

PRIVATE CHARITIES, PUBLIC LANDS AND PUBLIC MONEY.

GRANTS OF LAND

AND

GIFTS OF MONEY

TO

Catholic and Non-Catholic Institutions

IN NEW YORK COMPARED:

WHICH CHURCH DOES THE STATE AND CITY SUPPORT?

NEW YORK :
THE CATHOLIC PUBLICATION SOCIETY CO.,

9 Barclay Street.

1880.

Catholic School Books for Catholic Schools.

The Catholic Publication Society Co.'s

SERIES OF

Illustrated School Books.

EDITED BY

RIGHT REV. J. L. SPALDING, D.D.,


BISHOP OF PEORIA.

THE YOUNG CATHOLIC'S SERIES OF READERS is thoroughly Catholic in all its lessons.

It is the best graded set of Catholic Readers now published.

The lessons are not made up of mere selections; many of the Historical and Biographical Sketches being written expressly for this Series.

The books are printed on the best quality of paper, and bound in the most substantial manner.

 These books are adopted by Catholic School Boards of the Dioceses of Cincinnati, Vincennes, and Pittsburgh, as the only books to be used in those Dioceses.

READERS.

THE FOLLOWING BOOKS ARE NOW READY :

<i>The Young Catholic's Illus. Primer,</i>	..	\$0 20
<i>The Young Catholic's Illus. First Reader,</i>		25
<i>The Young Catholic's Ill. Second Reader,</i>		40
<i>The Young Catholic's Ill. Third Reader,</i>		60
<i>The Young Catholic's Ill. Fourth Reader,</i>		75
<i>The Young Catholic's Ill. Fifth Reader,</i>	..	1 25
<i>The Young Catholic's Ill. Sixth Reader,</i>		1 50
<i>Illustrated Young Ladies' Reader,</i>	..	1 25
<i>Recueil de Lectures a l' Usage des Ecoles,</i>		1 00

[CONTINUED ON THIRD PAGE OF COVER.]

PRIVATE CHARITIES, PUBLIC LANDS AND PUBLIC MONEY.

GRANTS OF LAND

AND

GIFTS OF MONEY

TO

Catholic and Non-Catholic Institutions

IN NEW YORK COMPARED:

WHICH CHURCH DOES THE STATE AND CITY SUPPORT?

NEW YORK:
THE CATHOLIC PUBLICATION SOCIETY CO.,
9 Barclay Street.

1880.



Copyright, 1879,

THE CATHOLIC PUBLICATION SOCIETY CO.

PRIVATE CHARITIES AND PUBLIC LANDS.

I.

THE difficulty which honest people sometimes find in stating the exact truth on a subject which excites their prejudices has been illustrated in a most remarkable manner by a recent correspondence in the *Atlantic Monthly*. We may well pause and consider the historic value of "contemporary records" when we find a gentleman for whose character we have a high respect, and in whose good faith we have entire confidence, writing a wholly mistaken account of important public transactions occurring in his own city during his own time, and, when his errors are pointed out, excusing them by the perpetration of other inaccuracies hardly less serious than the original blunder. If all this may be done with good intentions by an honest contemporary observer, how may not history be daily falsified by people who write without opportunity of knowing the truth or without the desire to tell it?

Mr. Clarence Cook contributed to the February number of the *Atlantic Monthly* a criticism upon the new cathedral in this city, and in order to give more force to his strictures he represented the whole work as a monument of fraud, chicanery, political immorality, and outrageous taxation of the poor. He asserted that the wages of servants are extravagantly high because "the receivers of these wages are obliged to pay the greater part

of what they get to the support of their church, and are regularly taxed besides for the building of their cathedral." But even this plundering of the poor was not enough; and Archbishop Hughes (whose respected memory Mr. Cook assailed with extreme bitterness) supplied the deficiency with "the money of Protestants and non-Catholics." "Of course," said the critic, "it was a subject of no little wonder where the money was to come from, not only to build the church itself but to buy the land, which under ordinary circumstances would have cost no small part of the whole sum. How this latter feat was accomplished we all know now, and New-Yorkers are disposed to say as little about it as possible. *The city was jockeyed out of the finest site on the island by a crafty and unscrupulous priest playing upon the political hopes and fears of as base a lot of men as ever got the government of a great city into their power.* For the consideration of one dollar the Archbishop of New York became possessor of the deed for the whole square bounded west and east by Fifth Avenue and Madison Avenue, and south and north by Fiftieth Street and Fifty-first Street, a plot of ground 420 feet on the cross streets and 200 feet on the avenues, situated in the heart of the most fashionable part of the city, and on one of the highest points of the whole island." This

would appear from the context to have occurred in 1858; Mr. Cook no doubt supposed that it did occur at that date. He added, however, that the Protestants would have generously pardoned the robbery if the Catholics had built a better church: "We were willing even to wink at the scurvy trick by which the land belonging to all the citizens was given in fee to a minority for their own private use. 'Let them have it,' we said; 'there is no other body of our citizens who can command money enough to build such a splendid structure as the Catholics can.'"

When we say that every one of the statements we have quoted from the article in the *Atlantic* is untrue, we wish it to be distinctly understood once more that we do not impugn Mr. Cook's good faith. We know that he believed what he wrote. The story about the cathedral land is an old no-popery invention which, although it has been exposed a hundred times, is continually renewed; and since there is nothing so hard to extirpate as a striking lie, it is quite conceivable that a gentleman who may be no very industrious reader of the newspapers should have missed the numerous contradictions by which the false statement has been regularly followed. He heard the story once upon a time; he assumed that it was correct; and he made no further inquiries. Yet while he thus acquits himself of intentional wrong, he remains open to the charge of a recklessness which is but too common in the controversies of our time.

The charge that a church, or an archbishop, or a body of priests "jockeyed" a community by crafty and unscrupulous arts out of a valuable piece of property is too

serious to be made on the strength of vague rumor. And that it was made upon nothing better is quite clear. The slightest investigation would have shown that the story had no basis—none, at least, in any transaction of a doubtful or discreditable character. The records of all transfers of land are open to public inspection. The conditions of all sales, leases, or grants by the city may be examined by anybody who will take the trouble to go to the City Hall and ask for the book in which they are entered. To do this would have been only an ordinary precaution. But Mr. Cook, no doubt unconsciously, fell into the common error of supposing that headlong denunciation of Catholic priests was entirely safe. How carelessly he treated the important charge is illustrated, moreover, by the dramatic incidents which he adduces in connection with it. He says that it was a matter of no little wonder in 1858 where the money was to come from to buy the land; that can hardly be, because the cathedral and St. Peter's Church had bought the land together nearly thirty years before that date; the cathedral had purchased St. Peter's share at public auction in 1852; and the notorious fact that this property was held by the Catholics for church purposes was kept constantly before the eyes of citizens by the Orphan Asylum standing on the north side of the property, and the church of St. John the Evangelist on the east side. Mr. Cook may have wondered where the money was to come from; but to the community at large it was well known that the trustees of the cathedral had been in possession of the land for a long while. So, too, Mr. Cook unintentionally draws upon his im-

agination when he adds that the Protestants were willing to wink at a trick which never was played, and that they said, "Let the Catholics have this land, provided they put a fine building on it." The Protestants could not have said anything of the kind, because we had bought the land at auction and paid the full price for it, and there was no reason why they should make the matter their business. The public authorities had nothing whatever to do with the affair. The lots anciently formed part of the common lands of the city, but the city sold them to private persons before the close of the last century, and they had passed through several hands when they came into possession of the Catholics by purchase, at what was then probably the fair price of \$5,500, in 1829. When they were put up at auction again in 1852 the cathedral bought out the half-interest of St. Peter's for \$59,500.

Mr. Cook's mistakes were corrected in a private note addressed to him by Mr. John R. G. Hassard, and Mr. Cook, with a frankness which does him credit, caused this note to be printed in the next number of the *Atlantic*, along with an expression of his regret for having been the means of disseminating a fiction. Here, it would seem, the affair ought to have stopped. What fatality drove Mr. Cook farther? In the desire to excuse his first error he rushed headlong into another, less venial since it was made after such ample warning. Accepting, like a man of honor, the correction of his statement about the cathedral, he nevertheless added that the blunder was a natural and, we suppose he meant to imply, a wholly immaterial one, because if the Catholics did not

"jockey" the city out of that particular block of land they did jockey it out of the next block, now occupied by the Orphan Asylum. "The taxpayers of New York knew," said he, "that they had been tricked out of a large and valuable tract of land, and they are not to be too hardly judged for having mistaken one block of land for another immediately adjacent, and not at that time separated from it by any actually existing street." To this the reply might be made that the two tracts were distinguishable by something much more conspicuous than a roadway between them, because when the cathedral was begun the Orphan Asylum grant had long been occupied by the Orphan Asylum buildings. This matter, however, is of no consequence. We are concerned now in knowing, not how the error originated, but by what evil spirit of sectarian hostility it is so persistently kept alive.

Mr. Cook's next sentences are as follows:

"From a point of view outside of any sect or party I cannot see any defence or excuse for the transaction I have described. The men who were at the head of the city government at the time had no right to give away or to lease in perpetuity for the benefit of any body of men, secular or religious, lands that belonged to the whole people. Nor could the bargain have been proposed and consummated except by crafty and unscrupulous men. That was a dark day for our city politics, and I am much mistaken in your character if you do not agree with me that it was a time in the history of the Catholic Church in this city which its best friends must prefer not to have dragged into the light."

The critic adheres, then, to the substance of his original charges. The piece of land involved in the case is not the one he supposed, but an adjoining piece of the

same size and value. Otherwise he holds the accusations to be true. A crafty and unscrupulous priest obtained the land from the city by trick—"jockeyed the city out of the finest site on the island." The wicked priest accomplished this feat by playing upon the political hopes and fears of the Common Council. The municipal authorities at that time (1846) were as base a lot of men as ever got the government of a great city into their power. The transaction can neither be defended nor excused. It was a bargain which could not have been proposed and consummated except by crafty and unscrupulous men. *The city government has no right to give away or to lease in perpetuity for the benefit of any body of men, secular or religious, lands that belong to the whole people.* In this sentence which we have placed in italics lies the essence of Mr. Cook's accusations. Upon this principle alone, propounded with as much assurance as if it were a rule in arithmetic, are based his indictment of the Catholic Church and clergy, of Bishop Hughes, and of the city government of 1846. No reason is assigned for calling one party base and the other crafty and unscrupulous, except that they combined to violate this principle.

The proposition is not stated with perfect clearness, because there is no pretence that the lands were given away or leased "for the benefit of any body of men," and Mr. Cook knew, as he shows in the context, that the donation was made for the benefit of the Orphan Asylum, the conditions as to the use of the land being stated in the deed and lease. Undoubtedly the critic meant to lay down the general rule that the city has no right

to apply the public property to the endowment of any charitable institution controlled by a private corporation or society. If that was not his meaning we can discover no meaning at all in the sentence we have quoted. He raises no objection to the amount of the endowment. He does not complain that the Catholics received more than the Protestants. He does not denounce the grant for the reason that the institution benefited was what he perhaps calls "sectarian"; but he sets forth the broad general principle that the city has no right to endow any charitable foundations whatever.

If he does hold that opinion he has the distinction of holding it almost entirely alone. Neither in this city, nor in any other Christian community that we know of, has it ever been accepted. For the honor of human nature, for the cause of civilization, we trust that it may never be accepted. Donations of land and money to charitable societies have always been made, with great liberality, by our national, State, and municipal governments, with the cordial approval of all classes of citizens. All denominations have shared in them. Transactions such as Mr. Cook denounces begin in the early days of our history and reach down to the present time. Appropriations from the public treasury or the public lands, which he thinks could only be obtained by fraud, have been made habitually in New York, in Albany, in Washington, in probably every State capital and every large city, to Catholic, to Protestant, to Jew, to infidel, and have been regarded by all classes as the best evidences of the enlightenment and humanity of the American people. Manhattan Island contains about

one hundred and fifty asylums, hospitals, refuges, and similar establishments for the succor of the unfortunate; nearly all of them have been aided from the public funds; a majority, we suppose, derive a considerable part of their revenues from State or city appropriations; and many of them have obtained grants of land from the Common Council by "transactions" precisely like that which we have seen stigmatized as a scurvy trick. It seems strange that a New-Yorker should be ignorant of the existence of this long-established and approved system of distributing municipal and State aid among the sick and poor; but we must infer from Mr. Cook's letter that he imagined the concession to the Roman Catholic Orphan Asylum to be something extraordinary, if not unprecedented.

His error is the more remarkable because the steps which he took to ascertain the particulars of the grant for the benefit of the Orphan Asylum ought to have led him to the discovery that such grants are customary, and that their propriety has always been recognized. The same books in the comptroller's office from which the deed and leases of the Orphan Asylum property were copied for his use contain numerous other deeds and leases to institutions of the same class, and for one grant to a Catholic institution there are five grants to Protestant or non-Catholic institutions. Were they all obtained by chicanery and fraud? Are they all without defence or excuse? Were all the Common Councilmen who voted for these concessions, and all the mayors who approved them, "as base a lot of men as ever got the government of a great city into their power"? Was every day on which

such a grant was made a dark day in our city politics? Are there times in the history of every religious denomination in this city which its best friends must prefer not to have dragged into the light?

We have caused a careful search to be made in the comptroller's office, and memoranda to be taken of *all* grants and leases of land executed by the city to institutions of charity under the management of churches, religious orders, or other societies and private corporations, "secular or religious." The municipal charities, such as the almshouse, Bellevue Hospital, etc., are of course not included; neither are the schools and colleges, none of these institutions coming within the scope of Mr. Cook's remarks; but we have endeavored to include everything else. If any grant has been overlooked the omission is accidental, and we shall be grateful for an opportunity to correct it. Before we proceed there are a few points which the reader is requested to fix in his mind:

I. If it appear that the propriety of public grants to private charities (that is to say, charities not managed by State or municipal officers) has been generally admitted both in theory and practice, and that such grants are an ordinary incident of our city administration, then the charge of Mr. Cook, that the grant to the Orphan Asylum was a scurvy trick which could not have been played upon the people except by crafty and unscrupulous men, falls to the ground.

II. There is no question at present of the justice or policy of public aid to *denominational* charities. Mr. Cook's statement is clear and broad that a donation of public land to any body of men, "secular

or religious," is a fraud upon the taxpayers.

III. There is no question as to the comparative value of the gifts to Catholics and to Protestants. The objection is made on principle to any gift at all, either to Catholic, to Protestant, to Jew, or to infidel. Nevertheless it will be seen that the grants to Catholics are far below what we should be entitled to under any pro-rata distribution.

DEEDS AND LEASES OF LAND TO CATHOLIC INSTITUTIONS.

I. *The Roman Catholic Orphan Asylum.*—The grants to the Orphan Asylum, conducted by the Sisters of Charity, were made in 1846. The institution had then been in existence nearly thirty years, and the buildings in Prince Street contained about 270 children, who were supported entirely by private contributions. The accommodations being inadequate to the demands upon the society, a petition for the appropriation of land for a new asylum was presented to the Common Council in December, 1845, but it was not acted upon until the following July, when the Finance Committee of the Board of Aldermen presented a report in which occurs the following passage :

"It has been questioned by some as to the right of the corporation to make similar grants of land, as in the case of the Colored Orphan Asylum and the Colored Home, but your committee believe it to be perfectly legitimate for the city authorities to dispense charity to the helpless and the destitute in any manner which may best comport with the public interest; and they consider the object much more economically and satisfactorily obtained by assisting the efforts of humane associations, by the granting of a piece of land upon which to erect the necessary asylum building, than to

maintain the recipients of their bounty in the almshouse."

The committee consequently recommended the grant, and their report was adopted. It does not appear from the official record of the proceedings of the Common Council whether there was any opposition to the resolution offered by the committee, but it was promptly adopted at any rate both by the aldermen and the assistants. The submission of the favorable report was announced (somewhat conspicuously) in the *New York Tribune* of the next morning. No comment was made upon it in that journal at the time, nor does an examination of the newspaper files show any trace of a discussion of the matter outside of the Common Council. Of course there may have been such debate; but we chance not to have discovered any indication of the great "stir" of which Mr. Cook speaks. In accordance, then, with the resolution of the Common Council, a deed, dated August 1, 1846, conveyed to the Orphan Asylum Association the land now bounded by Fifth and Madison Avenues and Fifty-first and Fifty-second Streets (34 lots), for the consideration of one dollar, and on the condition that within three years the managers should erect a suitable asylum. A lease was executed on the same day, transferring to the same society the block between Madison and Fourth Avenues and Fifty-first and Fifty-second Streets (30 lots), at the rent of one dollar a year, during the pleasure of the Common Council. In 1857 a new lease was granted of the same premises, so long as they should be occupied for the purposes of an orphan asylum.

On the land thus acquired the Ca-

tholics erected extensive buildings, and on January 1, 1877, the number of children maintained by their society was 1,345. The support of these waifs would have fallen upon the city, if they had not been cared for by a private corporation. The revenue for the previous year was about \$100,000, of which sum \$28,600 was drawn from the public treasury under general laws making per-capita allowances to all such institutions, and the rest, except a few miscellaneous items, consisted of the voluntary offerings of the Catholic people and about \$15,000 in legacies. The expenditures, including payment of debts and permanent improvements, were somewhat in excess of the income. The society maintains four establishments—namely, the old one in Prince Street, two asylums (male and female) on the city grant, and a farm at Peekskill. The aggregate cost of administration in 1877 was, for salaries of officers only \$3,045; wages of servants and laborers, \$5,660, about half of which was on the farm; and maintenance of the Sisters of Charity and Brothers of the Christian Schools employed in the care of the asylums, \$6,300. The religious give their services gratuitously. In point of economy and efficiency the administration is admitted to be a model.

The charge that the city government which made the grant to this institution was composed of a particularly base set of men we confess that we do not understand. The Common Council of 1846 has not left in the annals of our city, so far as we have learned, a bad reputation, or, indeed, a reputation of any kind. The list of aldermen and assistant aldermen contains very few names that are now remembered. One of the assistant

aldermen was Mr. Thomas McElrath, for many years Mr. Greeley's partner in the publication of the *Tribune*. One of the aldermen was Mr. William V. Brady, whom the *Tribune* earnestly supported for mayor the next year. One of the signers of the report of the Finance Committee recommending the grant to the Orphan Asylum was Alderman Egbert Benson, whom Mr. Greeley urged for re-election a few months later as a reward for his eminent faithfulness. The mayor was Andrew H. Mickle.

2. *St. Joseph's Industrial Home*.—This institution, under the charge of the Sisters of Mercy, was founded for the protection and support of destitute girls between the ages of eleven and eighteen, who are received free of expense and taught remunerative trades. In 1878 it had between 500 and 600 inmates. The land which it occupies, an irregular block, 200 feet on Madison Avenue, 255 feet on Eighty-first Street, and 205 feet on Eighty-second Street (about eighteen city lots), was leased from the corporation February 3, 1866, for the term of ninety-nine years, at the yearly rent of one dollar.

3. *New York Foundling Asylum*.—This establishment, one of the best of its class in the world, and one of the noblest in the metropolis, is under the charge of the Sisters of Charity. It supports about 2,000 infants, and how much crime, suffering, and mortality are prevented by its beneficent and extensive operations the mind can hardly even conjecture. It is needless to say that the poor little creatures committed to its charge have the strongest possible claims upon the compassion of the public, and that they could not be cared for except by a voluntary association of be-

nevolent women. The land now occupied by the asylum was obtained from the city December 15, 1870, on a lease for ninety-nine years, at the yearly rent of one dollar. The grant covers about thirty-four lots, being the block between Lexington and Third Avenues and Sixty-eighth and Sixty-ninth Streets.

These are the only grants or leases of land from the city to Catholic institutions of which we find any record, except that, in order to rectify the street lines, an exchange of small gores was made between the city and the trustees of the new cathedral in 1852. The question of appropriations of money has not been raised in this controversy, but we shall consider it later. We come now to the concessions of land to Protestant and other non-Catholic institutions:

DEEDS AND LEASES OF LAND TO PROTESTANT AND OTHER INSTI- TUTIONS.

1. *The Colored Orphan Asylum.*—On December 29, 1842, the city sold to the Association for the Benefit of Colored Orphans, for one dollar, a piece of land 200 feet on the west side of Fifth Avenue, and 250 feet on Forty-third and Forty-fourth Streets (20 lots), which was a much more liberal appropriation, considering the number of orphans to be relieved, than the concession to the Catholic asylum. The trustees were required to erect a suitable building within three years, and to provide for twelve colored pauper children committed to their care by the public authorities. After the destruction of the asylum during the draft riots the society sold this land, and with the proceeds purchased a new site on One Hundred and Forty-third Street.

Like other institutions of the same class, the Colored Orphan Asylum receives per-capita allowances from the city and State. The religion taught the children is Protestant, although no particular denomination is recognized to the exclusion of others. The number of orphans in the asylum on December 1, 1878, was 307.

2. *Protestant Episcopal Orphan Asylum.*—This institution is strictly denominational; the religious services and instructions are those of the Protestant Episcopal Church, and all persons to whom children are bound out from the asylum must be Episcopalians. The land which it occupies, 100 feet on Lexington Avenue and 305 feet on Forty-ninth Street (about 12 lots), was leased from the city April 26, 1861, for twenty years, at a yearly rent of one dollar. The asylum is not a large one, being intended only for a small class of the poor. Under the circumstances, it is interesting to note that *The Churchman*, Protestant Episcopal journal of this city, "agrees with Mr. Cook that the less said about the leasing of the thirty-six lots by the city government to the Roman Catholic Orphan Asylum Society, the better for the Roman Catholics and the city government."

3. *Hebrew Orphan Asylum.*—The Hebrew Benevolent Society of New York manages an Orphan Asylum, and also a general charitable fund, the two branches of the benevolent enterprise being kept separate. As the title of the association implies, its object is to relieve the suffering and destitute of the Hebrew race; the trustees are required to be Israelites; and the children in the asylum are instructed in the Jewish faith, none but Jewish children being admitted. Of

course the number of inmates is not large. On October 29, 1860, the city conveyed to the society, in fee simple, for the consideration of one dollar, a parcel of ground consisting of about twelve lots, extending 300 feet on Seventy-seventh Street and 102 feet on the west side of Third Avenue; and on the 17th of October, 1864, a second deed, for the same consideration, added to the grant the five adjoining lots on Seventy-seventh Street. The land is now occupied by the Hebrew Orphan Asylum.

4. *Baptist Ladies' Home*.—The Ladies' Home Society of the Baptist churches in the city of New York manages an institution commonly known as the Baptist Home. Its object is "to provide the aged, infirm, or destitute members of the Baptist churches with a comfortable residence, with board, clothing, skilful medical attendance, with their accustomed religious services, and at their death with respectable burial." It is not an almshouse, for an entrance fee of \$100 is required. At the date of the last published report (1878) the number of inmates was ninety-one. This institution received from the city, November 28, 1870, a lease for ninety-nine years, at the yearly rent of one dollar, of the land which it now occupies, comprising ten lots, between Lexington and Fourth Avenues, running through from Sixty-seventh to Sixty-eighth Street, with a width of 125 feet and a depth of 200 feet.

5. *The Chapin Home* is an institution for the aged and infirm under the control of the Universalists, only members of that denomination being eligible as trustees. Its objects are like those of the Baptist Home, and it demands an admission fee of \$300. In 1878

the number of inmates was forty-four. The asylum obtained from the city, March 29, 1871, a lease for ninety-nine years, at the yearly rent of one dollar, of the premises extending from Sixty-sixth to Sixty-seventh Street between Lexington and Third Avenues, with a width of 170 feet and a depth of 200 feet, being nearly fourteen lots. We have no fault to find either with the plan or administration of the Baptist and Chapin Homes, or with the liberality of the corporation towards them; but we do not believe it would be easy to select more striking examples of what Mr. Cook calls the giving away of the lands of the whole people for the benefit of a small minority than these grants of valuable property, made not to save the destitute from starvation, but to enable forty or ninety members of a particular church to obtain a great deal of comfort for a very small price.

6. *Society for the Reformation of Juvenile Delinquents*.—The House of Refuge on Randall's Island is supposed by many to be a municipal institution. This is a mistake. It is under the full control of a private corporation, although it was founded at the public cost and is supported from the public funds. Juvenile vagrants and criminals are committed to it by the courts. It is entirely Protestant in its religious instruction and forms of worship; it has a Protestant chaplain; Catholic priests are not allowed to visit the children unless they are asked for in case of sickness. Yet that a large proportion of the inmates are Catholics may be gathered from the fact that out of 948 boys and girls in the institution at the beginning of last year, 317 were of Irish parentage. There were also 111 of German parentage, and

many of these, too, were doubtless Catholics. Formerly magistrates were required by the statute to send Catholic children to the Catholic Protectory, but this law has been repealed. More than half the children are committed not for crime but for truancy, vagrancy, and disorderly conduct; so that in point of fact the society obtains a large number of innocent Catholic children, picked up in the streets by the police, and keeps them under lock and key until it has forcibly made them Protestants. The last annual report shows that the expenditures for 1878 amounted to \$136,754, including about \$14,500 for permanent improvements and \$5,000 in payment of a loan. Salaries and wages cost \$37,454, or about one-third of the running expenses; and the cost of maintenance of the children, after allowing for their earnings (\$31,000), was \$85 87 per capita per annum. The revenues (earnings, etc., excepted) were wholly from the public treasury: \$68,500 from the State comptroller, \$11,843 from the Board of Education, \$22,457 from theatre licenses. In 1824 the society obtained from the city a grant of a triangular plot of land on Madison Square. This, together with an adjoining piece of property purchased from the United States, they afterwards transferred to the city in exchange for premises on Twenty-third Street and First Avenue. A further grant of adjoining lots was made in 1854, and the society then had the whole block, 197 by 613 feet, between Twenty-third and Twenty-fourth Streets and Avenue A and First Avenue. On November 10, 1851, the city conveyed to the society thirty-six acres on Randall's Island, and the buildings which it now occupies there were erected partly

with the proceeds of the sale of the Twenty-third Street property, partly by fresh appropriations from the State. We shall have occasion to examine hereafter the enormous grants of money to this cruelly sectarian institution. The Catholic Protectory, which does for Catholic children what the House of Refuge does for those of Protestant parentage, has never received any grant or lease of land from the city or the State.

7. *Nursery and Child's Hospital.*—This institution, founded (under another name) in 1854, has three departments. It comprises, 1, an asylum for children who from any cause are deprived of the care of a mother; 2, a hospital for sick children; 3, a lying-in asylum and a foundling hospital for illegitimate children. Last year the society received \$102,000 from the city government. The city granted the land which the asylum occupies, consisting of about fifteen lots, between Fiftieth and Fifty-first Streets and Lexington and Third Avenues. The concession was in the form of two leases made at different times (August 1, 1857, and February 16, 1866), at the yearly rent of one dollar, to hold as long as the property is used for the purposes of the asylum. The State contributed liberally towards the cost of the buildings.

8. *St. Philip's Church.*—This is a Protestant Episcopal Church for colored persons. In 1827 the city conveyed to it for one dollar a plot of land in First Street, 50 by 200 feet (four lots), to be used as a burying-ground.

9. *Church of the Redeemer.*—The city granted permission to the Protestant Episcopal Church of the Redeemer, Yorkville, December 31, 1864, to occupy a plot of land ex-

tending 204 feet on Fourth Avenue, 200 feet on Eighty-first Street, and 100 feet on Eighty-second Street during the pleasure of the Common Council.

10. *St. Luke's Hospital*.—Two-thirds of the land now occupied by this fine institution was originally a grant from the city, though not to this particular establishment. May 10, 1848, the city conveyed to the Protestant Episcopal Church of St. George the Martyr a plot 200 feet in extent on the west side of Fifth Avenue, and 300 feet on Fifty-fourth and Fifty-fifth Streets (24 lots), for the consideration of one dollar, and on condition that the rector should build a hospital and chapel for British emigrants, and that Trinity Church should, moreover, surrender all its claim to certain land in the lower part of the city—land of which, if we are not mistaken, the title was in dispute. The value of the grant depends, of course, upon the value of the claim thus surrendered as a partial equivalent, and as we are not familiar with all the facts we state the transaction under reserve, giving merely what appears upon the record, and drawing no conclusions. Subsequently (November 20, 1851) the Common Council authorized a transfer of the Fifth Avenue land to the managers of St. Luke's Hospital, on condition that they should comply with the covenants of the original grant. The institution is denominational in its government and character. It was established "for the purpose of affording medical and surgical aid and nursing to sick or disabled persons, and also to provide them, while inmates of the hospital, with the ministrations of the Gospel agreeably to the doctrines and forms of the Protestant Episcopal

Church. A further object of the society is the instructing and training of suitable persons in the art of nursing and attending upon the sick." A sisterhood is connected with the hospital. Service is held daily in the wards. Although the hospital opens its doors freely to accident cases requiring immediate attention, patients are not usually admitted except upon payment. But however freely it might extend its charity to the suffering, it would still, according to Mr. Cook's principle, be inexcusable for the city to help it.

11. *Mount Sinai Hospital*.—Founded especially for the benefit of the Jews, and governed by men of that race and creed, this institution admits patients of whatever belief, and, we believe, allows them all to receive the visits of clergymen of their choice; but naturally the inmates are nearly all Hebrews. It received from the city, May 31, 1871, on a lease for ninety-nine years at the yearly rent of one dollar, the ground which it now occupies, 200 feet on Lexington Avenue and 170 feet on Sixty-sixth and Sixty-seventh Streets—that is to say, about fourteen lots.

12. *German Hospital*.—The German Hospital and Dispensary occupies the block between Lexington and Fourth Avenues and Seventy-sixth and Seventy-seventh Streets. It purchased a part of the land from a private owner, and obtained the rest (eighteen lots) from the city February 9, 1866, on a lease for fifty years, at the yearly rent of one dollar.

13. *Hahnemann Hospital*.—This homœopathic institution, occupying 200 feet on Fourth Avenue and 125 feet on Sixty-seventh and Sixty-eighth Streets (ten lots), obtained a lease of its land from the city,

January 10, 1871, for ninety-nine years, at a yearly rent of one dollar. This would certainly seem to be a case in which "the land belonging to all the citizens was given to a minority for their own private use"; but we are not prepared to believe that the felonious deed was accomplished by "a scurvy trick."

14. *New York State Woman's Hospital.*—This is not only an institution for the benefit of a small minority, but it is intended for the treatment of a certain class of diseases only. A considerable proportion of the patients pay board, but there is a fixed number of free beds. The sick are allowed to call for the services of any clergyman they desire, but only "in extreme cases." January 10, 1859, the institution obtained from the city, for one dollar, the whole block between Fourth and Lexington Avenues and Forty-ninth and Fiftieth Streets (32 lots), on condition that twenty-four free beds should be provided for poor persons residing in New York City.

15. *Deaf and Dumb Institution.*—Although the New York Institution for the Instruction of the Deaf and Dumb is supported chiefly at the cost of the State, it is, like all the other institutions we have mentioned, a truly private charity in its management. In its religious character it is distinctly Protestant, and the pupils attend Protestant service every day. In September, 1827, the city conveyed to the institution for one dollar a tract of land between Fourth and Fifth Avenues extending from Forty-ninth to Fiftieth Street, and 207 feet wide on each street (eight lots). In 1850 the city sold to the institution all the remaining land between Fourth and Fifth Avenues and Forty-ninth and Fiftieth Streets (25 lots) for \$28,000, a price which

made the transaction virtually a gift. The establishment was afterwards removed to Washington Heights, and the old buildings are now occupied by Columbia College.

16.—*The Association for the Improved Instruction of Deaf Mutes* obtained from the city, August 1, 1870, a lease for ninety-nine years, at the yearly rent of one dollar, of a block of land extending 200 feet on the west side of Lexington Avenue, and 155 feet on Sixty-seventh and Sixty-eighth Streets, or about twelve lots.

Here, then, we have a total of nineteen charitable institutions and churches to which the city has made grants of land under exactly or substantially the same conditions that accompanied the grant to the Orphan Asylum of the Sisters of Charity. Only three of these institutions are Catholic. The other sixteen, with only one or two unimportant exceptions, are distinctly Protestant or Jewish. We have laid no great stress upon the religious influences of these sixteen establishments, because the question now is not whether the public authorities have distributed their beneficence impartially between the two great religious bodies, nor is it whether the city has a right to aid "sectarian charities"; it is whether there is justification, precedent, established and approved custom, for the donation of public lands to benevolent institutions, or whether, as we have been angrily assured, the endowment of an orphan asylum with lands belonging to the taxpayers was an inexcusable outrage, a scurvy trick, an infamous bargain, which could only have been proposed and consummated by a crafty and unscrupulous

priest on one side and a base Common Council on the other. The high grounds within a radius of a mile and a half of the Catholic Orphan Asylum are covered with magnificent hospitals, homes, refuges, etc., etc., for the relief of almost every sort of misery. That region of the island might almost be called a colony of charity. We have seen that the city has given the land for a large proportion of the most important of these institutions. We shall see hereafter that the donations in money have been still more generous than the donations in land. Without such aid from the city and State not a tithe of these foundations could exist. To some people—we hope they are not many—it may seem that this expenditure of a part of the funds of the whole people for the relief of the suffering and destitute is a crime. To us it appears to be one of the glories of the metropolis.

With respect to the comparative values of the donations to Catholic and Protestant charities, although the matter is not pertinent to the present discussion, it may be worth while to remind the reader that the Orphan Asylum grant—which was the most considerable made to us—is surpassed by many others. At the date of the deed and lease (1846) a block of ground on Fiftieth Street was not worth an extravagant sum, probably not so much as the grant to the Hebrew Orphan Asylum was worth when it was made fifteen and eighteen years later. And it would be the height of absurdity to reckon such grants as additions to the wealth of the church which holds them. How a piece of land which can never yield any revenue, but, on the contrary, must always make necessary a heavy annual outlay, can be called

an addition to one's wealth we are at a loss to understand.

Some of the institutions which we have classed as Protestant profess to be unsectarian. Probably there are only one or two—and those hospitals for adults—which are entitled to make such a claim. In all hospitals, if there is no religious influence or ministration there ought to be, and it is monstrous that the sick should be left to die without the attendance of a clergyman unless they ask for one. In most of the hospitals we have enumerated the duty of attending to the soul is at least recognized. Asylums for the care of children can never in any case be unsectarian. If religion is banished from them altogether, they become nurseries of atheism and the most cruel of inventions for the ruin of the little ones. If religion is taught at all, it must be some particular kind of religion, for there is no delusion so empty as that which hugs the idea of abstract religion without any concrete belief.

The question of State aid to religious charities was argued in the Constitutional Convention of this State in 1868. Among those who came forward most conspicuously in that body to rebuke the narrow sectarian spirit which remonstrated against "sectarian charities" and which clamored at the benefactions to Catholic asylums, was no less bitter a Protestant than Mr. Erasmus Brooks, then editor of the *Evening Express*. "Let me address a few words," said he, "to those who would refuse appropriations to men, women, and children of the Roman Catholic faith. Those who know my antecedents will not accuse me of any undue partiality for the adherents of this church. I would give them no advantage

over others, and I would do them no wrong by discriminations against them, and least of all in dispensing charity would I inquire the religious faith of any who need assistance. . . . While discarding state and church as combinations, we must remember that *there can be no true charity where all religion is excluded*, since a pure charity is the very essence of practical Christianity. To say that the state has nothing to do with religion makes it atheistical; and that education and charity form no part of its duties, makes it barbarian."

PRIVATE CHARITIES AND PUBLIC MONEY.

II.

In the preceding paper we examined the record of grants and leases of land by the city authorities of New York for the benefit of charitable institutions, and we saw that it has long been the settled policy of our public authorities to make liberal donations in aid of the humane enterprises of benevolent persons, whether under the control of religious societies or of purely secular associations. We saw, moreover, that, contrary to the belief of a great many Protestants, the grants and leases to Catholic charities have been far below our fair proportion both in number and value. Out of nineteen institutions which have received portions of the city land, only three are Catholic; and of the other sixteen all, except, perhaps, two, are more or less distinctly "sectarian," while several are connected with particular religious denominations. We have now something to say about grants of *money* to charitable institutions, and in this branch of the subject we shall consider the benefactions of the State as well as the city. To the best of our belief there have been no grants of land by the State to any charity within the metropolis.

The general question of the justice and policy of voting money from the public treasury to charitable institutions managed by private corporations or individuals was discussed in the New York Constitutional Convention of 1867-8, and the principle for which we Catholics contend was sustained there with great ability by gentlemen

who are known as uncompromising Protestants. When the Convention assembled in the summer of 1867 an anonymous document, headed *Shall the State support the Churches?* was laid on the desks of the members. It was circulated, evidently by preconcert, all over the State. It asserted that the money of the taxpayers was used to build up the Roman Catholic Church. It represented that the Legislature of 1866 had appropriated \$129,025 for sectarian purposes, of which amount the Catholics obtained no less than \$124,174! As a natural consequence petitions were addressed to the Convention from various quarters, asking for a constitutional prohibition of all "sectarian appropriations." The dishonesty of this sensational document was promptly exposed by Mr. Ellis H. Roberts, editor of the *Utica Herald*, and a member of the Committee of Ways and Means in the Legislature of 1866. It was also taken up in the Convention. "I do not hesitate to say," remarked Mr. Cassidy, editor of the *Albany Atlas and Argus*, "that it is false from beginning to end. It has all the characteristics of a forgery. It has been exposed as a deliberate and well-contrived falsehood. Nobody disputes it." "I have the memorial to which my friend has alluded," added Mr. Erastus Brooks (the same gentleman who held the famous controversy with Archbishop Hughes on the subject of church property in 1855), "and although it may not go to the extent of falsehood men-

tioned by the gentleman from Albany, that it is an entire falsehood, it comes under one of those definitions laid down by Lord Paley [?] where he says that a man may state ninety-nine facts and every one of them be a falsehood, because when the hundredth fact is given it overthrows all that has been stated before. This is precisely one of those cases. It has just enough truth in it to make a pretension; but, in point of fact and result, it is no true statement at all." Mr. Alvord, the present Speaker of the Assembly, declared that the anonymous communication was "from the beginning to the end a falsehood," and he added: "In all my legislative experience, in all these cases where State aid has been given to institutions of this character it has been based, not upon the question whether the institution belonged to this or that religious denomination, but upon the numbers who are taken care of by the charity, and only upon that." Mr. Develin exposed the "evident and intentional suppression of the truth" in the statements of the same anonymous paper relative to the legislative appropriations of 1867, and showed that, in order to pick out the Catholic charities mentioned in the tax-levy, the compiler must necessarily have gone through a multitude of similar grants to Protestant charities, of which he suppressed all mention. The list was made up, in short, by the double fraud of charging to Catholics what they had not received, and omitting what had been given to non-Catholics.

This fraudulent list, notwithstanding the complete exposure of its character in the Constitutional Convention, seems to have been used nevertheless by Dr. Leonard

Bacon in the preparation of two articles against the Catholics published nearly two years later in *Putnam's Magazine* (and answered in *THE CATHOLIC WORLD*, August, 1869, and January, 1870)—at all events, Dr. Bacon adopted the same figures—and now, ten years afterward, we find Mr. Cook referring with approval to Dr. Bacon's "fierce, but not too fierce, denunciation of the spoliation the city was then undergoing." All which is only another illustration of the difficulty of stopping the circulation of a lie.

A small minority in the Convention wished to insert in the constitution a prohibition of any appropriation whatever for "sectarian" or private charitable institutions. The Committee on Charities, at the head of which was Mr. Erastus Brooks, recommended the creation of a State Board of Charities, and was unwilling to limit the power of the Legislature to give what it deemed proper. Neither scheme prevailed, and the proposed new constitution left the matter as before. We do not purpose following the debate; but now that a fresh attempt has been made to accomplish by constitutional amendments the object which failed in the Convention, it will be especially useful to note how thoroughly the fallacies of the anti-Catholic party were laid bare by some of the foremost Protestants in the assemblage, and how indignantly principles were then scouted as "barbarian" which are now growing into fashion. There were several Catholics in the Convention who took a distinguished part in the discussion; but we shall here quote chiefly from Protestants

Mr. Brooks, beginning with a severe rebuke of the "sectarian

hate" which had displayed itself in the memorials against appropriations for religious charities, laid down the plain rule that while "the State ought not to support the churches, and ought not to make donations for purely sectarian purposes," on the other hand "it is also unworthy of a State to deny to any class of needy people the State's aid because the recipients of its bounty perchance belong to any one sect or to no sect. And I may also add," he continued, "that it is also unworthy of 'taxpayers' and all others to incite the fury of the State against any sect or party on account of its religious faith." Mr. Brooks reminded the Convention that "there can be no true charity where all religion is excluded"; and to those who cherish the absurd idea that there can be an abstract religion distinct from any particular creed or form of worship he addressed the following sensible remarks :

"Sectarianism cannot be, must not be, supported by the State, nor must it, if presented in the form of a true charity, be disowned by the State. If you strike at one mode of religious worship you strike at all. Your blows fall everywhere, and prostrate all whom they may reach. You must not suppose that asylums in New York, Westchester, Rochester, or Buffalo can be assailed upon the score of sectarianism, or Romanism if you please, and Protestant institutions like the two State Houses of Refuge, the institutions for the deaf and dumb, the blind, the Children's Aid Societies, Five Points Missions, hospitals for those of mature years and infant dependants, escape unscathed. All are so far Protestant as to have Protestant officers, Protestant boards of trustees and directors, and a general Protestant management and superintendence. This is true of all our main institutions, either criminal or for the maintenance of the poor. I have no fault to find with any of them; but be careful where you strike, or, like Samson, you may bring the whole temple at your

feet, and destroy all in your zeal to prostrate those you dislike."

Mr. George William Curtis, the editor of *Harper's Weekly*, followed Mr. Brooks.

"Unquestionably," said he, "if the State, as we have determined, is to aid charities, it cannot avoid, at least proportionately, helping those institutions which are under the care of the Roman Church. It is impossible not to recognize the fact that the charitable foundations of the Roman Church are the most comprehensive, the most vigorous, and the most efficient known in history. It is still further true, as the chairman of the committee (Mr. Brooks) has told us, that the great majority of those who must be relieved by State charities in certain sections of the State are members of that church, and will naturally fall to the care of that church. I cannot stop to speak of the various forms of the charity of that church, but it is to one of its saints that civilization owes the institution of the Sisters of Charity, whose benign service is known even in the hospitals of other denominations, and any system which this State should adopt which should strike at the very root of such institutions would necessarily bring the State to this question: 'Are you willing to do, absolutely and to the utmost, what is now done by the institutions already in existence?' I do not believe that the State is willing to do it. I believe the experience of this State to be that of Massachusetts. Massachusetts in the year 1863 established a board of charity. In the very first report which that board made, after looking over the whole ground, they announced that in their judgment the true policy of the State was to give assistance to the private foundations, of whatever sect, that already existed, rather than to establish new public institutions."

"I am not a Catholic," said Mr. Martin I. Townsend, recently member of Congress from the Troy district; "I am the farthest from it, perhaps, that a man can well be and have respect for the God that they worship. But my Protestantism has not taught me, when I see a naked, bare-footed child in the month of January tracking its little feet in the snow, to ask, before I relieve its necessities, what is the faith in which it is being brought

up; and notwithstanding the multitude of petitions that have come here, I do not believe that that is the sentiment of the State. I believe the sentiment of the State would be to relieve Catholic orphans as well as Protestant orphans."

"I am aware," said Mr. Alvord, "that there are numerous petitions coming up from all parts of the State against giving State aid for sectarian purposes; but I am not aware that this cry which has been raised throughout the State is entitled to any consideration, because so far as regards the foundations of these charities, in the very nature of the case, in almost all of these institutions of charity throughout our land, so far as regards their administration, they fall into some sectarian hands. They are the creation of benevolent people—people who have organized them because they have an abundance of means—and there are very many instances, both under Protestant and Romanish auspices, where the institutions have been the emanations of the piety of individuals. Such persons consider it a part of their religion that they should perform these acts of charity and kindness to their fellow-beings, and they must of necessity, under the circumstances, gather themselves together animated by the religious feeling in order to establish their work of benevolence."

And after showing how essential it is to the public welfare that orphans and other helpless and destitute persons should be properly cared for, Mr. Alvord continued:

"It is right and proper for the great body politic to put their hands into the coffers of the State from time to time, as may be required, and give forth of the means of the people for the purpose of benefiting directly the people themselves by seeing to it that this great mass of human beings, orphans as they are, shall not come up to be a terror to the people of the State."

Upon the question of the justice of giving State aid to institutions under religious influence or control, the sentiment of the Convention seemed, indeed, to be nearly all one way. The policy of that

course, as a mere matter of expediency and economy, was also demonstrated. The point was well made that a large proportion of charitable institutions which originate in private beneficence and are partly sustained by private contributions must inevitably go down if State aid is withheld. "If private liberal-minded individuals," said one member, "will from their private means defray nineteen-twentieths of this expense and leave but one-twentieth for the State to supply, it seems to me wise to accept of such a donation, and not by constitutional restrictions deny ourselves the benefit of such liberality." Private beneficence already bears about as heavy a tax as it is able to sustain. If the state and city should withdraw their help, individuals would not supply the deficiency, but a large proportion of the charitable institutions would have to close their doors. Thousands of destitute persons would be thrown into the streets and become a burden upon the public. The number of municipal hospitals, almshouses, asylums, etc., etc., would have to be quadrupled; and where taxation now contributes only a small part of the cost of supporting the poor and disabled, it would then have to pay the whole.

Probably the voluntary contributions of churches and private persons defray not less than three-quarters of the current expenses of the hundred and fifty charitable institutions of this city, and have borne an equally large proportion of the first cost of the buildings. Does anybody imagine that these donations would ever have been made to municipal hospitals and almshouses? It has been calculated that public charities of a

secular character consume in salaries on an average about thirty per cent. of their income. The income of the House of Refuge last year, exclusive of a special gift from the State of \$20,000, was \$114,962, and salaries and wages amounted to \$37,454. But in the best class of religious charities the services of managers, officers, and attendants are in large part gratuitous. To show the economy of public aid to religious charities we have a striking illustration in the case of the Catholic Protectory. That institution does for children of Catholic parents what the House of Refuge and the Juvenile Asylum do for Protestants. All three receive per-capita allowances from the public funds. The House of Refuge and the Juvenile Asylum are supported wholly by the city and State. The House of Refuge, moreover, received its land from the city, and very nearly the entire expense of its buildings was paid by the taxpayers. According to its fiftieth annual report, issued in 1875, the cost of its real estate and buildings up to that date was \$745,740, and the total amount received from private subscriptions and donations during its whole history was only \$38,702. Now look at the record of the Catholic Protectory. That establishment contained at the date of its last report 2,034 children, the House of Refuge having 903 and the Juvenile Asylum 781. Up to 1875 (the same date we have taken for the review of the expenditures of the House of Refuge) the outlay on real estate and buildings amounted to \$933,968, of which the public authorities had contributed \$193,502 in money and nothing at all in land, leaving a balance of about \$740,000 supplied by the liberality of Catholics. Nor is this

all. During the first three years of its existence the Protectory received no allowances from the public treasury. It obtained at last from the Legislature a per-capita grant of \$50 (less than half the actual cost of maintenance). It now receives \$110 for each child, the House of Refuge drawing about the same amount, while the Juvenile Asylum got last year \$122 50 for each child. The deficit of the Protectory on current expenses up to 1875 reached the sum of \$250,000, and it is now regularly from \$40,000 to \$50,000 a year; so that this Catholic charity has expended in the care of the children committed to it considerably more than *a million of dollars* over and above all sums received from any public source. If Catholic religious zeal had not undertaken this noble work the taxpayers must have borne the entire burden. They must have put up buildings for the army of children whom the Christian Brothers and Sisters of Charity have taken care of (the House of Refuge can accommodate only 1,000, and now contains over 900); they must have made per-capita grants for their support considerably larger than they have made to the Protectory; or else the children must have been left in the streets to grow up vagrants, drunkards, thieves, and worse. Besides doing the public an incalculable service by reforming and caring for these boys and girls, the Protectory has therefore saved the taxpayers more than a million dollars in cash.

We can imagine no more dreadful condition of society than one in which the flow of private charity is checked by illiberal laws, and a host of orphans and paupers are maintained out of the taxes in establishments from which religion

is excluded. Such a system is a curse both to the community that gives such aid and to the poor who receive it. It discountenances the exercise of a virtue which has been universally recognized as one of the brightest ornaments of the Christian life; it deprives the unfortunate of the chief solace of their misery, the weak and erring of the chief help to a new career. It would not take long under such a system to produce a population hard, selfish, immoral, monstrous beyond all example in Christian countries. But Protestants will tell us that although charity ought to be religious, it must nevertheless be "unsectarian." There is no cant more absurd than this. *Why* must charity be "unsectarian?" Unsectarian is a fetich word to which Protestants are prone to pay an unreasoning worship. If there is any difference between truth and error, "sectarian" disagreements are founded upon important principles. If a man has any faith he is bound to stand by it and bring up his children in it. To say that the State ought to withhold its aid from every charity dispensed in an asylum where a positive religious belief is professed, and to open its purse to asylums where indifferentism is cultivated, is to require the State to discriminate against all creeds and in favor of free-thinking. This is not impartiality; it is the most offensive form of sectarianism. It makes the State the active enemy of all creeds.

And in point of fact a general system of undenominational charity has never been established in any civilized country. We can understand an unsectarian soup-house or dispensary. But an unsectarian orphan asylum is an impossibility. All institutions which undertake

the care and education of children, all which assume the ordinary duties of parents and attempt to supply the influences proper to the home, *must* give either a distinctly religious training or a distinctly infidel training. If they accept the latter alternative their managers are guilty of the most fearful crime against the children, and a crime, too, against the state. If they choose the former they are driven to decide between rival creeds, Christian or Jewish, Catholic or Protestant. There is no getting around this difficulty. There is no devising a composite religion, suitable for the use of asylums. How shall we please the Jew with a faith that teaches Christ crucified? Or if we yield to the Jew, shall we have a Christianity that ignores our Lord? Or if perchance we can satisfy Jew and Protestant, are we to rob Catholics of the sacraments? Nearly all denominations which retain any love for their own creed and any respect for spiritual things understand the essential vice of unsectarian asylums as clearly as we do, and hence the multitude of church institutions of various sorts which have sprung up all over the city.

An unsectarian reformatory is, if possible, a still greater outrage upon justice and common sense than an unsectarian infant asylum, since it undertakes to cultivate virtue by the exclusion of religion, and to conquer sin without the help of grace. Homes and refuges for adults are worse than useless if religion is shut out of them. Hospitals are places of danger if the soul is not watched in them as carefully as the body. Indeed, if our Protestant friends adhered in practice to the principles of management which they profess so

freely in the annual reports of benevolent institutions, their charities would be cold enough. But in point of fact nearly all these establishments do teach religion. It may not be distinguishable as Episcopalianism, Methodism, or Presbyterianism, but at all events it is surely Protestantism. The one point upon which they all agree is hostility to the Catholic Church. "Ours is a strictly unsectarian home," said the matron of one of these institutions to a visitor; "we open our doors to all, without distinction of race or creed." "Do you receive Catholics too?" "Oh! yes, certainly we do; but"—confidentially—"we make sure that they are not Catholics any more when they leave us." If Protestant denominations care so little about fundamental doctrines, so little about modes of worship, so little about positive religious duties, that they are content to mix their children in these great combination asylums—where a Ritualist will preach to them to-day and a Unitarian to-morrow, where nobody can determine whether it is even proper to baptize the little ones, and where they must inevitably be educated to have no respect for any denomination whatever—that is their affair; let those support the system who like it. But in the eyes of Catholics who cling to the sacraments and the divinely-instituted priesthood, and who know that our Lord enjoins upon us not merely a vague religious sentiment but certain religious practices, all such pretended compromises between faith and infidelity are in the last degree odious. He who is not for me is against me. We take the ground that we have an absolute right to the free exercise of our religious duties and observances, and

our children an absolute right to a Catholic education. When the State places our poor, our sick, our criminals, our orphans and destitute children in establishments where these rights are in any way abridged, it commits the most grievous tyranny of which a government can be guilty. When it declares that it will aid none who cling to their faith and their religious privileges, but will give its money liberally to all who consent to abandon their church, it is guilty of enormous injustice and makes itself the strongest support of practical infidelity.

No, the so-called non-sectarian institutions are either really sectarian in disguise or they are schools of indifferentism, materialism, atheism. In either case they are violently hostile to the Catholic Church, and we can have no part or lot with them. There is only one just and rational method of solving the problem of State aid to the poor, only one method that treats all alike. That is to encourage every religious denomination or society of charitable persons to found and manage asylums, etc., for those of their own creed, and, when private benevolence has done its utmost, for the State to lend its assistance to all impartially in proportion to the numbers they relieve, asking of none, "Are you Methodists? Are you Catholics? Do you believe in the Trinity? Do you approve of infant baptism?" but only requiring proof that the recipients of public money are honestly engaged in work for the public good, and that the funds committed to them in trust will be honestly and wisely expended. *This* is "unsectarian charity." This is the only fair and economical method of taking care of the

poor. And this, as we shall see, in spite of occasional outbreaks of fanatical opposition, is the method to which our State has long given at least a formal approval. "The very complainants who remonstrate against sectarian charities," said Mr. Erastus Brooks, in speaking of the anonymous paper referred to in the first part of this article, "are themselves all of some sect and party, and the complaint, I think, is not so much that money is expended as that, perhaps, those not of the sect of the signers get more than their share of this money."

At the request of the Constitutional Convention in 1867 tabular reports were prepared by State Comptroller Hillhouse and City Comptroller Connolly of all sums of money paid by the State and City of New York to religious, charitable, and educational institutions during the previous twenty years, specifying the amounts received by each institution in each year. In these reports were included asylums, reformatories, hospitals, dispensaries, benevolent societies, colleges, corporate free schools and academies of various denominations, etc., etc.—everything, in short, of a charitable nature except municipal institutions like those under the care of the Commissioners of Charities and Correction on Blackwell's Island, and the public schools, which are maintained by a special fund and tax. The State report covered the period from January 1, 1847, to December 31, 1866; the city report comprised also a part of the expenditures of 1867; and both were published with the official proceedings of the Convention.* We have supplemented these statements by obtaining from the official records an account

of all sums paid by the State and city to the same or similar institutions from the date of the Convention reports down to the 1st of January, 1878, so that the record is now complete for a period of thirty-one years. No statement covering the past ten years has ever been compiled until now, and the preparation of this one has involved great labor. The charitable appropriations of the city alone, which were less than \$200,000 in 1867, amounted to \$967,000 in 1877, and the number of institutions benefited has doubled in the same time, although corporate schools, formerly included, have been dropped from the list since 1872. The figures include payments from whatever source, and fall under no fewer than eight separate heads: 1. Special appropriations by the Legislature; 2. Per-capita allowances made by the Legislature in the annual charity bill, and divided first among the counties in the ratio of their taxation, the share of each county being then divided among its charitable institutions in proportion to the number of their inmates; 3. Per-capita allowances from the school fund to charitable institutions (such as orphan asylums and reformatories) which are partly engaged in the work of education; 4. Special appropriations by the city or county; 5. Per-capita allowances from the city or county, under general laws; 6. The excise funds distributed among charitable associations; 7. License fees from theatres (paid to the House of Refuge); 8. Board of inmates of certain institutions paid from the appropriations of the Commissioners of Charities and Correction.*

* See *Documents of the Convention of the State of New York*, vol. iii. Nos. 54 and 55.

* During the seven years 1867 to 1873 these last-mentioned items were paid by the commissioners and not by the comptroller, and the confusion in the

The State appropriations are taken from the State comptroller's annual reports. The city and county appropriations, up to the close of 1869, are copied from the annual reports of the city comptroller. But since December, 1869, that officer has never made a detailed report from which it is possible to discover the payments to any one institution, and the figures have only been obtained by considerable research. It has been necessary to examine the ledgers in the comptroller's office for a series of years, and often to consolidate a great number of entries, in order to ascertain the amount paid to a single society in a single year. Since the distinction between city and county expenditures was abolished in 1874, an inspection of the comptroller's warrants has given the desired information. The work has been complicated by obscurities and inaccuracies in the titles by which institutions are occasionally entered on the books of the city, and in several cases it has been difficult to ascertain which of two establishments having somewhat similar names was the one intended. It is possible that this confusion has led to a few errors in our statement; but we have taken great pains to avoid such mistakes, and in many instances have had recourse to the books of the institutions themselves. It is proper to say that the comptroller and his deputies and clerks have cheerfully given us every possible facility for the examination of the city records.

Schools and colleges are not included in the statements that fol-

low—first, because the question of public education has been held to be distinct from that of public charity, and cannot be discussed here without swelling the dimensions of this article far beyond all reasonable bounds; and, secondly, because no grants have been made in aid of corporate or private schools since 1872, and none can be made under the amended constitution as it now stands. Dispensaries are omitted, because they are a peculiar kind of charity which all parties approve of aiding from the public funds, and "sectarianism" has nothing to do with them. Hospitals, however, are included, because religious influences are naturally concerned with them. Societies for general charitable relief are also included, because a very large proportion of them combine missionary work with alms-giving; as it is impossible always to specify those which confine themselves to a single function, we have entered them all. For convenience of comparison we group the institutions under several heads according to their chief objects. Some operate in two or more spheres; the Sisters of Mercy, for instance, and the Hebrew Benevolent Society, besides maintaining asylums for children, distribute a great deal of out-door relief to adults; but as we have no means of distinguishing the revenues and expenditures of each branch, the total grants to the society or institution are set down under the head which represents its principal work.

CATHOLIC CHARITIES.

Among the Catholic institutions of New York there are three "great charities"—namely, the Orphan Asylum, Foundling Asylum, and Protec-

books is such that we have failed to obtain the figures. The only institutions which received anything from that source during the period mentioned were the Colored Orphan Asylum and the Colored Home.

tory—each of which far surpasses in the extent of its operations any *two* non-Catholic establishments in the city, and each receives allowances strictly proportioned to the number of its inmates.

I. ASYLUMS FOR CHILDREN.

1. *The Roman Catholic Orphan Asylum* embraces four important institutions—namely, an establishment for girls at the corner of Prince and Mott Streets, which contained, according to the *Catholic Almanac* of 1879, 210 children; another for girls on Madison Avenue and Fifty-second Street, with 510 children; one for boys on Fifth Avenue, with 520 children (these three being under the care of the Sisters of Charity); and a farm at Peekskill, where 120 of the older boys are cared for by the Christian Brothers. Whole number of children, 1,360, or nearly as many as all the seven Protestant and Hebrew orphan asylums put together. The society was founded in 1817; consolidated with it are the Roman Catholic Half-Orphan Society and the Society for the Relief of Children of Poor Widows and Widowers, grants to both which are included in the figures given below. After the society had been in active operation for thirty years, sustaining all the poor children the Prince Street building could accommodate, and pressed to make room for more, it obtained from the city a grant and lease of the land for the erection of the new asylums on Fifth and Madison Avenues. The annual report for 1877 (the latest at hand) shows that the society received during the previous year from the Board of Excise \$15,000; from the Board of Education, \$13,658 43; from the State, nothing;

from legacies, \$14,861; from the voluntary offerings of Catholics, \$34,830 28. The collections taken up in the churches on Christmas and Easter days are given to this charity, and in prosperous years they have generally amounted to about \$50,000 annually. No salaries are paid to the sisters or the Christian Brothers, but a small sum is allowed for their actual expenses, amounting in the total to \$4,400 for the sisters and \$1,895 59 for the brothers. During the thirty-one years covered by our reports these four asylums have received from the city and State \$298,196 54.

2. *St. Joseph's Orphan Asylum*, on Eighty-ninth Street and Avenue A, was founded in 1858, chiefly for German children, and is under the charge of the School Sisters of Notre Dame. At the last report it had 180 children. Its annual expenses are about \$14,000. It received of the public money in 1877, from all sources, \$1,100, and its gross receipts from the city and State since its foundation (twenty years) have been \$61,498 55.

3. *St. Vincent de Paul's Orphan Asylum*, in West Thirty-ninth Street, was founded in 1858, and gives preference to children of French descent. It has 87 inmates, who are supported chiefly by the contributions of French Catholics and cared for by the Marianite sisters of the Holy Cross. Its expenditures amount to about \$10,000 a year, and it has a mortgage debt of \$54,000. Its receipts of public money last year were \$1,500 from the excise fund. Its gross receipts of public money since its foundation (twenty years) have been \$19,174 04.

4. *St. Stephen's Home*, under the Sisters of Charity, in East Twenty-

eighth Street, was founded in 1868 for the relief of destitute boys and girls between the ages of two and thirteen. It had 141 inmates at the date of the last report. Its annual expenses are between \$7,500 and \$8,000. In 1877 it received \$3,220 from the public funds, and its gross receipts from city and State since the commencement have been \$14,202 89.

5. *The Foundling Asylum* of the Sisters of Charity, established in 1869, is one of the noblest of our Catholic benefactions. Institutions of this kind do a double service to the community, for they not only relieve a class of destitute children who have peculiar claims upon our compassion, but they accomplish untold good in the prevention of the crimes of infanticide and abandonment. Mr. Brooks paid a high tribute to the usefulness of foundling asylums in the course of the debate in the Constitutional Convention from which we have already quoted. A beginning had then been made towards the establishment of such an asylum in connection with the (Protestant) Nursery and Child's Hospital; but the reception of foundlings has always been a small and subordinate part of the operations of that institution, while the sisters' asylum attained from the first the most extensive proportions. Begun in East Twelfth Street, "almost immediately its many cribs were filled by babies of well-nigh every race, and presenting different conditions of health and suffering—some with marks of violence upon their little bodies, others evidently under the influence of drugs to such an extent that but the merest semblance of life remained in them, and others bearing with them contagion of various kinds." Before the Sisters of

Charity undertook this work the foundlings of New York were consigned to the care of the pauper women in the Blackwell's Island Almshouse, most of whom were old, infirm, filthy in their habits, and broken down by a long life of hardships or vice. A visiting physician appointed to that institution was shocked at learning from these women that "only one foundling had lived in many months." The sisters had great difficulties to contend with, and at one time their funds were reduced to fifty-two cents; but the Legislature came to their aid by granting them the same allowances made to Protestant institutions of the same class; a society of ladies was formed to raise money for them by subscription, and the city gave them land for the present asylum on Sixty-eighth Street, which was opened in 1863. The buildings as they now stand cost over \$300,000; others are to be put up whenever the sisters obtain the necessary funds. The society of ladies already mentioned devotes itself especially to collections for this object. The asylum not only takes care of abandoned children, but it embraces a refuge and reformatory for unfortunate mothers, receiving from 250 to 300 wretched women every year. Besides the infants in the asylum proper, there are many others whom the sisters are obliged to place out at nurse for want of room; in the supervision of the nurses the sisters are aided by the visitors of the Society of St. Vincent de Paul. The number of foundlings in the institution at the date of the last report was 1,783. By the act of 1872 the supervisors of the city and county of New York are required to pay to the managers of the Foundling Asy-

lum, for each infant maintained by them, the same sum granted by the act of 1865 to the (Protestant) Infants' Asylum for the same service. This sum is not to exceed the average cost of the maintenance of children of like ages in the municipal Nursery and Infants' Hospital under the charge of the Commissioners of Charities and Correction. The grants to the Catholic and the Protestant institution are made in identical terms and with the same conditions, the payments in both cases being strictly proportioned to the number of inmates, and made to correspond with the lowest cost of keeping children in the public institutions. Under the law the Foundling Asylum received \$242,776 54 in 1877, and its gross receipts from city and State since the beginning have been \$1,252,713 71.

6. *St. Vincent's Home for Boys*, in Warren Street, was founded in 1870, and somewhat resembles in its general plan the Newsboys' Lodging-Houses conducted by our Protestant friends. It gives food and shelter, besides a careful moral training, to homeless lads, and extends charity to a great number of out-door applicants besides. There are about 220 inmates. Those who are able pay five cents for a meal and a night's lodging; the destitute are received free. The annual expenses are about \$10,000; the institution received \$1,600 from the city in 1877. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$5,375.

7. *St. Vincent de Paul's Industrial School* for girls, in West Forty-second Street, was founded in 1856. It is under the direction of the Sisters of Charity, and comprises not only a school where girls over twelve years of age are taught

trades, etc., but also a home for the destitute. It has about 160 inmates, and in 1877 received \$1,200 from the city. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning (twenty-two years), \$8,860, or about five cents a week for each girl in the Home.

8. *Asylum and Schools of the Sisters of St. Dominic*.—The Sisters of St. Dominic have parochial schools attached to three of the German churches, and maintain besides, in Second Street, an asylum with about seventy-five inmates, and an Industrial School where three hundred and twenty-five children are clothed, fed, and taught trades. They moreover feed about fifty poor persons daily. They received in 1877 from the excise funds \$5,787 28, and no other public money. The grants to these sisters previous to 1872 were made in such form that the per-capita allowances from the education fund, on account of their various free day-schools, are not distinguishable from the grants to the asylum and Industrial School. Gross receipts of public money for all purposes since the foundation (1860), \$64,751 94. Of this amount \$17,030 37 came from the school fund.

9. *St. Joseph's Industrial Home*, on Madison Avenue and Eighty-first Street, is the only Catholic institution except the Orphan Asylum and the Foundling Asylum which obtained its land from the city. It was founded in 1869 for the protection of destitute young girls (the daughters of deceased or disabled soldiers having a preference), and for the reception of homeless little children committed to it by the police courts. It is under the charge of the Sisters of Mercy. The number of inmates in October,

1878, was 596. During the previous year nearly 1,000 destitute children were sent to the asylum by the magistrates, not for petty crimes but because they had no home. These committed children, including some transferred from Randall's Island, were paid for out of the excise fund, the amount for the year being \$39,052 43; other allowances from the public treasury, \$9,946 51. The State made three appropriations towards the cost of the building, viz.: \$30,000 in 1867, \$25,000 in 1868 on condition that an equal amount should be raised by private contributions, and \$50,000 in 1869 with the same proviso. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning including these three donations, \$161,502 81.

II. REFORMATORIES.

10. *The Catholic Protectorsy*.—This is the third of the "great charities," and the most extensive of any class, Catholic or non-Catholic, within the limits of this review. It was founded in 1863 for the purpose of reforming juvenile delinquents and educating vagrant children, the statutes conferring upon it the same powers and responsibilities that belong by law to the House of Refuge, Juvenile Asylum, and Female Guardian Society. We have already seen that Catholic charity has contributed over a million of dollars to the cost of this institution, and that the voluntary offerings of benevolent persons pay annually a large proportion of its running expenses. The following courteous letter was addressed to the rector of the Protectorsy by the superintendent of the Five Points House of Industry:

FIVE POINTS HOUSE OF INDUSTRY,
May 28, 1878.

DEAR SIR: I desire again in this for-

mal manner to tender my sincere thanks for your courtesy shown to Mr. Camp and myself on our visit to your institution yesterday. The visit, as we said, was one wholly for information which might be useful to us in our work. I was both surprised and delighted with what I saw, and you are certainly doing a most excellent work in an admirable manner. You have the right ideas in regard to fitting these children for usefulness, and are fortunate in being able to put them in such a practical shape. I think no candid person can take in such a knowledge of your general work as we did without commending it. I shall always be glad to say a word of commendation whenever an opportunity offers for the thoroughly good work you are doing for the poor Catholic children.

Sincerely yours,

WILLIAM F. BARNARD.

TO REV. BROTHER ADRIAN,
New York Protectorsy.

The number of inmates at the date of the last report was 2,034. The allowance from the public treasury for the support of the children is \$110 each per annum, that to the House of Refuge being the same, while the Juvenile Asylum received last year \$122 50. The Protectorsy obtained thus from the city in the year 1877-8, \$227,853 93, and from the Commissioners of Charities and Correction \$8,125 98, besides a special donation of \$50,000 from the Legislature. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, including donations to the building fund (there have been no grants of land), \$2,030,454 47.

11. *The House of the Good Shepherd*, at the foot of Eighty-ninth Street, East River, was founded in 1857, by the religious order whose name it bears, for the relief and reformation of fallen women. In 1878 it had 464 inmates, including penitent women, and young girls and children entrusted to the institution as a measure of precau-

tion, these classes being kept separate. Its annual expenditures are about \$80,000. In 1877 it received from the city \$8,946 47, and its gross receipts of public money from the commencement have been \$406,552 60.

12. *The Association for Befriending Children and Young Girls* is a society of benevolent ladies who sustain the House of the Holy Family, in Second Avenue, for the shelter and reformation of unfortunate children who are either vicious or exposed to bad influences. It was founded in 1869; expends about \$12,000 a year, mostly obtained by voluntary offerings; supports and educates about 100 girls; and received from the public treasury in 1877 \$1,750. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$16,450.

III. ASYLUMS FOR ADULTS.

13. *The Institution of Mercy*, in Houston Street, under the charge of the Sisters of Mercy, was founded in 1846. It comprises a House of Protection for poor women out of employment, and an asylum and school for young girls, and the sisters are also extensively engaged in the visitation of the sick and the distribution of general out-door relief. It has about 250 inmates, and expends nearly \$20,000 a year. In 1878 it received \$1,000 of the public money, and its gross receipts from the city and State from the beginning (thirty-one years), for all branches of its work, have been \$66,625 46.

14. *St. Joseph's Home for the Aged* is an asylum for poor women, conducted by the Sisters of Charity, in West Fifteenth Street. It was founded in 1868 and has 230 inmates, the destitute being received free. Its annual expenses are

about \$30,000. It received \$6,930 from the excise funds in 1877, and its gross receipts of public money from the beginning have been \$27,305.

15. *The Home for the Aged of the Little Sisters of the Poor*, in East Seventieth Street, is an asylum of a similar character, founded in 1870. It is entirely free, and receives only those who are over sixty years of age and quite destitute. It has 158 inmates, for whose support the sisters in person go begging from door to door; its annual expenditures are about \$13,000 a year; it received \$3,040 from the excise funds in 1877; and its gross receipts of public money from the beginning have been \$14,671 02.

IV. HOSPITALS.

16. *St. Vincent's Hospital*, in Eleventh Street, was founded by the Sisters of Charity in 1849, and was the first institution of the kind in this city depending on voluntary contributions. The money for its first outlay was advanced by the late Vicar-General Starrs. In 1860 it raised a fund of \$45,000 by means of a fair, and this enabled it to purchase land and put up a part of its present buildings. It receives persons of any creed, and allows ministers of all denominations free access to patients who wish to see them. Inmates who are not Catholics are not expected to attend the religious services. There were about eighty patients at the last report. Those who have means pay something for board and attendance; the indigent are received free. The annual expenditures are about \$40,000. The hospital received \$4,500 from the city in 1877. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$69,166 59.

17. *St. Francis' Hospital*, in Fifth Street, is a free German institution under the care of the Sisters of the Poor of St. Francis, who add to their duties in the hospital an extensive work of out-door relief. It was founded in 1865; had 173 patients at the last report; received \$4,243 50 from the city in 1877, and has had of public money from the beginning \$92,033 73.

18. *St. Elizabeth's Hospital*, in West Thirty-first Street, was founded in 1870 under the Sisters of the Third Order of St. Francis, has room for about fifty patients, spends \$6,000 a year, and obtained \$1,000 from the city in 1877. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$4,700.

V. SPECIAL INSTITUTIONS.

19. *St. Joseph's Institute for Deaf Mutes*, at Fordham, is an establishment under lay management, founded in 1869. It has received altogether \$10,554 03 from the public funds.

VI. GENERAL RELIEF.

20. *The Society of St. Vincent de Paul*, an association of laymen organized in nearly all the parishes for the visitation and relief of the poor, distributes \$50,000 or \$60,000 a year. It has been in operation here since 1856, and has received \$43,172 50 from the public funds.

These are the only gifts and allowances to Catholic charities of which we find record.

PROTESTANT AND JEWISH CHARITIES.

I. ASYLUMS FOR CHILDREN.

1. *The New York Orphan Asylum*, on Eleventh Avenue near Seventy-third Street, was founded in 1806. It has been liberally en-

dowed by the benefactions of private individuals, and has prospered by the increase in the value of real estate. It is strictly Protestant, and orphans are only indentured to persons who are "regular attendants of a Protestant place of worship and recommended by their pastor." Its expenditures are about \$40,000 a year. It has accommodation for 225 children. In 1877 it received \$1,933 91 from the city. Gross receipts of public money since 1847, \$52,204 51.

2. *The Leake and Watts Orphan House*, at Bloomingdale, was founded in 1831 under the will of Mr. John G. Leake, and derives an ample income from its endowment. It is free to destitute full orphans, of whom it has about 150. According to the language of the act of incorporation, the children are to be admitted without regard to "the country or religious persuasion of their deceased parents." They attend the Protestant Episcopal Church service, however; the religious instruction is of course Protestant; and the rector of Trinity Church has been president of the institution from its foundation. It received from the city in 1877 \$1,442 24. Gross receipts of public money since 1847, \$22,975 49.

3. *The Colored Orphan Asylum*, One Hundred and Forty-third Street, was founded in 1836. The city gave it in 1842 twenty lots of ground on Fifth Avenue, between Forty-third and Forty-fourth Streets, and with the proceeds of the sale of this property, after the destruction of the asylum by a mob in 1863, the present site was purchased. Religious instruction is furnished by ministers of various Protestant denominations in turn. The number of children at the last report was 307. In 1877 the asy-

lum received \$11,287 82 from the city. Receipts of public money since 1847, \$176,157 24, not including amounts paid by the Commissioners of Charities and Correction during the seven years ending with 1873. (See note on a preceding page.)

4. *The Hebrew Orphan Asylum*, founded in 1859, is one of several charities under the management of the Hebrew Benevolent Society. The land which it occupies on Seventy-seventh Street and Third Avenue was a gift from the corporation, and the city also contributed \$30,000 to the building fund. Besides the main building, used for boys, it has an industrial school adjoining, and an asylum for girls in Eighty-sixth Street. The number of children in the three establishments in 1878 was 301. The charity is exclusively for Jews, and the inmates receive a strictly Jewish education. The funds of the society are derived in large part from the annual contributions of its two thousand patrons and members, but it also receives liberal aid from the city, the payments from this source in 1877 amounting to \$21,729 66. The expenditures for the current year have been distributed by the managers of the association as follows: Orphan Asylum, \$45,000; Industrial School, \$3,000; charity and relief, \$15,000. Gross receipts of public money (eighteen years), \$155,147 37.

5. *The Protestant Half-Orphan Asylum*, in West Tenth Street, founded in 1835, is intended explicitly for the education of destitute children in Protestantism. It is not wholly free; board must be paid in advance at the rate of 75 cents a week. At the last report the asylum had 200 children. It

received from the city in 1878 \$2,157 86. Gross receipts of public money since 1847, \$62,389 94.

6. *The Orphans' Home and Asylum of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, Forty-ninth Street and Lexington Avenue, founded in 1851, has 158 inmates. It obtained from the city in 1861 a twenty years' lease of the land it occupies, at the yearly rent of one dollar, and its gross receipts of public money from the beginning have been \$28,047 61. In this total are included a payment of \$1,000 in 1865 to the "Orphans' Home," and another of \$1,395 79 to the "Orphans' Home and Asylum," by which titles we suppose this institution to be meant.

7. *The Union Home and School*, on the Boulevard near One Hundred and Fiftieth Street, was founded in 1861 for the education and support of the destitute children of soldiers and sailors from this city. It professes to permit "no sectarianism in the institution," but to allow the visits of clergymen of all denominations. The infants are probably encouraged to judge for themselves on disputed points of theology. It is unnecessary to say that the spirit of such an asylum must be radically anti-Catholic, and its influence highly favorable to indifferntism and infidelity. By act of the Legislature, passed in 1873, the managers are to receive \$150 per annum for every child maintained in the Home, this being a much larger per-capita allowance than is made, so far as we know, to any other establishment. The institution is supported entirely from the public funds. At the last report it contained 187 children. It received from the city in 1877 \$26,528 44. Gross receipts from the city and State since 1861,

\$252,371 54, not including amounts paid by Westchester, Kings, and other counties for children from those parts of the State.

8. *The Society for the Relief of Destitute Children of Seamen* is an adjunct of the Sailors' Snug Harbor on Staten Island, but under independent management. It received \$1,000 from the city in 1877. Gross receipts of public money since 1847, \$36,655 76.

9. *The Children's Aid Society* is the most extensive of the Protestant organizations for the care of children, and also one of the most bitterly sectarian. It began operations in 1853, and now has twenty industrial schools, twelve night-schools, six lodging-houses, and a summer home on Long Island. The daily average attendance at the schools last year was 3,477. The most important part of the work of the society is collecting poor and vagrant children and sending them to "carefully-selected homes" in the West. Nearly 50,000 boys and girls have thus been disposed of. About 3,500 were shipped last year. THE CATHOLIC WORLD has heretofore shown how this society operates in destroying the faith of Catholic children who are taken into its schools, and removing the little Western emigrants from all Catholic influences. Force is used in this process of conversion; the last annual report speaks with approval of the effect of "the action of the truant agents, and the existence of the compulsory law (though mainly unexecuted) in forcing street children into our own night-schools, and into half-sessions of our day industrial schools." In the same report the secretary, Mr. Charles L. Brace, congratulates the friends of the society on the failure of the proposed amendments to the constitution

which threatened the existence of the industrial schools, and he added the following sentence, which well illustrates the spirit of his enterprise: "It was seen that the previous amendments of the constitution sufficiently protected our public schools from *priestly or sectarian interference.*" Now, the amendments to which Mr. Brace refers were two. The first prohibits grants by the State, the second prohibits grants by counties, cities, towns, and villages, to any association, corporation, or private undertaking, except that provision may be made for juvenile delinquents, the blind, the deaf and dumb, and the poor. Under these amendments all allowances to Catholic free schools have been cut off, but the school money is paid freely to Mr. Brace's schools, on the plea that they are for the "support of the poor." And when he says that "priestly interference" with the schools has been prevented, he means that measures have been adopted to hinder Catholics from conducting schools of their own. What more open avowal could be made of the character of his "unsectarian" establishments? Notwithstanding the constitutional amendments, the Children's Aid Society received from the Board of Education in 1878 \$34,599 28, and from the city \$70,000. Gross receipts of public money from 1853; to 1877, \$979,499 69.

10. *The American Female Guardian Society*, founded in 1835, is an institution somewhat similar in its character to the Children's Aid Society. It has a House of Industry and Home for the Friendless in East Thirtieth Street, where destitute women and children are received; it conducts twelve industrial schools; it finds Protestant homes.

for children on the plan of the Children's Aid Society; and it does various out-door missionary work. "Persons applying for children must be regular attendants at a Protestant place of worship and recommended by their pastor." In 1878 there were 118 children in the Home and 35 adults. The report for that year says that "1,945 children have been in regular attendance" in the twelve industrial schools, but the average or the number at any one time is not given. The number adopted out during the year was 151. In 1877 the society received \$16,072 23 from the Board of Education and \$25,000 from the State. Gross receipts of public money since 1847, \$359,542 06.

11. *The Five Points House of Industry*, in Worth Street, founded in 1850, embraces a home and school for destitute children and an asylum for poor women. An important part of its work is religious, services being held twice a day in the institution. The managers make no secret of their efforts to convert Catholic children to Protestantism. A large proportion of the boys and girls are of Catholic parentage, but none are ever placed in Catholic homes. In 1878 the whole number of inmates was 286 and the average attendance at the school 354. The institution received from the city in 1877 \$6,876 14. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$124,472 14.

12. *The Five Points Mission*, in Park Street, founded in 1850, is an enterprise of the Ladies' Home Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church, and is entirely under the influence and control of the Methodist denomination. It maintains missionaries at the Five Points, keeps up religious

services, finds situations for adults and children, gives away food and clothing, and has a school with an average attendance of 430. In nearly all associations of this class the distribution of material relief is only auxiliary to the spiritual work. In 1877 the mission obtained \$2,100 from the city. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$45,059 36. (See also Ladies' Home Missionary Society, No. 84.)

13. *The Howard Mission and Home for Little Wanderers*, in the New Bowery, was founded in 1861 professedly for the purpose of giving shelter and material aid and "imparting intellectual, moral, and religious instruction" to children and others. It also provides homes for children, and in no case places them with Catholic families. The perversion of Catholic children to Protestantism is one of its chief objects. It obtained \$2,265 25 from the city in 1877, and its gross receipts of public money from the beginning have been \$22,490 50.

14. *The Wilson Industrial School and Mission*, in St. Mark's Place, was organized in 1853, and comprises a school and night-refuge for poor girls, and a "mission church" with its pastor and Bible-reader, Sunday-school, prayer-meetings, etc., its operations being largely of a religious character. The average number of girls in the school last year was 184. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$4,839 11.

15. *The Shepherd's Fold*, in East Sixteenth Street, and (16) *The Children's Fold*, Boulevard and Ninety-fourth Street, are Protestant Episcopal institutions which have had a curious history. In 1869 the superintendent of the Shepherd's Fold was the Rev. Edward Cowley. The trustees having dispensed with his

services, he organized, with the aid of seceders from the original institution, an opposition house, which he called the Children's Fold, both asylums having the same object—namely, the care and education of destitute and orphan children. In 1874 a mortgage on the real estate of the Shepherd's Fold was foreclosed, the children were transferred to other institutions, and the charity was abandoned. In 1877, the trustees of the Children's Fold in their turn resolved to get rid of Mr. Cowley. He was accused of cruelty and mismanagement. The State Board of Charities took the matter up; there was an investigation and a public scandal; both parties went to law to secure possession of the asylum, and meanwhile the managers of the Sheltering Arms were requested to take care of the children. By a law of 1874 the city was required to pay \$2 a week for every child maintained by the Children's Fold. But by a law of 1871 the Shepherd's Fold was entitled to draw from the public treasury \$5,000 a year, *even if it supported no children at all*. Mr. Cowley and his friends, ejected from the Children's Fold, now revived this profitable institution (March, 1877), and suits and counter suits followed to test the legality of their action. At their annual meeting held last March Mr. Cowley stated that they had received fifty children in two years, and expended \$7,000, and he claims \$5,000 from the city on account of the operations of 1878. This amount has not so far been paid; but while the two Folds were at open warfare they both drew from the public treasury at the same time. The original Shepherd's Fold from 1869 to 1873 obtained \$21,280, and the

Children's Fold from 1869 to 1877 received \$34,175 06.

17. *The Sheltering Arms*, One Hundred and Twenty-ninth Street and Tenth Avenue, is a Protestant Episcopal institution, founded in 1864 for the relief and education of poor children, not orphans, who are not provided for by other institutions. It is conducted by the Protestant sisterhood of St. Mary. It has about 135 children, and received from the city in 1877 \$2,520. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$21,972 95.

18. *St. Barnabas House*, in Mulberry Street, is a Protestant Episcopal institution, founded in 1865, and comprising a temporary home for women and children, a permanent home for sixteen poor children, and a day nursery. It is under the management of a Protestant sisterhood. All the inmates are obliged to attend the Protestant Episcopal service every day. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$9,355 21.

19. *The Nursery and Child's Hospital*, Lexington Avenue and Fifty-first Street, founded in 1854, is the largest of the Protestant charities for children, next to the Children's Aid Society. It embraces a Lying-in Asylum and a home for children; payment being expected for both classes of inmates, unless they are quite destitute. At the last report there were 586 children and 262 women in the institution, including the country branch on Staten Island. During the year ending March 1, 1878, the institution received \$108,007 10. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$668,334 10. The land which the nursery occupies was a grant from the city.

20. *The New York Infant Asylum*, Sixty-first Street and Tenth Avenue, founded in 1865, is an institution somewhat like the preceding. It comprises a home for foundlings and other destitute children, and a lying-in hospital. A law of 1865 requires the city to pay for every child maintained by the asylum a sum not greater than the average cost of each child in the municipal asylums. This is the same provision afterwards extended to the Foundling Asylum of the Sisters of Charity. The number of children and women is about 400. Receipts from the city in 1877, \$44,165 43. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$160,208 86, nearly all of which was paid during the past five years.

21. *The Juvenile Guardian Society*, in St. Mark's Place, a sort of mission and industrial school, was the subject of an investigation undertaken by the State Board of Charities in 1877, resulting in a most damaging report and an application to the courts for a forfeiture of its charter, on account of misuse of funds and general worthlessness. From 1866 to 1873 it received \$59,435 18 of the public money.

22. *The Bowery Juvenile Guardian Society* is debited with one grant of \$264 89.

23. *The Wayside Industrial Home*, incorporated in 1869 "for the care, support, and proper training and education of destitute children," received \$13,998 of the public money during the four years ending with 1872.

24. *The Children's Educational Relief Association*, in East Broadway, was organized "to co-operate with the Board of Public Instruction in advancing the cause of education on a broad and unsectarian basis," and its particular business

is to aid truant officers and others in getting poor children into the irreligious common schools. It received \$1,164 from the city in 1876.

25. *The Ladies' Educational Union*, which appears to be no longer in existence, had received of the public money, from 1865 to 1871, \$41,873 98.

26. *The Industrial School of the Protestant Reformed Dutch Church* received \$5,000 from the city in 1868.

27. *The Fourth Ward Society for the Relief of Poor Children* is debited with a gift of \$980.

II. REFORMATORIES.

28. *The House of Refuge*, under the management of the Society for the Reformation of Juvenile Delinquents, is the chief Protestant reformatory, corresponding to the Catholic Protectory and the Western House of Refuge at Rochester. Juvenile delinquents under sixteen years of age are received on commitment by a magistrate. There has been an understanding, and for a short time there was a law, that the children of Catholic parents should be sent to the Protectory, but this is not faithfully observed; for example, out of 625 committed to the House of Refuge in 1878 no fewer than 317 were of Irish parentage, and it is probable that half the inmates of the asylum are of Catholic birth. The religious instruction and worship, however, are exclusively Protestant. Priests are not allowed to visit the Catholic children, unless they are specially asked for in case of sickness. A formal application, made by the Catholic Union in 1875, for the admission of a priest to act as chaplain to the Catholic children and to say Mass for them, etc., was

refused. A majority of the inmates are not criminals, but idle and neglected children. Of the commitments in 1878, only 49 per cent. were for crimes of all sorts, great and small, and the rest were for vagrancy, truancy, and disorderly conduct. The number of children in the institution January 1, 1879, was 903. The House of Refuge was built almost wholly at the public expense, and *all* its expenses are paid from the public treasury. It received from the city the land which it now occupies on Randall's Island, and lands which it formerly occupied on Madison Square and on Twenty-third Street. Its revenues, apart from proceeds of the labor of the inmates, are derived from the State comptroller, the Board of Education, and the license tax on theatres, and amount in the aggregate to \$110 per annum for each child, or the same sum allowed to the Catholic Protectory. It receives nothing from private charity. It obtained last year \$68,500 from the State, \$11,843 48 from the Board of Education, and \$22,457 56 from theatre licenses; total, \$102,801 04. Gross receipts of public money since 1847, \$1,552,196 58.

29. *The Juvenile Asylum*, founded in 1853, takes charge of children committed by police magistrates for vagrancy and petty offences, and children of bad habits placed in the asylum by their parents or friends. Those who have no homes it sends to the West. It is of course strictly Protestant, although a large proportion of its wards are of Catholic parentage. The institution comprises the asylum proper near High Bridge, a House of Reception in Thirteenth Street, and a Western Agency at Bloomington, Illinois. In January, 1879, there

were 781 children in the Asylum and House of Reception, and during the previous year 141 had been sent to Illinois. The receipts from the city and Board of Education in 1878 were \$95,146 92; daily average number of inmates, 775; per-capita allowance, \$122 50. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning to 1877 (twenty-five years), \$1,442,292 87.

30. *The (Protestant) House of Mercy*, at Bloomingdale, founded in 1854, is a Protestant Episcopal reformatory for fallen women and wayward girls. It is under the management of the Protestant sisterhood of St. Mary, and its religious instruction and services are those of the denomination under whose auspices it is conducted. In 1877 it had 70 inmates. The city and State have made several liberal grants in its aid—\$15,000 in 1863, \$25,000 in 1867, \$10,000 in 1872. It received \$2,253 93 from the city in 1877. Gross receipts of public money (twenty-four years), \$91,893 10.

31. *The New York Magdalen Benevolent Society*, founded in 1851, has an asylum for fallen women in Eighty-eighth Street, and does some out-door missionary work, employing "a competent and respectable agent, who shall be an authorized minister of some Evangelical church." The number of inmates of the asylum in May, 1878, was 57. Allowances from the city during the previous year, \$2,620. Gross receipts of public money (twenty-seven years), \$42,406 17.

32. *The Home for Fallen and Friendless Girls*, in Fourth Street, had 26 inmates in 1877, and received that year \$2,977 49 from the city. Gross receipts from the city and State between 1870 and 1877, \$15,446 83.

33. *The Midnight Mission*, in Greene Street, a Protestant Episcopal charity, offers a temporary shelter to fallen women, and sends them to homes, friends, or public institutions. It received from the city in 1874, 1876, and 1877 a total of \$2,404 60.

34. *The Women's Prison Association* conducts the "Isaac T. Hopper Home," in Second Avenue, for the help and reformation of discharged female prisoners. Gross receipts of public money (1859 to 1877), \$11,121.

35. *The Home for Discharged Prisoners* (possibly the same as the institution mentioned above) received from the city \$500 in 1847 and \$1,000 in 1854.

36. *The Gilbert Library and Aid Fund* for prisoners received \$1,000 from the city in 1877.

37. *The National Temperance Society* obtained \$2,000 from the State in 1871 for the establishment of an Industrial Temperance Home in this city.

38. *The Inebriate Reform Society* received allowances from the city in 1860-1-2; total, \$1,250.

III. ASYLUMS FOR ADULTS.

39. *The Colored Home*, in East Sixty-fifth Street, founded in 1839, embraces an almshouse and a hospital. In the former department it had last year 59 inmates and in the latter 127. The prevailing religious influence is that of the Methodist denomination. The city makes it an allowance of \$91 25 per annum for each person supported, and the society has little other income. It received from the city in 1877 \$21,729 66. The gross receipts of public money since 1847, not including seven years' per-capita payments by the Commissioners of Charities and

Correction (see note on a preceding page), have been \$121,342 20.

40. *The Ladies' Union Aid Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church* has a home in Forty-second Street for aged and infirm members of that denomination. Applicants for admission must have been members of the Methodist Episcopal Church in good standing for ten years, and nominated by the congregation to which they belong. The annual report for 1878 does not mention the number of inmates; but the *Hand-Book* of the Board of United Charities for 1877 gives the average number as 95. The society received \$2,375 from the city in 1877. Gross receipts of public money since its foundation in 1850, \$38,032 28.

41. *The Chapin Home*, in East Sixty-sixth Street, is an asylum founded in 1869 for aged and infirm Universalists, only members of the Universalist Church being eligible as trustees. An admission fee of \$300 is required. Number of inmates in 1878, 44. The city gave a perpetual lease of the ground which the institution occupies (fourteen lots), and both city and State have made liberal donations in money. Gross receipts from the public funds (nine years), \$38,036 16.

42. *St. Luke's Home for Indigent Christian Females*, Madison Avenue and Eighty-ninth Street, founded in 1852, is a Protestant Episcopal institution, and is only open to communicants of that denomination. An entrance fee of \$200 is required. Number of inmates in 1877, 62. Allowance from the city that year, \$1,260. Gross receipts of public money since the foundation, \$21,820.

43. *The Home for Old Men and*

Aged Couples, in Hudson Street, is a Protestant Episcopal institution founded in 1872, and only open to members of the Episcopal Church. An admission fee of \$250 is required. The average number of inmates is about 20. Gross receipts of public money, \$2,040.

44. *The Samaritan Home for the Aged*, in West Twenty-second Street, was founded in 1866 as an asylum for indigent women. One of its circulars announces that it is to be "absolutely free from all sectarian bias, and open in its direction and its objects to persons of all *Protestant* denominations," and that its Board of Managers "shall represent indiscriminately our common *Protestant* Christianity in all its forms." An admission fee of \$250 is required. Number of inmates, about 40. Gross receipts of public money, \$7,350.

45. *The Association for the Relief of Respectable Aged Indigent Females*, founded in 1814, has a home in East Twentieth Street. Admission fee, \$80. The managers are required by the rules to see that "the asylum is duly supplied with the preaching of the Gospel, and any minister properly authorized as a preacher of the Gospel by any Evangelical denomination of Christians shall be cordially received. . . . No inmate in the asylum to be permitted to introduce any preacher of the Gospel, or to invite their friends to give religious instruction, without the consent of the church committee." Gross receipts of public money since 1847, \$10,647 36.

46. *The Home for Aged and Infirm Hebrews*, Eighty-seventh Street and Avenue A, founded in 1848, has about seventy inmates. Gross receipts of public money, \$4,403.

47. *The Night-Refuge Association*, Avenue D and Tenth Street, opened in 1877 a temporary shelter where it can furnish lodging to 400 men and 100 women. It received \$10,000 from the city in 1876 and \$5,000 in 1877.

48. *The Ladies' Christian Union* maintains a Young Women's Home in Washington Square, where working-girls and others can obtain cheap board and improving society. Religious influences are set forth among the chief advantages of the institution; there are morning and evening devotions, Bible-classes, etc. The society received \$3,000 from the city in 1870 and \$3,000 in 1871.

49. *The Young Woman's Aid Association*, in Bond Street, a boarding-house for the same class of persons, obtained \$1,895 from the city in 1876-7.

50. *The Female Christian Home*, in East Fifteenth Street, is an establishment where from thirty to forty working-women obtain board at rather low rates. It received \$1,700 from the city during the years 1876-7.

51. *The Peabody Home* for aged and indigent women, Thirty-third Street and Lexington Avenue, with accommodations for fifteen persons, received \$375 from the city in 1876 and the same amount in 1877.

52. *The Mariners' Family Asylum and Industrial Society*, on Staten Island, is an institution founded for the support, shelter, and religious (Protestant) instruction of the female relatives of seamen, missionary work entering largely into its plan of operations. It obtained \$16,000 from the Legislature at the start (1848-9), and its gross receipts of public money have been \$27,966 13.

IV. HOSPITALS.

The religious influence at the non-Catholic hospitals varies according to the rules of each institution. In some the visits of priests and sisters, if not forbidden, are obstructed and discountenanced. In others the management is indifferent to all religion.

53. *The New York Hospital*, in Fifteenth Street, with a limited number of charity patients, and the *Insane Asylum* at Bloomingdale, at which the amount received for board of inmates nearly, or perhaps quite, meets the current expenditures, are under the management of the same corporation. The hospital cases are chiefly surgical. The society has received from the city and State since 1847, \$331,750.

54. *The Society for the Relief of the Ruptured and Crippled*, founded in 1863, has an institution on Forty-second Street and Lexington Avenue, where a small number of patients are treated, but its principal work is among the out-door poor. It received \$27,607 10 from the city in 1877. Gross receipts of public money (eighteen years), \$199,087 06.

55. *The Woman's Hospital*, in Forty-ninth Street, was founded in 1858 for the treatment of diseases peculiar to women. In November, 1878, it had 98 patients. There are 24 free beds. Protestant service is held in the hospital every Sunday, and religious visits are paid by a regular missionary, and by three clergymen in turn, one Methodist, one Presbyterian, and one Episcopalian. Patients, however, are allowed to see any clergyman they desire "in extreme cases." The city gave the land for the institution (a whole block between Fourth and Lexington

Avenues), and the city and State have paid to the hospital (twenty years) \$147,325 04.

56. *The Lying-in Asylum* for destitute married women, in Marion Street, founded in 1823, has accommodations for twenty patients, but the ladies connected with it extend their aid to the out-door poor also. It has received of the public money since 1847 \$23,437 49.

57. *The New York Infirmary for Women and Children*, in Livingston Place, founded in 1853, has accommodations for thirty-four inmates, and attends also to dispensary and out-door patients. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$54,526 27.

58. *The Women's Infirmary*, formerly at Washington Heights, a small homœopathic institution, received \$3,500 from the State in 1866, and \$5,500 from the city in 1865-6; total, \$9,000.

59. *The Medical College and Hospital for Women*, Thirty-seventh Street and Lexington Avenue, has received \$61,894 47.

60. *The Hahnemann Hospital*, Sixty-seventh Street and Fourth Avenue, obtained from the city a perpetual lease of the ten lots of land it occupies, and has received of the public money since its foundation in 1871 \$39,000.

61. *The Bond Street Homœopathic Hospital* received \$9,615 30.

62. *The Homœopathic Surgical Hospital* received \$1,500.

63. *St. Luke's Hospital*, Fifty-fourth Street, is a Protestant Episcopal institution, served by the Sisters of St. Mary. Patients are received without regard to religious belief, but St. Luke's Hospital, like most of the other charities of the Episcopal Church, honestly avows the denominational character of its management—an example of frank-

ness and common sense which many professedly "unsectarian" establishments might profitably imitate. The last annual report says: "*Corpus sanare, animam salvare*—'to cure the body, to save the soul'—crystalizes in words the founder's thought. The very building embodies his idea. Its chapel stands, not in a remote corner, but as the centre from which the wards radiate." The superintendent is always a clergyman of the Episcopal Church. The average number of patients in 1878 was 139. We have already told the circumstances under which the hospital obtained its land. It received \$7,602 from the city in 1877, and its gross receipts of public money from the beginning have been \$30,020 73.

64. *The Mount Sinai Hospital*, a Jewish institution, on Lexington Avenue and Sixty-sixth Street, founded in 1852, received a perpetual lease of its land from the city at a nominal rent. The number of patients in November (1877) was 109. The institution received \$4,248 from the city in 1877. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, \$46,229 60.

65. *The German Hospital*, founded in 1861, obtained from the city a fifty years' lease, at a dollar a year, of the greater part of the block which it occupies on Lexington and Fourth Avenues, Seventy-sixth and Seventy-seventh Streets. It has accommodation for about fifty free patients, and maintains also a dispensary in St. Mark's Place. It obtained \$2,567 85 from the city in 1877. Gross receipts of public money from the beginning, not including allowances to the dispensary before the two institutions were consolidated, \$16,890 37.

66. *St. Mary's Hospital for Children*, a Protestant Episcopal char-

ity in West Thirty-fourth Street, under the Sisters of St. Mary, founded in 1870, and having twenty-six inmates in November, 1878, received \$1,500 from the city in 1866-7.

67. *The Home for Incurables*, Fordham, founded in 1866, is a Protestant Episcopal charity, in which, as usual with this denomination, the ministrations of the Episcopal Church have an important part. One-third of the beds are free. Number of inmates in 1877, 58. Gross receipts of public money, \$5,446 45.

68. *The House of Rest for Consumptives*, at Tremont, founded in 1869, is likewise a Protestant Episcopal institution. Number of inmates in 1877, 20. Gross receipts of public money, \$5,317 56.

Donations and allowances have been made to a number of hospitals for the treatment of particular forms of disease. We presume that most of them exert no religious influence; but we give their titles and the gross amount of public money they have received up to and including 1877:

- 69. *Ophthalmic Hospital*, \$83,942 06.
- 70. *Eye and Ear Infirmary*, \$47,575 15.
- 71. *Ophthalmic and Aural Institute*, \$16,315 01.
- 72. *Manhattan Eye and Ear Hospital*, \$2,560.
- 73. *New York State Hospital for Diseases of the Nervous System*, \$8,000.
- 74. *Orthopedic Hospital*, \$5,000.
- 75. *Cancer Hospital*, \$1,287 24.
- 76. *Infirmary of the New York College of Dentistry*, \$3,500.
- 77. *Metropolitan Throat Hospital*, \$1,736 60.
- 78. *West Side Throat Infirmary*, \$1,103 80.

V. SPECIAL INSTITUTIONS.

In the education of the deaf and dumb and the blind it is of course

necessary that religion should have as prominent a part as in the training of children who are in possession of all their faculties. Religion is an essential element, also, in the teaching of the insane and idiotic, a large proportion of those afflicted with mental disorders being quite capable of receiving instruction in spiritual things. For all these classes of unfortunate persons there is only one small Catholic institution. (See No. 19.)

79. *The Institution for the Deaf and Dumb*, Washington Heights, receives free pupils from all parts of the State, and takes pay-pupils at the charge of \$300 a year. It is entitled to draw from the public treasury \$300 a year for each child committed to it by the State or county authorities. The city granted the land which it formerly occupied on Fiftieth Street and Fifth Avenue. The course of study, according to the last annual report (1878), does "not omit that religious instruction which, while entirely unsectarian in its character, is yet necessary to fit our pupils to embrace intelligently the various forms of faith which, however they may differ in details, unite in enjoining love and obedience to a common Father, and in most instances in fostering reliance upon a common Saviour." In November, 1878, the number of pupils was 485; only five were supported at the cost of their friends. The institution received during the previous year \$90,035 01 from the State comptroller, \$20,384 70 from the city of New York, \$21,216 98 from the other counties of this State, and \$18,343 67 from the State of New Jersey; total, \$149,980 36. Gross receipts from the city and State of New York (not including the counties) from 1847 to 1877, \$2,210,054 96.

80. *The Institution for the Improved Instruction of Deaf Mutes*, founded in 1867, obtained from the city a grant of twelve lots of ground on Lexington Avenue, Sixty-seventh and Sixty-eighth Streets. It takes State and county pupils on the same terms as the preceding asylum. It has about 100 inmates. Gross receipts of money from the State and city, \$139,180 71.

81. *The Church Mission to Deaf Mutes* has a Home for Aged and Infirmer persons of that class in East Thirteenth Street, with eight inmates. It is a Protestant Episcopal institution, of which Bishop Potter is president. Gross receipts of public money (1860-77), \$3,340 28.

82. *The New York Institution for the Blind*, in Ninth Avenue, receives both State and private pupils, and at the date of the last report (1878) the number of inmates was 200. No information is given about the character of the religious instruction. During the previous year the institution received \$52,643 49 from the State of New York, \$7,283 82 from the State of New Jersey, \$5,078 25 from the city of New York, and \$1,921 50 from Kings and Queens counties; total, \$66,927 06. Gross receipts from the city and State of New York (1847-77), \$1,052,798 06. Donations to the amount of \$8,250 have also been made by the city to graduates of this institution.

The insane and idiotic poor supported by the city are sent either to the municipal institutions on Randall's, Ward's, and Blackwell's Islands, or the State institutions at Syracuse and Utica. Large sums have been appropriated to these asylums, but they do not come within the scope of this article.

VI. GENERAL RELIEF.

83. *The Ladies' Union Relief Association*, founded in 1848, has of late years paid particular attention to the visitation of soldiers' families. Gross receipts of public money, \$80,807 06.

84. *The Ladies' Home Missionary Society* of the Methodist Episcopal Church was organized "to support one or more missionaries for this city, who shall be appointed in accordance with the requirements of the discipline of the Methodist Episcopal Church." After paying the allowance of the missionaries "the surplus funds are reserved for objects of benevolence," etc. The society supports the Five Points Mission-house, for children and others. Besides the allowances of \$45,059 36 made to the Mission-house specifically, the society has received \$42,856 14; total, \$87,915 50. (See Five Points Mission, No. 12.)

85. *The New York Prison Association* extends its operations over the whole State. It occupies itself with the reform of prison discipline and the support and encouragement of reformed convicts after their discharge. It has received from the city since 1847, besides the allowances from the State, \$36,581 37.

86. *The United Hebrew Charities* comprise a partnership of most of the principal Jewish benevolent associations for co-operation in the relief of the poor of their own creed. They have received \$24,421.

87. *The Hebrew Benevolent Fuel Association* received \$1,000 from the city in 1877.

88. *The Down-town Hebrew Ladies' Benevolent Society* received \$1,000 90 from the city in 1877.

89. *The Young Men's Christian Association* received \$5,000 from the city in 1867.

90, 91, 92, 93. *Relief for the Blind*. The Blind Mechanics' Association has received from the city and State \$55,000; the Society for the Relief of the Indigent and Crippled Blind, \$19,600; the Society for the Relief of the Destitute Blind, \$5,475 37; and the city has made donations to the blind amounting to \$32,581 98. Total, \$112,657 35.

94. *The Association for Improving the Condition of the Poor*, which aims at the moral instruction of the needy as well as their material welfare, has received \$19,300. This organization founded the Children's Aid Society and the Juvenile Asylum, which are described elsewhere.

95. *St. John's Guild*, an association begun in 1866 under Protestant Episcopal auspices for the general relief of the poor, received \$1,000 from the city in 1874, \$21,367 in 1876, and \$15,000 in 1877; total, \$37,367. The Society of St. Vincent de Paul, which is engaged in a similar work, and, according to the last report (1877), distributed nearly twice as much money to the poor as St. John's Guild did, received \$1,000 in 1874, and has had nothing since then.

96. *The Female Assistance Society*, an association for the relief of the sick poor, which meets in the lecture-room of the Reformed Church on Fifth Avenue and Twenty-ninth Street, has received \$34,625.

97. *The American Seamen's Friend Society*, instituted "for the spiritual and temporal welfare of seamen," has received \$6,007 21.

98. *The New York Seamen's Society* received \$30,000 from the State in 1870, and \$10,000 in 1872.

99. *The New York City Mission*, in the Bible House, supports Protestant missionaries among the poor of the city, and distributes money, food, and clothing incidentally to its religious work. It received \$10,000 from the city in 1876.

100. *The German Mission* received \$5,000 from the city in 1870 and \$5,000 in 1871. There is a German Mission House in Pearl Street, and there is also a German Mission connected with the Protestant Episcopal City Mission Society.

101. *The Dorcas Society*, a Protestant Episcopal association for the relief of the poor, has received \$5,500.

102. *The Protestant Episcopal Sisterhood of St. Mary* received \$8,500 from the city between 1869 and 1874.

103. *The German Ladies' Aid Society* devotes itself to the relief of widows, orphans, and destitute sick women of the German nationality. It received \$5,000 from the State in 1871, and \$8,334 from the city in 1876-7; total, \$13,334.

104. *The Ladies' Society for the Support of Widows and Orphans (?)* received \$500 from the city in 1874 and \$3,272 90 in 1876; total, \$3,772 90.

In the list of societies which follow there are several which apparently are concerned only in the relief of material wants, and there are several concerning which we have little information. The figures represent the gross receipts of public money up to the close of 1877:

105. *Working-women's Protective Union*, \$300.

106. *Ladies' Protective Union*, \$200.

107. *Women's Educational and Industrial Society*, \$300.

108. *Ladies' Depository*, \$3,000.

109. *Ladies' Mission Society (?)*, \$1,000.

110. *Society for the Relief of Poor Widows and Children (?)*, \$500.

111. *New York Volunteer Association*, \$500.

112. *Free Training-School*, \$500.

113. *Woman's Aid Society for Training Young Girls*, \$5,250.

114. *Diet Kitchen*, for supplying food to the sick poor at their own homes, \$7,011 60.

115. *Colored Mission*, "for the religious, moral, and social elevation of the colored people," \$1,132.

116. *Seventy-ninth Street Mission*, \$600.

117. *The Harlem Missionary Association*, \$650.

118. *Guild of St. Ignatius* (Protestant Episcopal), \$400.

119. *Ladies' Association of St. Paul's Evangelical Lutheran Church*, \$400.

120. *Seventeenth Ward Ragged Mission*, \$750.

121. *West Side Relief Association*, \$5,550.

122. *Twelfth Ward West Side Relief Association*, \$1,000.

123. *Twenty-fourth Ward West Side Relief Association*, \$500.

124. *Rose Hill Ladies' Relief Association*, \$3,000.

125. *West Farms Ladies' Employment and Benevolent Association*, \$270.

126. *The Bread-and-Bief House*, \$2,538.

127. *Free Dormitory for Women*, \$1,300.

To this list may be added donations to a number of charitable funds, like that for the widows and orphans of firemen, and also the following gifts to National Benevolent Associations, viz.: German Society, \$14,787; French Benevolent Society, \$1,988; Swiss Benevolent Association, \$900; Irish Aid Society, \$300.

And now for the lesson of this survey. It will be evident from the statistics and explanations given in the preceding pages—

1. That the twenty Catholic institutions aided by the city and State are devoted, without a single exception, to the relief of destitute persons who would be a burden

upon the taxpayers or a danger to the community if private charity did not take care of them.

2. That these Catholic institutions are vastly more extensive in their operations than any other establishments of the kind in the metropolis.

3. That the allowances to these charities from the public treasury have not been proportionate to the allowances to Protestant institutions for an equivalent service.

4. That all the large grants to Catholic charities—the orphan asylums, Protectory, Foundling Asylum, etc.—are made under a general system of law in the benefit of which Catholic, Protestant, and Hebrew now share on exactly the same terms. Formerly there were discriminations against the Catholics.

5. That Catholic individual charity has borne by far the greater part of the burden of supporting these homes and asylums, so that the policy of the State in aiding and stimulating private benefactions has resulted in the saving of millions of dollars to the taxpayers.

6. That the Catholic charities which ask help from the public treasury are occupied wholly in the care of the Catholic poor, and not at all in converting Protestants.

On the other hand, it is evident—

7. That the majority of the one hundred and twenty-seven Protestant and other charities have received payments from the public trea-

sure far in excess of their proper share.

8. That large sums have been granted to Protestant institutions which have no claim at all upon the taxpayers.

9. That some of the Protestant charities under private management derive their entire revenue from the public treasury, whereas no Catholic institution has been thus favored.

10. That all the institutions in which religious or moral influences can be exercised at all are “sectarian” in the true sense of that word, many of them excluding Catholicism by their rules, and nearly all of them working against it in practice.

11. That all denominations which maintain asylums, etc., for those of their own church are freely aided by the State and city, Methodists, Episcopalians, etc., etc., getting at least as much consideration as Catholics.

12. Finally, that a large number of the Protestant institutions are actively and primarily engaged in making war upon the Catholic Church, using charity as an auxiliary to the work of proselytism, and especially stealing thousands of our Catholic children every year, so that the public money is used in their case to build up one creed at the expense of another. This is a charge which can be brought against no Catholic society.

AN EXHIBITION OF MR. DEXTER A. HAWKINS.

WILL it be credited that the old story about a gift from the city of New York to the Roman Catholic Church of the land on which the new cathedral stands has been started again? Only a year ago, when it was revived—for the hundredth time or so—in the *Atlantic Monthly*, it was so promptly and thoroughly answered that the gentleman responsible for the false statement withdrew it in the next number of the magazine. The whole subject of grants of land and money to Catholic and Protestant charities was then discussed in *THE CATHOLIC WORLD*. The elaborate articles of this magazine, with their convincing array of figures, were republished in a pamphlet* and extensively circulated. The matter was generally noticed by the secular press; and so public was the exposure of the old slanders and misrepresentations, so widespread was the interest manifested in the question, that it did seem safe to predict that we should hear no more of this particular anti-popery invention for some years.

But, alas! some lies are immortal. The cathedral story is already taken up afresh by some of the more violent Protestant organs with as much energy and assurance as if they had forgotten the correspondence between Mr. Cook and Mr. Hassard in the *Atlantic Monthly*, and the subsequent papers

in *THE CATHOLIC WORLD*. The fiery bigot who has now renewed the tale is Mr. Dexter A. Hawkins. He tells it with some extraordinary variations. He says: "1. The church got possession of a lease from the city at a nominal annual rent." [This is a rank invention.] "2. When forfeited for non-payment of this rent" [it never was forfeited] "the city waived the forfeitures, and, on payment by the church of \$83 32, converted the lease into a fee." [This is partly an invention, partly a ridiculous travesty.] 3. The city afterwards "made an even exchange with the church of a freehold strip [on Fiftieth Street] for a much smaller leasehold strip on the block above" [it was precisely ten inches narrower, and one was as much freehold as the other]. 4. Finally, Mr. Hawkins wishes us to understand that the city accompanied the gift of land by a gift of nearly \$33,000 in money.

Once more let us give the facts of this notorious transaction. 1. The site of the cathedral was sold by the city to a private purchaser in 1799 for £405, with the reservation of an annual quit-rent of four bushels of wheat. The city has never had any title in the property since that time. It passed through various hands, and in 1828 was sold under foreclosure of a mortgage given to the Eagle Fire Insurance Company. The purchaser, Francis Cooper, sold it the next year to the trustees of the cathedral and of St. Peter's Church for

* *Private Charities, Public Lands, and Public Money*. Grants of land and gifts of money to Catholic and non-Catholic institutions in New York compared. The Catholic Publication Society Co.

about \$5,500. In consequence of an order of the Supreme Court in a friendly partition suit between the two churches, it was again sold at public auction in 1852, and the cathedral bought out the interest of St. Peter's for \$59,500. 2. The nominal quit-rent of four bushels of wheat remained. The policy of later times is always to get rid of these vexatious and useless conditions originally attached to old deeds as an acknowledgment of feudal tenure, and this was done at the time of the last sale by accepting a money payment the interest of which would be equivalent to the price of four bushels of wheat. 3. When the streets were opened it appeared that the cathedral was left with a useless strip on the north side of Fifty-first Street, running from a point at Fifth Avenue to a width of 4ft. 8in. on Fourth Avenue, and the city had a similarly useless strip, ten inches wider than the other, on the north side of Fiftieth Street. These were exchanged, to the equal advantage of both parties. As neither strip was of any value at all except to the owner of the adjacent land, the difference of ten inches really does not seem to require discussion. 4. As for the pretence of a gift of money, it appears from Mr. Hawkins' statement (which we have not thought it worth while to verify) that when Madison Avenue was opened through the cathedral property the city paid, according to law, \$24,000 as the appraised value of the land condemned for that purpose. There was an assessment of about \$9,000 upon the cathedral, for supposed benefit in having its land cut in two, and this charge was a partial offset against the \$24,000; but in harmony with a well-established custom where

churches, etc., are concerned, this assessment was remitted. Mr. Hawkins actually adds the \$9,000 to the \$24,000, and so makes a gift of \$33,000! This is something like estimating a man's wealth by adding his debts to his income.

With this promising beginning, Mr. Dexter A. Hawkins sets off to show that "the Romish Church" is plundering the public right and left. First, he says, it has obtained "five and a half blocks of land in the best part of the city, worth \$3,500,000." The two blocks belonging to the cathedral, and worth, according to him, \$1,500,000 (not counting the \$33,000), we have already disposed of. The rest of the estate consists of the Orphan Asylum property, on Fifth Avenue; the land occupied by the St. Joseph's Industrial Home, on Madison Avenue; and the site of the Foundling Asylum, on Lexington Avenue. With a disingenuousness which we cannot too severely reprobate, Mr. Hawkins conceals the *purpose* of these grants; he states that the first was made to "the church," which is not true, for it was made to the Orphan Asylum Association, and the condition of its use was carefully stipulated; the second he merely calls a present to the Sisters of Mercy, and the third a gratuity to the Sisters of Charity. Now, we have shown—and Mr. Hawkins must know, if he has any comprehension of the subject he is talking about—that it has been the custom of the city of New York for more than fifty years to give the land for the erection of charitable asylums, etc., under the control of churches, private individuals, or societies; and that while all religious denominations have thus been helped in the care of their

own poor, the Catholics have received a much smaller proportion than their numbers and the extent of their benevolent enterprises would entitle them to.

Since the beginning of our history just *three* grants of public land have been made for Catholic asylums in New York. *Sixteen* such grants have been made for Protestant, Jewish, or other non-Catholic asylums under private control, not counting the municipal charities. If land was given for the Catholic Orphan Asylum, land was given also for the Hebrew Orphan Asylum, and for the (Protestant) Colored Orphan Asylum, and leased, for a dollar a year, to the Protestant Episcopal Orphan Asylum. If land was given for St. Joseph's Home for destitute children, land was also given for the Baptist Old Ladies' Home, and the Chapin (Universalist) Home, and the Deaf and Dumb Institution, where the pupils have a distinctly Protestant education and attend Protestant religious services every day. If land was given for the Catholic Foundling Asylum, so also was land given for the Protestant Nursery and Child's Hospital, and to the Society for the Reformation of Juvenile Delinquents, which refuses to allow a Catholic chaplain to minister to the Catholic children in its custody. About a third of the inmates of the House of Refuge are children of Catholic parents, but they are forcibly trained to be Protestants. Then we find donations of land to two Protestant churches, to a Jewish hospital, and to several other charitable institutions, only two of which can properly be called "non-sectarian."

We do not think it is of consequence to compare the values of the Catholic and non-Catholic do-

nations; but since Mr. Hawkins is so much alarmed at the magnitude of the grants to "Romish" charities, we may as well add a few words on this branch of the subject. He sets down the total at \$3,500,000. To reach it he began, as we have seen, by counting the value of the cathedral land, which was not a gift but a purchase in open market, at \$1,500,000. This we must strike out. Next he sets down the value of the gift to the Orphan Asylum as another \$1,500,000. But this is the estimated *present* value. The only figures, of course, that he has a right to consider are those of the value at the time the grant was made, viz., in 1846. Land near Fiftieth Street at that time was not worth much. In 1852 the cathedral block, next to the Orphan Asylum and of the same size, was sold at auction, and a half-interest brought \$59,500. If we put the other property at the same price (and it certainly was not worth any more) we have \$120,000 instead of \$1,500,000 as the value of the land appropriated for the Orphans. The grants to St. Joseph's Home and the Foundling Asylum are supposed by Mr. Hawkins to be worth respectively \$200,000 and \$300,000. If we accept these figures his total of \$3,500,000 dwindles to the sum of \$620,000.

Now look at the other side of the account. The land given to the Colored Orphan Asylum in 1842 was on Fifth Avenue, the whole width of the block between Forty-third and Forty-fourth streets, and 250 feet deep, or about one-third as large as the Catholic grant. We do not know how many children it maintained then, but it now has about 300, while the Catholic institution has nearly 1,400. The grants for the

Jewish Asylum, consisting of 17 lots on Third Avenue and Seventy-seventh Street, were probably worth nearly as much when they were made in 1860 and 1864 as the Fifth Avenue grant was worth in 1846, and the city added a money gift of \$30,000 as a contribution to the building fund. The number of children is under 300. The grant to the Protestant Episcopal Asylum (1861) consists of 12 lots on Lexington Avenue and Forty-ninth Street; there are about 150 inmates. The Baptist Home, with 90 inmates, obtained 10 lots on Sixty-seventh and Sixty-eighth streets, near Fourth Avenue, in 1870; the Chapin Home, with about 50 inmates, received 14 lots on Sixty-sixth and Sixty-seventh streets, near Lexington Avenue, in 1871; the Nursery and Child's Hospital obtained 15 lots on Fiftieth and Fifty-first streets, near Lexington Avenue, in 1857 and 1866, and a large money donation from the State; the Society for the Reformation of Juvenile Delinquents obtained its lands, its buildings, *everything* it possesses, from the city or State, and is wholly supported from the public treasury. It has received from the city, in land, a whole block on Twenty-third and Twenty-fourth streets, Avenue A and First Avenue, and thirty-six acres on Randall's Island. And so we might go through the whole list.

Suppressing the facts about the sixteen Protestant and Jewish land-grants, Mr. Hawkins then proceeds to the grants of money. These he treats in the same fashion. He presents a tabular statement for a series of eleven years, showing "under what guises or names the Romish Church has drawn public money from the city and from the State treasuries." To make up this table

he has deliberately passed over hundreds of appropriations to Protestant societies, although they must have been right before his eyes in the same public records from which he assures us that he obtained his figures; and he has also included in his list of "Romish" institutions at least one Presbyterian church, several Protestant Episcopal free schools, one Protestant Episcopal asylum, one Protestant sisterhood, at least one Lutheran school, a German mission which is Protestant, and a considerable number of schools (drawing in the aggregate many thousands of dollars) which do not appear to be Catholic schools, but are so imperfectly described in Mr. Hawkins' list that it is impossible to identify them. He has shown himself so recklessly inaccurate in other instances that the presumptions are not in his favor. Until 1872 it was the practice, not only of the city but of the State, to vote annual allowances to all free schools in proportion to the number of their pupils. No discrimination was made on account of religion. In the city of New York our free schools are much more numerous than those of any other denomination, and here, consequently, the Catholics received the largest share of these appropriations. But every other denomination obtained its proportion. Episcopalians, Lutherans, Hebrews, all who chose to open church schools, were impartially aided. In the rest of the State the Protestant outnumbered the Catholic free schools more than ten to one; and anybody who will take the trouble to look at the report of the State charities presented by the comptroller to the Constitutional Convention in 1867 will find there page after page of appropriations during the previous twenty years

to corporate academies, etc., not one of which, we believe, was Catholic. All these, it should be explained, were "private" institutions, having no connection with the common-school system. Since 1872 such appropriations have been prohibited by an amendment to the constitution, and the State and city can no longer lend their aid except to institutions for the relief of the poor and the care of juvenile delinquents. Let us look for a moment at the school allowances in New York City. Mr. Hawkins makes most of his entries in duplicate or triplicate, charges ten or twelve Protestant schools to us, and omits all the other Protestant schools. We have before us a genuine list, prepared for our use last year from the public records at the City Hall, of all the payments to schools and charitable institutions. We find that it covers grants to just *thirty-six* Catholic schools and *thirty-five* Protestant and Jewish private schools; among them are German Reformed, German Presbyterian, several German Lutheran, Unitarian, Hebrew, Turnverein, German Workingmen's, and the following Protestant Episcopal schools, viz., St. Chrysostom's, Trinity Church, Trinity Chapel, St. John's, St. Paul's, St. Luke's, St. Ann's, St. Mark's, St. Bartholomew's, the Protestant Episcopal Public School, and the Protestant Episcopal Mission School. Considerable sums were also, and are still, paid by the Board of Education for the children in orphan houses and other asylums, and under the care of such institutions as the Children's Aid Society; and of this money the Protestants have always received the lion's share.

Mr. Hawkins asserts that when the Constitutional Amendments al-

ready referred to were pending the Romish Church caused two "pestilent clauses" to be "Jesuitically introduced," by means of which it was enabled "to connect whole broods of its institutions by a sort of sectarian suction-hose with the public treasury." These were the clauses allowing appropriations to be made for the support of the "poor" and of "juvenile delinquents"; and the trick, according to him, consisted in classing destitute children as the "poor." He wishes to have the oversight repaired, and a new amendment looking to that result was introduced some time ago in the Legislature. It will be a sufficient answer to this Christian proposal to quote the following passage from the report for 1878 of that doughty foe of the Pope of Rome, Mr. Charles L. Brace, Secretary of the Children's Aid Society:

"The proposed amendment to the constitution which threatened the existence of our Industrial Schools did not pass the last Legislature—perhaps from a conviction that these schools for poor children were a necessary part of the public-school system, and had therefore a fair claim on their proportion of the State School Fund. It was seen, too, that the previous amendments of the constitution sufficiently protected our public schools from priestly or sectarian interference."

But if Mr. Hawkins suppressed part of the truth in treating of the schools, he did still worse in treating of the other charities. A year ago THE CATHOLIC WORLD published a full statement of the sums contributed by the State and city, not merely for eleven years but for thirty-one years (Jan., 1847, to Jan., 1878), to the charitable foundations of every creed—Catholic, Protestant, Jewish, and infidel. The total number of Ca-

tholic charities aided in any way from the public treasury was exactly *twenty*. The total number of Protestant, Jewish, and other non-Catholic charities similarly aided during the same period was exactly *one hundred and twenty-seven*. It is fair to say that a small proportion of these latter—perhaps 25 or 30—are concerned only in the relief of material wants and exercise no religious influence. Our articles of last year gave so full an account of them that the reader could judge for himself of their character and objects. Omitting certain infirmaries, etc., we have at least 100 distinctively Protestant and Jewish charities, against 20 Catholic; and we also showed, in the papers referred to, the following facts:

1. That the 20 Catholic institutions are devoted, without a single exception, to the relief of destitute persons who would be a burden upon the taxpayers if private charity did not take care of them.

2. That many of the Protestant charities have no claim at all upon the taxpayers.

3. That all the Catholic charities are occupied in taking care of the Catholic poor, and not at all in converting Protestants.

4. That many of the Protestant institutions use charity only as an auxiliary to proselytism.

5. That the allowances to Catholic charities have in no case been proportionate to the allowances to Protestant charities for a parallel service.

6. That Catholic individual charity has borne by far the greater part of the burden of supporting these homes and asylums, while there are extensive Protestant charities which derive their entire revenue from the public treasury.

Mr. Hawkins indulges in a violent tirade against two of the Catholic charities especially. These are the Protectory and the Foundling Asylum, the most extensive of our institutions. Of the Protectory he says:

“Charity is the using of one’s own means for the good of others. It is the highest Christian virtue and the duty especially of all churches; but to get hold of and use the public money to build up a sect under the pretence of charity is hypocrisy.”

Very well; let us apply this test. The Catholics bought the land for this institution, and put up the buildings mainly at their own cost. For the first three years they received no contributions of public money towards the support of the children committed to the Protectory by the magistrates. Then for a while they received less than half as much per head as was paid to Protestant institutions of the same class. Now the Protectory gets the same allowance that is made to the House of Refuge. The generosity of individual Catholics has spent *more than a million of dollars* on this charity in sixteen or seventeen years, and gives about \$40,000 annually towards its current expenses. The same work which the Protectory does for Catholic children is divided between two Protestant institutions, the House of Refuge and the Juvenile Asylum. Both are engaged in the forcible perversion of Catholic children to Protestantism. *Both are supported wholly by the public money.* The House of Refuge draws the same allowance as the Protectory, viz., \$110 per head per annum. The allowance to the Juvenile Asylum is \$122 50. The House of Refuge obtained from the city its land and nearly the

entire cost of its buildings, and during its whole existence it has received only about \$40,000 from private charity.

The Foundling Asylum Mr. Hawkins calls a "church boarding-house"; the Sisters of Charity he has the indecency to sneer at as "these 'charitable sisters'"; the children he refers to as "so-called foundlings"; and he makes the charge that the institution has "grabbed" the public money by trickery, fraud, etc., etc. In answer to all this abuse we repeat what we said a year ago: "By the act of 1872 the supervisors of the city and county of New York are required to pay to the managers of the Foundling Asylum for each infant maintained by them the same sum granted by the act of 1865 to the (Protestant) Infant Asylum for the same service. This sum is not to exceed the average cost of the maintenance of children of like ages in the municipal Nursery and Infants' Hospital under the charge of the Commissioners of Charities and Correction. The grants to the Catholic and the Protestant institution are made in identical terms and with the same conditions." But Mr. Hawkins suppresses this important fact: he does not allow his readers even to suspect that there is a Protestant asylum for foundlings. In point of fact there are two Protestant institutions which divide between them the work corresponding to that of the Catholic Foundling Asylum—namely, the Infant Asylum and the Nursery and Child's Hospital, the latter of which received its land from the city. Together they support about 1,200 inmates (a large proportion of whom pay board) and receive about \$150,000 a year. The Catholic asylum supports over

2,000 persons (hardly one of whom pays anything) and draws about \$240,000 a year. Average allowance to the Catholics, \$120 a head; average allowance to the Protestants, \$125 a head. Mr. Hawkins quotes the statutes (1872, 1874, 1877) which fix the allowances to the Foundling Asylum. The first contains the provisions we have just cited. The second specifies the rate, 38 cents a day, and makes an appropriation for certain past deficiencies. Exactly the same provisions, deficiencies and all, were extended to the New York Infant Asylum. The laws of 1877 (chapters 43 and 90) allow \$18 a month to *both* institutions "for each and every homeless and needy mother with a nursing infant who shall reside at the asylum by request of its officers and nurse her own infant"; and Mr. Hawkins must have known this, for the grant to the Foundling Asylum is made in the following terms: "Which said sum shall be raised and paid to the said Foundling Asylum of the Sisters of Charity in the city of New York in the same manner, at the same time, and by the same authorities and officer in and at which, and by whom, the sum paid to the New York Infant Asylum, to which it is or may be entitled as aforesaid, shall or may be raised and paid." The precise terms of the grants to the Nursery and Child's Hospital we have not thought it worth while to investigate.

When the Constitutional Convention assembled in 1867 an anonymous document very much like this production of Mr. Hawkins' was laid on the desks of the members and circulated all over the State. It was intended to show that the Catholics were

“grabbing” the money of the taxpayers to build up their church, and it presented a list of appropriations made up by the double fraud of charging to Catholics what they had not received and suppressing what had been given to Protestants and Jews. The character of this disgraceful publication was exposed by several of the leading members of the convention—among others by Mr. Ellis H. Roberts, editor of the *Utica Herald*; by Mr. Cassidy, editor of the *Albany Atlas and Argus*; by Mr. Alvord (the ex-Speaker), and by Mr. Erastus Brooks, then editor of the *Express*, and well known for his hostility to the Catholic Church. All these gentlemen denounced the list as a falsehood. Mr. Hawkins has made a list of precisely the same sort, in precisely the same way, and we refer him back to Messrs. Brooks, Alvord, Roberts, and others for the comment upon it.

As an introduction to his remarks upon charitable appropriations Mr. Hawkins favors the universe with his opinions of the papal Syllabus, accompanied by a number of alleged citations from that document. Heaven forbid that we should waste time in controverting such a farrago, but we have read enough of it to discover that Mr. Hawkins, if he has ever seen the Syllabus, is wholly incapable of understanding or translating it. His pretended citations are so ludicrous a travesty of the text of the Syllabus that it is impossible to read them without laughing. Sometimes he has so distorted the sense that we are at a loss to discover what it is he thinks he is translating. Sometimes he has blundered through confounding

contradictory with contrary propositions. Sometimes he has given a malicious twist to a proposition so as to make it apply to a different subject from that expressed in the text. Upon the whole, however, this introductory discourse is not without its uses; for it establishes beyond question the complete inability of Mr. Hawkins to make an accurate statement of facts or to argue rationally from any assumed premises.

Perhaps it is not his fault so much as his misfortune that he has stumbled into this mess. But what shall we say of the *Christian Advocate*, which publishes and applauds his essay, and of other religious papers—the *Christian Intelligencer*, the *Advance*—which join in the chorus? The editor of a church paper is supposed to know something of current religious history; to know at least how the charities of its own sect are supported; and we can hardly believe that the conductor of any denominational journal in New York is ignorant of the exposures made only a few months ago, in the *Atlantic Monthly* and *THE CATHOLIC WORLD*, of the very same falsehoods which are now called back to life. And what are we to think of the following remark by the *Christian Intelligencer*: “Other ecclesiastical organizations in this city are endowed with large and remunerative tracts of real estate, but they have been bequeathed to them by persons who were enrolled among their communicants. The Romish Church by political influence has robbed the taxpayers of the city, the great majority of whom are heartily opposed to the Papacy, of the great property it holds.”

SPELLERS.

<i>The Young Catholic's Illus. Speller,</i>	\$0 25
<i>The Grammar-School Speller and De-</i> <i>finer,</i>	75

ARITHMETICS.

<i>The Illustrated Table-Book; or, First</i> Lessons in Numbers,	
<i>The Standard Arithmetic, for Schools</i> of all Grades. Number One,	75
<i>The Standard Arithmetic, for High-</i> Schools, Colleges, etc. Number Two,	75

CATECHISMS.

<i>Complete Historical Catechism, after</i> Fleury. By Rev. H. Formby. Continued down to the Present Day,	12
<i>A Full Catechism of the Catholic Re-</i> ligion. No. 1. From the German of Deharbe, S. J. New edi- tion, corrected, revised, and amended by an American Ecclesi- astic. Published with the approbation of Cardinal McCloskey,	60
<i>Deharbe's Short Catechism, No. 2,</i>	30
" <i>Shorter</i> " <i>No. 3,</i>	20
<i>Boston Catechism, per 100,</i>	NET, 2 25
<i>New York, or Small Catechism, per</i> 100,	NET, 1 85
<i>National Council Catechism, per 100,</i>	NET, 2 25
<i>Butler's Large Catechism, per 100,</i>	NET, 2 50

HISTORIES.

<i>History of the United States of North</i> America for Catholic Schools. By J. R. G. Hassard, author of "Life of Pius IX.," "Life of Archbishop Hughes," etc. With an Introduction by Rt. Rev. J. L. Spalding, D. D., Bishop of Peoria. 1 vol. 12mo. Illustrated,	1 50
<i>An Introductory History of the Unit-</i> ed States, arranged on the Catechetical Plan. This book is an Abridgment of the larger History. Illustrated,	40

Ancient History.

Translated and Adapted from the French of Father Gazeau,
S.J. 1 vol. 18mo, \$0 30

Roman History.

Translated and Adapted from the French of Father Gazeau,
S.J. 1 vol. 18mo, 40

History of the Middle Ages.

Translated and Adapted from the French of Father Gazeau,
S.J. 1 vol. 16mo, 1 00

Modern History.

Translated and adapted from the French of Father Gazeau,
S.J., and continued down to the present time. (In press.)

Illustrated Bible History of the Old

and New Testaments, for Catholic Schools. Translated
from the German of Dr. I. Schuster, 60

COPY BOOKS.

Thompson's "Excelsior" Penmanship.

Simplicity, conciseness, elegance. The cheapest and most beautiful system of writing ever issued. Thompson's complete system of Practical Business Penmanship. A Progressive Series, in nine books.

Each book contains 24 pages of the best quality of finely-finished paper, with explicit printed rules for the formation of the letters. On the top margin of each copy of the first three books are complete analyses of the various forms of small and capital letters.
Per doz., 80

Sample Copy-Books sent free.

Composition and Exercise Books.

The following, which are those most used in schools, are given
at NET PRICES:

1. Best quality of paper.	24 pages.	Per doz.,	\$0 50
2. Good " "	24 " "	" "	35
3. Best " "	36 " "	" "	80
4. Good " "	36 " "	" "	60
5. Best " "	60 " "	" "	1 20
6. Good " "	60 " "	" "	90
7. Good " "	16 " "	" "	25

Composition and Exercise Books made to order, of any size or quality of paper, and at prices to suit purchasers.

Crayons, Slates, Slate-Pencils, Pen-Holders, Gillott's Pens, Blackboard Rubbers and Sponges, Ink, Letter Paper, Note Paper, Envelopes, etc., etc., supplied at the lowest possible price.

The Catholic Publication Society Co.,

LAWRENCE KEHOE, Manager,

9 Barclay Street, New York, N. Y.