional cash assistance is money for people with low incomes; (4) unconditional cash assistance for workers; and (5) Challenges of the Covid-19 Pandemic. The findings from the identification and analysis of the research problem became the basis for this research focusing on the implementation of unconditional cash transfers for handling the poor in health dilemmas due to the Covid-19 pandemic in Maros Regency.



Figure 1. Identification and Analysis of Research Problems Source: Produced by researchers from Vosviewer, 2022

Based on these problems, the improvement of social protection, productivity, and the fulfillment of basic rights for the poor and vulnerable becomes very relevant. However, the different characteristics of poverty in each region/regency, and in each household, is still a thorny problem in itself. For this reason, integration in handling poor and vulnerable families needs serious attention from stakeholders, both central and regional. It is realized that it is not easy to integrate various programs comprehensively in its implementation. In connection with this, that one of the causes of the difficulty of implementing integrated services is the conflict of interest between various leaders of institutions/agencies that provide similar services (Sandfort, 2014). It was further emphasized that the difficulty of sustainable integrated social services is due to the existence of an organizational culture that does not focus on solving the fulfillment of basic needs and handling people with problems.

This study offers new evidence of the importance of time and hope in understanding the impact of cash transfers in low-income neighborhoods and the behavior of the poor affected by the COVID-19 pandemic in Maros Regency. There is a lot of literature that examines the implementation of Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) programs (eg. Sentanu, I. et al., 2021; Dartanto, T. et al., 2021; Bryan, G., et al., 2021; Bauer, A. et al., 2021). These studies are interesting for insight into the implementation and evaluation of the distribution of Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT)) to regions/districts in Indonesia.

#### **RESEARCH METHOD**

This study uses a qualitative-exploratory method with a phenomenological approach (Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N., 2016), exploring the actual situation of the dynamics of the distribution of Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) programs during the COVID-19 pandemic in Maros Regency. The descriptive type is limited to efforts to express a problem or the situation as it is so that it is merely to reveal facts. However, the results of this study will place more emphasis on an objective description of the actual condition of the dynamic process of distributing Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) as a national program to respond to social vulnerabilities in the community. The data collection technique in this study was through observation/field observations, and documentation. Such as data obtained from books, journal articles, government working papers, and laws. Then the data is analyzed using an in-depth interactive-interpretation analysis technique (Miles et al., 2018), through collecting research data, reducing research data related to the research topic, verifying data, presenting analysis, then drawing conclusions. Assisted with tools such as Nvivo 12 pro qualitative data analysis software (Woolf, NH, & Silver, C., 2017) in managing data and analyzing existing data (field observation notes and documents related to research topics) to get the best conclusions. Go through the stages as shown in figure 2 below:



Figure. 2. Data Collection and Analysis Techniques with NVivo 12 Pro Source: Processed from Woolf & Silver (2017), 2022

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION Overview: Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) Program in Maros Regency

Based on the regulation of the village minister for Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration (PDTT) Number 7 of 2020 concerning the priority of using village funds, including the provision of Unconditional Cash Transfer from village funds (BLT - Village Funds). In addition, policies regarding the effectiveness, transparency, and accountability of the use of village funds are regulated in Law No. 6 of 2014 concerning Villages. One of the villages that received village funds from the State Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBN) and approximately 30% of the village funds were channeled as Direct Cash Assistance-Village Funds (BLT - Village Funds) during the COVID-19 pandemic in Maros Regency. As stated by Sumarto, M. (2021) the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) is temporary cash assistance distributed to poor households to meet basic needs in the midst of the COVID-19 pandemic, including needs health needs and the standards of education for poor families in Maros Regency. The Maros Regency Government distributes BLT-Village Funds with a population of approximately 353,121 people in villages in Maros Regency (Mustafa, M. et al., 2022). Figure 3 below shows the percentage of the amount of Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) in Maros Regency for 2020-2022 that was distributed to the community in the midst of the COVID-19 pandemic:



Figure 3. Total Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) in Maros Regency in 2020-2022 Source: Compiled from Various Sources, 2022

The Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) program from the Maros Regency government was distributed to as many as 25,900 Maros residents who entered the data on beneficiaries spread across 14 sub-districts/villages, in Maros Regency. The total budget of approximately

Rp. 12 billion was distributed to the community as Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) in the midst of the COVID-19 pandemic situation in Maros Regency. The government established a Unconditional Cash Transfer program (BLT) with the aim of helping vulnerable communities affected by Covid-19 pandemic (Mustafa, M. et al., 2022; Abdillah, A. et al., 2021). Based on the identification and analysis in figure 4 below from various sources through Nvivo 12 pro, the strategic efforts carried out by local governments to deal with social vulnerabilities caused by the Covid-19 pandemic with the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) program as a national program that is forwarded to the regions/ regency, to respond to social vulnerabilities caused by the Covid-19 pandemic in Maros Regency.



Figure 4. Identification of the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) in Maros Regency Source: Compiled from Various Sources, 2022

The distribution of BLT - Village Funds in Maros Regency has been running for 6 in 2020, from April to September 2020, and continued from January to September 2021. The recipients have felt the effects of the assistance. However, data held by both the central and local governments that are used as data on target recipients of social assistance

can potentially not be right on target, because in general, the data are outdated and no longer relevant to people who need assistance at this time (Mappong, 2020; Hidayah, N., 2022). People who do not need assistance also need this assistance considering that Covid-19 has a broad impact on the economy. So in the current conditions in the midst of the COVID-19 pandemic, it brings its own challenges and problems. Therefore, the government's readiness and responsibility to deal with unexpected conditions during the COVID-19 pandemic are very much needed.

The Maros Regency Government with the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) program hopes to be able to ease the burden on residents during the Covid-19 pandemic, considering that the level of community needs is increasing every time (Postimur, 2022). The distribution of Unconditional Cash Transfer to help people affected by COVID-19 in Maros Regency is carried out in stages by complying with health protocols. This was stated by the Regent of Maros HM Hatta Rahman in Maros Regency (Mustafa, M. et al., 2022). The second phase of the distribution of Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) began with the symbolic handing over of BLT to Simbang District, which has 80 villages this sub-district is one of 14 sub-districts in the district, nicknamed "Butta Salewangang". According to Hatta (in Mustafa, et al., 2022) the delivery of Unconditional Cash Transfer sourced from the Village Fund budget is the first time this has been carried out and must be carried out in stages so that not all residents in 14 sub-districts simultaneously go to the post office, making it difficult to control to keep their distance. This follows up on a circular letter from the Ministry of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration to utilize Village Funds for the distribution of Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) for communities affected by COVID-19 Previously, the Village Fund was intended for physical development in villages or activities that can boost the economy in the area. the village.

However, due to the pandemic of this new type of coronavirus throughout Indonesia, the funds were transferred to the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) with each aid recipient receiving Rp.600 thousand per month. With the Village Fund - Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) assistance, the Maros Regency Government hopes to ease the economic burden on the community in the midst of the COVID-19 pandemic (Mustafa, M. et al., 2022). Moreover, this working area, which is directly adjacent to Makassar City, is admittedly affected by many, because some of its citizens are employees or employees in the provincial capital of South Sulawesi. This was confirmed by the Head of Simbang M Bakri. According to him, apart from the residents being farmers, some are also civil servants and private sector employees. Private employees are usually employees in the Makassar Industrial Estate, which is near the border of Makassar City and Maros Regency, South Sulawesi. Meanwhile, AA (one of the beneficiaries of Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT)) (in Mustafa, M. et al., 2022) said he was very grateful to receive Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) because he could buy daily consumption needs, because the public stopped

operate, and there have been layoffs in several companies that make people's incomes comply.

#### Opportunities and Challenges: Dynamics of the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) Program in the Middle of the Covid-19 Pandemic in Maros Regency

In 2020, the Maros Regency Government disbursed Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) in several areas in Maros Regency. The distribution of the Unconditional Cash Transfer Fund (BLT) is carried out for several months to ensure that the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) is distributed to the maximum extent. The total Unconditional Cash Transfer Fund (BLT) distributed in villages in Maros Regency is Rp. 26 billion, in 2020 (Pemeritah Kab. Maros, 2020). There are a number of criteria for receiving the Village Fund BLT, including those whose house floor area is less than 8 m<sup>2</sup>, then the walls are not made of walls or at least have not been plastered, and those who earn less than IDR 600 thousand per month and prioritized for residents affected by Covid-19 19 such as those who are not registered with the Social Safety Net (JPS) or are not covered by the Family Hope Program, the Non-Cash Food Assistance Program (BPNT) and the Ministry of Social's Unconditional Cash Transfer Program (BLT) (Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2020).

In 2022, the Maros Regency Government distributes Unconditional Cash Transfer Funds (BLT) to thousands of Beneficiary Families (KPM) in Maros Regency. the Covid-19 pandemic and rising fuel prices. The number of recipients of the Direct Tunai Assistance Fund (BLT) distributed by the Maros Regency Government was 25,586 from the Maros Regency Beneficiary Families (KPM). Each KPM will receive assistance worth Rp 500 thousand. If we add up, the special Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) budget for Maros Regency reaches Rp. 12.793 billion. The distribution is through the post office which will be distributed at the local sub-district office. Every month, KPM gets Rp 250 thousand in cash and is distributed in two stages. And the recipients of this Unconditional Cash Transfer Fund (BLT) are on average previous recipients of social assistance (Hidayah, N., 2022; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2020).

Several research results suggest that the COVID-19 pandemic has caused the poor to lose their jobs or experience a decrease in income (Buheji, M. et al., 2020; Fosu, A. K., 2017). The groups most affected are those who work in the urban and informal sectors. This was mainly due to the large-scale social restriction policies and restrictions on the operation of public facilities, such as schools and public transportation, which were implemented by the Central Government or Regional Governments in an effort to prevent the spread of Covid-19. For poor communities in the rural areas of Bantimurung Subdistrict, whose livelihoods rely on the agricultural sector, the impact of the pandemic is relatively smaller, especially for residents whose agricultural products tend to be for their own consumption. In people whose agricultural products are sold more, the perceived impact is difficulty in marketing and a decrease in the selling price of savings (Pemerintah Kab. Maros., 2020; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2021b).

Cases in several regions/regency in Indonesia are efforts by the poor to overcome the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, especially by reducing spending and seeking additional income. Expenditure reduction is carried out by, among other things, reducing/changing consumption patterns and eliminating children's pocket money. Efforts to increase income can be done by changing jobs or doing side jobs. In addition, a small number of poor families can make other efforts, such as borrowing and using savings (Pemerintah Kab. Maros., 2020; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2021b).

Then another phenomenon that was found, was that poor family receiving the Family Hope Program and the Basic Food Program also used the assistance received as a safety net to reduce the impact of the pandemic. Both programs have helped Beneficiary Families minimize the impact of the pandemic through cash receipts, reduced spending, and provision of family food. The Sembako Program can reduce staple food expenditures for up to two weeks each month and allow Beneficiary Families to get variety in consumption and nutritional adequacy (Pemerintah Kab. Maros., 2021b; Hastuti, et al., 2020).

The ineffective implementation of social assistance in meeting the basic needs of poor families in Bantimurung District, Maros Regency, is caused by various factors, one of which is socialization carried out in stages and generally through teleconferences and online media as an adjustment to the COVID-19 pandemic (Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2019; Fajar, A., 2021). The socialization was initiated by the Central Government through the distribution of circulars and teleconferences with regional administrators as well as the dissemination of information through mass media. At the local level, more formal teleconferences are conducted among technical implementers, while Beneficiary Families are generally conducted informally via WhatsApp. Face-to-face socialization was carried out on a limited basis in several villages in Maros Regency by implementing health protocols. Another finding in this study is the lack of data collection on the beneficiaries of the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) program carried out by local governments, including the Maros Regency government (Wahyuni, Di., 2022).

Observing the research results of Hastuti, R., & Widyaningsih, D.Y.A.N. (2020) and Cahyono, S.A.T. (2018), it was found that there were problems with the results of verification and validation which showed that the number of Beneficial Families (KPM) was not right on target, this had an impact on the benefits of the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) program not providing comprehensive benefits during the COVID-19 pandemic. in Maros Regency. Identify problems such as the surname of the Beneficiary who has died, changed address, or is not poor (vulnerable). In Bantimurung Subdistrict, Maros Regency, for example, there were 458 KPM out of 2,343 KPM expanding the Basic

Food Program that did not pass the verification and validation. For Beneficiary Families who do not meet the requirements, the Social Welfare Card in their name is withheld. In the Family Hope Program, it was also found that the extended beneficiary families were socio-economically eligible, but did not have the Family Hope Program component or the number of components did not match. If the assistance funds are already available in the account, the Beneficiary Families who have not fulfilled these components can still withdraw and receive assistance.

#### Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) as a Social Response to Vulnerability in the Community Due to the Covid-19 Pandemic in Maros Regency

Based on the analysis of research data, the researcher shows that, there are a number of Beneficiary Families (KPM) whose expansion is not appropriate, which is an indication of the invalidity or lack of up-to-date data sources, in this case the Integrated Social Welfare Data, which is used for targeting (Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2020a; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2021b). According to the prevailing regulations, the Regional Government should update the Integrated Social Welfare Data every six months (in fact, this rule was later changed to every three months). The study in the region (Kabupaten Maros) is updated every six months at the beginning and the middle of the year, but this varies between regions as it depends on the support of each local government.

Another finding from the results of this study shows that the updating of the Integrated Social Welfare Data for Maros Regency is carried out by other service providers, individuals who are placed at the village level in sufficient numbers (Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2020a; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2020b; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2021b). The major update will be carried out in September 2020. In addition, the community is also actively registering at the village or sub-district office. In other areas, updates are carried out by operators stationed at the village office. As explained in Maros Regency, the updating of the Integrated Social Welfare Data is relatively limited because it is only carried out by subdistrict social welfare workers assisted by operators and cadres. The Regional Government of Maros Regency has not fully supported, the terms of policies and funding in programs for updating data on recipients of social assistance such as Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) in Maros Regency. Based on the research data owned by the researchers, it shows that, even though the data has been updated, the Integrated Social Welfare Data they receive still contains old data, not in accordance with the facts on the ground. Figure 5 below shows that one of the social responses of the Maros Regency government is facing vulnerabilities due to the COVID-19 pandemic by distributing direct cash (BLT), although in its implementation in the field it faces challenges such as data collection and socialization, this program can help the community ease the burden of the situation. which is difficult due to the covid-19 pandemic, this program is also a national program that is sent to regions in Indonesia.



Figure 5. Challenges and Opportunities for the Implementation of the Family Hope Program (PKH) in Maros Regency Source: Processed by Researchers from Nvivo 12 pro, 2022

The distribution of cash social assistance to beneficiary families of the expansion begins with the distribution of prosperous family cards which have been implemented in all sub-districts with various mechanisms. Beneficiaries of the Family Hope Program of the expanded Sembako Program which are recipients of the regular Sembako Program of the Family Hope Program are not given a new Social Welfare Card because they can use the old Social Welfare Card. It is known that in Maros Regency there are 14 sub-districts, 107 villages, and the number of recipients is 8,606 Beneficiary Families. In most areas, the distribution of Social Welfare Cards is carried out by channeling banks in villages or sub-districts and witnessed by a number of parties, such as the Family Hope Program facilitator,

District Social Welfare Workers, and village officials (Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2019; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2020b; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2021a).

Until October 2021, when the researchers collected field data (observations and interviews), the distribution/disbursement of aid to Beneficiary Families of the expansion had been carried out in almost all sub-districts and proceeded smoothly. The distribution has been evenly distributed in 14 sub-districts, 107 villages, and 8,606 recipients. Beneficiary Families of the Family Hope Program disburse assistance at ATMs or e-Warong, while Beneficiary Families of the Sembako Program take assistance at e-Warong. During the pandemic, disbursement at ATMs and e-Warongs is carried out by following health procedures. Especially at e-Warong, there is a regional unit scheduling system to prevent crowds. In some areas there are also heads of Beneficiary Families and e-Warongs who take the initiative to collect aid collectively or deliver aid to Beneficiary Families' homes without charging a fee, although some of them voluntarily give Rp. 5,000 in return (Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2019; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2020b; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2021a).

The increase in assistance for the Family Hope Program by 25% does not reflect the principle of fairness for Beneficiary Families, especially those whose assistance value is small. For beneficiary families who only have one component of elementary school children, for example, the assistance received only increases from Rp. 180,000 to Rp. 225,000 per quarter, or Rp. 75,000 per month. This value is much smaller when compared to other social assistance in the context of mitigating the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic, such as cash social assistance which provides assistance of IDR 600,000 per month (Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2019; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2020b; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2021a).

Beneficiary families must have the flexibility to choose the type and amount of food, timing, and e-Warong. Beneficiary families must take assistance in the form of packages determined by program implementers at the district/city level, in certain e-Warongs, and in one take (Belanawane S. et al., 2020). The implementation of the Family Hope Program (PKH) in the midst of the Covid-19 pandemic in Maros Regency, which is a concern in the distribution of Unconditional Cash Transfer to the poor is based on various social programs centered on the government, regional social institutions, and the Ombudsman to help poor families in rural areas. Maros Regency was spared from economic, health, and education difficulties during the Covid-19 pandemic. Problems with the implementation of the Family Hope Program (PKH) regarding incorrect data updating, a major update was carried out in September 2020, namely: other service providers, individuals who actively visit registered family homes, and poor/vulnerable families who have not been registered. It was noted that by collaborating with the Ombudsman and the Social Service of the Maros Regency Government, as well as adapting to the e-Warong

system, as a regional unit scheduling system to prevent the creation of opening PKH funds during the Covid-19 Pandami Period (Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2019; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2020b; Pemerintah Kab. Maros, 2021a).

# CONCLUSIONS

The results of this study found that the pandemic caused the poor to lose their jobs or experience a decrease in income. The groups most affected are those who work in the urban and informal sectors. This was mainly due to the large-scale social restriction policies and restrictions on the operation of public facilities, such as schools and public transportation, which were implemented by the Central Government or Regional Governments (Pemda) in an effort to inhibit the spread of Covid-19 which had an impact on decreasing the opinion of the poor in Maros Regency. The effectiveness of adaptation has not been realized because the Maros Regency Integrated Social Welfare Data is updated by other service providers, individuals who are placed at the village level in sufficient numbers. A major update was carried out in September 2020, namely: other service providers, individuals who are actively visiting registered family homes, and registering poor/vulnerable families who have not yet been registered. The inaccuracy of targets that indicate the invalidity of the reference data, namely the integrated social welfare data, indicates the need for updating the Integrated Social Welfare Data widely, seriously, and periodically. Therefore, there needs to be a strong commitment from the Regional Government through the provision of an adequate legal umbrella for policies, human resources, and budgets to ensure that the Unconditional Cash Transfer (BLT) program can be fully utilized in regions in Indonesia, especially also in Maros Regency. Another finding in this study, there are efforts to integrate social programs to help poor families carried out by the Maros Regency Government in collaboration with the central government, regional social institutions, and the Ombudsman to help poor families in Maros Regency avoid economic, health and educational difficulties during the Covid-19 pandemic.

# REFERENCES

- Abdillah, A., Prastio, L. O., & Effendi, S. N. (2021). Analisis Alienasi Sosial Karl Marx dalam Kebijakan Sistem Pemagangan Nasional Indonesia. Jurnal Identitas, 1(2), 48-61. https://doi.org/10.52496/identitas.v1i2.155
- Agung, K. (2015). Transformasi Playanan Publik. Yogyakarta: Pembaharuan
- Angeles, G., de Hoop, J., Handa, S., Kilburn, K., Milazzo, A., Peterman, A., & Team, M. S. C. T. E. (2019). Government of Malawi's unconditional cash transfer improves youth mental health. Social Science & Medicine, 225, 108-119. https://doi.org/10.4073/ csr.2013.8

- Baird, S., Ferreira, F. H., Özler, B., & Woolcock, M. (2013). Relative effectiveness of conditional and unconditional cash transfers for schooling outcomes in developing countries: a systematic review. Campbell systematic reviews, 9(1), 1-124. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2019.01.037
- Bappenas. (2009). Laporan Akhir Evaluasi Program Perlindungan Sosial: Program Keluarga Harapan. Jakarta: Bappenas.
- Bauer, A., Garman, E., McDaid, D., Avendano, M., Hessel, P., Díaz, Y., ... & Evans-Lacko, S. (2021). Integrating youth mental health into cash transfer programmes in response to the COVID-19 crisis in low-income and middle-income countries. The Lancet Psychiatry, 8(4), 340-346. https://doi.org/10.1016/S2215-0366(20)30382-5
- Bazzi, S., Sumarto, S., & Suryahadi, A. (2012). Evaluating Indonesia's Unconditional Cash Transfer Program, 2005-6. International Initiative for Impact Evaluation Report.
- Belanawane S., M., Sari, R.P., Purwanto, A.B., Yohana, J., Sabarisman, M., & Sugiyanto. (2020). Kelembagaan Penyediaan Dan Penyaluran Komoditas Bantuan Pangan Non-Tunai (BPNT). Jakarta: Puslibangkesos Kemensos RI.
- Bryan, G., Chowdhury, S., Mobarak, A. M., Morten, M., & Smits, J. (2021). Encouragement and distortionary effects of conditional cash transfers. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/ papers.cfm?abstract\_id=3841907
- Buheji, M., da Costa Cunha, K., Beka, G., Mavric, B., De Souza, Y. L., da Costa Silva, S. S., ... & Yein, T. C. (2020). The extent of covid-19 pandemic socio-economic impact on global poverty. a global integrative multidisciplinary review. American Journal of Economics, 10(4), 213-224. https://doi.org10.5923/j.economics.20201004.02
- Bungin, Burhan. 2012. Analisis Data Penelitian Kualitatif. Raja Grafindo.
- Cahyono, S. A. T. (2018). Konstribusi PKH Terhadap Kesejahteraan Keluarga Penerima Manfaat (KPM). Jurnal penelitian kesejahteraan sosial, 17(4), 401-414. https://doi.org/ 10.31105/jpks.v17i4.1608
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2016). Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches. Sage publications.
- Dartanto, T., Moeis, F. R., Can, C. K., Ratih, S. P., Nurhasana, R., Satrya, A., & Thabrany, H. (2021). Good intentions, unintended outcomes: Impact of social assistance on tobacco consumption in Indonesia. Tobacco induced diseases, 19. https://doi.org/10.18332/ tid/132966
- Fajar, A. (2021). Penerima PKH di Maros Sisa 14 Ribu. [online] available at https:// sulsel.fajar.co.id/2021/03/18/penerima-pkh-di-maros-sisa-14-ribu/ accessed on august 2022
- Fosu, A. K. (2017). Growth, inequality, and poverty reduction in developing countries: Recent global evidence. Research in Economics, 71(2), 306-336. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.rie.2016.05.005

- Hamrun, Harakan, A., Prianto, A., & Khaerah, N. (2020). Strategi Pemerintah Daerah dalam Pengembangan Pelayanan Berbasis E- Government di Kabupaten Muna. Nakhoda: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan, 18(2), 64-78. https://doi.org/10.35967/ jipn.v18i2.7808
- Haris, A., Adys, A. K., & Prianto, A. L. (2014). Pengelolaan Corporate Social Responsibility PT. Lonsum di Kecamatan Ujung Loe Kabupaten Bulukumba. *Otoritas: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 4(1).
- Hastuti, R., & Widyaningsih, D. Y. A. N. (2020). Pelaksanaan PKH dan Program Sembako dalam rangka Mitigasi Dampak COVID-19. *Catatan Penelitian SMERU*, 2, 1-8. [online] available at https://smeru.or.id/sites/default/files/publication/cp02\_covidpkh\_in.pdf accessed on august 2022
- Hastuti, R., & Widyaningsih, D. Y. A. N. (2020). Pelaksanaan PKH dan Program Sembako dalam rangka Mitigasi Dampak COVID-19. *Catatan Penelitian SMERU*, 2, 1-8. [online] available at https://smeru.or.id/sites/default/files/publication/ cp02\_covidpkh\_in.pdf accessed on august 2022
- Hidayah, N. (2022). 25.586 KPM di Maros Bakal Terima BLT BBM, Simak Cara Cek Nama Penerima. [online] available at https://makassar.tribunnews.com/2022/09/05/25586kpm-di-maros-bakal-terima-blt-bbm-simak-cara-cek-nama-penerima accessed on september 2022
- Kanbur, R., & Sumner, A. (2012). Poor countries or poor people? Development assistance and the new geography of global poverty. Journal of International Development, 24(6), 686-695. https://doi.org/10.1002/jid.2861
- Kementerian Sosial. (2013). PKH Program Profile. Jakarta: Kementerian Sosial.
- Khaerah, N., Prianto, A. L., & Harakan, A. (2021). Pendidikan Demokrasi Berbasis Sekolah. Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat Nasyiatul Aisyiyah Sulawesi Selatan (JPMNAS), 1(1), 45-50.
- Laia, K. (2022). Underreported, 10 Negara dalam Darurat Akibat Krisi Iklim. [online] available at https://betahita.id/news/detail/7036/underreported-10-negara-dalamdarurat-akibat-krisis-iklim.html.html accessed on september 2022
- Luhur, A., & Abdillah, A. (2020). Dekolonisasi dan Indegenisasi Ilmu Pemerintahan. GOVERNABILITAS (Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan Semesta), 1(2), 136-159.
- Malik, I., Prianto, A. L., Abdillah, A., Rusnaedy, Z., & Amalia, A. A. (2021). Urban Resilience Strategy in The Climate Change Governance in Makassar City, Indonesia. *Journal of Government and Civil Society*, 5(1), 31-50. http://dx.doi.org/ 10.31000/jgcs.v5i1.3884
- Malik, I., Khaerah, N., Prianto, A. L., & Hamrun, H. (2020). Edukasi politik virtual era demokrasi digital pada sekolah menengah kejuruan. *Masyarakat Berdaya dan Inovasi*, 1(1), 39-47.

- Mappong, S. (2020). Penyaluran BLT di Kabupaten Maros dilakukan bertahap. [online] available at https://makassar.antaranews.com/berita/193456/penyaluran-blt-dikabupaten-maros-dilakukan-bertahap accessed on september 2022
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2018). Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook. Sage publications.
- MoF. (2022). Menkeu: Ancaman Krisis Iklim Dapat Lebih Luas Dari Pandemi Covid-19. [online] available at https://www.kemenkeu.go.id/informasi-publik/publikasi/beritautama/Ancaman-Krisis-Iklim-Dapat-Lebih-Luas-Dari-Pandemi accessed on september 2022
- Muhtar. 2017. Peningkatan Akses Layanan Sosial Keluarga Miskin melalui Sistem Layanandan Rujukan Terpadu. Sosioinforma, edisi 1, 2017.
- Mustafa, M., Nurjaya, M., Rahmawati, R., Tanggareng, T., & Bakti, A. (2022). Alokasi Dana Desa dalam Penanggulangan Dampak Covid-19 di Desa Majannang Kabupaten Maros. SEIKO: Journal of Management & Business, 5(1), 141-150. https://doi.org/ 10.37531/sejaman.v5i1.1900
- Neuman, W.L. 2006. *Social Research Methods, Qualitative & Quantitative Approach*. Sixth Edition. Pearson Education, Inc.
- Palmer, M. (2011). Disability and poverty: A conceptual review. Journal of Disability Policy Studies, 21(4), 210-218. https://doi.org/10.1177/104420731038933
- Pega, F., Pabayo, R., Benny, C., Lee, E. Y., Lhachimi, S. K., & Liu, S. Y. (2022). Unconditional cash transfers for reducing poverty and vulnerabilities: effect on use of health services and health outcomes in low and middle income countries. Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, (3). https://doi.org/10.1002/ 14651858.CD011135.pub3
- Pemerintah Kab. Maros. (2019). Wabup Dorong Pemantapan Program PKH. [online] available at https://maroskab.go.id/2019/06/27/wabup-dorong-pemantapan-program-pkh/ accessed on august 2022
- Pemerintah Kab. Maros. (2020a). Bupati Maros Kembali Terjun Langsung Salurkan BLT Dana Desa. [online] available at https://maroskab.go.id/2020/05/11/bupati-maroskembali-terjun-langsung-salurkan-blt-dana-desa/ accessed on september 2022
- Pemerintah Kab. Maros. (2020b). Antisipasi Inflasi Di Masa Pandemi Covid-19, TPID Adakan High Level Meeting. [online] available at https://maroskab.go.id/2020/09/ 14/antisipasi-inflasi-di-masa-pandemi-covid-19-tpid-adakan-high-level-meeting/ accessed on august 2022
- Pemerintah Kab. Maros. (2021a). Tingkatkan Kapasitas keluarga Penerima Manfaat PKH, Bupati Marosu Buka Kegiatan Workshop. [online] available at https://maroskab.go.id/ 2021/08/20/tingkatkan-kapasitas-keluarga-penerima-manfaat-pkh-bupati-marosbuka-kegiatan-workshop/ accessed on august 2022

- Pemerintah Kab. Maros. (2021b). Laporan Penyelenggaran Pemerintahan Daerah Kabupaten Maros. [online] available at https://ppid.maroskab.go.id/assets/ dokumen/e0aac6f0a7d81de98afae729f4d3de77.pdf accessed on august
- Peraturan Menteri Sosial Republik Indonesia Nomor 25 Tahun 2016 Tentang Bantuan Pengenbangan Sarana Usaha Melalui Elektronik Warung Gotong Royong Kelompok Usaha Bersama Program Keluarga Harapan.
- Peraturan Presiden RI. Nomor 166 Tahun 2014 tentang Program Percepatan Penanggulangan Kemiskinan.
- Postimur. (2022). 25.900 Warga Maros Masuk Penerima BLT, Bupati Pantau Langsung Penyalurannya. [online] available at https://postimur.net/daerah/25900-wargamaros-masuk-penerima-blt-bupati-pantau-langsung-penyalurannya/ accessed on september 2022
- Prianto, A. L., Malik, I., Khaerah, N., Abdillah, A., & Jermsittiparsert, K. (2022). Government, Digital Society and Industry 4.0: Connective Action Against Covid-19 Fake News. In *International Conference on Digital Technologies and Applications* (pp. 480-491). Springer, Cham.
- Prianto, A. L., Malik, I., Rusneady, Z., Khaerah, N., Abdillah, A., Lestari, D., & Angraini, R. (2021). Demokrasi Lokal dan Pemilihan Kepala Daerah Pasangan Calon Tunggal. *Makassar: Subaltern Inti Media*.
- Prianto, A. L., Abdillah, A., Syukri, S., Muhammad, F., & Yama, A. (2021). Combating Infodemic Covid-19: Government Response Against Fake News on Social Media. *Profetik: Jurnal Komunikasi*, 14(2), 255-275.
- Prianto, L. A. (2017). *Dinamika tata pemerintahan daerah dalam formulasi kebijakan tata ruang kota*. Samudra Biru.
- Prianto, A. L. (2013). Model of Advocacy Coalitions in the Formulation of Spatial Plan Policy of Makassar in 2010-2030. *Bisnis & Birokrasi Journal*, 20 (3). pp. 163-170. https:/ /doi.org/10.20476/jbb.v20i3.3205
- Prianto, A. L. (2012). Kepentingan Politik dan Ekonomi Kepala Daerah dalam Reformasi Birokrasi: Kasus Reformasi Pelayanan Perizinan Di1kabupaten Gowa dan Kabupaten Takalar. *Jurnal Borneo Administrator*, 8(3). 361-382
- Rasyid, M. (2022). Can unconditional cash assistance improve household welfare? QUAIDS model for food commodities in Indonesia. Development Studies Research, 9(1), 1-11. https://doi.org/10.1080/21665095.2022.2027258
- Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional 2015-2019. (2014). *Buku I Agenda Pembangunan Nasional.* Jakarta: Kementerian Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional/ Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional.
- Richard. M. Steers. 2005. Efektifitas Organisasi.(Terjemahan). Jakarta: Erlangga.
- Rys, V. (2010). *Merumuskan Ulang Jaminan Sosial, Kembali Ke Prinsip-Prinsip Dasar* (diterj. Dewi Wulansari). Jakarta: PT. Pustaka Alfabet.

- Salaputa, I., Madani, M., & Prianto, A. L. (2013). Peran aktor dalam penyusunan agenda kebijakan pemekaran wilayah kecamatan di Kabupaten Maluku Tengah. *Otoritas: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 3(1).
- Sentanu, I. G. E. P. S., Kumalasari, K., & Prabowo, A. (2021). Collaborative governance model in COVID-19 pandemic mitigation: a temporary unconditional cash transfer program. In E3S Web of Conferences (Vol. 331, p. 01003). EDP Sciences. https:// doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202133101003
- Suharto, Edi. (2009). Kemiskinan dan Perlindungan Sosial di Indonesia, Menggagas Model Jaminan Sosial Universal Bidang Kesehatan. Bandung: CV. Alfabeta.
- Sumarto, M. (2021). Welfare and conflict: Policy failure in the Indonesian cash transfer. Journal of Social Policy, 50(3), 533-551.https://doi.org/10.1017/S0047279420000252
- van Daalen, K. R., Dada, S., James, R., Ashworth, H. C., Khorsand, P., Lim, J., ... & Blanchet, K. (2022). Impact of conditional and unconditional cash transfers on health outcomes and use of health services in humanitarian settings: a mixed-methods systematic review. BMJ global health, 7(1), e007902. http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/ bmjgh-2021-007902
- Wahyuni, D. (2021). Permasalahan Penyaluran Bantuan Sosial dalam Masa Pemberlakuan Pembatasan Kegiatan Masyarakat. Bidang Kesejahteraan Sosial, XII, 13–18. [online] available at https://berkas.dpr.go.id/puslit/files/info\_singkat/Info%20Singkat-XIII-15-I-P3DI-Agustus-2021-218.pdf accessed on september 2022
- Woolf, N. H., & Silver, C. (2017). Qualitative analysis using NVivo: The five-level QDA® method. Routledge.